



A
Treasury
of the
Buddha's
Words

DISCOURSES FROM THE
MIDDLE COLLECTION
TRANSLATED BY NYANAMOLI

AKUT
The Buddha's Words

D-15

A Treasury of the
Buddha's Discourses
from the Mahāvastu-nikaya
Middle Collection

TILAKA'S LIBRARY (416)
752-2253
44 CLONMORE DR.
TORONTO, ONTARIO
M1N 1X6

translated by
Vaj. Nyangul Thera

edited and arranged by
Paco Khanipala

TORONTO MAHAVIHARA LIBRARY
4698 KINGSTON ROAD
SCARBOROUGH, ONT. M1E 2P9
TEL: (416) 208-9276

**A Treasury of the
Buddha's Discourses
from the Majjhima-nikaya
(Middle Collection)**

VOLUME III

translated by
Ven. Nyanamoli Thera

edited and arranged by
Phra Khantipalo

A Treasury of the
Buddha's Discourses
from the Majjhima-nikaya
Middle Collection
VOLUME III

Printed in Thailand at:
Mahāmakut Rājavidyālaya Press
287 Phra Sumeru Road
Bangkok 2

Translated by
Ven. Nyanonā Thera

Edited and arranged by
Phra Khandalo

III

PATH AND FRUIT (a) UNDERSTANDING (WISDOM, INSIGHT)

“Whatever fears arise, bhikkhus, fools, not wise men, are the cause of them all. Whatever perils arise, fools, not wise men, are the cause of them all. Whatever calamities arise, fools, not wise men, are the cause of them all... Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train thus: “We shall be wise men and inquirers.”

(Sutta 115)

CONTENTS

Path and Fruit

Understanding (Wisdom, Insight)

43. *Questions and Answers-1*: by the Theras Mahākotthita and Sāriputta. 1
44. *Questions and Answers-2*: by Theri Dhammānā and Visākha. 12
109. *The Full Moon-1*: on not-self and wrong view. 23
28. *The Simile of the Elephant's Footprint-2*: 4 elements and 'self'. 29
140. *The Exposition of the Elements*: to Pukkusāti, he wins to Non-returning. 38
115. *Many Sorts of Elements*: elements, bases, dependent origination, impossible & possible. 49
146. *Advice from Nandaka*: not-self of faculties, objects and consciousness. 57
148. *Six Sixes*: not-self in 6 groups, dependent origination. 65
18. *The Sweet Morsel*: how to be rid of contentions. 74
9. *Right View*: 16 aspects of right view. 82
117. *The Forty Parts*: right view and the Noble 8-fold Path. 97
24. *The Relay Coach*: the seven stages of purification. 106
38. *The Exhaustion of Craving*: dependent origination. 114
131. *One Fortunate Attachment*: to cultivating insight. 131

Path and Fruit

Attainment

105. *To Sunakkhatta*: on final knowledge and the simile of the dart. 139
14. *To Vacchagotta*: who has attained? and Vacchagotta's attainment of Arahantship. 149

34. <i>The Cowherd-2</i> : the stages of attainment.	157
32. <i>Gosinga Wood-2</i> : various characteristics among Arahants.	161

CONTENTS

The Buddha:

Striving and Enlightenment

4. <i>Fear and Dread</i> : fear, its overcoming, Enlightenment.	173
36. <i>Saccaka-2</i> : austerities and Enlightenment.	182
26. <i>The Noble Search</i> : teachers, Enlightenment, and teaching Dhamma.	197
100. <i>To Sangāra</i> : 3 kinds of teachers, Enlightenment, devas.	214

The Buddha

The Tathagata

47. <i>The Inquirer</i> : should inquire about the Tathāgata.	221
88. <i>The Cloak</i> : what would the Tathāgata do and not do?	226
58. <i>To Prince Abhaya</i> : what would the Tathāgata say and not say?	232
12. <i>The Lion's Roar-2</i> : what the Tathāgata is like.	238

Path and Fruit

Attainment

100. To Sangāra on final knowledge and the simile of the dart.	214
34. To Vāseṭṭhi on the simile of the arrow and the simile of the arrow.	157
32. To Vāseṭṭhi on the simile of the arrow and the simile of the arrow.	161

Mahavedalla Sutta Questions and Answers-1

Introduction

Here are two of the most eminent Arahants discussing Dhamma. You might ask: 'Well, if they are Arahants, how come they are talking about such easy topics? They're only defining paññā (understanding), instead of discoursing on deep dhammas!' It should be understood that each of these Arahants had some unenlightened pupils with him and that the basic questions at the beginning are for their benefit. And if you want deep dhammas, then the Sutta later on progresses to them but the points of view of the reader nowadays and those bhikkhus then are quite different. They were hearing enlightened Teachers speak Dhamma, the Dhamma that came from their own hearts. Moreover, they heard it having practised intensively and thus had the possibility of enlightenment while sitting and listening intently. But now if one reads this account of a Dhamma-conversation, it will not come to life, unless one's heart is ready to know that Dhamma in oneself.

The Sutta (43)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park.

Then when it was evening, the venerable Mahā Kotthita rose from meditation, and went to the venerable Sāriputta and exchanged greetings with him. When the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said to the venerable Sāriputta:

(Understanding)

“Without understanding, without understanding” is said, friend. With reference to what is that said?’

“Does not understand, does not understand”, friend, that is why “without understanding” is said. Does not understand what? Does not understand: “This is suffering”, does not understand: “This is the origin of suffering”, does not understand: “This is the cessation of suffering”, does not understand: “This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering”. “Does not understand, does not understand”, that is why “without understanding” is said.’

Saying ‘Good friend’, the venerable Mahā Kotthita delighted in the venerable Sāriputta’s words, and after agreeing, he asked him a further question:

3. “Possessed of understanding, possessed of understanding” is said, friend. With reference to what is that said?’

“Understands, understands”, friend. That is why “possessed of understanding” is said. Understands what? Understands: “This is the origin of suffering”, understands: “This is the cessation of suffering”, understands: “This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering”. “Understands, understands”, that is why “possessed of understanding” is said.’

(Consciousness)

4. “Consciousness, consciousness” is said, friend. With reference to what is “consciousness” said?’

“Cognizes, cognizes”, friend, that is why “consciousness” is said. Cognizes what? Cognizes: “(This is) pleasant”, cognizes: “(This is) painful”, cognizes: “(This is) neither-painful-nor-pleasant”. “Cognizes, cognizes,” that is why “consciousness” is said.’

5. ‘This understanding and this consciousness, friend, are these dhammas conjoined or disjoined? And is it possible to separate each from each in order to describe the difference between them?’

‘This understanding and this consciousness, friend, these dhammas are conjoined, not disjoined, and it is impossible to separate each from each in order to describe the difference between them; for what one understands, that one cognizes, and what one cognizes, that one understands.

That is why these ideas are conjoined, not disjoined, and why it is impossible to separate each from each in order to describe the difference between them.'

6. 'This understanding and this consciousness, friend, that are conjoined, not disjoined, what is the difference between them?'

'This understanding and this consciousness, friend, that are conjoined, not disjoined, the difference between them is this, namely, understanding can be developed,¹ while consciousness can be fully known.'

(Feeling)

7. "'Feeling, feeling" is said, friend. With reference to what is that said?'

'"Feels, feels", friend, that is why "feeling" is said. Feels what? Feels pleasure and feels pain and feels neither-pain-nor-pleasure. "Feels, feels", that is why "feeling" is said.'

(Perception)

8. "'Perception, perception", is said friend. With reference to what is "perception" said?'

'"Perceives, perceives", friend, that is why "perception" is said. Perceives what? Perceives blue and perceives yellow and perceives red and perceives white. "Perceives, perceives", that is why "perception" is said.'

9. 'This feeling and this perception and this consciousness, friend, are these dhammas conjoined or disjoined? And is it possible to separate each from each in order to describe the difference between them?'

'This feeling and this perception and this consciousness, friend, these dhammas are conjoined not disjoined, and it is impossible to separate each from each in order to describe the difference between them; for what one feels, that one cognizes. That is why these dhammas are conjoined, and not disjoined, and why it is impossible to separate each from each in order to describe the difference between them.'

(Knowable by Mind Alone)

10. 'Friend, what can be known by pure mind-consciousness disjoined

1. The translator had 'maintained in being' for bhāvetabba (derived from the root bhū=be) but the meaning is 'developed' or 'cultivated'

from the five faculties?’

‘Friend, by pure mind-consciousness disjoined from the five faculties the base consisting of space can be known thus: “Infinite space”, the base consisting of infinity of consciousness can be known thus: “Infinite consciousness”, and the base consisting of nothingness can be known thus: “There is nothing at all”.’

11. ‘Friend, with what does one understand a knowable dhamma?’

‘A knowable dhamma, friend, one understands with the eye of understanding.’

12. ‘Friend, what does understanding have for its purpose?’

‘Understanding, friend, has direct-knowledge for its purpose,² it has full-knowledge for its purpose,² and it has abandoning for its purpose.²’

(Right View)

13. ‘Friend, how many conditions are there for the arising of right view?’

‘Friend, there are two conditions for the arising of right view: another’s voice and wise attention. These are the two conditions for the arising of right view.’

14. ‘Friend, how many factors is right view assisted by when it has deliverance of the heart for its fruit, deliverance of the heart for its benefit, and has the deliverance by understanding for its fruit, the deliverance by understanding for its benefit?’

‘Friend, right view is assisted by five factors when it has the deliverance of the heart for its fruit, the deliverance of the heart for its benefit, the deliverance by understanding for its fruit, the deliverance by understanding for its benefit. Here right view is assisted by virtue, by learning, by converse, by peace and by insight. Right view assisted by these five factors has the deliverance of the heart for its fruit, the deliverance of the heart for its benefit, the deliverance by understanding for its fruit, the deliverance by understanding for its benefit.’

(Being)

15. ‘Friend, how many kinds of being are there?’

‘There are these three kinds of being, friend: being with sensual

2. Attha, can also be translated ‘aim’ or ‘goal’.

desire, being with form and being without form.'

16. 'Friend, how is renewed being in the future generated?'

'Friend, renewed being in the future is generated for beings who, shut in by ignorance and fettered by craving, delight in this and that.'

17. 'Friend, how is renewed being in the future not generated?'

'Friend, with the fading of ignorance, with the arising of true knowledge, and with the cessation of craving, renewed being in the future is thus not generated.'

(The First Jhāna)

18. 'Friend, what is the first jhāna?'

'Here, friend, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the first jhāna which is accompanied by initial and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of seclusion. This is called the first jhāna.'

19. 'Friend, how many factors has the first jhāna?'

'Friend, the first jhāna has five factors. Here in a bhikkhu who has entered upon the first jhāna there is the occurrence of initial application and sustained application and happiness and pleasure and unification of mind. That is how the first jhāna has five factors.'

20. 'Friend, how many factors does the first jhāna abandon and how many does it possess?'

'Friend, the first jhāna abandons five factors and possesses five factors. Here in a bhikkhu who has entered upon the first jhāna, desire for sensual pleasures is abandoned, ill-will is abandoned, lethargy and drowsiness are abandoned, agitation and worry are abandoned, and uncertainty is abandoned; and there is the occurrence of initial application and sustained application and happiness and pleasure and unification of mind. That is how the first jhāna abandons five factors and possesses five factors.'

(The Five Faculties)

21. 'Friend, (there are) these five faculties each with a separate field, a separate resort,³ no one of them exploiting for its being another's

3. or 'sange' (gocara)

field and resort, that is to say, the eye faculty, ear faculty, nose faculty, tongue faculty and body faculty. Now these five faculties each with a separate field, a separate resort, no one of them exploiting for its being another's field and resort: What is their homing-place, what exploits for its being their fields and resorts?'

'Friend, (there are) these five faculties each with a separate field, a separate resort, no one of them exploiting for its being another's field and resort, that is to say, the eye faculty, ear faculty, nose faculty, tongue faculty, and body faculty. Now these five faculties each with a separate field, a separate resort, no one of them exploiting for its being another's field and resort, have mind as their homing-place, mind exploits for its being their fields and resorts.'

22. 'Friend, (there are) these five faculties, that is to say, the eye faculty, ear faculty, nose faculty, tongue faculty, body faculty: 'These five faculties persist depending on what?'

'Friend, (there are) these five faculties, that is to say, the eye faculty, ear faculty, nose faculty, tongue faculty, and body faculty: 'These five faculties persist depending on life-span.'

'Life-span, friend, persists depending on what?'

'Life-span persists depending on heat.'

'Heat, friend, persists depending on what?'

'Heat persists depending on life-span.'

'Just now, friend, we understood the venerable Sāriputta to say: "Life-span persists depending on heat", and, and now again we understand him to say: "Heat persists depending of life-span". How should the meaning of these statements be regarded?'

'In that case, friend, I shall give you a simile, for some wise men understand by means of a simile the meaning of a statement. Just as, when an oil lamp is burning, its radiance is seen depending on the flame and its flame is seen depending on the radiance, so too life-span persists depending on heat, and heat persists depending on life-span.'

(Life Processes)

23. 'Life-processes,⁴ friend, are they (the same as) states of feeling or are life-processes one and states of feeling another?'

4. Āyusākhāra, meaning bodily life processes, simply 'life' according to the Com.

'Life-processes, friend, are not states of feeling. Were life-processes states of feeling; then when a bhikkhu had entered upon the cessation of perception and feeling, his emergence could not be known⁵. And it is because life-processes are one and states of feeling are another that when a bhikkhu has entered upon the cessation of perception and feeling his emergence can be known⁶.'

24. 'Friend, when this body is bereft of how many dhammas is it then dropped and forsaken (so that) it lies senseless like a log?'

'Friend, when this body is bereft of three dhammas, that is to say, life, heat and consciousness, it is then dropped and forsaken (so that) it lies senseless like a log.'

25. 'Friend, one who is dead, who has completed his time, and a bhikkhu who has entered upon the cessation of perception and feeling, what is the difference between them?'

'Friend, (in the case of) one who has completed his time, his bodily processes have ceased and are tranquil, his verbal processes have ceased and are tranquil, his mental processes have ceased and are tranquil, his life-span is exhausted, his heat has subsided, and his faculties are quite broken up. (In the case of) a bhikkhu who has entered the cessation of perception and feeling, his bodily processes have ceased and are tranquil, his verbal processes have ceased and are tranquil, his mental processes have ceased and are tranquil, his life-span is unexhausted, his heat has not subsided, and his faculties are intact. One who is dead, who has completed his time, and a bhikkhu who has entered upon the cessation of perception and feeling, the difference between them is this.'

(Deliverance of Mind)

26. 'Friend, how many conditions are there for attainment of the deliv-

mentary. The question is simply: Are life processes the same as feelings (*vedanā*) or are they different? If they are the same, then it would be impossible for one who attained the cessation of perception and feeling to emerge from it since life-processes would be extinct along with the perception and feeling while in that state.

5. 'Could not take place.'

6. 'Can take place.'

erance of mind that is neither-painful-nor-pleasant?’

‘Friend there are four conditions for this: here with the abandoning of pleasure and pain and with the previous disappearance of joy and grief, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the fourth meditation, which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity. These are the four conditions for attainment of the deliverance of mind that is neither-painful-nor-pleasant.’

27. ‘Friend, how many conditions are there for attainment of the deliverance of mind that is signless?’

‘Friend there are two conditions for this: non-attention to all signs, and attention to the signless element. These are the two conditions for attainment of deliverance of mind that is signless.’

28. ‘Friend, how many conditions are there for persistence of the deliverance of mind that is signless?’

‘Friend, there are three conditions for this: non-attention to all signs, attention to the signless element, and the prior determination (of the length of the persistence). These are the three conditions for persistence of the deliverance of mind that is signless.’

29. ‘Friend, how many conditions are there for emergence from the deliverance of mind that is signless?’

‘Friend, there are two conditions for this: attention to all signs, and non-attention to the signless element. These are the two conditions for emergence from the deliverance of mind that is signless.’

30. ‘Friend, the deliverance of mind that is measureless and that which is nothingness and that which is voidness and that which is signless: are these dhammas different in meaning and different in the letter, or are they one in meaning and only the letter is different?’

‘Friend, the deliverance of mind that is measureless and that which is nothingness and that which is voidness and that which is signless: there is a way in which these dhammas are different in meaning and different in the letter, and there is a way in which they are one in meaning and only the letter is different.

31. ‘What is the way in which they are different in meaning and different in the letter? Here a bhikkhu abides with a mind endued with

loving-kindness extending over one quarter, likewise the second, likewise the third, likewise the fourth, and so above, below, around, and everywhere, and to all as to himself; he abides with an abundant, exalted, measureless mind of loving-kindness without hostility or affliction extending over the all-embracing world. He abides with a mind endued with compassion . . . He abides with a mind endued with gladness . . . He abides with a mind endued with equanimity . . . without hostility or affliction extending over the all-embracing world. This is called the deliverance of mind that is measureless.

32. 'And what is the deliverance of mind that is nothingness? Here with the complete surmounting of the base consisting of infinity of consciousness, (aware that): "there is nothing", a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the base consisting of nothingness. This called the deliverance of mind that is nothingness (as-non-owning).⁷

33. 'And what is the deliverance of mind that is voidness? Here a bhikkhu, gone to the forest or to the root of a tree or to an empty hut, considers thus: "This is void of self or of what belongs to self". This is called the deliverance of mind that is voidness.

34. 'And what is the deliverance of mind that is signless? Here with non-attention to all signs a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the signless concentration of mind. This is called the deliverance of mind that is signless.

'Thus is the way in which these dhammas are different in meaning and different in letter.

35. 'And what is the way in which they are one in meaning and only the letter is different?

'Lust is a making of measurements,⁸ hate is a making of measurements, delusion is a making of measurements. In a bhikkhu whose taints are exhausted, these are abandoned, made like a palm stump, done away with so that they are no more liable to future arising. Of (all) the kinds of deliverance of mind that are measureless, the unassailable deliverance of mind is pronounced the best. Now that

7. (As non-owning)? An insertion in the MS. The word translated means, both 'nothing' and 'non-owning'. See para. 36 below.

8. 'A making of limitations' could also be used as a translation.

unassailable deliverance of mind is void of lust, void of hate, and void of delusion.

36. 'Lust is an owning, hate is an owning, delusion is an owning. In a bhikkhu whose taints are exhausted, these are abandoned, made like a palm stump, done away with so that they are no more liable to future arising. Of (all) the kinds of deliverance of mind that are nothingness (as non-owning), the unassailable deliverance of mind is pronounced the best. Now the unassailable deliverance of mind is void of lust, void of hate, and void of delusion.

37. 'Lust is a making of signs, hate is a making of signs, delusion is a making of signs. In one whose taints are exhausted, these are abandoned, made like a palm stump, done away with so that they are no more liable to future arising. Of (all) the kinds of deliverance of mind that are signless, the unassailable deliverance of mind is pronounced the best. Now that unassailable deliverance of mind is void of lust, void of hate, and void of delusion.

'That is the way in which these dhammas are one in meaning and the letter is different.'

That is what the venerable Sāriputta said. The venerable Mahā Kottita was satisfied, and he delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words.

Notes

paras. 5. and 9. It is plain from para. 30 that the expression *nānākaraṇa* simply means 'difference between' (lit. 'making a difference').

para. 21. See DhsA. p. 71: 'Etesaṃ hi rūpārammaṇāḍini gocaravisayo nāma tāni manena panānubhaviyamānāni pi rūpārammaṇāḍini. yevā ti atthi siddho'

paras. 21-25. On the faculties, etc. All this must be regarded as describing faculties, etc., seen in, and predicated of *someone else*, i.e. externally, excluding the more purely subjective viewpoint of the saḷāyatana (six sense bases).

para. 21. *pacānubhoti*—exploits for its being: of. Sutta 49, paras. 14f; '*ananubhūtam*—is not co-essential with'. (Passage repeated at S.v, 217-8).

'*kimpatisaraṇā*—what is their homing-place?'; The word '*saraṇa*' (see e.g. Sutta 4, para. 37) has been rendered by 'refuge'. '*Paṭisaraṇa*', however, is better rendered by 'homing-place', in the sense of 'that to which things flow back' (cf. *Paṭisota*—upstream) or 'sourcing from' (cf. use at Sutta 46, para. 3 and at S, the tree where birds return to roost). It is thus opposed in a sense to *samosaraṇa* (confluence) as e.g. '*vedana-samosaraṇa sabbe dhammā*—all dhamma meet in feeling': A., and in the sense that craving and feeling are confluent, as joining streams are.

This connects the word *paṭisaraṇa* here with *sarati*—'to flow'; but possibly there is also a connexion with *sarati*—'to remember', as well.

Culavedalla Sutta

Questions and

Answers-2

Introduction

In this Sutta there is a discussion between the bhikkhuni Dhamma-dinnā, an Arahant, and her former husband, the lay disciple Visākha who was a Non-returner. As in Sutta 43, the topics discussed being with well known facts, but there is a difference in quality of knowing between that layman clad in white seated in front of the bhikkhuni in yellow robes, and ourselves. If they talked about “embodiment” (=five aggregates, khandha), then they knew from personal experience, or direct knowledge, what those aggregates were, their arising, cessation and the Path thereto. But in our case, unless we have practised vigorously, with a good Teacher, for a long time, it is unlikely that we know much about this subject, apart from what can be gathered from books. The danger of this is that having studied, become learned in the Vinaya (Discipline) and the Sutta (Discourses) we then think that we know it all. We are able to give learned talks upon Dhamma and cite all sorts of quotations, yet all that is the Buddha’s Dhamma, it is not our Dhamma. Learning Dhamma is a good thing only if it goes hand-in-hand with practice but if it is learning isolated from practice then it becomes a danger to oneself. Just as the Buddha says: ‘A snake grasped by the middle or the tail is dangerous, twisting round it bites the arm or body of the person holding it. Why? Because it is wrongly grasped?’ In the same way the unwise person grasps Dhamma for fame or gain and so gets himself into much suffering. But with people like the Arahant bhikkhuni of this Sutta the Buddha was satisfied, for she had grasped Dhamma rightly.

The Sutta (44)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the Squirrels' Sanctuary.

Then the lay follower Visākha went to the bhikkhuni Dhammadinnā, and after paying homage to her, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he asked:

(Embodiment)**2. 'Lady, "Embodiment, embodiment" is said. What is called embodiment by the Blessed One?'**

'Friend Visākha, these five aggregates affected by clinging are called embodiment by the Blessed One, that is to say: the form aggregate affected by clinging, the feeling aggregate affected by clinging, the perception aggregate affected by clinging, the formations aggregate affected by clinging, the consciousness aggregate affected by clinging. These five aggregates affected by clinging are called embodiment by the Blessed One.'

Saying 'Good, lady', the lay follower Visākha delighted in the bhikkhuni Dhammadinnā's words, and after agreeing, he asked her a further question:

3. 'Lady, "Origin of embodiment, origin of embodiment" is said. What is called the origin of embodiment by the Blessed One?'

'Friend Visākha, it is that craving which renews being and accompanied by delight and lust, it delights in this and that, that is to say: craving for sensual desires, craving for being, craving for non-being. This is called the origin of embodiment by the Blessed One.'

4. 'Lady, "Cessation of embodiment, cessation of embodiment" is said. What is called the cessation of embodiment by the Blessed One?'

'Friend Visākha, it is the remainderless fading and ceasing, the giving up, relinquishing, letting go and rejecting, of that same craving. This is called cessation of embodiment by the Blessed One.'

5. 'Lady, "The way leading to the cessation of embodiment, the way leading to the cessation of embodiment" is said. What is called the way

leading to the cessation of embodiment by the Blessed One?’

‘Friend Visākha, it is this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say: right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.’

6. ‘Lady, is that clinging the same as these five aggregates affected by clinging, or is the clinging something apart from these five aggregates affected by clinging?’

‘Friend Visākha, that clinging is neither the same as these five aggregates affected by clinging nor is it something apart from these five aggregates affected by clinging. It is the desire and lust comprised in these five aggregates affected by clinging that is the clinging there.’

(The Embodiment View)

7. ‘Lady, how does there come to be the embodiment view?’

‘Here, friend Visākha, the untaught ordinary man who has no regard for the Noble Ones and is unacquainted with their Dhamma and undisciplined in it, who has no regard for True Men and is unacquainted with their Dhamma and undisciplined in it, sees form as self, or self as possessed of form, or form in self, or self in form. He sees feeling as self, or self as possessed of feeling, or feeling in self, or self in feeling. He sees perception as self, or self as possessed of perception, or perception in self, or self in perception. He sees formations as self, or self as possessed of formations, or formations in self, or self in formations. He sees consciousness as self, or self as possessed of consciousness or consciousness in self, or self in consciousness. That is how there comes to be the embodiment view.’

8. ‘Lady, how does there not come to be the embodiment view?’

‘Here friend Visākha, the well-taught Noble disciple who has regard for Noble Ones and is acquainted with their Dhamma and disciplined in it, who has regard for True Men and is acquainted with their Dhamma and disciplined in it, does not see form as self, or self as possessed of form, or form in self, or self in form. He does not see feeling as self, or self as possessed of feeling, or feeling in self, or self in feeling. He does not see perception as self or self as possessed of perception, or perception in self, or self in perception. He does not see formations as self,

or self as possessed of formations, or formations in self, or self in formations. He does not see consciousness as self, or self as possessed of consciousness, or consciousness in self, or self in consciousness. That is how there does not come to be the embodiment view.'

(The Eightfold Path)

9. 'Lady, what is the Noble Eightfold Path?'

'Friend Visākha, it is just this Noble Eightfold Path, namely: right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.'

10. 'Lady, is the Noble Eightfold Path conditioned or unconditioned¹?'

'Friend Visākha, the Noble Eightfold Path is conditioned.'

11. 'Are the three groups included by the Noble Eightfold Path, lady, or is the Noble Eightfold Path included by the three groups?'

'The three groups are not included by the Noble Eightfold Path, friend Visākha, but the Noble Eightfold Path is included by the three groups. Any right speech, any right action, any right livelihood: these dhammas are included in the Virtue group. Any right effort, any right mindfulness, any right concentration: these dhammas are included in the Concentration group. Any right view, any right intention: these dhammas are included in the Understanding group.'

(Concentration)

12. 'What is concentration, lady, what is the sign of concentration, what is the equipment of concentration, what is the development of concentration?'

'Any unification of mind is concentration, friend Visākha; the four foundations of mindfulness are the sign of concentration; the four right endeavours are the equipment of concentration; the repetition, development, and cultivation of those same dhammas are the development of concentration therein.'

1. 'Sankhata' or 'asankhata.' All internal and external (eye and forms, ear and sounds ... etc.) phenomena are conditioned. Only Nibbāna is unconditioned.

(Processes)

13. 'How, many processes² are there, lady?'

'There are these three processes, friend Visākha: bodily process, verbal process, and mental process.'

14. 'But, lady, what is a bodily process, what is a verbal process, what is a mental process?'

'In-breaths and out-breaths are a bodily process, friend Visākha, thinking and exploring³ are a verbal process, perception and feeling are a mental process.'

15. 'But, why are in-breaths and out-breaths a bodily process, lady, why are thinking and exploring a verbal process, why are perception and feeling a mental process?'

'Friend Visākha, in-breaths and out-breaths belong to a body; these are dhammas bound up with a body, that is why in-breaths and out-breaths are a bodily process. Having previously thought and explored, subsequently one breaks into speech, that is why thinking and exploring are a verbal process. Perception and feeling belong to mind; these are dhammas bound up with mind, that is why perception and feeling are a mental process.'

(Cessation Attainment)

16. 'Lady, how does there come to be the attainment of the cessation of perception and feeling?'

'Friend Visākha, when a bhikkhu is attaining cessation of perception and feeling, it does not (occur) to him: "I shall attain the cessation of perception and feeling" or "I am attaining the cessation of perception and feeling" or "I have attained the cessation of perception and feeling"; but rather his mind has previously been developed in such wise that it induces that state.'

17. 'Lady, when a bhikkhu is attaining the cessation of perception and feeling, which dhammas come first in him: the bodily process or the verbal process or the mental process?'

2. Sankhāra is usually rendered by formations in this book.

3. 'Thinking and exploring' vitakka-vicāra is usually rendered, where jhāna is discussed as 'initial and sustained application'.

'Friend Visākha, when a bhikkhu is attaining the cessation of perception and feeling, first his verbal process ceases, then his bodily process, then his mental process.'

18. 'Lady, how does there come to be emergence from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling?'

'Friend Visākha, when a bhikkhu is emerging from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling, it does not (occur) to him: "I shall emerge from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling" or "I am emerging from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling" or "I have emerged from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling"; but rather his mind has previously been developed in such wise that it induces that state.'

19. 'Lady, when a bhikkhu is emerging from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling, which dhammas arise first in him: the bodily process or the verbal process or the mental process?'

'Friend Visākha, when a bhikkhu is emerging from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling, first his mental process arises, then his bodily process, then his verbal process.'

20. 'Lady, when a bhikkhu has emerged from attainment of cessation of perception and feeling, how many kinds of contact touch him?'

'Friend Visākha, when a bhikkhu has emerged from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling, three kinds of contact touch him: void contact, signless contact and desireless contact.'

21. 'Lady, when a bhikkhu has emerged from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling, to what does his mind incline, lean and tend?'

'Friend Visākha, when a bhikkhu has emerged from the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling, his mind inclines, leans and tends to seculsion.'

(Feeling)

22. 'Lady, how many kinds of feeling are there?'

'Friend Visākha, there are three kinds of feeling: pleasant feeling, painful feeling, neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling.'

23. 'But, lady, what is pleasant feeling, what is painful feeling, what is neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling?'

'Friend Visākha, whatever is bodily or mentally felt as pleasant and gratifying is pleasant feeling. Whatever is bodily or mentally felt as painful and hurting is painful feeling. Whatever is bodily or mentally felt as neither gratifying nor hurting is neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling.'

24. 'Lady, what is pleasant feeling pleasant in virtue of and painful in virtue of? What is painful feeling painful in virtue of and pleasant in virtue of? What is neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling pleasant in virtue of and painful in virtue of?'

'Friend Visākha, pleasant feeling is pleasant in virtue of presence and painful in virtue of change. Painful feeling is painful in virtue of presence and pleasant in virtue of change. Neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling is pleasant in virtue of knowledge (of it) and painful in virtue of want of knowledge (of it).'

(Underlying Tendency)

25. 'Lady, the underlying tendency to what underlies in the case of pleasant feeling? The underlying tendency to what underlies in the case of painful feeling? The underlying tendency to what underlies in the case of neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling?'

'Friend Visākha, the underlying tendency to lust underlies in the case of pleasant feeling. The underlying tendency to resistance underlies in the case of painful feeling. The underlying tendency to ignorance underlies in the case of neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling.'

26. 'Lady, does the underlying tendency to lust underlie in the case of all pleasant feeling? Does the underlying tendency to resistance underlie in the case of all painful feeling? Does the underlying tendency to ignorance underlie in the case of all neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling?'

'Friend Visākha, the underlying tendency to lust does not underlie in the case of all pleasant feeling. The underlying tendency to resistance does not underlie in the case of all painful feeling. The underlying tendency of ignorance does not underlie in the case of all neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling.'

27. 'Lady, what is abandonable in the case of pleasant feeling? What is abandonable in the case of painful feeling? What is abandonable in the case of neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling?'

'Friend Visākha, the underlying tendency to lust is abandonable in the case of pleasant feeling. The underlying tendency to resistance is abandonable in the case of painful feeling. The underlying tendency to ignorance is abandonable in the case of neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling.'

28. 'Lady, is the underlying tendency to lust (there and) abandonable in the case of all pleasant feeling? Is the underlying tendency to resistance (there and) abandonable in the case of all painful feeling? Is the underlying tendency to ignorance (there and) abandonable in the case of all neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling?'

'Friend Visākha, it is not in the case of all pleasant feeling that the underlying tendency to lust is there (and so) abandonable, it is not in the case of all painful feeling that the underlying tendency to resistance is there (and so) abandonable, it is not in the case of all neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling that the underlying tendency to ignorance is there (and so) abandonable.

'Here, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the first jhāna, which is accompanied by initial application and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of seclusion: with that he abandons lust, and no underlying tendency to lust underlies that.

'Here a bhikkhu considers thus: "When shall I enter upon and abide in that base which Noble Ones now enter upon and abide in", and as he builds up love for the supreme liberations in this way, grief arises with that love as its condition: with that he abandons resistance, and no underlying tendency to resistance underlies that,

'Here with the abandoning of pleasure and pain and with the previous disappearance of mental joy and grief, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the fourth jhāna which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity: with that he abandons ignorance, and the underlying tendency to ignorance does not underlie that.'

(Counterparts)

29. 'What is a counterpart of pleasant feeling, lady?'

'Friend Visākha, painful feeling is a counterpart of pleasant feeling.'

'What is a counterpart of painful feeling, lady?'

'Friend Visākha, pleasant feeling is a counterpart of painful feeling.'

'What is a counterpart of neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, lady?'

'Friend Visākha, ignorance is a counterpart of neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling.'

'What is a counterpart of ignorance, lady?'

'Friend Visākha, true knowledge is a counterpart of ignorance.'

'What is a counterpart of true knowledge, lady?'

'Friend Visākha, deliverance is a counterpart of true knowledge.'

'What is a counterpart of deliverance, lady?'

'Friend Visākha, Nibbāna is a counterpart of deliverance.'

'What is a counterpart of Nibbāna, lady?'

'Friend Visākha, you have pushed this line of questioning too far. You cannot find a conclusion to this line of questioning; for it is the life divine that merges in Nibbāna, leads to Nibbāna. If you like, you may go to the Blessed One and ask him the meaning of this. As he answers, so you should remember it.'

(Conclusion)

30. Then the lay follower Visākha delighted in the bhikkhuni Dhammadinnā's words, and after agreeing, he rose from his seat, and after paying homage keeping her on his right, he (departed and) went to the Blessed One. After paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he recounted to the Blessed One all his conversation with the bhikkhuni Dhammadinnā. When this was said, the Blessed One told him:

31. 'The bhikkhuni Dhammadinnā is wise, Visākha, the bhikkhuni Dhammadinnā has great understanding. Had you asked me the meaning of this, I should have given you the same reply. As the bhikkhuni Dhammadinnā has answered you, such is the meaning, and so you should remember it.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The lay follower Visākha was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 15. *vācam bhindati*—breaks into speech: this idiom and meaning of *bhindati* not in P.T.S. Dict. (but see under *vāca*).

para. 23. Cf. S. xxxvi, 20: “na kho āvuso bhagavā sukhaṃ yeva vedanaṃ sandhāya sukhasmiṃ paññāpeti. Yattha yattha āvuso sukhaṃ upalabbhati, yamhi yamhi sukhaṃ taṃ taṃ Tathāgato sukhasmiṃ paññāpeti. (S. iv, 229). (With regard to pleasure arisen through a pleasurable object.) “The Blessed One does not only declare as pleasure pleasurable feeling but wherever pleasure obtains in every instance the Tathāgata has declared it as comprised in pleasure.” (As for instance in the relief of pain which is felt as pleasurable).

para. 24. (Among Ven. Nyānamoli’s papers there is this translation of the Sub-commentary to Majjhima-nikāya (MAA. ii, 294-5) on the second half of para 24):

“*Thitisukhā*: pleasant owing to presence, owing to persistence not merely owing to the presence-moment, hence he said ‘*Its being there is pleasant*.’ *Vipariṇāmadukkhā*: unpleasant owing to its changing, owing to its departing, not owing to the (mere) cessation-moment, hence he said ‘*Its not being there is unpleasant*’; for the stopping of pleasant feeling appears unpleasant to those who do not fully know the facts. This meaning should be illustrated by “dissociation from the loved.” *Thitidukkhā vipariṇāmasukhā*: the same method applies here too, hence he said ‘*Its being there is unpleasant . . . its not being there is pleasant*’; for the stopping of unpleasant feeling appears to beings as pleasure, since they say thus ‘Oh what pleasure is born from the curing of that sickness!’

The state of knowing is awareness according to true individual essence; for when someone knows neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, he has pleasure because of its subtleness, just as the awareness of dhammas other than that according to their specific and general characteristics is the highest pleasure on which account it is said “Whenever a man comprehends the aggregates’ rise and fall, he finds there happiness and joy; that knowledge is deathlessness.” (Dh. 374). *The state of not-knowing* should be understood in the opposite sense here; for abiding in delusion is unpleasant.

Another method: *the state of knowing* is the presence of knowing, of knowledge; for the neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling that is associated with knowledge and a support for knowledge is pleasant with a desirable aspect, according as it is said "desirable and desirable is its fruit". *The state of not-knowing is unpleasant* should be understood in the opposite sense.

Mahapunnama Sutta

The Full Moon-I

Introduction

On the Uposatha days of the New and Full Moons, from the Buddha time to the present day, bhikkhus, nuns and lay people have gathered to listen to the Dhamma, discuss it and engage in more intensive practice of it. Here is a Sutta of question and answer type delivered by the Buddha surrounded by many bhikkhus and probably lay people as well.

The topic here is one which can lead to liberation if heard with a pure and concentrated mind: the five aggregates, the clinging in them, how self (or soul) is conceived of with these aggregates as the basis, and the gratification, danger and escape in each of the aggregates. So the Sutta is all about various aspects of Anattā or not-self.

In that assembly there was a bhikkhu who was too clever and managed, after hearing such teaching, to think a thought like this: "The aggregates, it seems, are not self. Then what self will the kmmas done by the not self affect?" Instead of letting go of the aggregates while the Buddha was speaking, this foolish bhikkhu clung to his confusion.

Having the idea of self, one makes kamma. When there is no idea of self, since aggregates are seen as empty of self, no kamma can be made. This bhikkhu has ordinary conventional understanding with a mere intellectual idea of not self and has compounded out of it such a confused question.

In the presence of the Buddha and even when with great Teachers of present-day Buddhism, it is not safe to think conceited thoughts. One cannot get away with it. One's skull (or one's heart) has no secrets for them.

Sixty bhikkhus became Arahants when they had listened intently to this discourse. It is doubtful whether that 'clever' bhikkhu was among them!

The Sutta (109)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvattthi in the Palace of Migāra's mother, the Eastern Park.

2. Now on that occasion it was the Uposatha day of the fifteenth on the night when the moon was full¹ and the Blessed One was seated in the open surrounded by the Sangha of bhikkhus.

3. Then a certain bhikkhu rose from his seat, and arranging his robe on one shoulder, he raised his hands palms together towards the Blessed One, and he said: 'Venerable sir, I would ask the Blessed One a question if the Blessed One would grant me an answer to the question.'

'Sit on your own seat, bhikkhu, and ask what you like.'

So the bhikkhu sat on his own seat, and he said to the Blessed One:

4. 'There are, venerable sir, are there not, these five aggregates (affected by) clinging, that is to say, the form aggregate (affected by) clinging, the feeling aggregate (affected by) clinging, the perception aggregate (affected by) clinging, the formations aggregate (affected by) clinging, the consciousness aggregate (affected by) clinging?'

'There are, bhikkhu, these five aggregates (affected by) clinging, that is to say ... the consciousness aggregate (affected by) clinging.'

Saying, 'Good, venerable sir,' the bhikkhu was satisfied and he delighted in the Blessed One's words. Then he asked him a further question:

5. 'But, venerable sir, what do these five aggregates (affected by) clinging have as their root?'

'These five aggregates (affected by) clinging, bhikkhu, have desire as their root.'

6. 'Venerable sir, is that clinging the same as these five aggregates (affected by) clinging, or is the clinging something apart from these five aggregates (affected by) clinging?'

'Bhikkhu, that clinging is neither the same as these five aggregates (affected by) clinging, nor is it something apart from these five aggre-

1. The full moon falls on the last day, the fifteenth, of the bright half of the lunar month when the moon is waxing.

gates (affected by) clinging. It is the desire and lust comprised in these five aggregates (affected by) clinging that is the clinging there.'

7. 'But, venerable sir, might there be particular diversity in the desire and lust comprised in these five aggregates (affected by) clinging?'

'There might be, bhikkhu,' the Blessed One said. 'Here, bhikkhu, someone thinks thus: "May my form be such in the future. May my feeling be such in the future. May my perception be such in the future. May my formations be such in the future. May my consciousness be such in the future." Thus, bhikkhu, there is particular diversity in the desire and lust comprised in these five aggregates (affected by) clinging.'

8. 'But, venerable sir, in what way is "aggregate" a term for the aggregates?'

'Any kind of form whatever, whether past, future or present, in oneself or external, gross or subtle, inferior or superior, far or near—that is the form aggregate.

'Any kind of feeling ...

'Any kind of perception ...

'Any kind of formation ...

'Any kind of consciousness whatever, whether past, future or present in oneself or external, gross or subtle, inferior or superior, far or near—this is the consciousness aggregate.

'It is in this way that "aggregate" is a term for the aggregates.'

9. 'What is the reason, venerable sir, what is the condition, for describing the form aggregate? ... the feeling aggregate? ... the perception aggregate? ... the formations aggregate? What is the reason, what is the condition for describing the consciousness aggregate?'

'The four great primary elements are the reason, bhikkhu, the four great primary elements are the condition, for describing the form aggregate.

'Contact is the reason, contact is the condition, for describing the feeling aggregate.

'Contact is the reason, contact is the condition, for describing the perception aggregate.

'Contact is the reason, contact is the condition, for describing the formations aggregate.

'Name-and-form is the reason, name-and-form is the condition for describing the consciousness aggregate.'

10. 'But, venerable sir, how does there come to be the embodiment-view?'

'Here, bhikkhu, an untaught ordinary man... (as in Sutta 44, para. 7)... or self in consciousness. That is how there comes to be the embodiment-view.'

11. 'But, venerable sir, how does there not come to be the embodiment-view?'

'Here, bhikkhu, a well taught noble disciple... (as in Sutta 44, para. 8)... or self in consciousness. That is how there does not come to be the embodiment-view.'

12. 'What, venerable sir, is the gratification, what is the danger, what is the escape,² in the case of form?... in the case of feeling?... in the case of perception?... in the case of formations? What is the gratification, what is the danger, what is the escape, in the case of consciousness?'

'The (bodily) pleasure and (mental) joy, bhikkhu, that arise in dependence on form—this is the gratification in the case of form. Form is impermanent, painful, and subject to change—this is the danger in the case of form. The removal of desire and lust, the abandonment of desire and lust, for form—this is the escape in the case of form.

'The (bodily) pleasure and (mental) joy that arise in dependence on feeling...

'... in dependence on perception...

'... in dependence on formations...

'... in dependence on consciousness... this is the escape in the case of consciousness.'

13. 'But venerable sir, how does a man know, how does he see, that there come to be in him no underlying tendencies to conceive this body with its consciousness and all external signs in terms of "I" and "mine"?'
'Any kind of form whatever, whether past, future or present, in one-

2. For this theme see Sutta 13.

self or external, gross or subtle, inferior (already abandoned) or superior (a superior goal), far or near, he sees all of it with right understanding as it is, thus: "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self."

'Any kind of feeling whatever ...

'Any kind of perception whatever ...

'Any kind of formations whatever ...

'Any kind of consciousness whatever ... "This is not myself."

'It is when a man knows thus, bhikkhu, sees thus, that there comes to be in him no underlying tendencies to conceive this body with its consciousness and all external signs in terms of "I" and "mine".'

14. Then in a certain bhikkhu's mind this thought arose: "So, it seems, form is not self, feeling is not self, perception is not self, formations are not self, consciousness is not self. Then what self will the kammas done by the not-self touch?'"³

Then the Blessed One knew in his mind the thought in that bhikkhu's mind, and he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'It is possible, bhikkhus, that some misguided man unknowing and ignorant, with his mind dominated by craving, might fancy that he could outstrip the Master's teaching thus: "So, it seems, form is not self ... then what self will kammas done by the not-self touch?" Now, bhikkhus, you have been trained by me in dependent (conditionality) in various instances.

15. 'Bhikkhus, how do you conceive this, is form permanent or impermanent?'

'Impermanent, venerable sir.'

'But is what is impermanent painful or pleasant?'

'Painful, venerable sir.'

'But is what is impermanent, painful and subject to change fit to be regarded thus: "This is mine, this is I, this is myself?"'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Bhikkhus, how do you conceive this, is feeling permanent ...

'... perception ...

'... formations ...

'... consciousness ...'

3. By 'touch' here one should understand 'affect'.

'No, venerable sir.'

16. 'Therefore, bhikkhus, any kind of form whatever, whether past . . . far or near, (in fact) all form should be seen as it is with right understanding thus: "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self."

'Any kind of feeling . . . perception . . . formations . . . consciousness . . . " . . . not my self."

17. 'When he sees thus, the well taught noble disciple becomes dispassionate towards form, becomes dispassionate towards feeling, becomes dispassionate towards perception, becomes dispassionate towards formations, becomes dispassionate towards consciousness.

18. 'Being dispassionate, his greed fades; with the fading of greed he is liberated; when he is liberated, there comes the knowledge: "It is liberated". He understands: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done. There is no more of this to come."

This is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

But while this discourse was being spoken, the minds of as many as sixty bhikkhus were liberated from taints by not clinging.

Notes

This Sutta is the same as S. xxii, no 82.

para. 4. The formula at the end of this para. is repeated before each following question in S. xxii. 82.

para. 9. *nāmarūpa* as condition for *viññāṇa*: cf. the four *viññāṇatthiti* at S. xxii, 54 (=D. 33).

para. 14. '*paṭiccavinitā kho me tumhe*—trained by me in conditionality' is not commented on in either *Papañcasūdanī* (M. Comy.) or *Sāraṭṭhapakāsini* (S. Comy.) The reference is probably to M. 38 (M. vol. i, 259-260) and similar teachings.

Mahahatthipadopama Sutta

The Simile of the Elephant's Footprint-2

Introduction

From the analysis at the beginning of this Sutta: Four Noble Truths, the Noble Truth of Suffering, the five aggregates affected by clinging, the form aggregate affected by clinging, the four great primary elements, one would look for a very long Sutta indeed, but in fact, the other three Noble Truths; the treatment of dukkha apart from the aggregates, and the last four aggregates, are not dealt with here. (Though the treatment of these topics could have been lost). The Sutta as we have it centres upon the four great primary elements and how through calm and insight meditations they should be regarded so that desire for them is abandoned. It is this body that is composed of earth, water, fire and air elements and which one clings to as me and mine, not seeing the impermanent state of those elements at all. Clinging can persist because the body is seen as 'all-of-a-lump', a oneness which is a 'me-ness'. Hence the need to analyze that oneness and to see that there is really no owner sitting inside, for there is no owner in the impermanent and conditioned mind either. But this analysis cannot be effective at the ordinary level of intellectual thought. Not-self will only be penetrated through meditative practice, both of calm and insight.

Venerable Sāriputta Thera's opening words on the simile of the elephant's footprint are worth remembering and frequently turning over in one's mind. A profound statement!

The Sutta (28)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park. There the venerable Sāriputta addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Friends, bhikkhus.'

'Friend,' they replied. The venerable Sāriputta said this:

2. 'Friends, just as the footprint of any living being that walks can be placed within an elephant's footprint, and so the elephant's footprint is declared the chief of them because of its great size, so too, whatever profitable dhammas there are can all be included in the Four Noble Truths. In what four?

3. 'In the Noble Truth of Suffering, in the Noble Truth of the Origin of Suffering, in the Noble Truth of the Cessation of Suffering, and in the Noble Truth of the Way leading to the Cessation of Suffering.

4. 'And what is the Noble Truth of Suffering? Birth is suffering, ageing is suffering, death is suffering; sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair are suffering; not to get what one wants is suffering; in short the five aggregates affected by clinging are suffering.

5. 'And what are the five aggregates affected by clinging? They are: the form aggregate affected by clinging, the feeling aggregate affected by clinging, the perception aggregate affected by clinging, the formations aggregate affected by clinging, the consciousness aggregate affected by clinging.

6. 'And what is the form aggregate affected by clinging? It is the four great primary elements and any form derived from them.

7. 'And what are the four great primary elements? They are the earth element, the water element, the fire element and the air element.

(Earth)

8. 'And what is the earth element? The earth element can be either in oneself or external.

'What is the earth element in oneself? Whatever in oneself, belonging

to oneself, is solid, solidified and clung-to, that is to say, head-hair, body-hair, nails, teeth, skin, flesh, sinews, bones, bone-marrow, kidneys, heart, liver, midriff, spleen, lights, bowels, entrails, gorge, dung, or whatever else in oneself, belonging to oneself, that is solid, solidified and clung-to: this is called earth element in oneself.

'Now earth element in oneself and external earth element are simply earth element. And that should be seen as it actually is with right understanding thus: "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self." When a man sees it with right understanding as it actually is thus, he becomes dispassionate towards the earth element, and he fades lust for the earth element out of his mind.

9. 'Now there is the occasion when the external earth¹ element is disturbed and then the external earth element vanishes.

10. 'For even this external earth element, great as it is, is describable as impermanent, as subject to destruction, as subject to disappearance, as subject to change, so what of this body, which is clung to by craving and lasts but a while? There can be no (considering) that as "I" or "mine" or "am".

11. 'So then, (having seen this element as it actually is, thus,) if others abuse and scold, curse and threaten a bhikkhu, he understands thus: "This painful feeling born of ear contact has arisen in me. That is dependent, not independent. Dependent on what? Dependent on contact." Then he sees that contact is impermanent, that feeling is impermanent, that perception is impermanent, that formations are impermanent, and that consciousness is impermanent. And his mind, which has already made an element (constituent of the form aggregate) its objective support, enters into that (new objective support now contemplated) and acquires confidence, steadiness and decision.

12. 'Now if others attack that bhikkhu with unwished-for, undesired and disagreeable contact of fists, clods, sticks or knives, he understands thus: "This body is a thing such that contact with fists, clods, sticks and knives takes place in it. But this has been said by the Blessed One in

1. Many texts have 'external water element' here and Comy explains world-destruction which can be by water (or fire or wind) but not by earth.

his discourse on the Simile of the Saw:² "Even if bandits savagely severed limb from limb with a two-handed saw, he who entertained hate in his heart on that account would not be one who carried out my teaching." So tireless energy shall be aroused in me and unremitting mindfulness established, my body shall be tranquil and unexcited, my mind shall be concentrated and unified. And now let contact with fists, clods, sticks and knives take place in this body; for this is just how the Buddha's message is put into effect.'

13. 'If, when he thus recollects the Buddha, Dhamma and Sangha, equanimity does not persist in him with the profitable as its support, then he arouses a sense of urgency thus: "It is loss for me, it is no gain for me, it is bad for me, it is no good for me, that when I recollect the Buddha, Dhamma and Sangha thus, equanimity does not persist in me with the profitable as its support." Just as when a daughter-in-law sees her father-in-law, she has a sense of urgency, so too, if a bhikkhu . . . profitable as its support.

14. 'But if when a bhikkhu recollects the Buddha, Dhamma and Sangha thus, equanimity becomes established in him with what is profitable as its support, then he is satisfied. And at that point, friends, much has been done by the bhikkhus.

(Water)

15. 'What is the water element? The water element can be either in oneself or external.

'What is the water element in oneself?

'Whatever in oneself, belonging to oneself, is water, watery, and clung-to, that is to say, bile, phlegm, pus, blood, sweat, fat, tears, grease, spittle, snot, oil-of-the-joints, urine, or whatever else in oneself, belonging to oneself, is water, watery, and clung-to: this is called water element in oneself.

'Now water element in oneself and external water element are simply water element. That should be seen with right understanding as it actually is thus: "This is not mine, this not I, this is not my self." When a man sees it thus with right understanding as it actually is, he

2. See Sutta 21, para. 25.

becomes dispassionate towards the water element, he fades lust for the water element out of his mind.

16. 'Now there is an occasion when the water element is disturbed. It carries away village, town, city, district and country. There is an occasion when the waters in the great ocean sink down a hundred leagues, two hundred leagues . . . seven hundred leagues. There is an occasion when the water in the great ocean stands seven palm trees deep, six palm trees deep . . . two palm trees deep, only a palm tree deep. There is an occasion when the waters in the great ocean stand seven fathoms deep, six . . . only a fathom deep. There is an occasion when the waters in the great ocean stand half fathom deep, only waist deep, only knee deep, only ankle deep. There is an occasion when the waters in the great ocean are not enough to wet even the joint of a finger.

17. 'For even this external water element, great as it is, is describable as impermanent, as subject to destruction, as subject to disappearance, as subject to change, so what of this body which is clung to by craving and lasts but a while? There can be no (considering) that as "I" or "mine" or "am".

18-21. 'So then, (having seen this element as it actually is, thus), if others abuse . . . (repeat paras. 11-14) . . . much has been done by that bhikkhu.

(Fire)

22. 'What is the fire element? The fire element can either be in oneself or external.

'And what is the fire element in oneself?

'Whatever in oneself, belonging to oneself, is fire, fiery, and clung-to, that is to say, that whereby one is warmed, ages, and is consumed, and that whereby what is eaten, drunk, chewed and tasted gets completely digested, or whatever else in oneself, belonging to oneself, is fire, fiery, and clung-to: this is called fire element in oneself.

'Now fire element in oneself and external fire element are simply fire element. That should be seen with right understanding as it actually is thus: "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self." When a man sees it thus with right understanding as it actually is, he becomes dispassionate towards the fire element, he fades lust for the fire element

out of his mind.

23. 'There is an occasion when the external fire element is disturbed. It burns up village, town, city, district and country. It only goes out when it comes to green grass, or to a road, or to a rock, or to water or a fair open space, for want of fuel. There is an occasion when they seek to make a fire even with fowls' claws and hide-parings.

24. 'For even this external fire element, great as it is, is describable as impermanent, as subject to destruction, as subject to disappearance, as subject to change, so what of this body, which is clung-to by craving and lasts but a while? There can be no (considering) that as "I" or "mine" or "am".

25-28. 'So then, (having seen this element as it actually is, thus) if others abuse (repeat paras. 11-14)... much has been done by that bhikkhu.

(Air)

29. 'What is the air element? The air element can either be in oneself or external.

'What is the air element in oneself?

'Whatever in oneself, belonging to oneself, is air, airy, and clung-to, that is to say, up-going winds (forces), down-going winds (forces), winds (forces) in the belly, winds (forces) in the bowels, winds (forces) that pervade all the limbs, in-breath and out-breath, or whatever else in oneself, belonging to oneself, is air, airy, and clung-to: this is called air element in oneself.

'Now air element in oneself and external air element are simply air element. And that should be seen as it actually is with right understanding thus: "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not myself." When a man sees it thus with right understanding as it actually is, he becomes dispassionate towards the air element, he fades lust for the air element out of his mind.

30. 'There is an occasion when the external air element is disturbed. It sweeps away village, town, city, district and country. There is an occasion in the last month of the hot season when they seek wind by

means of a fan or bellow's and even the strands of straw in the drip-fringe of the thatch do not stir.

31. 'For even this external air element, great as it is, is describable as impermanent, as subject to destruction, as subject to disappearance, as subject to change, so what of this body, which is clung-to and lasts but a while? There can be no (considering) that as "I" or "mine" or "am".

32-35. 'So then, (having seen this element as it actually is, thus,) if others abuse ... (repeat paras. 11-14) ... much has been done by the bhikkhu.

36. 'Just as when a space is enclosed by timber and creepers, grass and clay, there comes to be the term "house", so too, when a space is enclosed by bones and sinews, flesh and skin, there comes to be the term "form".

37. 'If the eye in oneself were intact but no external forms came to its threshold (of consciousness) and there were no appropriate (conscious) engagement, then there would be no manifestation of the appropriate class of consciousness. If the eye in oneself were intact and external forms came to its threshold but there were no appropriate (conscious) engagement, there would be no manifestation of the appropriate class of consciousness. But it is owing to the fact that the eye in oneself is intact and that external forms come to its threshold, and that there is the appropriate (conscious) engagement, that there is manifestation of the appropriate class of consciousness.

38. 'Whatever form of what has come to be thus,³ is included in the form aggregate affected by clinging. Whatever feeling of what has come to be thus, is included in the feeling aggregate affected by clinging. Whatever perception of what has come to be thus, is included in the perception aggregate affected by clinging. Whatever formations of what has come to be thus, are included in the formations aggregate affected by clinging. Whatever consciousness of what has come to be thus, is included in the consciousness aggregate affected by clinging.

'He understands thus: "This, it seems, is how there comes to be in-

3. Tathārūpassa: Comy. explains as the aggregates: feeling, perception, formations and consciousness.

clusion, gathering, amassing into these five aggregates affected by clinging. Now this has been said by the Blessed One: "He who sees dependent origination sees the Dhamma: he who sees the Dhamma sees dependent origination." And these five aggregates affected by clinging are dependently arisen. The wish for reliance on, approval or acceptance of, these five aggregates affected by clinging is the origin of suffering. The removal of wishing and lust, the abandoning of wishing and lust for them is the cessation of suffering. And at this point too, friends, much has been done by the bhikkhu.

39-40. 'If the ear in oneself were intact but no external sounds came to its threshold . . . (as in paras. 37-38) . . . much has been done by the bhikkhu.

41-42. If the nose in oneself were intact but no external smells came to its threshold . . . much has been done by the bhikkhu.

43-44. 'If the tongue in oneself were intact but no external flavours came to its threshold . . . much has been done by the bhikkhu.

45-46. 'If the body of oneself were intact but no external tangibles came to its threshold . . . much has been done by the bhikkhu.

47-48. 'If the mind in oneself were intact but no external dhammas came to its threshold . . . much has been done by the bhikkhu.'

That is what the venerable Sāriputta said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in his words.

Notes

para. 8. *khariḡata*—solidified: not in P.T.S. Dict.

upādinna—clung-to: given no Pitaka ref. in P.T.S. Dict. Repeated in Suttas 62 and 140.

para. 10. *matta-tṭhaka*—lasts but a while: *tṭhaka* is not in P.T.S. Dict. The word occurs at Vis. pp. 66 and 75 in the form *tatrattṭhaka* (that remains where it is).

para. 23. *daddula*—hide-parings: see Sutta 12, para. 45.

para. 30. *ossavane pi tiṇāni na icchanti*—even the straws (hanging) in the drip-fringe of the thatch do not stir: the sentence has been misread. The Sinhalese translation has been followed here.

vidhūpana—bellows: properly a 'fan for fanning a fire' (Comy).

icchati—to stir, to move: not in P.T.S. Dict., but see *aticchati*.

para. 37. *samannāhāra*—(conscious) engagement: apparently the only Sutta ref.

para. 38. *samavāya*—amassing: given no Piṭaka ref. in P.T.S. Dict.

Dhatuvibhanga Sutta

The Exposition of the Elements

Introduction

Both story and Dhamma in this Sutta are deeply [moving. We meet here the former King Pukkusāti who and ruled over Takkaṣilā (Taxila, now in Pakistan). This king, through merchants travelling to King Bimbisāra's realm, became very friendly with the latter. Though they had never met, yet King Pukkusāti sent a gift of priceless cloths to his friend contained in lacquered caskets. King Bimbisāra then considered what treasure he could send his friend. Considering that no treasure in his realm surpassed the Three Treasures—Buddha, Dhamma and Sangha, he sent an account of them inscribed on a golden plate (about five feet long and six inches broad by modern measures). This plate was enshrined in the inmost of several precious caskets and then taken in procession to King Bimbisāra's frontiers. In all the territories through which it passed, the kings paid their respects and safeguarded it. At last it reached King Pukkusāti and when he read this extraordinary treasure, he lost no time in abdicating his throne and setting off eastwards clad as a bhikkhu in search of his Teacher. He understood from his friend's 'plate' that the Buddha was in Rājagaha and though he passed through Sāvatti where the Buddha was then in residence, he did not enquire for him. At Rājagaha he learnt that the Buddha was in Sāvatti. However, the Buddha had used his heavenly eyesight and seen this course of events, knowing as well that Pukkusāti had not much longer to live. Out of his Great Compassion he walked the forty-five yojanas (leagues) to Rājagaha to meet him, and teach him Dhamma so that he became a Non-returner.

The Sutta (140)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was wandering by stages in the Magadhan country, and at length he arrived at Rājagaha where he went to the Bhaggava Potter and said to him:

2. 'If it is no inconvenience to you, Bhaggava, I will stay in your workshop for one night.'

'It is no inconvenience to me, venerable sir. But a homeless one has already taken up his abode there first. If he agrees, venerable sir, [then stay as long as you like.'

3. Now there was a clansman named Pukkusāti who had gone forth from home life into homelessness out of faith in the Blessed One. On that occasion he had already taken up his abode in the potter's workshop first. Then the Blessed One went to the venerable Pukkusāti and said to him: 'If it is no inconvenience to you, I, bhikkhu, will stay in the workshop for one night.'

'The potter's workshop is large enough, friend. Let the venerable one stay as long as he likes.'

4. Then the Blessed One went into the Potter's workshop, and after spreading out a grass mat at one end, he sat down, folded his legs crosswise, set his body erect, and established mindfulness in front of him: Then when the Blessed One spent much of the night seated, and also the venerable Pukkusāti spent much of the night seated, the Blessed One thought: 'This clansman's posture inspires confidence. What if I questioned him?' Then he asked the venerable Pukkusāti:

5. 'Under whom have you gone forth, bhikkhu? Who is your Teacher? Or whose Dhamma do you profess?'

'There is the monk Gotama, friend, a son of the Sakyans, who went forth from a Sakyan clan. Now a good report of that Blessed One Gotama has been spread to this effect: "That Blessed One is such since he is Arahant, Fully Enlightened, perfect in true knowledge and conduct, sublime, knower of worlds, incomparable leader of men to be tamed,

teacher of gods and men, enlightened, blessed." I have gone forth under the Blessed One and he is my Teacher. I profess the Dhamma of that Blessed One.'

'But, bhikkhu, where is that Blessed One, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, living now?'

'There is a city called Sāvatti, friend, in the North Country. The Blessed One, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, is living there now.'

'But, bhikkhu, have you seen that Blessed One? And would you recognize him if you saw him?'

'No, friend, I have not seen that Blessed One. I should not recognize him if I saw him.'

6. Then the Blessed One thought: 'This clansman has gone forth under me from the home life into homelessness. What if I taught him the Dhamma?' Then he addressed the venerable Pukkusāti thus:

7. 'Bhikkhu, I shall expound the Dhamma to you. Listen and heed well what I shall say.'

'Even so, friend, the venerable Pukkusāti replied. The Blessed One said this:

8. 'Bhikkhu, (1) this man, (who) has six elements, (2) six bases for contact, (3) and eighteen kinds of mental approach, (4) has four foundations (6) steadied whereon no more the tides of conceit occur in him, and when the tides of conceit occur in him no more, he is called a Hermit Stilled¹, (so) (5) let him (i) not neglect understanding, let him (ii) guard truth, let him (iii) intensify giving up and let him (iv) train only for peace. This is the summary of an exposition of the elements.

9. (1) "'Bhikkhu, this man has six elements": so it was said. And with reference to what was this said? There is the earth element, the water element, the fire element, the air element, the space element and the consciousness element. So it was with reference to this that it was said: "Bhikkhu, this man has six elements."

1. Lit: 'a wise man at peace'. Muni has the meanings of 'one who is silent' (meaning in the Dhamma, 'one who does not identify as self anything'), and 'one who has wisdom'. See Sutta 131.

10. (2) “‘Bhikkhu, this man has six bases for contact’”: so it was said. And with reference to what was it said? There is the eye-contact base, the ear-contact base, the nose-contact base, the tongue-contact base, the body-contact base, and the mind-contact base. So it was with reference to this that it was said: “‘Bhikkhu, this man has six bases for contact.’”

11. (3) “‘Bhikkhu, this man has eighteen kinds of mental approach’”: so it was said. And with reference to what was this said?

‘On seeing a form with the eye he approaches it as a form productive of joy, he approaches it as a form productive of grief, he approaches it as a form productive of equanimity.

‘On hearing a sound with the ear . . .

‘On smelling an odour with the nose . . .

‘On tasting a flavour with the tongue . . .

‘On touching a tangible with the body . . .

‘On cognizing a dhamma with the mind, he approaches it as a dhamma productive of joy, he approaches it as a dhamma productive of grief, he approaches it as a dhamma productive of equanimity.

‘Thus there are six kinds of approach with joy, six kinds of approach with grief, and six kinds of approach with equanimity.

‘So it was with reference to this that it was said: “‘Bhikkhu, this man has eighteen kind of mental approach.’”

12. (4) “‘Bhikkhu, this man has four foundations’”: so it was said. And with reference to what was this said? There is (i) the foundation of understanding, (ii) the foundation of truth, (iii) the foundation of giving up, and (iv) the foundation of peace. So it was with reference to this that it was said: “‘Bhikkhu, this man has four foundations.’”

13. (5) “‘(So) let him (i) not neglect understanding, let him (ii) guard truth, let him (iii) intensify giving up, and let him (iv) train only for peace’”: so it was said. And with reference to what was this said?

14. (i) ‘And how does a bhikkhu not neglect understanding? There are these six elements: the earth element, the water element, the fire element, the air element, the space element, and the consciousness element.

15. ‘And what is the earth element? The earth element can be either in oneself or external . . . (as in Sutta 28, para. 8) . . . he fades lust for the

earth element out of his mind.

16. 'And what is the water element? The water element can be either in oneself or external... (as in Sutta 28, para. 15)... he fades lust for the water element out of his mind.

17. 'And what is the fire element? The fire element can be either in oneself or external... (as in Sutta 28, para. 22)... he fades lust for the fire element out of his mind.

18. 'And what is the air element? The air element can be either in oneself or external... (as in Sutta 28, para. 29)... he fades lust for the air element out of his mind.

19. 'And what is the space element? The space element can be either in oneself or external. What is the space element in oneself? Whatever in oneself, belonging to oneself, is space, spacial and clung-to, that is to say, the ear-hole, the nose hole, the mouth door, and that (aperture) whereby what is eaten, drunk, chewed and tasted gets swallowed, and where what is eaten, drunk, chewed and tasted collects, and whereby what is eaten, drunk, chewed and tasted comes out from below, or whatever else in oneself, belonging to oneself, is space, spacial and clung-to: this is called space-element in oneself.

'Now space element in oneself and the external space element are simply space element. That should be seen with right understanding as it actually is thus: "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not myself." When a man sees it thus with right understanding as it actually is, he becomes dispassionate towards the space element and he fades lust for the space element out of his mind.

20. 'Then there remains only consciousness purified and bright. What does it cognize? It cognizes the pleasant, it cognizes the painful, it cognizes the neither-painful-nor-pleasant. Dependent on contact to be felt as pleasant there arises pleasant feeling. Feeling pleasant feeling, he understands "I feel pleasant feeling". With the cessation of that same contact to be felt as pleasant, what was appropriately felt, the pleasant feeling arisen dependent on the contact to be felt as pleasant, ceases (too): he understands "That is stilled". Dependent on contact to be felt as

painful there arises painful feeling. Feeling painful feeling, he understands "I feel painful feeling". With the cessation of that same contact to be felt as painful, what was appropriately felt, the painful feeling arisen dependent on the contact to be felt as painful, ceases (too): he understands "That is stilled". Dependent on contact to be felt as neither-painful-nor-pleasant there arises neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling. Feeling neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling he understands "I feel neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling". With the cessation of that same contact to be felt as neither-painful-nor-pleasant, what was appropriately felt, the neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling arisen dependent on the contact to be felt as neither-painful-nor-pleasant, ceases (too): he understands "That is stilled". Just as with the contact, the meeting of two (fire-) sticks, heat is generated and fire produced, and with the separation of those same two sticks, with their parting the appropriate heat ceases, is stilled, so too, dependent on contact to be felt as pleasant . . . to be felt as neither-painful-nor-pleasant ceases (too): he understands "That is stilled".

21. 'Then there remains only equanimity, purified and bright, wieldy, malleable and radiant. Suppose a skilled goldsmith or his apprentice prepared a furnace, and having done so, he heated up the crucible and having done that, he took gold with tongs and put it into the crucible, and he blew on it from time to time and sprinkled water on it from time to time and looked at it from time to time, then that gold became refined, properly refined, completely refined, faultless, rid of dross, wieldy, malleable and radiant; then whatever kind of ornament he wanted to work it into, whether a chain or a ring or a necklace or a gold fillet, it served his purpose; so too, there remains only equanimity, purified and bright, wieldy, malleable and radiant. He understands thus: "I might connect this equanimity that is thus pure and bright with the base consisting of infinite space, and I might develop a mind in accordance with that². And then this equanimity of mine would thus have that for its support, that to cling to, and (so) would last for a long time. I might connect this equanimity which is pure and bright with the base consisting of infinite consciousness . . . with the base consisting of nothingness . . . with the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception,

2. With the base consisting of infinite space.

and I might develop a mind in accordance with that, and then this equanimity of mine would thus have that for its support, that to cling to, and (so) would last for a long time." He understands thus: "I might connect this equanimity that is pure and bright with the base consisting of infinite space, and I might develop a mind in accordance with that, (nevertheless) that is conditioned (in scope). I might connect this equanimity that is pure and bright with the base consisting of infinite consciousness . . . with the base consisting of nothingness . . . with the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, and I might develop a mind in accordance with that, (nevertheless) that is conditioned (in scope)." He neither builds up (*kamma*) for being or non-being nor aims at them; he does not cling to anything in the world³. When he does not cling, he has no anxiety⁴. When he has no anxiety, he attains Nibbāna (actually) in himself. He understands: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come." If he feels a pleasant feeling, he understands: "That is impermanent", he understands: "It is not cleaved to", he understands: "It is not relished". If he feels a painful feeling, he understands: "That is impermanent", he understands: "It is not cleaved to", he understands: "It is not relished". If he feels a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, he understands: "That is impermanent", he understands: "It is not cleaved to" he understands: "It is not relished". If he feels a pleasant feeling, he feels it as one dissociated from it; if he feels a painful feeling, he feels it as one dissociated from it; if he feels a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, he feels it as one dissociated from it. When he feels feeling of the body ending, he understands: "I feel feeling of the body ending". When he feels feeling of life ending, he understands: "I feel feeling of life ending". He understands: "With the termination of life upon the dissolution of the body, all that is felt will, being not relished, be cooled here in this same (life). Just as a lamp, which burns in dependence on oil and wick, with the termination of that same oil and wick, attains extinction (*nibbāyati*) when not fed with more fuel, so too, when he feels feeling of life ending . . . be cooled⁵ here in this same (life)." So endowed with that a bhikkhu

3. Meaning, 'he does not cling to anything in any world'; to any state of existence, not even to the most refined heavens of formlessness.

4. Fear arises due to craving and clinging.

5. Meaning, Nibbāna—this is parallel in meaning to the lamp 'attaining extinction'.

is endowed in the highest degree with this foundation of understanding; for the Noble One's understanding in the highest degree is this, that is to say, knowledge of the exhaustion of all suffering.

22. (ii) 'His deliverance, being founded on truth, is unassailable; for the false is that which is false-natured, and the true is Nibbāna which is not false-natured. So endowed with that a bhikkhu is endowed in the highest degree with this foundation of truth; for the Noble Ones' truth in the highest degree is this, that is to say, Nibbāna, which is not false-natured.

23. (iii) 'Formerly having in ignorance affirmed and undertaken the essentials of existence, he has now abandoned them, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, done away with it, so that their nature to arise in future is no more. So endowed with that a bhikkhu is endowed in the highest degree with this foundation of giving up: for the Noble Ones' giving up in the highest degree is this, that is to say, the relinquishment of all essentials of existence.

24. (iv) 'Formerly having in ignorance had the covetousness of desire with lust, he has abandoned it, cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, done away with it, so that its nature to arise in future is no more. Formerly having in ignorance had the annoyance of ill-will with hatred, he has abandoned it . . . to arise in future is no more. Formerly having in ignorance had the ignorance of delusion, he has abandoned it . . . to arise in future is no more. So endowed with that a bhikkhu is endowed in the highest degree with this foundation of peace: for the Noble Ones' peace in the highest degree is this, that is to say, the pacification of greed, hate and delusion.

25. 'So it was with reference to this that it was said: "(So) let him (i) not neglect understanding, let him (ii) guard truth, let him (iii) intensify giving up, let him (iv) train only for peace."

26. (6) "'Stedied whereon no more the tides of conceit occur in him, and when the tides of conceit occur in him no more, he is called a Hermit Stilled": so it was said. And with reference to what was this said?

27. "'Am" is a conceit, "I am this" is a conceit, "shall be" is a conceit,

“shall not be” is a conceit, “shall be possessed of form” is a conceit, “shall be formless” is a conceit, “shall be percipient” is a conceit, “shall be non-percipient” is a conceit, “shall be neither-percipient-nor-non-percipient” is a conceit. Conceit is a disease, conceit is a cancer, conceit is a dart. It is with the surmounting of all conceits that he is called a Hermit Stilled. The Hermit who is Stilled neither is reborn nor ages, nor dies, he is unassailed and free from longing. He has none of that whereby he might be reborn. Not being reborn, how shall he age? Not ageing, how shall he die? Not dying, how shall he be assailed? Being unassailed, what shall he long for?

28. ‘So it was with reference to this that it was said: “Steadied whereon no more the tides of conceit occur in him, and when the tides of conceit occur in him no more, he is called a Hermit Stilled.”

29. ‘Bhikkhu, bear in mind this my exposition of elements in brief.’

30. Then the venerable Pukkusāti (thought): ‘The Teacher has surely come to me, the Sublime One has surely come to me, the Fully Enlightened One has surely come to me!’ and he got up from his seat and arranging his robe over one shoulder, he prostrated himself with his head at the Blessed One’s feet and said: ‘Venerable sir, I have done wrong, I have transgressed in that, like a fool confused and blundering, I have presumed to address the Blessed One as “friend”. Venerable sir, may the Blessed One forgive my wrong doing (seen) as such for restraint in the future.’

‘Surely, bhikkhu, you did wrong, you transgressed, in that like a fool confused and blundering, you presumed to address me as “friend”. But since you see your wrong doing as such and make amends according to the Dhamma, we forgive you; for it is growth in the Noble Ones’ Discipline when one sees one’s own wrong doing as such and makes amends according to the Dhamma by undertaking restraint for the future.’

31. ‘Venerable sir, I ask for the Admission under the Blessed One.’

‘But, bhikkhu, are your bowl and robes complete?’

‘Venerable sir, my bowl and robes are not complete.’

‘Bhikkhu, Tathāgatas do not give the Admission to one whose bowl

and robes are not complete.'

32. Then the venerable Pukkusāti, satisfied and delighting in the Blessed One's words, rose from his seat, and after paying homage to the Blessed One, keeping him on his right, he departed in order to seek for a bowl and robes. Then, while the venerable Pukkusāti was wandering in search of a bowl and robes, a stray cow⁶ killed him.

33. Then a number of bhikkhus went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, they sat down at one side. When they had done so, they asked the Blessed One: 'The clansman named Pukkusāti, to whom the Blessed One gave advice in brief, is dead. What is his destination, what is his future course?'

'Bhikkhus, the clansman Pukkusāti was wise; he entered into the way of Dhamma, and he did not trouble me in the interpretation of the Dhamma. With the destruction of the five lower fetters he has appeared spontaneously (in the Pure Abodes) to attain Nibbāna there, never to return from that world.'

This is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied and delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 1. For the name Bhaggava, see Sutta 81, para. 19 (not in this selection) and D. iii, I (Sutta 24).

para. 3. *urunda*—large enough: not in P.T.S. Dictionary.

para. 5. For the four foundations (*adhittāna*) see D. iii, 229.

para. 8. Reading *uddeso dhātuvibhaṅgassa* with Burm. 6th Sang. Ed which accords better with the title and the meaning. Similarly at para. 29.

para. 20: Reading *kiñca vijānāti* instead of *kiñci jānāti*. Cf. M. Sutta 43 (i, 299).

para. 21: *nihatam*—faultless: not in P.T.S. Dict. For *paraṭṭikāya* read *paṭṭikāya* (cf. A. i, 256). '*upādāya*—that to cling to' cf. M. 106, descrip-

6. A cow rushing after her young calf.

tion of 4th āruppa.

For 'relishing' (*abhinandana*) as applicable to painful feeling, see Sutta 38.

para. 22. With the Pāli: *taṃ hi bhikkhu musā yaṃ mosadhammaṃ, taṃ saccaṃ yaṃ amosadhammaṃ nibbānaṃ* compare with slightly twisted Sanskrit version "Uktaṃ sūtre: taṃ mrsā mosadharmā yadidaṃ saṃskṛtaṃ, etaddhi khalu, bhiksavaḥ, paramaṃ satyaṃ yadidaṃ amosadharmā yadidaṃ nirvāṇaṃ sarvasaṃskārās ca mrsā mosadharmāna iti" (Mādhyamika-kārikā-vṛtti (Prasannapadā) by Candrakīrti.

para. 24. Burm: 6th Sang. Ed. omits *sampadoso* after *samoho*.

para. 25. *Na miyyati* missing in P.T.S. text after *na jiyati*

Bahudhatuka Sutta

Many Sorts of Elements

Introduction

As our world is so full of fears, perils and calamities we can judge, using the Buddha's impressive opening words, that it is also full of fools. Are we numbered among the fools? Or are we worthy to be called 'wise men and inquirers'? In reply to Venerable Ānanda's question the Buddha relates what his standard for wise people is—a high standard! We have to be skilful in insight (*vipassanā*) before we rate as 'wise', insight into elements, bases, dependent origination and the possible and impossible. The last category includes what accords with Dhamma (and so is possible) and what goes against the way of Dhamma (and so impossible). The Buddha's answers may not please everyone these days but they have the merit of being straightforward. And as this discourse can be called: 'The Dhamma's Looking Glass', so, if one wants to see what Dhamma looks like, one should look into it, which means looking into oneself. When one has done that, as a person grown in wisdom, it will be said of oneself: 'No fear, peril or calamity comes from the wise man.'

The Sutta (115)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anathapindika's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Whatever fears arise, bhikkhus, fools, not wise men, are the cause of them all. Whatever perils arise, fools, not wise men, are the cause of them all. Whatever calamities arise, fools, not wise men, are the cause of them all. Just as a fire that starts in a rush shed or a grass shed burns down even an upper chamber plastered within and without, shut off, secured by bars, and with shuttered windows, so too, bhikkhus, whatever fears arise . . . fools, not wise men, are the cause of them all. So, bhikkhus, while the fool brings fear the wise man does not; while the fool brings peril the wise man does not; while the fool brings calamity the wise man does not. No fear comes from the wise man; no peril comes from the wise man; no calamity comes from the wise man. Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train thus: "We shall be wise men and inquirers."¹

3. When this was said, the venerable Ānanda asked the Blessed One: 'In what way, venerable sir, does a bhikkhu become worthy to be called a wise man and an inquirer?'

'When a bhikkhu is skilled in elements, Ānanda, skilled in the bases, skilled in dependent origination, skilled in the possible and impossible, in that way a bhikkhu becomes worthy to be called a wise man and an inquirer.'

(Elements)

4. 'But venerable sir, in what way does a bhikkhu become skilled in elements?'

'There are these eighteen elements, Ānanda: eye-element, form-element, eye-consciousness-element; ear-element, sound-element, ear-consciousness-element; nose-element, odour-element, nose-consciousness-element; tongue-element, flavour-element, tongue-consciousness-element; body-element, tangible-element, body-consciousness-element; mind-element, dhamma-element, mind-consciousness-element. When once he knows and sees these eighteen elements, in that way he becomes worthy to be called skilled in elements.'

5. 'But, venerable sir, might there be another way in which a bhikkhu is worthy to be called skilled in elements?'

1. For 'inquirers' see Sutta 47.

'There might be, Ānanda. There are these six elements: earth element, water element, fire element, air element, space element and consciousness element. When once he knows and sees these six elements, in that way he becomes worthy to be called skilled in elements.'

6. 'But, venerable sir, might there be another way in which a bhikkhu is worthy to be called skilled in elements?'

'There might be, Ānanda. There are these six elements: (bodily-) pleasure element, (bodily-) pain element, (mental-) joy element, (mental-) grief element, equanimity element and ignorance element. When once he knows and sees these six elements, in that way he becomes worthy to be called skilled in elements.'

7. 'But, venerable sir, might there be another way in which a bhikkhu is worthy to be called skilled in elements?'

'There might be, Ānanda. There are these six elements: sensual desire element, renunciation element, ill-will element, non-ill-will element, cruelty element, non-cruelty element. When once he knows and sees these six elements, in that way he becomes worthy to be called skilled in elements.'

8. 'But, venerable sir, might there be another way in which a bhikkhu is worthy to be called skilled in elements?'

'There might be, Ānanda. There are these three elements: the sensual desire element, the form element and the formless element. When once he knows and sees these three elements, in that way he is worthy to be called skilled in elements.'

9. 'But, venerable sir, might there be another way in which a bhikkhu is worthy to be called skilled in elements?'

'There might be, Ānanda. There are these two elements: the conditioned element and the unconditioned element. When once he knows and sees these two elements, in that way he is worthy to be called skilled in elements.'

(Bases)

11. 'But, venerable sir, in what way is a bhikkhu worthy to be called skilled in the bases?'

“There are these six in-oneself external bases, Ānanda: eye and form ear and sound, nose and odour, tongue and flavour, body and tangible, mind and dhamma. When once he knows and sees these six in-oneself external bases, in that way he is worthy to be called skilled in the bases.’

(Dependent Origination)

11. ‘But, venerable sir, in what way is a bhikkhu worthy to be called skilled in dependent origination?’

‘Here, Ānanda, a bhikkhu knows thus: “That is when this is; that arises with the arising of this. That is not when this is not; that ceases with the cessation of this. That is to say: ‘It is with ignorance as condition that formations (have positive being); with formations as condition, consciousness; with consciousness as condition, name-and-form; with name-and-form as condition, the six-fold base; with the sixfold base as condition, contact; with contact as condition, feeling; with feeling as condition, craving; with craving as condition, clinging; with clinging as condition, being; with being as condition, birth; it is with birth as condition that ageing and death (have positive being), and also sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair: that is how there is an origin to this whole mass of suffering. It is with the remainderless fading away and cessation of ignorance that there is cessation of formations; with the cessation of formations, the cessation of consciousness; with the cessation of consciousness, the cessation of name-and-form; with the cessation of name-and-form, the cessation of the sixfold base; with the cessation of the sixfold base, the cessation of contact; with the cessation of contact, the cessation of feeling; with the cessation of feeling, the cessation of craving; with the cessation of craving, the cessation of clinging; with the cessation of clinging, the cessation of being; with the cessation of being, the cessation of birth; it is with the cessation of birth that ageing and death cease, and also sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair; that is how there is a cessation of this whole mass of suffering.” In that way he is worthy to be called skilled in dependent origination.’

(The Possible And Impossible)

12. ‘But, venerable sir, in what way is a bhikkhu worthy to be called

skilled in the possible and impossible?’

‘Here, Ānanda, a bhikkhu understands: “It is impossible, it never happens, that a person whose view is perfected should treat any formation as permanent—no such possibility is found”, and he understands: “It is possible that an ordinary man should treat any formation as permanent—such a possibility is found.”

31. ‘He understands: “It is impossible, it never happens, that a person whose view is perfected should treat any formation as pleasurable—no such possibility is found”, and he understands: “It is possible that an ordinary man should treat any formation as pleasurable—such a possibility is found.”

14. ‘He understands: “It is impossible, it never happens, that a person whose view is perfected should treat any dhamma as self—no such possibility is found”, and he understands: “It is possible that an ordinary man should treat any dhamma as self—such a possibility is found.”²

15. ‘He understands: “It is impossible, it never happens, that a person whose view is perfected should deprive his mother of life—no such possibility is found”, and he understands: “It is possible that an ordinary man should deprive his mother of life—such a possibility is found.”

16. ‘... deprive his father of life ...

17. ‘... deprive an Arahant of life ...

18. ‘He understands: “It is impossible, it never happens, that a person whose view is perfected should, with a mind of hate, shed a Tathāgata’s blood—no such possibility is found”, and he understands: “It is possible that an ordinary man should, with a mind of hate, shed a Tathāgata’s blood—such a possibility is found.”

19. ‘... should cause a schism in the Sangha ...

20. ‘... should acknowledge another teacher ...³

21. ‘He understands: “It is impossible, it never happens, that two Ara-

2. These first three paragraphs on the impossible/possible clearly show the difference between an Arahant (whose view is perfected) and an ordinary man (overselves).

3. See Sutta 38, para. 26, footnote.

hants, Fully Enlightened Ones, should arise contemporaneously in one world element—no such possibility is found”,⁴ and he understands: “It is possible that one Arahant, Fully Enlightened One should arise in one world-element—such a possibility is found.”

22. ‘... two Wheel-turning Monarchs should arise...’

23. ‘He understands: “It is impossible, it never happens, that an Arahant, Fully Enlightened One should be female⁵—no such possibility is found”, and he understands: “It is possible that an Arahant, Fully Enlightened One should be male—such a possibility is found.”’

24. ‘... that a Wheel-turning Monarch should be female...’

25. ‘... that the status of Sakka should be occupied by female...’

26. ‘... that the status of Māra should be occupied by female...’

27. ‘... that the status of the (Brahmā) Divinity should be occupied by female...’

28. ‘He understands: “It is impossible, it never happens, that a wished-for, desired and agreeable result should come of bad bodily conduct—no such possibility is found”, and he understands: “It is possible that an unwished-for, undesired and disagreeable result should come of bad bodily conduct—such a possibility is found.”’

29. ‘... of bad verbal conduct...’

30. ‘... of bad mental conduct...’

31. ‘He understands: “It is impossible, it never happens, that an unwished-for, undesired and disagreeable result should come of good bodily conduct—no such possibility is found”, and he understands: “It is possible that a wished-for, desired and agreeable result should come of good bodily conduct—such a possibility is found.”’

4. Nāgaṣeṇa Thera in the Milinda Questions states that two Buddhas do not arise in one world to prevent quarrelling among their unenlightened disciples!

5. Women can become Arahants, as many did in the Bhikkhuni Sangha, but no example is known of a female originally discovering the Dhamma as Sammā-sambuddha.

32. '... of good verbal conduct ...
33. '... of good mental conduct ...
34. 'He understands: "It is impossible, it never happens, that a man possessed of bad bodily conduct should on that account, for that reason, reappear on the dissolution of the body, after death, in a happy destination, in the heavenly world—no such possibility is found", and he understands: "It is possible that a man possessed of bad bodily conduct should on that account, for that reason, reappear on the dissolution of the body, after death, in a state of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, in hell—such a possibility is found."
35. '... possessed of bad verbal conduct ...
36. '... possessed of bad mental conduct ...
37. 'He understands: "It is impossible, it never happens, that a person possessed of good bodily conduct should on that account, for that reason, reappear on the dissolution of the body, after death, in a state of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, in hell—no such possibility is found", and he understands: "It is possible that a man possessed of good bodily conduct should on that account, for that reason, reappear on the dissolution of the body, after death, in a happy destination, in the heavenly world—such a possibility is found."
38. '... possessed of good verbal conduct ...
39. '... possessed of good mental conduct ...
- 'In that way, Ānanda, he is worthy to be called skilled in the possible and impossible.'

(Conclusion)

40. When this was said, the venerable Ānanda said to the Blessed One: 'It is wonderful, venerable sir, it is marvellous. What is the name of this discourse on the Dhamma?

'You may remember this discourse, Ānanda, as "The Many Sorts of Elements" or "The Four Cycles" or "The Dhamma's Looking Glass" or "The Drum of the Deathless" or "The Supreme Victory in Battle."

This is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Ānanda was satisfied and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 34f. The reservation "on that account, for that reason" is explained in Sutta 136.

Nandakovada Sutta

Advice from Nandaka

Introduction

This is the only Sutta in this selection where large numbers of bhikkhunis are spoken of. While we have few Suttas spoken by Arahant bhikkhunis, most of their discourses were probably not recorded by the reciting bhikkhus (bhāṇakas) who would only have had limited opportunities to meet bhikkhunis. The relationship of the two Sanghas was carefully regulated by the Buddha so that the weak members of either should not be tempted, and ignorant people should not misunderstand. The good reputation of the two Sanghas was important and the Buddha did not want opportunities to arise for slander. There were always opponents of the Buddha's Teaching looking for such opportunities. One of the permitted contacts between bhikkhus and bhikkhunis was the exhortation of the latter by the former on Uposatha days. Only senior bhikkhus who had been agreed upon by the Sangha could go to exhort the bhikkhunis. In this Sutta it appears that there was a rota of senior bhikkhus among whom was the venerable Nandaka Thera. He had attained Arahantship and probably all of the other theras performing this task were also Arahants. This is the reason why his exhortation proved so effective, and that after its repetition, even 'the most backward of those bhikkhunis was a Stream Enterer'.

The Sutta (146)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park.

2. Then Mahāpajāpati Gotāmi went with bhikkhuniṣ to the number of

five hundred to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, she stood at one side. When she had done so, she said: 'Venerable sir, let the Blessed One advise the bhikkhunis, let the Blessed One instruct them, let the Blessed One give them a talk on the Dhamma.'

3. Now on that occasion the elder bhikkhus were advising the bhikkhunis in turn; but the venerable Nandaka did not want to advise them in (his) turn¹. Then the Blessed One addressed the venerable Ānanda thus: 'Ānanda, whose turn is it today to advise the bhikkhunis?'

'Venerable sir, it is Nandaka's turn to advise the bhikkhunis; but the venerable Nandaka does not want to advise them in (his) turn.'

Then the Blessed One addressed the venerable Nandaka thus: 'Advise the bhikkhunis, Nandaka; instruct the bhikkhunis, Nandaka; give a talk divine on the Dhamma to the bhikkhunis.'

4. 'Even so, venerable sir,' the venerable Nandaka replied. Then, when it was morning he dressed and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Sāvattī for alms. When he had wandered for alms in Sāvattī and had returned from his alms-round after the meal, he went with a companion to the Rājaka Park.

5. The bhikkhunis saw him coming in the distance, and they prepared a seat and set out water for the feet. The venerable Nandaka sat down on the seat prepared and washed his feet. And the bhikkhunis paid homage to him and stood at one side. When they had done so, the venerable Nandaka said this:

6. 'Sisters, this talk will be in the form of questions. When you know, you should say: "We know"; when you do not know, you should say: "We do not know"; or if any of you have doubt or uncertainty, I too should be questioned thus: "Venerable sir, what is the meaning of this talk?"'

"Venerable sir, we are satisfied and happy that the venerable Nandaka invites us in this way.'

1. Because those bhikkhunis in a past life had been his concubines when he had been a king, and he thought that anyone remembering past lives could accuse him of continued attachment to them.

7. 'Sisters, how do you conceive this: Is the eye permanent or impermanent?'

'Impermanent, venerable sir.'

'Is what is impermanent painful² or pleasant?'

'Painful, venerable sir.'

'Is what is impermanent, painful and liable to change, fit to be seen thus: "This is mine, this is I, this is my self?"'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Sisters, how do you conceive this: Is the ear permanent ...

'... Is the nose permanent ...

'... Is the tongue permanent ...

'... Is the body permanent ...

'... Is the mind permanent or impermanent?'

'Impermanent, venerable sir.'

'Is what is impermanent painful or pleasant?'

'Painful, venerable sir.'

'Is what is impermanent, painful and liable to change, fit to be seen thus: "This is mine, this is I, this is my self?"'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Why is that?'

'Because, venerable sir, it has already been well seen as it actually is with right understanding by us that these six bases in oneself are impermanent.'

'Good, good, sisters. So a Noble disciple (thinks) when he sees (this) as it actually is with right understanding.

8. 'Sisters, how do you conceive this: Are forms permanent or impermanent?'

'Impermanent, venerable sir.'

'Is what is impermanent painful or pleasant?'

'Painful, venerable sir.'

'Is what is impermanent, painful and liable to change fit to be seen as: "This is mine, this is I, this is myself?"'

2. Painful: (dukkha), There is no one English word which will translate dukkha in all its meanings. The sense bases (and every other aspect of the world) are dukkha since they are impermanent, they are unreliable and insecure yet it is in the transient features of the world that people try to find security! They get further into dukkha.

'No, venerable sir.'

'Sisters, how do you conceive this: Are sounds permanent ...'

'... Are odours permanent ...'

'... Are flavours permanent ...'

'... Are tangibles permanent ...'

'... Are dhammas permanent or impermanent?'

'Impermanent, venerable sir.'

'Is what is impermanent painful or pleasant?'

'Painful, venerable sir.'

'Is what is impermanent, painful and liable to change fit to be seen as: "This is mine, this is I, this is my self?"'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Why is that?'

'Because, venerable sir, it has already been well seen as it actually is with right understanding by us that these six external bases are impermanent.'

'Good, good, sisters. So a Noble disciple (thinks) when he sees (this) as it actually is with right understanding.'

9. 'Sisters, how do you conceive this: Is eye-consciousness permanent ...'

'No, venerable sir.'

'... Is ear-consciousness permanent ...'

'... Is nose-consciousness permanent ...'

'... Is tongue-consciousness permanent ...'

'... Is body-consciousness permanent ...'

'... Is mind-consciousness permanent ...'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Why is that?'

'Because, venerable sir, it has already been well seen as it actually is with right understanding by us that these six bodies of consciousness are impermanent.'

'Good, good, sisters. So a Noble disciple (thinks) when he sees (this) as it actually is with right understanding.'

10. 'Sisters, suppose there were a lamp burning and its oil was impermanent and liable to change, and its wick was impermanent and liable to change, and its flame was impermanent and liable to change, and

its radiance was impermanent and liable to change, would anyone speak rightly who spoke thus: "When this lamp is burning its oil is impermanent and liable to change, and so are its wick and its flame, but its radiance is permanent, everlasting, eternal, and not liable to change?"

'No, venerable sir.'

'Why is that?'

'Because, venerable sir, when that lamp is burning, its oil is impermanent and liable to change, and so are its wick and its flame and its radiance.'

'So too, sisters, would anyone speak rightly who spoke thus: "These six bases in oneself are impermanent, but that dependent on the six bases in (one) self which I feel as pleasant, painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant is permanent, everlasting, eternal, and not liable to change?"'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Why is that?'

'Because, venerable sir, each appropriate feeling arises dependent on the appropriate condition, and with the cessation of the appropriate condition the appropriate feeling ceases.'

'Good, good sisters. So a Noble disciple (thinks) when he sees (this) as it actually is with right understanding.'

11. 'Sisters, suppose there were a great tree standing possessed of heartwood and its root was impermanent and liable to change, and its trunk was impermanent and liable to change, and its branches and foliage were impermanent and liable to change, and its shadow was impermanent and liable to change, would anyone speak rightly who spoke thus: "When this great tree stands possessed of heartwood, its root is impermanent and liable to change, and so are its trunk, branches and foliage, but its shadow is permanent, everlasting, eternal, and not liable to change?"'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Why is that?'

'Because, venerable sir, when that great tree stands possessed of heartwood, its root is impermanent and liable to change and so are its trunk, branches and foliage and its shadow.'

'So too, sisters, would anyone speak rightly who spoke thus: "These

six external bases are impermanent and liable to change but that dependent on the six external bases which I feel as pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant is permanent, everlasting, eternal, and not liable to change?"'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Why is that?'

'Because, venerable sir, each appropriate feeling arises dependent on the appropriate condition, and with the cessation of the appropriate condition the appropriate feeling ceases.'

'Good, good, sisters. So a Noble disciple (thinks) when he sees (this) as it actually is with right understanding.'

12. 'Sisters, suppose a clever butcher or his apprentice killed a cow and carved it up with a sharp carving knife in such a manner that, without damaging the inner flesh body and without damaging the outer skin body, he cut and severed and carved away with the sharp carving knife the skin muscles and sinews and attachments between, and having done that, and taken off the outer skin body, he then covered that cow again with that skin; would he be speaking rightly if he spoke thus: "This cow is joined to this skin just as it was before?"'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Why is that?'

'Because, venerable sir, were he to do so, that cow would nevertheless be disjoined from that skin.'

'Sisters, the simile has been given by me in order to intimate a meaning. The meaning is this: the "inner flesh body" is a term for the six bases in oneself; the "outer skin body" is a term for the six external bases; the "skin-muscle, sinews and attachments between" is a term for relishing and lust; the "sharp carving knife" is a term for the Noble understanding, which cuts, severs, and carves away the defilements, fetters and attachments between.'

13. 'Sisters, there are these seven enlightenment factors with the development and cultivation of which a bhikkhu, by realization himself with direct knowledge, here and now enters upon and abides in the deliverance of the heart and the deliverance by understanding that are taint-free with the exhaustion of taints. What are the seven? Here a bhikkhu

develops the mindfulness enlightenment factor which has seclusion, fading away and cessation for its support, and changes to relinquishment. He develops the investigation-of-dhammas enlightenment factor . . . the energy enlightenment factor . . . the happiness enlightenment factor . . . the tranquillity enlightenment factor . . . the concentration enlightenment factor . . . the equanimity enlightenment factor which has seclusion, fading away and cessation for its support, and changes to relinquishment. These are the seven enlightenment factors, with the development . . . taint-free with exhaustion of taints.'

14. When the venerable Nandaka had advised the bhikkhunis thus, he dismissed them thus: 'Go, sisters, it is time.'

Then the bhikkhunis being satisfied and delighting in the venerable Nandaka's words, rose from their seats, and after paying homage they departed, keeping him on their right. They went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, they stood at one side. When they had done so, the Blessed One said: 'Go, sisters, it is time.' Then they paid homage to the Blessed One and departed keeping him on their right.

15. Soon after they had gone, the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus, just as most people have no doubt or uncertainty on the Uposatha Day of the Fourteenth whether the moon is new or full, since the moon is only new then, so too those bhikkhunis are satisfied with Nandaka's teaching of the Dhamma but their intention is not yet waxed full.'

16. Then the Blessed One addressed the venerable Nandaka thus: 'So, Nandaka, you should advise those bhikkhunis tomorrow too.'

17-27 'Even so, venerable sir,' the venerable Nandaka replied.

Then when it was morning . . . (repeat verbatim para. 4 to para. 14) . . . The Blessed One said: 'Go, sisters, it is time.' (Then they paid homage to the Blessed One and departed, keeping him on their right).

28. Soon after they had gone, the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus, just as most people have no doubt or uncertainty on the Uposatha Day of the Fifteenth whether the moon is new or full, since the moon is only full then, so too, those bhikkhunis are satisfied

with Nandaka's teaching of the Dhamma and their intention is waxed full. Bhikkhus, [the most backward of those bhikkhunis is a Stream Enterer, no more liable to perdition, certain (of rightness) and headed for Full Enlightenment.]

This is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para: 12. *cilimam* (P.T.S. text, iii, 274) should read *vilimamsam* according to *Tikā*: "vilimamsan'ti cammanissitamamsam."

Chachakka Sutta

The Six Sixes

Introduction

This is one of the small group of Suttas at the conclusion of which we find large numbers of bhikkhus attaining Arahantship. Now the text looks dry enough and very repetitious, so why didn't they yawn and go to sleep? That shows the difference between the mind of a person who has practised Dhamma intensively gradually building up his power of understanding and people like ourselves who find it difficult to take much interest in 'dry' material.

Of course, *the Buddha* spoke this discourse. He spoke it no doubt in measured phrases and with that peculiar beauty that the Pāli of the Suttas has. The bhikkhus who were listening were also seated in meditation posture and checking up on his words in themselves as he went on. And then there is the great force of the many repetitions, to drum the teaching home, to ensure that it was clearly seen by those bhikkhus in their own minds and bodies.

In the first part of the Sutta the process of perception from the six sense bases to the arising of craving is described, step by step. The second part takes the six steps for each sense base and analyzes them to see that there is no lasting entity there called 'self' or 'soul'. How the idea of self comes into being is described in the third part and how it ceases in the fourth. Of great importance is the fifth section on the underlying tendencies and how they arise and how they cease to arise. The conclusion illustrates the Arahant's dispassion.

The Buddha, in this way, led those sixty bhikkhus to the highest attainment and we do not doubt that they 'delighted in the Blessed One's words'.

The Sutta (148)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvattthi in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' the bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, I shall expound to you the Dhamma that is good in the beginning, good in the middle and good in the end, with (the right meaning and phrasing, and I shall announce the life divine¹ that is utterly perfect and pure, that is to say, the Six Sixes. Listen and heed well what I shall say.'

'Even so, venerable sir,' the bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

(Synopsis)

3. (i-vi) 'Six bases in oneself can be understood. Six external bases can be understood. Six bodies of consciousness can be understood. Six bodies of contact can be understood. Six bodies of feeling can be understood. Six bodies of craving can be understood.'

(A. Enumeration)

4. (i). 1-6. "Six bases in oneself can be understood", so it was said. And with reference to what was this said? There are the eye-base, the ear-base, the nose-base, the tongue-base, the body-base, the mind-base. So it was with reference to this that it was said: "Six bases in oneself can be understood." This is the first six.

5. (ii). 1-6. "Six external bases can be understood", so it was said. And with reference to what was this said? There are the form base, the sound base, the odour base, the flavour base, the tangible base, the dhamma base. So it was with reference to this that it was said: "Six external bases can be understood." This is the second six.

6. (iii). 1-6. "Six bodies of consciousness can be understood", so it was said. And with reference to what was this said? Dependent on eye and

1. Here meaning 'a way of practice'.

forms eye-consciousness arises, dependent on ear and sounds ear-consciousness arises, dependent on nose and odours nose-consciousness arises, dependent on tongue and flavours tongue-consciousness arises, dependent on body and tangibles body-consciousness arises, dependent on mind and dhammas mind-consciousness arises. So it was with reference to this that it was said: "Six bodies of consciousness can be understood." This is the third six.

7. (iv). 1-6. "Six bodies of contact can be understood", so it was said. And with reference to what was this said? Dependent on eye and forms eye-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact; dependent on ear and sounds ear-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact; dependent on nose and odours nose-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact; dependent on tongue and flavours tongue-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact; dependent on body and tangibles body-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact; dependent on mind and dhammas mind-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact. So it was with reference to this that it was said: "Six bodies of contact can be understood." This is the fourth six.

8. (v). 1-6. "Six bodies of feeling can be understood", so it was said. And with reference to what was this said? Dependent on eye and form eye-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling; dependent on ear and sounds ear-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling; dependent on nose and odours nose-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling; dependent on tongue and flavours tongue-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling; dependent on body and tangibles body-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling; dependent on mind and dhammas mind-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling. So it was with reference to this that it was said: "Six bodies of feeling can be understood." This is the fifth six.

9. (vi). 1-6. "Six bodies of craving can be understood", so it was said. And with reference to what was this said? Dependent on eye and forms eye-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling, with feeling as condition there is craving; dependent on ear and sounds ear-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling, with feeling as condition there is craving; dependent on nose and odours nose-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling, with feeling as condition there is craving; dependent on tongue and flavours tongue-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling, with feeling as condition there is craving; dependent on body and tangibles body-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling, with feeling as condition there is craving; dependent on mind and dhammas mind-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there is feeling, with feeling as condition there is craving. So it was with reference to this that it was said: "Six bodies of craving can be understood." This is the sixth six.

(B. Not Self)

10. 1. (i). 'If anyone says that the eye is self, it is not tenable. The eye's rise and fall is evident.² Now since its rise and fall are evident it follows that self rises and falls. That is why, should anyone say that the eye is self, it is not tenable.

(ii) 'If anyone says that forms are self, it is not tenable ...

(iii) 'If anyone says that eye-consciousness is self, it is not tenable ...

(iv) 'If anyone says that eye-contact is self, it is not tenable ...

(v) 'If anyone says that feeling is self, it is not tenable ...

(vi) 'If anyone says that craving is self, it is not tenable ...

11. 2. (i). 'If anyone says that the ear is self, it is not tenable ...

(ii) '...sounds are self ...

(iii) '...ear-consciousness is self ...

2. Its coming to existence and passing away with the different types of mental states.

- (iv) '... ear-contact is self ...
 - (v) '... feeling is self ...
 - (vi) '... craving is self ... not tenable.
12. 3. (i). 'If anyone says that nose is self, it is not tenable ...
- (ii) '... odours are self ...
 - (iii) '... nose-consciousness is self ...
 - (iv) '... nose-contact is self ...
 - (v) '... feeling is self ...
 - (vi) '... craving is self ... not tenable.
13. 4. (i) 'If anyone says that tongue is self, it is not tenable ...
- (ii) '... flavours are self ...
 - (iii) '... tongue-consciousness is self ...
 - (iv) '... tongue-contact is self ...
 - (v) '... feeling is self ...
 - (vi) '... craving is self ... not tenable
14. 5. (i) 'If anyone says that body is self, it is not tenable ...
- (ii) '... tangibles are self ...
 - (iii) '... body-consciousness is self ...
 - (iv) '... body-contact is self ...
 - (v) '... feeling is self ...
 - (vi) '... craving is self ... not tenable.
15. 6. (i). 'If anyone says that mind is self, it is not tenable. The mind's rise and fall is evident. Now since its rise and fall are evident it follows that self rises and falls. That is why, should anyone say that the mind is self, it is not tenable.
- (ii) '... dhammas are self ...
 - (iii) '... mind-consciousness is self ...
 - (iv) '... mind-contact is self ...
 - (v) '... feeling is self ...
 - (vi) '... craving is self ... not tenable.

(C. The Origin of Embodiment)

16. 'Now, bhikkhus, the way leading to the arising of embodiment is thus:

17. 1. (i-vi). 'A man sees the eye as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees forms as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees eye-consciousness as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees eye-contact as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees feeling as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees craving as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self".

18. 2. (i-vi). 'A man sees the ear as as "This is mine . . ."

19. 3. (i-vi). 'A man sees the nose as "This is mine . . ."

20. 4. (i-vi). 'A man sees the tongue as "This is mine . . ."

21. 5. (i-vi). 'A man sees the body as "This is mine . . ."

22. 6. (i-vi). 'A man sees the mind as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees dhammas as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees mind-consciousness as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees mind-contact as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees feeling as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self". He sees craving as "This is mine, this is I, this is my self".

(D. The Cessation of Embodiment)

23. 'Now, bhikkhus, the way leading to the cessation of embodiment is this:

24. 1. (i-vi). 'A man sees the eye as "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self". He sees forms as "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self". He sees eye-consciousness as "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self". He sees eye contact as "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self". He sees feeling as "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self". He sees craving as "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self".

25. 2. (i-vi). 'A man sees the ear as "This is not mine . . ."

26. 3. (i-vi). 'A man sees the nose as "This is not mine . . ."

27. 4. (i-vi). 'A man sees the tongue as "This is not mine . . ."

28. 5. (i-vi). 'A man sees the body as "This is not mine . . ."

29. 6. (i-vi). 'A man sees the mind as "This is not mine . . ."

(E. The Underlying Tendencies)

30. 1. (i-vi). 'Bhikkhus, eye-consciousness arises dependent upon eye and forms, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there arises what is felt as pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant. If when he is touched by pleasant feeling, he relishes it, he affirms and accepts it, then the underlying tendency to lust underlies it. If when he is touched by painful feeling, he sorrows, grieves and laments, beating his breast he weeps and becomes distraught, then the underlying tendency to resistance underlies it. If when he is touched by neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, he does not understand as it actually is, the origin and cessation of that feeling, or the gratification, danger and escape (in its case), then the underlying tendency to ignorance underlies it. Then indeed, bhikkhus, that he shall make an end of suffering without abandoning the underlying tendency to lust for pleasant feeling, without eliminating the underlying tendency to resistance to painful feeling, without abolishing the underlying tendency to ignorance of neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, without abandoning ignorance or having produced true knowledge—that is not possible.

31. 2. (i-vi). 'Ear-consciousness arises dependent . . .

32. 3. (i-vi). 'Nose-consciousness arises dependent . . .

33. 4. (i-vi). 'Tongue-consciousness arises dependent . . .

34. 5. (i-vi). 'Body-consciousness arises dependent . . .

35. 6. (i-vi). 'Mind-consciousness arises dependent . . .

(F. The Abandonment of Underlying Tendencies)

36. 1. (i-vi). 'Bhikkhus, dependent on eye and forms eye-consciousness arises, the coincidence of the three is contact, with contact as condition there arises what is felt as pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant. If when he is touched by pleasant feeling, he does not relish it or affirm or accept it, then no underlying tendency to lust any longer underlies it. If when he is touched by painful feeling, he does not sorrow,

grieve and lament, he does not, beating his breast, weep and become distraught, then no underlying tendency to resistance any longer underlies it. If when he is touched by neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, he understands as it actually is, the origin and cessation of that feeling, or the gratification, danger and escape (in its case), then no underlying tendency to ignorance any longer underlies it. Then indeed, bhikkhus, that he shall here and now make an end of suffering by abandoning the underlying tendency to lust for pleasant feeling, by eliminating the underlying tendency to resist painful feeling, and by abolishing the underlying tendency to ignore neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, abandoning ignorance and having produced true knowledge—that is possible.

37. 2. '(i-vi). Dependent on ear and sounds...

38. 3. '(i-vi). Dependent on nose and odours...

39. 4. '(i-vi). Dependent on tongue and flavours...

40. 5. '(i-vi). Dependent on body and tangibles...

41. 6. '(i-vi). Dependent on mind and dhammas... Then indeed, bhikkhus, that he shall here and now make an end of suffering by abandoning the underlying tendency to lust for pleasant feeling, by eliminating the underlying tendency to resist painful feeling, and by abolishing the underlying tendency to ignore neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling; abandoning ignorance and having produced true knowledge—that is possible.

(Conclusion)

42. Seeing thus a well-taught Noble disciple becomes dispassionate towards the eye, becomes dispassionate towards forms, becomes dispassionate towards eye-consciousness, becomes dispassionate towards eye-contact, becomes dispassionate towards feeling, becomes dispassionate towards craving.

'He becomes dispassionate towards the ear...

'He becomes dispassionate towards the nose...

'He becomes dispassionate towards the tongue...

'He becomes dispassionate towards the body...

'He becomes dispassionate towards the mind, becomes dispassionate towards dhammas, becomes dispassionate towards mind-consciousness, becomes dispassionate towards mind-contact, becomes dispassionate towards feeling, becomes dispassionate towards craving.

'Being dispassionate, (his lust) fades away; with the fading away (of lust) he is liberated; when (his mind is) liberated, there comes the knowledge "It is liberated". He understands: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come."'

This is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and delighted in the Blessed One's words.

And while this discourse was being spoken the minds of as many as sixty bhikkhus were liberated from taints by not clinging.

Notes

para. 10. *uppajjati*—is tenable: (= *yujjati*, Comy), not in P.T.S. Dict. in this sense.

Note idiomatic use of "*iccassa evam āgataṃ hoti*—it follows".

Should one read "*yasmā kho pana uppādo pi . . .*" instead of "*yassa . . .*"?

Madhupindaka Sutta

The Sweet Morsel

Introduction

The Buddha was never lost for an apt answer as the opening of this profound Sutta illustrates, while his questioner, Daṇḍapāṇi, full of ill-will towards the him, could not even find words to ask him what he meant. When a bhikkhu later did so, even then the Buddha gave only the briefest reply which did not satisfy him. When the bhikkhus applied to venerable Mahā-Kaccāna he spoke upon the deep meaning. Throughout the Sutta there is a vein of non-contention beginning with the Buddha's reply to the angry Daṇḍapāṇi, continuing through his brief summary to the bhikkhu and ending with the peacefulness of Arahantship resulting from the lack of inner contention: 'When there is no manifestation of thinking, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of being beset by evaluation of diversifying perceptions.' Though the pacification of the world's contentiousness is not mentioned again after the Buddha's brief summary, still it is plain that exterior peace among peoples depends upon the interior peace of the people concerned. When there is 'the end of the underlying tendencies (the seven anusaya)... this is the end of resorting to sticks, resorting to weapons...' The way that this has to be done is through meditation, at first of calm to make the mind strong and then insight when the various stages of the process of perception, mentioned here, could be checked and verified. The profundity of this Sutta makes study of it fruitful (as Ven. Nyānānanda has done in "Concept and Reality", B.P.S. Kandy). When its title is thought of one must picture one of these globular Indian mill-sweets which float in thick syrup (and in fact Miss Horner translates it as "The Honey-Ball") sweet in every fragment. This sutta has the sweetness of Dhamma pervading it.

The Sutta (18)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living in the Sakka country at Kapilavatthu in Nigrodha's Park.

2. Then it being morning, the Blessed One dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Kapilavatthu for alms. When he had wandered for alms in Kapilavatthu and had returned from his alms-round after the meal, he went to the Great Wood for the day's abiding and went into the Great Wood and sat down at the root of a bilva¹ sapling.

3. 'Stick-in-hand' (Dandapāṇi) the Sakyan also went to the Great Wood, walking and wandering for exercise, and when he had gone into the Great Wood, he went to the bilva sapling where the Blessed One was and exchanged greetings with him. When the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he stood at one side leaning on his stick. When he had done so, he asked the Blessed One: 'What does the monk tell, what does he preach?'²

4. 'Friend, as one who tells that whereby he quarrels with no one in the world with its gods, its Māras and its Divinities, in this generation with its monks and divines, with its kings and its men, and who tells that whereby perceptions no more underlie that divine one when he abides dissociated from sensual desires, undoubting, shorn of worry, rid of craving for any kind of being—so do I tell, friend, so do I preach.'

5. When this was said, 'Stick-in-hand' the Sakyan shook his head, wagged his tongue and raised his eyebrows till his forehead was puckered in three lines. Then he departed, leaning on his stick.

6. Then when it was evening, the Blessed One rose from meditation,

1. The citrus fruit tree called 'bael' in India and 'beli' in Sri Lanka.

2. 'Stick-in-hand' was not courteous and asked this question without interest as he had enmity in his heart, for which Devadatta was responsible. The Buddha replied so that he would not be able to say that he does not answer when asked a question, and in such a way that 'Stick-in-hand' would not understand. However, his reply is concerned with non-contention and non-enmity.

and he went to Nigrodha's Park where he sat down on a seat prepared (for him), when he had done so, he told the bhikkhus what had taken place. When this was said, a certain bhikkhu asked the Blessed One:

7. 'But, venerable sir, what is it that the Blessed One tells whereby he has no quarrel with any one in the world with its gods, its Māras and its Divinities, in this generation with its monks and divines, with its kings and its men? And, venerable sir, how is it that perceptions no more underlie that divine one when he abides dissociated from sensual desires, undoubting, shorn of worry, rid of craving for any kind of being?'

8. 'Bhikkhus, as to that with which as their source the evaluation of diversifying perceptions besets a man: if there is (found to be) nothing there to delight in, affirm or to accept, this is the end of underlying tendencies to lust, resistance, views, uncertainty, conceit, lust for being and ignorance; this is the end of resorting to sticks, resorting to weapons, quarrels, brawls, disputes, recrimination, malice and speech; here unprofitable dhammas cease without remainder.'

9. So the Blessed One said. Having said this, the Sublime One rose from his seat and went to his dwelling.

10. Then soon after the Blessed One had gone, the bhikkhus (considered): 'Now, friends, the Blessed One has risen from his seat and gone into his dwelling after giving a summary in brief without the detailed meaning, that is that is to say: "Bhikkhus, as to that with which as their source... unprofitable dhammas cease without remainder." Now who will expound this in detail? Then they (considered): 'The venerable Mahā-Kaccāna is praised and esteemed by the Blessed One and by companions in the the life divine. He is capable of doing that. Suppose we went to him and asked him the meaning of this?'

11. Then they went to the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna and exchanged greetings with him, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, they sat down at one side. When they had done so, they told him what had taken place, and they added: 'Let the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna expound it to us.'

12. 'Friends, it is as though a man needing heartwood, seeking heartwood, wandering in search of heartwood, conceived that heartwood should be sought among the branches and leaves of a great tree standing possessed of heartwood, after passing over the root and the trunk. And so it is with you, venerable sirs, that you conceive that we should be asked about the meaning of this, after passing the Blessed One by when you were face-to-face with the Master. For, Knowing, the Blessed One knows; Seeing, he sees; he is the Eye, he is knowledge, he is the Dhamma, he is the Divine; the Tathāgata is the Sayer, the Proclaimer, the Elucidator of Meaning, the Giver of the Deathless. That was the time when you should have asked the Blessed One the meaning. As he told you so you should have remembered it.'

13. 'Surely, friend Kaccāna, Knowing, the Blessed One knows; Seeing, he sees; (surely) he is the Eye, he is knowledge, he is the Dhamma, he is the Divine; (surely) the Tathagata is the Sayer, the Proclaimer, the Elucidator of Meaning, the Giver of the Deathless. (Surely) that was the time when we should have asked the Blessed One the meaning; and as he told us so we should have remembered it. Yet the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna is praised and esteemed by the Blessed One and by companions in the life divine. The venerable Mahā-Kaccāna is capable of expounding the detailed meaning of this summary given in brief by the Blessed One without expounding the detailed meaning. Let the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna expound (it) without finding it troublesome.'²

14. 'Then listen, friends, and heed well what I shall I say.'

'Even so, friend,' the bhikkhus replied. The venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said this:

15. 'Friends, when the Blessed One rose from his seat and went into his dwelling after giving a summary in brief without expounding the detailed meaning, that is to say: "Bhikkhus, as to that with which as their source the evaluation of diversifying perceptions besets a man: if there is (found to be) nothing there to delight in, to affirm or to accept, this is the end of underlying tendencies to lust, resistance, views, uncertainty, conceit, lust for being, and ignorance; this is the end of the use

2. 'Without giving importance (to that)' in original trans.

of sticks, the use of the weapons, quarrels, brawls, disputes, recrimination, malice and false speech; here evil, unprofitable dhammas cease without remainder", I understand the detailed meaning of it to be as follows:

16. 'Dependent on eye and forms, eye consciousness arises. The coincidence of these three is contact. With contact as condition there is feeling. What a man feels that he perceives. What he perceives that he thinks about. What he thinks about that he diversifies. With what he has diversified as the source the evaluation of diversifying perceptions beset a man with respect to past, future and present forms cognizable by the eye.

'Dependent on ear and sounds... with respect to past, future and present sounds cognizable by the ear.

'Dependent on nose and odours... with respect to past, future and present odours cognizable by the nose.

'Dependent on tongue and flavours... with respect to past, future and present flavours cognizable by the tongue.

'Dependent on body and tangibles... with respect to past, future and present tangibles cognizable by the body.

'Dependent on mind and dhammas, mind consciousness arises. The coincidence of these three is contact. With contact as condition there is feeling. What a man feels that he perceives. What he perceives that he thinks about. What he thinks about that he diversifies. With what he has diversified as the source the evaluation of diversifying perceptions beset a man with respect past, future and present dhammas cognizable by the mind.

17. 'When there is eye and there is form and there is eye consciousness, it is possible that one will recognize that manifestation of contact.³ When there is the manifestation of contact, it is possible the one will recognize the manifestation of feeling. When there is the manifestation of feeling, it is possible that one will recognize the manifestation of perception. When there is the manifestation of perception, it is possible that one will recognize the manifestation of thinking. When there is

3. 'Describe a description of contact', 'notify a notion of contact'—two experimental trans. in the original.

the manifestation of thinking, it is possible that one will recognize the manifestation of being beset by evaluation of diversifying perceptions.

'When there is ear and there is sound and there is ear consciousness . . .

'When there is nose and there is odour and there is nose consciousness . . .

'When there is tongue and there is flavour and there is tongue consciousness . . .

'When there is body and there is tangible and there is body consciousness . . .

'When there is mind and there is dhamma and there is mind consciousness . . . it is possible that one will recognize the manifestation of being beset by evaluation of diversifying perceptions.

18. 'When there is no eye and there is no form and there is no eye consciousness, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of contact. When there is no manifestation of contact, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of feeling. When there is no manifestation of feeling, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of perception. When there is no manifestation of perception, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of thinking. When there is no manifestation of thinking, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of being beset by evaluation of diversifying perceptions.

'When there is no ear . . . nose . . . tongue . . . body . . .

'When there is no mind and there is no dhamma and there is no mind consciousness, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of contact. When there is no manifestation of contact, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of feeling. When there is no manifestation of feeling, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of perception. When there is no manifestation of perception, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of thinking. When there is no manifestation of thinking, it is impossible that one will recognize the manifestation of being beset by evaluation of diversifying perceptions.

19. 'Friends, when the Blessed One rose from his seat and went into his

dwelling after giving a summary in brief without expounding the detailed meaning, that is to say: "Bhikkhus, as to that with which as their source . . . (para. 8) . . . cease without remainder", I understand the detailed meaning of it to be thus.

'Now, friends, if you wish, go to the Blessed One and ask him about the meaning of this. As the Blessed One tells you so should you remember it.'

20. Then the bhikkhus were satisfied, and delighting in the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna's words, they rose from their seats and went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, they sat down at one side. When they had done so, they told him all that had taken place after the Blessed One had left, and they added: 'Then, venerable sir, we went to the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna and asked him about the meaning. Venerable sir, the meaning has been expounded to us with these reasons, these phrases and these syllables.'

21. 'Mahā-Kaccāna is wise, bhikkhus, Mahā-Kaccāna has great understanding. Had you asked me the meaning of this, I should have given you the same answer as Mahā-Kaccāna has given you. Such is the meaning and so should you remember it.'

22. When this was said, the venerable Ānanda said to the Blessed One: 'Venerable sir, just as if a man exhausted by hunger and weakness came by a sweet morsel, he would, in the course of eating it, find a sweet, unadulterated flavour, so too, venerable sir, any able-minded bhikkhu would, in the course of scrutinizing with understanding the meaning of this discourse on the Dhamma, find satisfaction and confidence of heart. Venerable sir, what is the name of this discourse on the Dhamma?'

'As to that, Ānanda, you may remember this discourse on the Dhamma as "The Sweet-Morsel Discourse".'

That is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Ānanda was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 12. *Vattā*—the Sayer is explained by the *Tikā* (vol. ii.p. 63) as

'Catusaccadhammaṃ vadati' ti ciram saccapaṭivedham pavattento vadati' ti pavattā'. There is perhaps a pun with *vattati* and *pavattati* (to set the wheel rolling forward), see e. g. Sutta 12, para. 9.

Atthassa ninnetā—the Elucidator of Meaning: this follows the Commentary; but the phrase could also mean 'Bringer of Good' or 'Guide to the Goal'.

para. 16: *papañceti*—diversifies: for *papañca* in this sense of Sutta 11, para. 5. *Papañca* has three meanings: (1) obstacle or delay (Vis. 125), (2) diffuseness (MA. on Sutta 18), (3) diversification (as the function of craving, wrong view and conceit, according to the Comy). P.T.S. Dict. has missed the point, and 'obsession' is definitely wrong and unjustified.

The sense here is this: the coincidence of eye, visible form and eye consciousness is called contact. Contact according to Dependent Origination is the principal condition for feeling. Feeling and perception are inseparable (Sutta 3, para. 9.). What is perceived as 'this' is thought about in its differences and is thus diversified from 'that' and from 'me'. This diversification (involving craving for forms, wrong view about permanence, etc., of forms, and involving the conceit 'I') leads to preoccupation with evaluating the desirability of past and present forms with a view to obtaining desirable forms in the future.

para. 17. *phassapaññattim paññāpessati*—he will recognize the manifestation of contact: for the Sutta use of *paññatti* see e.g. D. Sutta 9. The Commentarial theory of *Paññatti* (see Puggalapaññatti Comy) grew up out of this. *Paññatti* is a noun from the causative (*Paññāpeti*) or passive (*Paññāyati*) of *pajānāti* (to understand). The sense is 'making understood' or a 'being understood' and in that sense it is the 'notion' or 'description' or 'symbol' by which actual experience is 'made understood', 'made known', and is thus allied to a 'name' or 'concept'. It is of first importance in the theory of perception.

Sammaditthi Sutta

Right View

Introduction

A Sutta which expounds in sixteen ways what 'a man of right view' is. There are to be heard in the Buddhist world confused and vague voices which proclaim that everyone is free to believe what they like in Buddhism. This amounts to saying that there is no such thing as Right View in the Buddha's Teachings. But not only in this Sutta but all through the various collections of discourses one comes upon formulations of *wrong views* (with the reasons clearly stated why they are wrong), *right view* as taught by the Buddha and anyone else who taught or teaches in agreement with Dhamma, this last leading on by practice and attainment to *perfect view* (the Pāli word *sammā* can mean either 'right' or 'perfect'). If one wishes to reach the perfect view of the Arahant, then it is necessary to know, and to put one's knowledge into practice, what right view is. One should know these various formulations of right view so that when one meets situations in one's own life where they apply, one can use them. And one should know them clearly so that if asked: 'What is right view about the four Noble Truths?' one can answer readily. Of course, the extent to which one can explain any point of Dhamma will depend not so much upon one's learning as upon one's practice. Learning piles up facts, but does not clear the mind as practice does. These aspects of right view become clear to those who practise moral conduct, meditation and grow in insight-wisdom, and the more they practise the greater will their understanding be. Initially though, one should go through these sixteen headings one by one—

the profitable and unprofitable,
nutriment,
the four truths,
ageing and death,

birth,
 being,
 clinging
 craving,
 feeling,
 contact,
 the sixfold base,
 name and form,
 consciousness
 formations,
 ignorance,
 taints,

and ask oneself: 'Do I know what is right view in this case?'

The Sutta (9)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park.

There the venerable Sāriputta addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Friend,' they replied. The venerable Sāriputta said this:

2. "A man of right view" is said, friends. In what way is a noble disciple a man of right view, his view rectified, having perfect confidence in the Dhamma, this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'Indeed, friend, we would come from far away to learn from the venerable Sāriputta the meaning of this pronouncement. It would be good if the meaning of this pronouncement would occur to the venerable Sāriputta. Having heard it from him, the bhikkhus will remember it.'

'Then, friends, listen and heed well what I shall say.'

'Even so, friend,' the bhikkhus replied. The venerable Sāriputta said this:

(The Profitable And Unprofitable)

3. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands the unprofitable, the root of the unprofitable, the profitable, and the root of the profitable, in that way he is a man of right view, his view rectified, having perfect confidence in the Dhamma, this being the true object of faith that he has come to.

4. 'And what is the unprofitable, the root of the unprofitable; what is the profitable, the root of the profitable?

'Killing beings is unprofitable. Taking what is not given is unprofitable. Misconduct in sexual desires is unprofitable. False speech is unprofitable. Malicious speech is unprofitable. Harsh speech is unprofitable. Gossip is unprofitable. Covetousness is unprofitable. Ill-will is unprofitable. Wrong view is unprofitable. This is what is called unprofitable.

5. 'And what is the root of the unprofitable? Greed is a root of the unprofitable. Hate is a root of the unprofitable. Delusion is a root of the unprofitable. This is what is called the root of the unprofitable.

6. 'And what is the profitable? Abstention from killing living beings is profitable. Abstention from taking what is not given is profitable. Abstention from misconduct in sexual desires is profitable. Abstention from false speech is profitable. Abstention from malicious speech is profitable. Abstention from harsh speech is profitable. Abstention from gossip is profitable. Abstention from covetousness is profitable. Abstention from ill-will is profitable. Abstention from wrong view is profitable. This is what is called profitable.

7. 'And what is the root of the profitable? Non-greed is a root of the profitable. Non-hate is a root of the profitable. Non-delusion is a root of the profitable. This is what is called the root of the profitable.

8. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood the unprofitable, the root of the unprofitable, the profitable and the root of the profitable he entirely abandons the underlying tendency to lust, he abolishes the underlying tendency to resistance, extirpates the underlying tendency to the view and conceit "I am", and by abandoning ignorance and arousing True Knowledge he here and now makes an end of suffering. In that

way a noble disciple is a man of right view, his view is rectified, he has perfect confidence in the Dhamma and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.'

9. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied and they delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view, his view rectified, having perfect confidence in the Dhamma, this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(Nutriment)

10. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands nutriment, the arising of nutriment, the cessation of nutriment, and the way leading to the cessation of nutriment, in that way he is a man of right view, his view is rectified, he has perfect confidence in the Dhamma and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

11. 'And what is nutriment, what is the origin of nutriment, what is the cessation of nutriment, what is the way leading to the cessation of nutriment?'

'There are these four kinds of nutriment for the maintenance and support of beings that already exist and for those seeking renewal of being. What four? They are, physical food as nutriment, gross or subtle, contact as the second, volition about (the state of) the mind as the third and consciousness as the fourth. With the arising of craving there is the arising of nutriment. With the cessation of craving there is the cessation of nutriment. The way leading to the cessation of nutriment is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.

12. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood nutriment... he entirely abandons the underlying tendency to greed... makes an end of suffering. In that way too a noble disciple is one of right view... and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.'

13. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied and delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(The Four Truths)

14. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands suffering, the origin of suffering, the cessation of suffering and the the way leading to the cessation of suffering, in that way he is a man of right view, his view is rectified, he has perfect confidence in the Dhamma and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

15. 'And what is suffering, what is the origin of suffering, what is the cessation of suffering, what is the way leading to the cessation of suffering?'

'Birth is suffering, ageing is suffering, sickness is suffering, death is suffering, sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair are suffering, not to get what one wants is suffering, in short, the five aggregates affected by clinging are suffering. This is what is called suffering.

16. 'And what is the origin of suffering? It is craving which produces renewed being, is accompanied by delight and lust, delights in this and that, that is to say, craving for sensual desires, craving for being, craving for non-being. This is what is called the origin of suffering.

17. 'And what is the cessation of suffering? It is the remainderless fading and ceasing, the giving up, relinquishing, letting go and rejecting of that same craving. This is what is called the cessation of suffering.

18. 'And what is the way leading to the cessation of suffering? It is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

19. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . . he is one of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.'

20. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(Ageing And Death)

21. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands ageing and death, the origin of ageing and death, the cessation of ageing and death, and the way leading to the cessation of ageing and death, in that way he is a man of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

22. 'But what is ageing and death, what is the origin of ageing and death, what is the cessation of ageing and death, what is the way leading to the cessation of ageing and death?'

'In the various orders of beings, the ageing of beings, their old age, brokenness (of teeth), grayness (of hair), wrinkles, decline of life, and weakness of faculties—that is what is called ageing.

23. 'In the various orders of beings, the decease, the deceasing, passing-away, dissolution, disappearance, dying, completion of time, dissolution of aggregates—that is what is called death.

24. 'So this ageing and this death are what is called ageing-and-death. What the arising of birth, there is the arising of ageing-and-death. With the cessation of birth there is the cessation of ageing-and-death. The way leading to the cessation of ageing-and-death is just this Noble Eight-fold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

25. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

26. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view, so that his view is rectified . . . this being the true

object of faith that he has come to?’

‘There might be, friends.

(Birth)

27. ‘As soon as a noble disciple understands birth, the origin of birth, the way leading to the cessation of birth, in that way he is one of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

28. ‘And what is birth, what is the origin of birth, what is the cessation of birth, what is the way of leading to the cessation of birth?’

‘In the various orders of beings, the birth of beings, their coming to birth, precipitation (in the womb), generation, manifestation of aggregates, obtaining the bases for contact, is what is called birth. With the arising of being there is the arising of birth. With the cessation of being there is the cessation of birth. The way leading to the cessation of birth is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

29. ‘After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .’

30. Saying, ‘Good, friend,’ the bhikkhus were satisfied, and delighted in the venerable Sāriputta’s words. Then they asked him a further question: ‘But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith that he has come to?’

‘There might be, friends.

(Being)

31. ‘As soon as a noble disciple understands being, the origin of being, the cessation of being, the way leading to the cessation of being, in that way he is a man of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

32. ‘And what is being, what is the origin of being, what is the cessation of being, what is the way leading to the cessation of being?’

‘There are these three kinds of being: sensual desire being, (subtle) form being and formless being. With the arising of clinging there is

the arising of being. With the cessation of clinging there is the cessation of being. The way leading to the cessation of being is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

33. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

34. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question. 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(Clinging)

35. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands clinging, the origin of clinging, the way leading to the cessation of clinging, in that way he is a man of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

36. 'And what is clinging, what is the origin of clinging, what is the cessation of clinging, what is the way leading to the cessation of clinging?'

'There are these four kinds of clinging: sensual desire clinging, (false) view clinging, rite and ritual clinging, and self-theory clinging. With the arising of craving there is the arising of clinging. With the cessation of craving there is the cessation of clinging. The way leading to the cessation of clinging is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

37. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

38. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view, his view rectified . . . this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(Craving)

39. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands craving, the origin of craving, the cessation of craving and the way leading to the cessation of craving, in that way he is a man of right view... and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

40. 'And what is craving, what is the cessation of craving, what is the way leading to the cessation of craving?

'There are these six classes of craving: craving for forms, craving for sounds, craving for odours, craving for flavours, craving for tangibles, craving for dhammas. With the arising of feeling there is the arising of craving. With the cessation of feeling there is the cessation of craving. The way leading to the cessation of craving is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view... right concentration.

41. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood ...'

42. Saying, 'Good friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and delighted in venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view... this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(Feeling)

43. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands feeling, the origin of feeling, the cessation of feeling, and the way leading to the cessation of feeling, in that way he is a man of right view... and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

44. 'And what is feeling, what is the origin of feeling, what is the cessation of feeling, what is the way leading to the cessation of feeling?

'There are these six classes of feeling: feeling born of eye-contact, feeling born of ear-contact, feeling born of nose-contact, feeling born of tongue-contact, feeling born of body-contact, feeling born of mind contact. With the arising of contact there is the arising of feeling. With cessation

of contact there is the cessation of feeling. The way leading to the cessation of feeling is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

45. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

46. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question. 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(Contact)

47. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands contact, the origin of contact, the cessation of contact, and the way leading to the cessation of contact, in that way he is a man of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

48. 'And what is contact, what is the origin of contact, what is the cessation of contact, what is the way leading to the cessation of contact?'

'There are these six classes of contact: eye-contact, ear-contact, nose-contact, tongue-contact, body-contact, mind-contact. With the arising of the sixfold base there is the arising of contact. With the cessation of the sixfold base there is the cessation of contact. The way leading to the cessation of contact is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

49. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

50. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied and delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith which he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(The Sixfold Base)

51. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands the sixfold base, the origin of the sixfold base, the cessation of the sixfold base, and the way leading to the cessation of the sixfold base, he is a man of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.'

52. 'And what is the sixfold base, what is the origin of the sixfold base, what is the cessation of the sixfold base, what is the way leading to the cessation of the sixfold base?'

'There are these six bases: the eye-base, the-ear base, the nose-base, the tongue-base, the body-base, the mind-base. With the arising of name-and-form there is the arising of the sixfold base. With the cessation of name-and-form there is the cessation of the sixfold base. The way leading to the cessation of the sixfold base is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.'

53. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

54. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith which he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.'

(Name-And-Form)

55. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands name-and-form, the origin of name-and-form, the cessation of name-and-form, and the way leading to the cessation of name-and-form, in that way he is a man of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.'

56. 'And what is name-and-form, what is the origin of name-and-form, what is the cessation of name-and-form, what is the way leading to the cessation of name-and-form?'

57. 'Feeling, perception, volition, contact and attention, these are what is called name.'

58. 'The four great primary elements and the form derived from the four great primary elements, these are what is called form.

59. 'So this name and this form are what is called name-and-form. With the arising of consciousness there is the arising of name-and-form. With the cessation of consciousness there is the cessation of name-and-form. The way leading to the cessation of name-and-form is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

60. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

61. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(Consciousness)

62. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands consciousness, the origin of consciousness, the cessation of consciousness, and the way leading to the cessation of consciousness, in that way he is a man of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

63. 'And what is consciousness, what is the origin of consciousness, what is the cessation of consciousness, what is the way leading to the cessation of consciousness?'

'There are these six classes of consciousness: eye-consciousness, ear-consciousness, nose-consciousness, tongue-consciousness, body-consciousness, mind-consciousness. With the arising of formations there is the arising of consciousness. With the cessation of formations there is the cessation of consciousness. The way leading to the cessation of consciousness is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

64. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

65. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied and they delight-

ed in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(Formations)

66. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands formations, the arising of formations, the cessation of formations, and the way leading to the cessation of formations, in that way he is a man of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

67. 'And what are formations, what is the origin of formations, what is the cessation of formations, what is the way leading to the cessation of formations?'

'There are these three kinds of formations: the bodily formation, the verbal formation, the mental formation. With the arising of ignorance there is the arising of formations. With the cessation of ignorance there is the cessation of formations. The way leading to the cessation of formations is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.

68. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

69. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view . . . this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.

(Ignorance)

70. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands ignorance, the origin of ignorance, the cessation of ignorance, and the way leading to the cessation of ignorance, in that way he is a man of right view . . . and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.

71. 'And what is ignorance, what is the origin of ignorance, what is the cessation of ignorance, what is the way leading to the cessation of ignorance?'

'Unknowing about suffering, about the origin of suffering, about the cessation of suffering, about the way leading to the cessation of suffering, is what is called ignorance. With the arising of taints there is the arising of ignorance. With the cessation of taints there is the cessation of ignorance. The way leading to the cessation of ignorance is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view . . . right concentration.'

72. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood . . .'

73. Saying, 'Good, friend,' the bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words. Then they asked him a further question: 'But, friend, might there be another way in which a noble disciple is a man of right view, his view is rectified, having perfect confidence in the Dhamma, this being the true object of faith that he has come to?'

'There might be, friends.'

(Taints)

74. 'As soon as a noble disciple understands the taints, the origin of taints, the cessation of taints, and the way leading to the cessation of taints, in that way he is a man of right view, his view is rectified, he has perfect confidence in the Dhamma and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.'

75. 'And what are the taints, what is the origin of taints, what is the cessation of taints, what is the way leading to the cessation of taints?'

'There are three kinds of taints: the taint of sensual desires, the taint of being, and the taint of ignorance. With the arising of ignorance there is the arising of taints. With the cessation of ignorance there is the cessation of taints. The way leading to the cessation of taints is just this Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.'

76. 'After a noble disciple has thus understood the taints, the origin of

taints, the cessation of taints, and the way leading to the cessation of taints, he entirely abandons the underlying tendency to lust, he abolishes the underlying tendency to resistance, extirpates the underlying tendency to the view and conceit "I am", and by abandoning ignorance and arousing True Knowledge he here and now makes an end of suffering. In that way too a noble disciple is a man of right view, his view is rectified, he has perfect confidence in the Dhamma and this is the true object of faith that he has come to.'

That is what the venerable Sāriputta said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the venerable Sāriputta's words.

Notes

para. 2. *saddhamma*, the word, traced as a ger. of *sant* + *dahati* (or *dharati*). It can be taken as an emphatic??.....??¹ of *dhamma*, in which case it is renderable as the True Dhamma; or it can be taken as a ger. from *saddahati* ('to have faith') from which the noun *saddhā* ('faith') comes, in which case it is renderable by '(true) object of faith' or 'what faith should be placed in (rightly)'.

1. Untraceable word in the original Ms: 'meteorative'? or 'metiorative', 'metioratic'??

Mahacattarisaka Sutta

The Forty Parts

Introduction

A methodical description of the Noble Eightfold Path which can be compared, like some other Suttas dealing with the highest wisdom-understanding, to towering architectural constructions standing upon secure foundations. 'Here, right view comes first': this is the theme of this Sutta. 'Here' means 'in this Teaching' (sāsana) where clear understanding of Dhamma is a pre-requisite for its practice and attainment. So *Right View* is understanding all the factors of the ignoble eightfold Path as wrong, besides understanding the content of the Noble Eightfold Path-factors as right. Along with right view go two other Path-factors: right effort and right mindfulness. Just as it is impossible to steer clear of wrong view without the guiding light of right view, so without effort and mindfulness one will have neither the mental energy nor the awareness required to put one's feet on the Noble Path. And those who meditate should note that 'the noble right concentration' has as its supports and requisites the other seven Path-factors, which include the three on moral conduct: right speech, right action, right livelihood. Finally, the Arahant's tenfold Path is mentioned, the additional two factors being right knowledge and right deliverance. The Buddha says that wise people can find nothing to condemn in the forty parts of this Sutta. If we consider this statement carefully, we must conclude that he is right for none of the Path-factors call for belief: they are obviously all beneficial and verifiable.

The Sutta (117)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living in Sāvatti in Jeta's

Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, I shall teach you the Noble right concentration with (its) supports and with (its) requisites. Listen and heed well what I shall say.'

'Yes, venerable sir,' the bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

3. 'And what, bhikkhus, is the Noble right concentration with (its) supports and with (its) requisites? These are right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness: any unification of mind equipped with these seven factors is called the Noble right concentration with (its) supports and with (its) requisites.'

(View)

4. 'Here, bhikkhus, right view comes first. And how does right view come first? A man understands wrong view as wrong view, and he understands right view as right view: this is his right view.'

5. 'And what is wrong view?¹ There is nothing given, nothing offered, nothing sacrificed, no fruit or ripening of good and bad kammās, no this world, no other world, no mother, no father, no spontaneously (born) beings, no good and virtuous monks and divines that have themselves realized by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other world. This is wrong view.'

6. 'And what is right view? There is twofold right view, I say: there is right view affected by taints which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence; and there is the Noble One's right view unaffected by taints, which is supermundane and a factor of the Path.'

7. 'And what is right view affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence? There is what is given and what is offered and what is sacrificed, and there is fruit and ripening

1. For this view see Sutta 60.

of good and bad karmas, and there is this world and the other world and mother and father and spontaneously (born) beings and good and virtuous monks and divines that have themselves realized by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other world. This is right view affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence.

8. 'And what is the Noble Ones' right view unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path? Any understanding, understanding faculty, understanding power, investigation-of-dhammas enlightenment factor, right view as path factor, in one whose mind is noble and taint-free, who possesses and develops the Path: this is called the Noble Ones' right view unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path.

9. 'He makes efforts to abandon wrong view and enter upon right view: this is right effort.

'Mindful he abandons wrong view; mindful he enters upon and abides in right view: this is his right mindfulness.

'So he has these three dhammas that have parallel movement and parallel turn-over with (his initial) right view, that is to say (developed) right view, right effort and right mindfulness.

(Intention)

10. 'Here, bhikkhus, right view comes first. And how does right view come first?

'A man understands wrong intention as wrong intention, and he understands right intention as right intention: this is his right view.

11. 'And what is wrong intention? Intention directed to sensual desires, intention directed to ill-will, intention directed to cruelty: this is his wrong intention.

12. 'And what is right intention? There is twofold right intention, I say: there is right intention affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence; and there is the Noble Ones' right intention unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path.

13. 'And what is right intention affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence? Intention directed to renunciation, intention directed to non-ill-will, intention directed to non-cruelty: this is right intention affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence.

14. 'And what is the Noble Ones' right intention unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path? Any thought, thinking², intention, fixing, fixedness, directing of mind, verbal process in one whose mind is noble and taint-free, who possesses and develops the Path: this is called the Noble Ones' right intention unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path.

15. 'He makes efforts to abandon wrong intention and to enter upon right intention: this is right effort.

'Mindful he abandons wrong intention; mindful he enters upon and abides in right intention: this is his right mindfulness.

'So he has these three dhammas that have parallel movement and parallel turn-over with right intention, that is to say, right view, right effort, and right mindfulness.

(Speech)

16. 'Here right view comes first. And how does right view come first?

A man understands wrong speech as wrong speech, and he understands right speech as right speech: this is his right view.

17. 'And what is wrong speech? False speech, malicious speech, harsh speech, gossip: this is wrong speech.

18. 'And what is right speech? There is twofold right speech, I say: there is right speech affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence; and there is the Noble Ones' right speech unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path.

19. 'And what is right speech affected by taints, which partakes of

2. This includes 'initial application', which is another translation of *vitakka* used where it is found in connection with *jhāna*.

merit and ripens into the essentials of existence? Abstinence from false speech, abstinence from malicious speech, abstinence from harsh speech, abstinence from gossip: this is right speech affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence.

20. 'And what is the Noble Ones' right speech unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path? Any abstaining, abstention, reabstention, abstinence, from the four kinds of verbal misconduct in one whose mind is noble and taint-free, who possesses and develops the Path: this is the Noble Ones' right speech unaffected by taints, which is supramandane and a factor of the Path.

21. 'He makes efforts to abandon wrong speech and to enter upon right speech: this is this right effort.

'Mindful he abandons wrong speech, mindful he enters upon and abides in right speech: this is his right mindfulness.

'So he has these three dhammas that have parallel movement and parallel turn-over with right speech, that is to say, right view, right effort and right mindfulness.

(Action)

22. 'Here right view comes first. And how does right view come first?

A man understands wrong action as wrong action and he understands right action as right action: this is his right view.

23. 'And what is wrong action? Killing living beings, taking what is not given, and misconduct in sexual desires: this is wrong action.

24. 'And what is right action? There is twofold right action, I say: there is right action affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence; and there is the Noble Ones' right action unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path.

25. 'And what is right action affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence? Abstinence from killing living beings, abstinence from taking what is not given, abstinence from wrong conduct in sexual desires: this is right action affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence.

26. 'And what is the Noble Ones' right action unaffected by taints,

which is supramundane and a factor of the Path? Any abstaining, abstinence, reabstention, abstinence, from the three kinds of bodily misconduct in one whose mind is noble and taint-free, who possesses and develops the Path: this is the Noble Ones' right action unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path.

27. 'He makes efforts to abandon wrong action and to enter upon right action: this is right effort.

'Mindful he abandons wrong action, mindful he enters upon and abides in right action: this is his right mindfulness.

'So he has these three dhammas that have parallel movement and parallel turn-over with right action, that is to say, right view, right effort and right mindfulness.

(Livelihood)

28. 'Here, right view comes first. And how does right view come first?

A man understands wrong livelihood as wrong livelihood, and he understands right livelihood as right livelihood: this is his right view.

29. 'And what is wrong livelihood? Scheming, talking, hinting, belittling, pursuing gain with gain: this is wrong livelihood (for a bhikkhu).

30. 'And what is right livelihood? There is twofold right livelihood, I say: there is right livelihood affected by taints which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence; and there is the Noble Ones' right livelihood unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path.

31. 'And what is right livelihood affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence? Here a disciple of the Noble Ones abandons wrong livelihood and gains his living by right livelihood: this is right livelihood affected by taints, which partakes of merit and ripens into the essentials of existence.

32. 'And what is the Noble Ones' right livelihood unaffected by taints, which is supramundane and a factor of the Path? Any abstaining, abstinence, reabstention, abstinence, from wrong livelihood in one whose mind is noble and taint-free who possesses and develops the Path: this is the Noble Ones' right livelihood unaffected by taints, which is supra-

mundane and a factor of the Path.

33. 'He makes efforts to abandon wrong livelihood, and to enter upon right livelihood: this is his right effort.

'Mindful he abandons wrong livelihood, mindful he enters upon and abides in right livelihood: this is his right mindfulness.

'So he has these three dhammas that have parallel movement and parallel turn-over with right livelihood, that is to say, right view, right effort and right mindfulness.

(Concentration, Knowledge, Deliverance)

34. 'Here right view comes first. And how does right view come first? In one of right view, right intention is brought to be. In one of right intention, right speech is brought to be. In one of right speech, right action is brought to be. In one of right action, right livelihood is brought to be. In one of right livelihood, right effort is brought to be. In one of right effort, right mindfulness is brought to be. In one of right mindfulness, right concentration is brought to be. In one of right concentration, right knowledge is brought to be. In one of right knowledge, right deliverance is brought to be.

'So, bhikkhus, the way of one in the higher training³ has eight factors, while the Arahant's has ten.

35. 'Here right view comes first. And how does right view come first?

'In one of right view, wrong view is abolished, and the many evil unprofitable dhammas that are given positive being with wrong view as their condition are also abolished in him. And the many profitable dhammas that have right view as their condition come to perfection in him through development.

'In one of right intention ...

'In one of right speech ...

'In one of right action ...

'In one of right livelihood ...

'In one of right effort ...

'In one of right mindfulness ...

3. Sekha: a Stream-winner, Once-returner, Non-returner

'In one of right concentration . . .

'In one of right knowledge . . .

'In one of right deliverance, wrong deliverance is abolished, and the many evil unprofitable dhammas that are given positive being with wrong deliverance as their condition are also abolished in him. And the many profitable dhammas that have right deliverance as their condition come to perfection in him through development.

(The Forty Parts)

36. 'So there are twenty parts on the profitable side, and twenty parts on the unprofitable side³. This discourse on the Dhamma in forty essential parts has been set rolling and cannot be stopped by monk or divine or god or Māra or Divinity or anyone in the world.

37. 'If any monk or divine conceived this discourse of the Dhamma in forty essential parts to be censurable and reprehensible then there are ten legitimate deductions from his assertions that would provide here and now grounds for condemning him.

'If any such worthy one censures right view, then any monks and divines that have wrong view are honoured and commended by him.

'If any such worthy one censures right intention, . . .

' . . . right speech . . .

' . . . right action . . .

' . . . right livelihood . . .

' . . . right effort . . .

' . . . right mindfulness . . .

' . . . right concentration . . .

' . . . right knowledge . . .

'If any such worthy one censures right deliverance, then any monks and divines that have wrong deliverance are honoured and commended by him.

'If any monk or divine conceived that this discourse . . . here and now

3. For instance, in the case of right view, there is 'right view' (=kamma) and 'the many profitable dhammas' dependent on this (=result), 'wrong view' and 'the many evil unprofitable dhammas' arising dependently (=result): so there are four parts for each factor, and so 40 for the whole ten factors.

grounds for condemning him.

'Even those of Okkalā, namely Vassa and Bhañña⁴, who hold the theory of no reason, the theory of no action, and the theory that there is nothing (given and the rest), would not conceive that this discourse on the Dhamma in forty essential parts should be censured and condemned. Why is that? For fear of blame, attack and confutation.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 8. 'possess the Path' by gaining the First Path (Stream entry) and 'develop the Path' by gaining the other three Paths.

para. 14. *abhiniropāna*—directing: lit. 'causing to mount upon'. Used in the Paṭisambhidāmagga and Abhidhamma as a definition of *saṅkappa* (see Ps. i, 16; Dhs. para. 7. Vbh. 87). No other Sutta reference apparently.

aḍḍhanā-vyappaṇā—fixing, fixity: Cf. Paṭisambhidā; Dhs.7.

para. 20. *ārati-virati*—abstaining, abstention: cf. Sn. 264 (in spite of P.T.S. Dict.). Cf. Nd. 2, 462; Dhs. 299.

para. 29. As to the words beginning with '*Kuḥanā*—scheming', the explanation is given at Vis. p.23 (Quoting Vbh. 352), Vis. p.26f. The meanings given in P.T.S. Dict. must be revised.

In general, this Sutta which is a detailed and structural study of the Eightfold Path, has lent a good deal of its material to the Abhidhamma, as is the case with Sutta III (not in this selection).

4. It is not known where these people lived. For the views they held see Suttas 60 (Apannaka), 76 (Sandaka).

Rathavinita Sutta

The Relay Coach

Introduction

A Sutta which illustrates clearly by means of a simile how Dhamma should be practised. In ancient times and even till recently in some places, a long journey which had to be accomplished quickly could be done only with a number of post horses or post carriages. From the first which carried one part of the way, one dismounted to find the second one waiting. In the same way, then, purification of virtue when fully practised brings one to purification of mind, and so on with the other five stages of purity. Does this mean that a Buddhist should not meditate until his or her moral conduct (virtue) is quite pure? No, the simile should not be pressed too far. When one seriously makes effort to purify one's precepts—five, eight, ten or 227, then one may try meditation—and attain some success. But when complete purity of precepts is arrived at, then the mind will enter meditation deeply. None of these stages of purity can be skipped over. Voices are heard here and there in the Buddhist world, intellectual and scholarly voices, which imply that there is no need to meditate and that purity of view will be arrived at when one's mindfulness in everyday life of the Abhidhamma's categories is strong enough. A convenient view for those who do not want to make the effort to meditate! (Views are always 'convenient' to the person holding them since they arise out of some hidden desire.) But it is not likely that purity of view and the higher stages can be attained without making the effort at sitting long and walking long, all the time in seclusion and with mindfulness. So when one hears some advertized 'short cut' just remember the simile of the Relay Coach. And 'short cuts' often turn out long wanderings!

The Sutta (24)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the Squirrels' Sanctuary.

2. Then a number of bhikkhus from (the Blessed One's) native land who had spent the Rains there, went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, they sat down at one side. When they had done so, the Blessed One asked them: 'Bhikkhus, who is there in (my) native land that is esteemed by the bhikkhus of (my) native land, his companions in the life divine, in this way: with few wishes himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on fewness of wishes; content himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on contentment; secluded himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on seclusion; aloof from society himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on aloofness from society; energetic himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on energy; perfect in virtue himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on perfection of virtue; perfect in concentration himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on perfection of concentration; perfect in understanding himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on perfection of understanding; perfect in deliverance himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on perfection of deliverance; perfect in the knowing and seeing of deliverance himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on perfection in knowing and seeing deliverance; who advises, informs, instructs, urges, rouses and encourages his companions in the life divine?'

'Venerable sir, the venerable Mantāniputta called Punna is esteemed in the native land by bhikkhus of the native land, his companions in the life divine, in this way: with few wishes himself, he talks to the bhikkhus on fewness of wishes... rouses and encourages his companions in the life divine.'

3. Now on that occasion the venerable Sāriputta was seated near the Blessed One. Then it occurred to the venerable Sāriputta: 'It is gain for the venerable Punna Mantāniputta, it is great gain for him that wise companions in the life divine praise him point by point in the Master's presence. Now suppose that sometime or other, we were to meet the venerable Punna Mantāniputta and have some conversation with him?'

4. Then, when the Blessed One had stayed at Rājagaha as long as he chose, he set out to go by stages to Sāvatti. Wandering by stages, he at length arrived at Sāvatti. There he lived in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindikā's Park.

5. The venerable Punna Mantāniputta heard: 'The Blessed One, it seems, has arrived at Sāvatti and is living in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindikā's Park.' Then the venerable Punna Mantāniputta set his resting-place in order and taking his outer robe and bowl set out to go by stages to Sāvatti. Wandering by stages, he at length arrived at Sāvatti (and he went) to Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindikā's Park, to (see) the Blessed One. After paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, the Blessed One instructed, roused and encouraged him with talk on the Dhamma. Then satisfied and delighting in the Blessed One's words, the venerable Punna Mantāniputta rose from his seat, and after paying homage to the Blessed One, keeping him on his right, he went to the Blind Mens' Grove for the day's abiding.¹

6. Then a certain bhikkhu went to the venerable Sāriputta and said to him: 'Friend Sāriputta, the bhikkhu Punna Mantāniputta of whom you have always spoken highly has just been instructed, urged, roused and encouraged by the Blessed One with talk on the Dhamma and being satisfied and delighting in the Blessed One's words, he has now risen from his seat, and after paying homage to him, keeping him on his right, he is going to the Blind Mens' Grove for the day's abiding.'

7. Then the venerable Sāriputta quickly picked up a mat and followed close behind the venerable Punna Mantāniputta, keeping his head in sight. Then the venerable Punna Mantāniputta went in to the Blind Mens' Grove and sat down for the day's abiding at the root of a tree. And the venerable Sāriputta went into the Blind Mens' Grove and sat down for the day's abiding at the root of a tree.

8. Then when it was evening, the venerable Sāriputta rose from meditation, and went to the venerable Punna Mantāniputta and exchanged greetings with him, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said to the

1. Meaning to stay int he attainments of meditation for the day.

venerable Punna Mantāniputta:

9. 'Is the life divine lived under the Blessed One, friend?'

'Yes, friend.'

'But, friend, is it for the goal of purification of virtue that the life divine is lived under the Blessed One?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is it for the goal of purification of mind?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is it for the goal of purification of view?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is it for the goal of purification by overcoming doubt?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is it for the goal of purification by knowledge and vision of what is and what is not the path?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is it for the goal of purification by knowledge and vision of the way?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is it for the goal of purification by knowledge and vision?'

'No, friend.'

'Friend, when asked: "But, friend is it for the goal of purification of virtue that the life divine is lived under the Blessed One", you replied: "No, friend", and when asked: "Then is it for the goal of purification of mind . . . purification of view . . . purification by overcoming doubt . . . purification by knowledge and vision of what is and what is not the Path . . . purification by knowledge and vision of the Way . . . purification by knowledge and vision" you replied: "No, friend". For what goal, then, is the life divine lived under the Blessed One?'

10. 'Friend, it is for the goal of Nibbāna through not clinging that the life divine is lived under the Blessed One.'

11. 'But, friend, is the purification of virtue Nibbāna through not clinging?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is the purification of mind Nibbāna through not clinging?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is the purification of view Nibbāna through not clinging?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is the purification by overcoming doubt Nibbāna through not clinging?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is the purification by knowledge and vision of what is and what is not the Path Nibbāna through not clinging?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is the purification by knowledge and vision of the Way Nibbāna through not clinging?'

'No, friend.'

'Then is the purification by knowledge and vision Nibbāna through not clinging?'

'No, friend.'

'When asked: "But, friend, is the purification of virtue Nibbāna through not clinging?" you replied: "No, friend", and when asked: "Then is the purification of mind...the purification of view...the purification by overcoming doubt...purification by knowledge and vision of what is and what is not the Path...the purification by knowledge and vision of the Way...the purification by knowledge and vision Nibbāna through not clinging?" you replied: "No, friend". But how should the meaning of these statements be regarded?'

12. 'Friend, if the Blessed One had described purification of virtue as Nibbāna through not clinging, he would have described what is still accompanied by clinging as Nibbāna through not clinging. If the Blessed One had described purification of mind... purification of view... purification by overcoming doubt... purification by knowledge and vision of what is and what is not the Path... purification by knowledge and vision of the Way... purification by knowledge and vision as Nibbāna through not clinging, he would have described what is still accompanied by clinging as Nibbāna through not clinging. And if what is without these dhammas were Nibbāna through not clinging, then an ordinary man would have reached Nibbāna, for an ordinary man is without these dhammas.

13. 'As to that, friend, I shall give you a simile, for some wise men understand by means of a simile the meaning of what is said first. Suppose the King Pasenadi of Kosala while living at Sāvatti had some urgent business to settle at Sāketa, and that between Sāvatti and Sāketa seven relay coaches were kept ready for him; and then King Pasenadi of Kosala came out of the inner palace door in Sāvatti and mounted the first relay coach; and by means of the first relay coach he arrived at the second relay coach; then he dismounted from the first coach and mounted the second coach; and by means of the second coach he arrived at the third coach . . . by means of the third coach he arrived at the fourth coach . . . by means of the fourth coach he arrived at the fifth coach . . . by means of the fifth coach he arrived at the sixth coach . . . by means of the sixth coach he arrived at the seventh coach, and by means of the seventh coach he arrived at the inner palace door in Sāketa. Then, when he had come to the inner palace door, his friends and acquaintances, his relatives and kin, asked him: "Sire, did you come from Sāvatti by means of this coach to the inner palace door in Sāketa?"—how then should King Pasenadi of Kosala answer in order to answer correctly?"

'In order to answer correctly, friend, he should answer thus: "Here while living at Savatti I had some urgent business to settle at Sāketa. And between Sāvatti and Sāketa seven relay coaches are kept ready for me. Then I came out of the inner palace door in Sāvatti and mounted the first relay coach and by means of the first relay coach I arrived at the second . . . and by means of the seventh relay coach I arrived at the inner palace door in Sāketa." In order to answer correctly he should answer thus.'

14. 'So too, friend, the purification of virtue has the purification of mind as its goal; the purification of mind has the purification of view as its goal; the purification of view has the purification by overcoming doubt as its goal; the purification by overcoming doubt has the purification by knowledge and vision of what is and what is not the Path as its goal; the purification by knowledge and vision of what is and what is not the Path has the purification by knowledge and vision of the Way as its goal; the purification by knowledge and vision of the Way has the purification by knowledge and vision as its goal; the purification by

knowledge and vision has Nibbāna through not clinging as its goal. It is for the goal of Nibbāna through not clinging that the life divine is lived under the Blessed One.'

15. When this was said, the venerable Sāriputta asked the venerable Punna Mantāniputta: 'What is the venerable one's name, and how do his companions in the life divine know him?'

'My name is Punna, friend, and companions in the life divine know me as Mantāniputta.'

'It is wonderful, friend, it is marvellous; each profound question has been answered point by point by the venerable Punna Mantāniputta as a learned disciple who knows the Master's Teaching as it is. It is gain for his companions in the life divine, it is great gain for them, that they have the opportunity to see him and to honour him. And even if it were by carrying the venerable Punna Mantāniputta about on a cushion on their heads that his companions in the life divine might get the opportunity to see him and to honour him, it would be gain for them, great gain for them. And it is gain for us, great gain for us, that we have the opportunity of seeing the venerable Punna Mantāniputta and honouring him.'

16. When this was said, the venerable Punna Maniāiputta asked the venerable Sāriputta: 'What is the venerable one's name, and how do his companions in the life divine know him?'

'My name is Upatissa, friend, and companions in the life divine know me as Sāriputta.'

'Indeed, friend, we did not know that we were talking with the venerable Sāriputta, the disciple who is like of the Master himself. Had we known that it was the venerable Sāriputta, we should not have said so much. It is wonderful, friend, it is marvellous; each profound question has been put point by point by the venerable Sāriputta as a learned disciple who knows the Master's Teaching as it is. It is gain for his companions in the life divine, it is great gain for them, that they have the opportunity to see him and to honour him. And even if it were by carrying the venerable Sāriputta about on a cushion on their heads that his companions in the life divine might get the opportunity to see him and to honour him, it would be gain for them, great gain for them.'

And it is gain for us, great gain for us, that we have the opportunity of seeing the venerable Sāriputta and honouring him.'

Thus it was that these two great Nāgas² agreed with each other's good words,

Notes

para. 2. *Jātibhūmaka*—from the . . . native land . Not in P.T.Ś. Dict.

para. 9. for 'the path and what is not the path' cf. Sutta 98, para. 7, v. 34.

2. Great being (as tusker elephant or serpent), here a synonym for Arahant.

Mahatanhasankhaya Sutta The Exhaustion of Craving-2

Introduction (by Ven. Nyānamoli thera)

General Note:

The Bhikkhu Sāti states the wrong view that consciousness passes on from life to life independent of conditions. The Buddha proves this wrong by Dependent Arising. The whole discourse is consequently an exposition of the conditionality in all components of conscious existence. To drive this home, Dependent Arising (or the structure of conditionality) is approached and converged upon from several different successive points. The construction of the Sutta is as follows:

I. Setting. The Bhikkhu Sāti states his view that consciousness passes on from life to life independent of conditions, and he is rebuked.

II. Discourse Proper

A. *Exposition* of the six kinds of consciousness.

B. *General Questionnaire of Being*: do you understand what an entity is, that it is such only through its conditions, and how it ceases? Are you free from doubts about this? Do you cling to this purified view of yours?

C. *First approach to Dependent Arising*: from the problem of nutriment (=condition), which is indispensable to being.

1. *Exposition* of the four kinds of nutriment.

2. The source or nutriment is craving, and craving's source is feeling... traced *backwards* through consciousness to ignorance by *arising*.

D. Simple *exposition* of Dependent Arising (arrived at in C) as the structure of conscious existence (being).

1. a. Simple exposition of Dependent Arising *forwards* as *arising*.
1. b. Retracing *backwards* as *arising* in form of questionnaire.
1. c. Agreement that conditionality as *arising* is a general principle.
1. d. Repetition of D.1.a.
2. a. Simple exposition of Dependent Arising *forwards* as *cessation*.
2. b. Retracing *backwards* as *cessation* in form of questionnaire.
2. c. Agreement that conditionality as *cessation* is a general principle.
2. d. Repetition of D 2. a.

E. Questionnaire to drive home lesson so far taught and to ensure that it has been understood. Have you any doubts? Do you speak only from your own knowledge?

F.1 . *Application* of Dependent Arising to conscious existence: approach from the 'conception' (described in acceptable common usage) of a conscious being in the womb (this refers back indirectly to the wrong view originally expressed), his birth, and development into an ordinary man.

2. a. With his senses matured he pursues sensual desires.
2. b. His mind being limited (by ignorance and craving) - he is attracted and repelled by the objects of the six kinds of consciousness (see A 1.). He seeks or resists (loves or hates) the feelings of pleasure or pain associated with any of the six kinds of consciousness of those objects, and thus lust arises in him, which is the arising of clinging: clinging conditions being (becoming), and so

on with the rest of Dependent Arising (see Cl.a.) *forwards* as *arising* (thus laying up kamma for future rebirth).

3. a. With the appearance of a Tathāgata in the world, who teaches the Dhamma, the ordinary man whose conception was described in F, may hear the Teaching and in consequence leave home life to practise virtue (as renunciation) and concentration (secluded from sensual desire).
3. b. His mind not being limited owing to the suppression, temporarily, of craving, he is not attracted or repelled by the objects of the six kinds of consciousness. He neither seeks nor resists (neither loves nor hates) the feelings of pleasure or pain associated with any of the six kinds of consciousness of those objects, and thus lust ceases in him, which is the cessation of clinging: with the cessation of clinging, being (becoming) ceases, and so on with the rest of Dependent Arising *forwards* as *cessation* (thus laying up no kamma for rebirth).

III. Conclusion

(The use of words here in this Sutta is of first importance: see e.g. use of *bhūta*, *sambhavesin*, *pañhava*, *sambhavyanti*, *bhava*, etc., etc., misuse or misapprehension of these will ruin the whole peculiarly important ontological structure.)

Dependent Arising (paticca-samuppāda) reference: M. Sutta 9, D. Sutta 15, S. Samyutta XII, A. Tikanipāta, 61.)

The Sutta (38)

(I. Setting)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvātthi in the Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park.

2. Now on that occasion a pernicious view had arisen in a bhikkhu called Sāti, son of a fisherman, thus: 'As I understand the Dhamma taught by

the Blessed One, it is this same consciousness that travels and traverses (the round of rebirths).'

3. Many bhikkhus heard that this was so. Then they went to the bhikkhu Sāti, son of a fisherman,¹ and they asked him: 'Friend, is it true, as it seems, that the following pernicious view has arisen in you: "As I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One, it is this same consciousness that travels and traverses (the round of rebirths)"?''

'Exactly so, friends. As I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One, it is this same consciousness that travels and traverses (the round of rebirths).'

Then the bhikkhus desiring to detach him from that pernicious view, pressed and questioned and cross-questioned him thus: 'Friend Sāti, do not say thus, do not misrepresent the Blessed One, it is not good to misrepresent the Blessed One. The Blessed One would not speak thus, for consciousness has been stated in many discourses by the Blessed One to be dependently-arisen, since without the condition (for it) consciousness has no positive being.'

Yet although pressed and questioned and cross-questioned by them in this way, the bhikkhu Sāti, son of a fisherman, still obstinately misapprehended according to his pernicious view and insisted upon it, saying: 'Exactly so, friends, as I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One, it is this same consciousness that travels and traverses (the round or rebirths).'

4. Since the bhikkhus were unable to detach him from that pernicious view, they went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, they sat down at one side. When they had done so, they told him all that had occurred and they added: 'Venerable sir, since we have been unable to detach the bhikkhu Sāti, son of a fisherman, from this pernicious view, we have reported this matter to the Blessed One.'

5. Then the Blessed One addressed a certain bhikkhu thus: 'Come, bhikkhu, tell the bhikkhu Sāti, son of a fisherman, in my name that the master calls him.'

'Even so, venerable sir,' he replied, and he went to the bhikkhu Sāti

1. This descriptive phrase 'kevattaputta' is in Pāli just part of his name to distinguish this 'Sāti-fisherman's-son' from other Sātis among the bhikkhus.

and told him: 'The Master calls you, friend Sāti.'

'Even so, friend,' he replied, and he went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, the Blessed One asked him: 'Sāti, is it true, as it seems, that the following pernicious view has arisen in you: "As I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One, it is this same consciousness that travels and traverses (the round of rebirths)"?''

'Exactly so, venerable sir. As I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One, it is this same consciousness that travels and traverses (the round of rebirths).'

'What is that consciousness, Sāti?'

'Venerable sir, it is what speaks and feels and experiences here and there the ripening of good and evil actions.'

6. 'Misguided man, whom have you ever heard me teach the Dhamma to in that way? Misguided man, has not consciousness been stated by me in many discourses to be dependently-arisen, since without the condition (for it) consciousness has no positive being? But you, misguided man, have both misrepresented us by your wrong grasp of it and worked your own undoing by storing up much demerit, for this will be long for your harm and suffering.'

7. Then the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus, how do you conceive this: has this bhikkhu Sāti, son of a fisherman, kindled (in himself) even a spark (of understanding) in this Dhamma and Discipline?'

'Why should he, venerable sir? No, venerable sir.'

When this was said, the bhikkhu Sāti, son of a fisherman, sat silent, dismayed, with shoulders drooping and head down, glum and with nothing to say.

Then knowing that, the Blessed One told him: 'Misguided man, you will be described by this your own pernicious view. I shall question the bhikkhus on this matter.'

8. Then the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus, do you know the Dhamma taught by me as this bhikkhu Sāti, son of a fisherman, does when he both misrepresents us by his wrong grasp (of it) and works his own undoing by storing up much demerit?'

'No, venerable sir, for consciousness has been stated by the Blessed One in many discourses to be dependently-arisen, since without the condition (for it) consciousness has no positive being.'

'Good, bhikkhus, good that you know the Dhamma taught by me thus: for consciousness has been stated by me in many discourses to be dependently-arisen, since without the condition (for it) consciousness has no positive being. But this misguided man, Sāti, son of a fisherman, both misrepresents us by his wrong grasp (of it) and works his own undoing by storing up much demerit: for this will be long for his harm and suffering.

(II. A. An Exposition of Consciousness)

9. 'Bhikkhus, consciousness is reckonable only by the condition dependent on which it arises: when consciousness arises dependent on eye and forms, it is reckoned only as eye-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on ear and sounds, it is reckoned only as ear-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on nose and odours, it is reckoned only as nose-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on tongue and flavours, it is reckoned only as tongue-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on body and tangibles, it is reckoned only as body-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent only on mind and dhammas, it is reckoned only as mind-consciousness.

'Just as a fire is reckoned only by the condition dependent on which it arises: when fire burns dependent on logs, it is reckoned only as a log fire; when fire burns dependent on faggots, it is reckoned only as a faggot fire; when fire burns dependent on grass, it is reckoned only as a grass fire; when fire burns dependent on cowdung, it is reckoned only as a cowdung fire; when fire burns dependent on chaff, it is reckoned only as a chaff fire; when fire burns dependent on rubbish, it is reckoned only as a rubbish fire—so too, consciousness is reckonable only by the condition dependent on which it arises. When consciousness arises dependent on eye and forms it is reckoned only as eye-consciousness; when . . . consciousness arises dependent on mind and dhammas it is reckoned only as mind-consciousness.

(II. B. General Questionnaire on Being)

10. '“This (entity) is”': bhikkhus, is this how you see (it)?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'“Its coming to positive being is due to its nutriment”: bhikkhus, is this how you see (it)?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'“Whatever (the entity that) is, with the cessation of its nutriment it has the nature of cessation”: bhikkhus, is this how you see (it)?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

11. '“This (entity) is, is it not?": bhikkhus, does uncertainty arise in one who doubts in that way?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'“Is its coming to positive being due to its nutriment, or is it not?": bhikkhus, does uncertainty arise in one who doubts in that way?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'“Whatever (the entity that) is, with the cessation of its nutriment has it the nature to change, or has it not?": bhikkhus, does uncertainty arise in one who doubts in that way?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

12. '“This (entity) is”: bhikkhus, is uncertainty abandoned in one who sees it thus as it actually is with right understanding?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'“Its coming to positive being is due to its nutriment”: bhikkhus, is uncertainty abandoned in one who sees it thus as it actually is with right understanding?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'“Whatever (the entity that) is, with the cessation of its nutriment it has the nature of cessation”: bhikkhus, is uncertainty abandoned in one who sees it thus as it actually is with right understanding?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'“This (entity) is”: bhikkhus, are you such that you are free from uncertainty here?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'“Its coming to positive being is due to its nutriment”: bhikkhus, are you such that you are free from uncertainty here?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'“Whatever (the entity that) is, with the cessation of its nutriment it

has the nature of cessation": bhikkhus, are you such that you are free from uncertainty here?

'Yes, venerable sir.'

14. '“This (entity) is”: bhikkhus, is (it) well viewed thus as it actually is with right understanding?’

'Yes, venerable sir.'

“Its coming to positive being is due to its nutriment”: bhikkhus, is (it) well viewed thus as it actually is with right understanding?’

'Yes, venerable sir.'

“Whatever (the entity that) is, with the cessation of its nutriment it has the nature of cessation”: bhikkhus, is (it) well viewed thus as it actually is with right understanding?’

'Yes, venerable sir.'

15. 'Bhikkhus, purified and bright as this view is, were you to adhere to it, cherish it, treasure it, and call it your own, would you then understand the Dhamma that has been taught as similar to a raft², being for the purpose of crossing over, not for the purpose of grasping?’

'No, venerable sir.'

'Bhikkhus, purified and bright as this view is, were you not to adhere to it, cherish it, treasure it, and call it your own, would you then understand the Dhamma that has been taught as similar to a raft, being for the purpose of crossing over, not for the purpose of grasping?’

'Yes, venerable sir.'

(II. C.1. Nutriment=Four Conditions For Being)

16. 'Bhikkhus, there are these four kinds of nutriment for the maintenance of creatures that already are (entities) and for the assistance of those seeking to renew positive being. What are the four? They are physical food as nutriment whether gross or subtle, contact as the second, volition about (the state of) mind as the third, and consciousness as the fourth.

2. See M. 22 (not in this selection) either Ven. Nyānaponika's trans. "The Snake Simile" (Wheel 48-49, B.P.S. Kandy) or Dr. I.B. Horner's: "The Parable of the Water Snake", Middle Length Sayings I. (P.T.S. London).

(II. C. 2 Being→Nutriment→Dependent Arising)

17. 'Now these four kinds of nutriment have what as their source, have what as their origin, what brings them birth, what provides them with being? These four kinds of nutriment have craving as their source, have craving as their origin, craving brings them to birth, craving provides them with being.

18. 'And this craving has what as its source...craving has feeling as its source...

'And this feeling has what as its source... feeling has contact as its source...

'And this contact has what as its source... contact has the sixfold base as its source...

'And this sixfold base has what as its source... the sixfold base has name-and-form as its source...

'And this name-and-form has what as its source... name-and-form has consciousness as its source...

'And this consciousness has what as its source... consciousness has formations as its source...

'And these formations have what as their source, have what as their origin, what brings them birth, what provides them with their being? Formations have ignorance as their source, have ignorance as their origin, ignorance brings them to birth, ignorance provides them with their being.

(II. D.1.a.)

19. 'So, bhikkhus, it is with ignorance as condition that formations (have positive being); with formations as condition, consciousness; with consciousness as condition, name-and-form; with name-and-form as condition, the sixfold base: with the sixfold base as condition, contact; with contact as condition, feeling; with feeling as condition, craving; with craving as condition, clinging; with clinging as condition, being; with being as condition, birth; it is with birth as condition that ageing and death have positive being, and (also) sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair; that is how there is an origin to this whole mass of suffering.

(II. D.1.b.)

20. "'With birth as condition, ageing and death': so it was said. Now

is that (correct), or not, or how (does it appear) in this case?’

‘With birth as condition, ageing and death, venerable sir: so (it appears) to us in this case: with birth as condition, ageing and death.’

‘“With being as condition, birth”: so it was said . . .

‘“With clinging as condition, being”: . . .

‘“With craving as condition, clinging”: . . .

‘“With feeling as condition, craving”: . . .

‘“With contact as condition, feeling”: . . .

‘“With the sixfold base as condition, contact”: . . .

‘“With name-and-form as condition, the sixfold base”: . . .

‘“With consciousness as condition, name-and-form”: . . .

‘“With formations as condition, consciousness”: . . .

‘“With ignorance as condition, formations”: so it was said. Now is that (correct), or not, or how (does it appear) in this case?’

‘With ignorance as condition, formations, venerable sir: so (it appears) to us in this case: with ignorance as condition, formations.’

(II. D.1.c-d.)

21. ‘Good, bhikkhus. So you say thus, and I also say thus: “That is, when this is; that arises with the arising of this”, that is to say: “It is with ignorance as condition that formations (have positive being); with formations as condition, consciousness; with consciousness as condition, name-and-form; with name-and-form as condition, the sixfold base; with the sixfold base as condition, contact; with contact as condition, feeling; with feeling as condition, craving; with craving as condition, clinging; with clinging as condition, being; with being as condition, birth; it is with birth as condition that ageing and death have positive being, and (also) sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair: that is how there is an origin to this whole mass of suffering.”

(II. D. 2. a. Dependent Cessation)

22. ‘With the remainderless fading and ceasing of ignorance only (there is) cessation of formations, with the cessation of formations, cessation of consciousness; with cessation of consciousness, cessation of name-and-form; with cessation of name-and-form, cessation of the sixfold base;

with the cessation of the sixfold base, cessation of contact: with the cessation of contact, cessation of feeling; with the cessation of feeling, cessation of craving; with the cessation of craving, cessation of clinging; with the cessation of clinging, cessation of being; with the cessation of being, cessation of birth; with the cessation of birth, ageing and death cease, and (also) sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair: that is how there is a cessation to this whole mass of suffering.

(II. D. 2. b.)

23. ‘“With cessation of birth, cessation of ageing and death”: so it was said. Now is that (correct), or not, or how (does it appear) in this case?’

‘With cessation of birth, cessation of ageing and death, venerable sir: so (it appears) in this case: with cessation of birth, cessation of ageing and death.’

‘“With cessation of being, cessation of birth”: . . .

‘“With cessation of clinging, cessation of being”: . . .

‘“With cessation of craving, cessation of clinging”: . . .

‘“With cessation of feeling, cessation of craving”: . . .

‘“With cessation of contact, cessation of feeling”: . . .

‘“With cessation of the sixfold base, cessation of contact”: . . .

‘“With cessation of name-and-form, cessation of the sixfold base”: . . .

‘“With cessation of consciousness, cessation of name-and-form”: . . .

‘“With cessation of formations, cessation of consciousness”: . . .

‘“With cessation of ignorance, cessation of formations”: so it was said. Now is that (correct), or not, or how (does it appear) in this case?’

‘With cessation of ignorance, cessation of formations, venerable sir: so (it appears) to us in this case: with cessation of ignorance, cessation of formations.’

(II. D. 2. c-d.)

24. ‘Good, bhikkhus. So you say thus, and I also say thus: “That is not, when this is not; that ceases with the cessation of this, that is to say: with cessation of ignorance (there is) cessation of formations; with

the cessation of formations, cessation of consciousness; with the cessation of consciousness, cessation of name-and-form; with the cessation of name-and-form, cessation of the sixfold base; with the cessation of the sixfold base, cessation of contact; with the cessation of contact, cessation of feeling; with the cessation of feeling, cessation of craving; with the cessation of craving, cessation of clinging; with the cessation of clinging, cessation of being; with the cessation of being, cessation of birth; with the cessation of birth, ageing and death cease, and (also) sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair: that is how there is a cessation to this whole mass of suffering.

(II. D. 2. c-d.)

25. 'Bhikkhus, knowing and seeing in this way, would you run back to the past thus: "Were we in past time? Were we not in past time? What were we in past time? How were we in the past time? Having been what, what were we in the past time"?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Knowing and seeing in this way, would you run forward to the future thus: "Shall we be in future time? Shall we not be in future time? What shall we be in future time? How shall we be in future time? Having been what, what shall we be in future time"?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Knowing and seeing in this way would you be doubtful about the present in yourselves now, thus: "Am I? Am I not? What am I? How am I? Whence will this creature have come? Whither will it be bound"?'

'No, venerable sir.'

26. 'Bhikkhus, knowing and seeing in this way, would you speak thus: "The Teacher is respected by us: we speak (as we do) out of respect for the Teacher"?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Knowing and seeing in this way, would you speak thus: "A monk told us, and (other) monks (did too); but we do not speak thus"?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Knowing and seeing in this way, would you acknowledge another?'

'No, venerable sir.'

3. That is, leave the Buddha's teaching for another path.

'Knowing and seeing in this way would you return to the ordinary monks' and divines' duties, and to the good omens open to the tumult of debate,⁴ as having a core (of truth)?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Do you speak only of what you have yourselves known, seen and experienced?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

27. 'Good, bhikkhus. So you have been guided by me with a Dhamma (with effect) visible here and now, not (after a lapse) of time, inviting inspection, onward-leading, and experienceable by the wise each of himself. For it was with reference to this that it has been said: "Bhikkhus, this Dhamma (has effect) visible here and now, not (after a lapse) of time, it invites inspection, is onward-leading, and is experienceable by the wise each of himself."

(II. F.1. Conception As Common Knowledge)

28. 'Bhikkhus, precipitation of an embryo (in a womb) comes about with the concurrence of three (things): Here there is concurrence of the mother and the father, but it is not the mother's season, and no creature to be reborn is ready, in which case there is no precipitation in the womb. Here there is concurrence of the mother and the father, and it is the mother's season, but no creature to be reborn is ready, in which case there is no precipitation in the womb. But owing to the fact that there is concurrence of the mother and the father, and it is the mother's season, and a creature to be reborn is ready, there thus comes about precipitation of an embryo (in a womb) with the concurrence of three (things).

29. 'The mother then carries the embryo in the womb for nine or ten months, with much anxiety as a great burden. Then at the end of nine or ten months the mother gives birth with much anxiety as a great burden. Then when it is born, she nourishes it with her own blood, for the mother's breast-milk is called blood in the Noble Ones' Discipline.

4. Omens were popular subjects for debate among the noisy gatherings of ascetics and wanderers. See the Comy's Introduction to the *Mahāmagala Sutta* ('Minor Readings and Illustrations,' P.T.S. Trans. by Ven. Nyānamoli Thera).

30. 'Necessitated by his growth and necessitated by the maturing of his faculties, the child plays with such childish games as a toy plough, "tipcat", turning somersaults, a toy windmill, a toy measure, a toy car, a toy bow and arrow.

(II. F. 2. a. Maturity)

31. 'Necessitated by his growth and necessitated by the maturing of his faculties, the youth becomes furnished and invested with the five cords of sensual desire, he enjoys them, namely: forms cognizable through the eye that are wished-for, desired, agreeable, and pleasing, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust; sounds cognizable through the ear . . . odours cognizable through the nose . . . flavours cognizable through the tongue . . . tangibles cognizable through the body . . . provocative of lust.

(II. F. 2. b. The Ordinary Man And Dependent Arising)

32. 'On seeing a form with the eye, he lusts after it if it is pleasing; he has ill-will towards it if it is unpleasing; he abides with mindfulness of body unestablished and with limited cognizance⁵ without understanding how the deliverance of the heart and the deliverance by understanding come to be, wherein those evil unprofitable dhammas cease without remainder. Engaged as he is in favouring and opposing, when he feels any feeling, whether pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant, he relishes that feeling, affirms it and remains cleaving to it. When he does that, relishing arises in him. Now relishing any of those feelings is clinging. With his clinging as condition, being; with being as condition, birth; with birth as condition, ageing and death have positive being, and (also) sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair. That is how there is an origin to this whole mass of suffering.

'On hearing a sound with the ear . . .

'On smelling an odour with the nose . . .

'On tasting a flavour with the tongue . . .

'On touching a tangible with the body . . .

'On cognizing a dhammā with the mind, he lusts after it if it is pleasing; he has ill-will towards it if it is unpleasing; he dwells with mind-

5. Unwholesome states of mind.

fulness of body unestablished and with limited cognizance without understanding how the deliverance of the heart and the deliverance by understanding come to be, wherein those evil unprofitable dhammas cease without remainder. Engaged as he is in favouring and opposing, when he feels any feeling, whether pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant, he relishes that feeling, affirms it and remains cleaving to it. When he does that, relishing arises in him. Now relishing any of these feelings is clinging. With his clinging as condition, being; with being as condition, birth; with birth as condition, ageing and death have positive being and (also) sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair. That is how there is an origin to this whole mass of suffering.

(II. F. 3. a. The Tathāgata Appears)

33-34. 'Here, bhikkhus, a Tathāgata appears in the world, Arahant and Fully Enlightened . . . (repeat Sutta 27, paras. 13-21 . . . he purifies his mind from uncertainty.

35-38. 'Having abandoned these five hindrances, defilements of the mind that weaken understanding, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, he enters upon and abides in the first meditation . . . (as in Sutta 4, paras. 23-26) . . . second meditation . . . third meditation . . . fourth meditation . . . and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.

(II. F. 3. b. The Disciple And Dependent Arising)

39. 'On seeing a form with the eye, he does not lust after it if it is pleasing; he has no ill-will towards it if it is not pleasing. He abides with mindfulness of body established and immeasurable cognizance⁶ understanding how the deliverance of the heart and the deliverance by understanding come to be, wherein those evil unprofitable dhammas cease without remainder. Having thus abandoned favouring and opposing, when he feels any feeling, whether pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant, he does not relish that feeling, or affirm it, or remain cleaving to it. When he does not do that, this relishing of those feelings

6. The jhānas (meditations).

ceases. With cessation of his relishing (there is) cessation of clinging; with cessation of clinging, cessation of being; with cessation of being, cessation of birth; with cessation of birth, ageing and death cease, and (also) sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair. That is how there is a cessation to this whole mass of suffering.

'On hearing a sound with the ear . . .

'On smelling an odour with the nose . . .

'On tasting a flavour with the tongue . . .

'On touching a tangible with the body . . .

'On cognizing a dhamma with the mind . . . That is how there is a cessation to this whole mass of suffering.

(III. Conclusion)

40. 'Bhikkhus, remember this Freedom due to craving's Full Exhaustion (as taught) in brief by me. But the bhikkhu Sāti, son of a fisherman, is caught up in a vast net of craving, in craving's trammel.'

This is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 9. deals with the absolute contingency of *consciousness*.

para. 10. is general in purport and deals with ontological material, the absolute conditionality or contingency of *being*. The use of the derivatives of *bhū* (be) is the key here, e.g. 'positive-being' (*sambhava*) is reflected in the 'have positive being' (*sambhavanti*) of para. 19, etc.

For *Bhūtamidaṃ* see S. ii, 48.

para. 15. For the Simile of the Raft see Sutta 22, para. 13.

para. 16. Nutriment or 'aliment' (*āhāra*) is a synonym for 'condition' (*paccaya*), though a difference is imposed on them in the Abhidhamma (i.e., in the 24 conditions)

para. 28. The description of conception is repeated in Sutta 93, para. 20 (M. ii, 157) where it rather seems to be a description current among

brahmins, too. The context there shows the meaning of the word *gan-dhabba* ('creature to be reborn') quite clearly and makes the P.T.S. Dict's interpretation of a spirit 'said to preside over conception' completely wrong.

Bhaddekaratta Sutta

One Fortunate Attachment

Introduction (by Ven. Nyānamoli Thera)

There are four consecutive suttas in the Majjhima Nikāya with the name *Bhaddekaratta*, each based on the same verse.

The term has been translated “The Saint” and like phrases, which however, quite miss the point.

The Commentary says only this: “‘*Bhaddekaratassa*’ means ‘of one who is fortunate (*bhadda*) in having one (*eka*) attachment (*ratta* or *ratti*)’; this is because of his possessing application to insight.” The Sub-commentary resolves the compound *ekaratta* (one-attachment) into *eka ratti*, and says only that “‘*Bhaddekaratta*’ means one who has a fortunate single attachment (*bhaddo ekaratto etassa*), and it is a term for a person who is cultivating insight.”

The Mahā-Niddesa (commentary on Sutta Nipāta verse 964) alludes to these suttas without throwing any light on them. There appears to be no other mention of the term elsewhere in the Canon and its Commentaries.

The Pali word *ratta* (adj) or *ratti* (s) in this instance is from the root *raj* (rañjati, rajjati—“to take pleasure in”—e.g. *ettha me rañjāti mano*—“here my mind delights”, Sutta Nipāta verse 424). So “*Bhaddekaratta*” appears as one who is applying himself invincibly, unshakeably, *to know and study the present state as it occurs* (see, verse). This application or attachment is *auspicious* or *fortunate* because it leads to deliverance.

The much commoner meaning of the Pali word *ratti* is “night” (Skt. *rātra*). But (and neither the Commentary nor Sub-commentary decides the point) if we attempt to interpret the Sutta term “*Bhaddekatta*” as “one

who has a single auspicious night" (and the commentarial passages accordingly, which is grammatically possible), it is hard to make satisfactory sense of the context. It might be supposed that the expression *Bhaddekaratta* was a popular phrase taken over by the Buddha and given a special sense by him, as was not infrequently done, but there seems no reason to do so in this case and there is no evidence for it. It is more likely to be a term coined by the Buddha himself to describe a certain aspect of development. Other such terms are *ukkhitapaliḥa* (one who has lifted the bar—M 22), *diṭṭhipatta* (one who has attained vision—M. 70), and many more.

The Sutta (131)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, I shall give you a summary and an exposition of him who has one fortunate attachment. Listen and heed well what I shall say.'

'Even so, venerable sir,' the bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:¹

3. 'Let not a man revive the past
Or on the future build his hopes;
The past is . . . as the left-behind,
The future . . . as the yet-unreached.
Rather with insight let him see
Each dhamma presently arisen:
To how and to be sure of that
Invincibly, unshakably.

1. In manuscript there are many versions of the following verses incorporating more or less experimental changes. The editor has selected the best renderings from them.

Today the effort must be made:
 Tomorrow Death may come, who knows?
 No bargain with Mortality
 Can keep him and his hordes away.
 But One who dwells thus ardently
 Relentlessly, by day, by night,
 'Tis he, the Hermit Stilled has said,
 That has one Fortunate Attachment.

4. 'And how does he revive the past?

'(Thinking) "I had such form in the past", he allows (himself) to relish that. (Thinking) "I had such feeling in the past", he allows himself to relish that. (Thinking) "I had such perception in the past", he allows himself to relish that. (Thinking) "I had such formations in the past", he allows himself to relish that. (Thinking) "I had such consciousness in the past", he allows himself to relish that.

'That is how he revives the past.

5. 'And how does he not revive the past?

'(Thinking) "I had such form in the past", he does not allow himself to relish that... feeling... perception... formations... (Thinking) "I had such consciousness in the past", he does not allow himself to relish that.

'That is how he does not revive the past.

6. 'And how does he build up hope upon the future?

'(Thinking) "I may have such form in the future", he allows himself to relish that. (Thinking) "I may have such feeling in the future", he allows himself to relish that. (Thinking) "I may have such perception in the future", he allows himself to relish that. (Thinking) "I may have such formations in the future", he allows himself to relish that. (Thinking) "I may have such consciousness in the future", he allows himself to relish that.

'That is how he builds up hope upon the future.

7. 'And how does he not build up hope upon the future?

'(Thinking) "I may have such form in the future", he does not allow himself to relish that... feeling... perception... formations... (Thinking) "I may have such consciousness in the future", he does not allow

himself to relish that.

‘That is how he does not build up hope upon the future.

8. ‘And how is he vanquished in regard to presently arisen dhammas?

‘Here an untaught ordinary man who has no regard for Noble Ones and is unacquainted with their Dhamma and undisciplined in it, who has no regard for True Men and is unacquainted with their Dhamma and undisciplined in it, sees form as self, or self possessed of form, or form in self, or self in form. He sees feeling as self, or self possessed of feeling, or feeling in self, or self in feeling. He sees perception as self, or self possessed of perception, or perception in self, or self in perception. He sees formations as self, or self possessed of formations, or formations in self, or self in formations. He sees consciousness as self, or self possessed of consciousness, or consciousness in self, or self in consciousness.

‘That is how he is vanquished in regard to presently arisen dhammas.

9. ‘And how is he invincible in regard to presently arisen dhammas?

‘Here a well-taught Noble disciple who has regard for Noble Ones and is acquainted with their Dhamma and disciplined in it, who has regard for True Men and is acquainted with their Dhamma and disciplined in it, does not see form as self, or self possessed of form, or form in self, or self in form. He does not see feeling as self, or self possessed of feeling, or feeling in self, or self in feeling. He does not see perception as self, or self possessed of perception, or perception in self, or self in perception. He does not see formations as self, or self possessed of formations, or formations in self, or self in formations. He does not see consciousness as self, or self possessed of consciousness, or consciousness in self, or self in consciousness.

‘That is how he is invincible in regard to presently arisen dhammas.

10. ‘Let not a man revive the past
 Or on the future build his hopes;
 The past is . . . as the left-behind,
 The future . . . as the yet-unreached.
 Rather with insight let him see
 Each dhamma presently arisen:
 To know and to be sure of that

Invincibly, unshakably.
 Today the effort must be made:
 Tomorrow Death may come, who knows?
 No bargain with Mortality
 Can keep him and his hordes away.
 But one who dwells thus ardently
 Relentlessly, by day, by night,
 'Tis he, the Hermit Stilled has said,
 That has one Fortunate Attachment.

11. 'So it was with reference to this that it was said: "Bhikkhus, I shall give you a summary and an exposition of him who has one fortunate attachment."'

This is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 2. *Bhaddekaratta*: adjectival compound (bahubhihi): single (*eka*), attachment (*ratti*). Cf. Skt. rakti attachment. *Ratti* (from *rañj*) is not in P.T.S. Dictionary.

para. 3. Cf. S iii, 19.

para. 4 read *enañrūpo* for *evarūpo*.

para. 4. *nandim samanvāneti*—allows (himself) to relish. *Samanvāneti* (*sam* + *anu* + *ā* + *neti*), see *samannāneti* in P.T.S. Dict. Lit: 'he directs delight there'.

para. 7. Read *na samanvāneti* throughout para., and *nappatīkankhati* at end of para.

III

PATH AND FRUIT

(b) ATTAINMENT

“Now on that occasion final knowledge had been declared by many bhikkhus in the Blessed One’s presence: ‘Birth is destroyed, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come—so I understand’.”

(Sutta 105)

Sunakkhatta Sutta

To Sunakkhatta

Introduction

Sunakkhatta (his name means 'one who has a good horoscope') seems to have been misnamed. He became a bhikkhu and then not only disrobed but spread all sorts of reports intended to discredit his former Teacher. In Sutta 12 he has only just left the Sangha while in this Sutta we must presume that he has been a layman for some time. Even when he was a bhikkhu (see D. Sutta 24) he was plagued by uncertainties and scepticism and here we see him still troubled that anyone could really declare 'final knowledge' (aññā) which means Arahantship. The Buddha admits that some who do so make this declaration from an overestimation of their attainments.

Then stage by stage the Buddha shows what different people are interested in and how their minds turn away from lower goals. This discourse leads up to Nibbāna and one who wrongly esteems it through overestimation, and one who rightly does so. The simile of the dart is introduced here to show how even one who is near to the final attainment should be careful, not careless. If he becomes careless even at this stage he dies (disrobes and returns to lay life) or experiences deadly suffering (committing some offence of a sexual nature). But the careful person heals his wound (a name for the sense-bases) and comes to be completely free of the essentials of existence—'it is not possible that he would either employ his body or bestir his mind about the essentials of existence.' Such is the Arahant's state.

The Sutta (105)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Vesāli in the Great

Wood in the Gabled Hall.

2. Now on that occasion final knowledge has been declared by many bhikkhus in the Blessed One's presence: 'Birth is destroyed, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come—so I understand.'

3. Sunakkhatta the Licchavi heard: 'It seems that final knowledge has been declared by many bhikkhus in the Blessed One's presence: "Birth is destroyed, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come—so I understand."' "

Then Sunakkhatta the Licchavi went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, Sunakkhatta the Licchavi said to the Blessed One:

4. 'It seems that final knowledge has been declared by many bhikkhus in the Blessed One's presence: "Birth is destroyed . . . so I understand." Now the bhikkhus, venerable sir, who declare final knowledge in the Blessed One's presence thus, do they declare final knowledge rightly, or are there some bhikkhus here who declare final knowledge owing to overestimation?'

5. 'Some of the bhikkhus, Sunakkhatta, who declare final knowledge in my presence: "Birth is destroyed, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come", do so rightly, but some bhikkhus do so owing to overestimation. Herein, when bhikkhus declare final knowledge rightly, it is true of them. But when bhikkhus declare final knowledge owing to overestimation, the Tathāgata thinks thus about them: "Let me teach them the Dhamma." So it is, here, Sunakkhatta, the Tathāgata thinks: "Let me teach them the Dhammas." But then certain misguided men here formulate a question, and they come to the Tathāgata to ask it. Now, Sunakkhatta, though the Tathāgata thinks thus: "Let me teach them Dhamma", yet he comes to think otherwise.¹

1. When people come to him with foolish questions having ulterior motives (such as to trap the Buddha into some illogical entanglement) or come pretending to have final knowledge (=Arahantship) or some other understanding, when they have no such attainments. Then the Buddha remained silent. This is possibly a warning to Sunakkhatta.

6. 'This is the time, Blessed One, this is the time, Sublime One, for the Blessed One to teach the Dhamma. Having heard it from the Blessed One, the bhikkhus will bear it in mind'

'Then listen, Sunakkhatta, and heed well what I shall say.'

'Yes, venerable sir,' Sunakkhatta the Licchavi replied to the Blessed One. The Blessed one said this:

7. 'There are, Sunakkhatta, these five cords of sensual desire. What five? Forms cognizable by the eye that are wished-for, desired, agreeable and likeable, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust. Sounds cognizable by the ear... Odours cognizable by the nose... Flavours cognizable by the tongue... Tangibles cognizable by the body that are wished-for, desired, agreeable and likeable, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust. These are the five cords of sensual desire.

8. 'It is possible that some person here may esteem worldly material things. When a person esteems worldly material things, only talk of that kind interests him, and his thinking and exploring is in line with that, he frequents that kind of man, and he finds satisfaction through him. But when there is talk about the imperturbable,² he will not hear or give ear or establish his mind in knowledge. He does not frequent that kind of man, and he finds no satisfaction through him.

9. 'Just as a man long absent from his own village or town seeing some man who had recently left that village or town, would ask that man about the well-being of that village or town, about its state of plenty, its health, and that man told him about it—how do you conceive this, Sunakkhatta, would that man hear, give ear and establish his mind in knowledge? Would he frequent that man and find satisfaction through him?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'So too, it is possible... and he finds no satisfaction through him.

'So he should be known as a person not bound by the fetter of the imperturbable who esteems worldly things.

10. 'It is possible that some person here may esteem the imperturbable.

2. Aneñja, a term usually meaning all the four formless attainments but here referring to the fourth form-sphere jhāna and the first two formless sphere states. See notes to Sutta 106.

When a person esteems the imperturbable, only talk of that kind interests him and his thinking and exploring is in line with that, he frequents that kind of man, and he finds satisfaction through him. But when there is talk about worldly material things, he will not hear, or give ear, or establish his mind in knowledge. He does not frequent that kind of man, and he finds no satisfaction through him.

11. 'Just as a yellow leaf shed from its attachment is incapable of becoming green again, so too, when a person esteems the imperturbable, he has shed the fetter of worldly material things.

'So too he should be known as a person not bound by the fetter of worldly things who esteems the imperturbable.

12. 'It is possible that some person here may esteem the base consisting of nothingness. When a person esteems the base consisting of nothingness, only talk of that kind interests him, and his thinking and exploring is in line with that, he frequents that kind of man, and he finds satisfaction through him. But when there is talk about the imperturbable, he will not hear or give ear, or establish his mind in knowledge. He does not frequent that kind of man, and he finds no satisfaction through him.

13. 'Just as a thick stone cracked in two cannot be joined together again, so too, when a person esteems the base consisting of nothingness his fetter of the imperturbable is broken.

'So too he should be known as a person not bound by the fetter of the imperturbable who esteems the base consisting of nothingness.

14. 'It is possible that some person here may esteem the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception. When a person esteems the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, only talk of that kind of interests him, and his thinking and exploring is in line with that, he frequents that kind of man, and he finds satisfaction through him. But when there is talk about the base consisting of nothingness, he will not hear, or give ear, or establish his mind in knowledge. He does not frequent that kind of man, and he finds no satisfaction through him.

15. 'Just as a man who has eaten some delicious food and thrown it up—what do you think, Sunakkhatta, would that man have any desire

to eat that food again?’

‘No, venerable sir. Why is that? Because, venerable sir, that food is reckoned as repulsive.’

‘So too, when a person esteems the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, his fetter consisting of the base of nothingness is rejected.

‘So he too should be known as a person not bound by the fetter of the base consisting of nothingness who esteems the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception.

16. ‘It is possible that some person here may rightly esteem Nibbāna. When a person rightly esteems Nibbāna, only talk of that kind interests him, and his thinking and exploring is in line with that, he frequents that kind of man, and he finds satisfaction through him. But when there is talk about the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, he will not hear, or give ear, or establish his mind in knowledge. He does not frequent that kind of man, and he finds no satisfaction through him.

17. ‘Just as a palm tree with its top cut off is incapable of growing, so too, when a person rightly esteems Nibbāna, his fetter of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception is cut off, cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, made non-existent, not subject to arising in the future.

‘So he too should be known as a person not bound by the fetter of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception who rightly esteems Nibbāna.

18. ‘It is possible that some bhikkhu here might think thus: “Craving has been called a dart by the Monk³. The poisonous humour of ignorance shows its disturbedness by desire and greed and by ill-will. That dart of craving is abandoned in me. The poisonous humour of ignorance is expelled. I am one who rightly esteems Nibbāna.” Now as one who has overestimated what is not actually true, he would resort to things unsuitable in one who rightly esteemed Nibbāna. He would resort to unsuitable seeing of visible objects with the eye, he would resort to . . . unsuitable sounds with the ear . . . unsuitable odours with

3. The Buddha.

the nose . . . unsuitable tastes with the tongue . . . unsuitable tangibles with the body . . . unsuitable dhammas with the mind. When he did so, greed would infect his mind. With his mind infected by greed he would incur death and deadly suffering.

19. 'Suppose a man were wounded by a dart thickly smeared with poison, then his friends and companions, relatives and kin, brought a surgeon-physician and the surgeon-physician cut round the wound's opening with a knife; and when he had cut round the wound's opening with a knife, he probed for the dart with a probe; and having probed for the dart with a probe, he pulled out the dart; and he expelled the poisonous humour with some trace left⁴. And knowing that some trace was left, he said: "Good man, your dart has been pulled out. The poisonous humour has been expelled with some trace left but not enough to be a danger to you. Eat only suitable food lest, through your eating unsuitable food, the wound should suppurate. Wash the wound from time to time, and anoint the wound's opening from time to time lest, if you do not, pus and blood should clot the wound's opening. And do not go walking in the wind and sun, lest by doing so, dust and grit should infect the wound's opening. You must live to guard your wound, good man, to heal your wound."

20. 'He thought: "My dart has been pulled out, the poisonous humour has been expelled with some trace left, but not enough to be a danger to me." And he ate only unsuitable food, and through his eating unsuitable food the wound suppurated. He did not wash the wound from time to time or anoint the wound's opening from time to time, and, through his not doing so, pus and blood clotted the wound's opening. And he went walking in the wind and sun, and, through his doing so, dust and grit infected the wound's opening. And he did not live to guard his wound, to heal his wound. Then, both through his doing what was unsuitable and owing to the foul poisonous humours having been ex-

4. Sa-upādisesa, more usually usually used, with anupādisesa (para. 24), in connection with Nibbāna, the first describing an Arahant or Buddha still alive, the second referring to one after death "with no trace left". A later translation appears in the MS. which is too cumbersome though more accurate: "some liability to arising (of its effect) still remaining,"

pelled with some left behind, his wound swelled, and with its swelling he incurred death or deadly suffering.

21. 'So too, it is possible that some bhikkhus here might think thus: "Craving is called a dart by the Monk. The poisonous humour of ignorance shows its disturbedness by desire and greed and by ill-will. That dart of craving is abandoned in me. The poisonous humour of ignorance is expelled. I am one who rightly esteems Nibbāna." Now as one who has overestimated what is not actually true, he would resort to things unsuitable . . . with his mind infected with greed, he might incur death or deadly suffering.

22. 'For it is death in the Noble One's Discipline when one renounces the training and reverts to what has been abandoned. And it is deadly suffering when one commits some defiling offence.

23. 'It is possible that some bhikkhu here might think thus: "Craving is called a dart by the Monk. The poisonous humour of ignorance shows its disturbedness by desire and greed and by ill-will. That dart of craving is abandoned in me. The poisonous humour of ignorance is expelled. I am one who rightly esteems Nibbāna." Being one who rightly esteemed Nibbāna, he would not resort to things unsuitable to one who rightly esteemed Nibbāna. He would not resort to unsuitable seeing of visible objects with the eye . . . unsuitable sounds with the ear . . . unsuitable odours with the nose . . . unsuitable flavours with the tongue . . . unsuitable tangibles with the body, he would not resort to unsuitable dhammas with the mind. When he did not do so, greed would not infect his mind. With his mind uninfected by greed he would not incur death and deadly suffering.

24. 'Suppose a man were pierced by a dart thickly smeared with poison, then his friends and companions, relatives and kin, brought a surgeon-physician, and the surgeon-physician cut round the wound's opening with a knife; and when he had cut round the wound's opening with a knife, he probed for the dart with a probe; and having probed for the dart with a probe, he pulled out the dart; and he expelled the poisonous humour with no trace left. And knowing that none was left behind, he said: "Good man, your dart has been pulled out, the poisonous humour

has been expelled with no trace left, not enough to be a danger to you. Eat only suitable food lest, through your eating unsuitable food, the wound should suppurate. Wash the wound from time to time, and anoint the wound's opening from time to time lest, if you do not, pus and blood should clot the wound's opening. And do not go walking in the wind and sun lest, by doing so, dust and grit should infect the wound's opening. You must live to guard your wound, good man, to heal your wound."

25. 'He thought: "My dart has been pulled out, the poisonous humour has been expelled with no trace left, not enough to be a danger to me." He ate only suitable food and, through his eating suitable food, the wound did not suppurate. He washed the wound from time to time and anointed the wound's opening from time to time, and, through his doing so, pus and blood did not clot the wound's opening. And he did not go walking in the wind and sun, through his not doing so, dust and grit did not infect the wound's opening. And he lived to guard his wound, to heal his wound. Then, both through his doing what was suitable and owing to the foul poisonous humour's having been expelled with none left behind, his wound healed, and when it was healed and covered with skin, he incurred neither death nor deadly suffering.

26. 'So too it is possible that some bhikkhu here might think thus: "Craving is called a dart by the Monk. The poisonous humour of ignorance shows its disturbedness by desire and greed and by ill-will. That dart of craving is abandoned in me. The poisonous humour of ignorance is expelled. I am one who rightly esteems Nibbāna." Being one who rightly esteemed Nibbāna, he would not resort to things unsuitable... with his mind uninfected by greed he would not incur death or deadly suffering.

27. 'This simile has been given by me, Sunakkhatta, in order to make known a meaning. This is the meaning here: "Wound" is a term for the six internal bases. "Poisonous humour" is a term for ignorance. "Dart" is a term for craving. "Probe" is a term for mindfulness. "Knife" is a term for Noble understanding. "Surgeon-physician" is a term for the Tathāgata, Arahant and Fully Enlightened.

28. 'When, Sunakkhatta, a bhikkhu practises restraint in the six bases of contact, is without the essentials of existences,⁵ liberated with the exhaustion of the essentials of existence through seeing the essentials of existence as the root of suffering, it is not possible that he would either employ his body or bestir his mind about any essential of existence.

29. 'Suppose there were a cup of drink with colour, smell and taste, and it were mixed with poison; and then a man came who wanted to live, not to die, and shrank from pain, what do you think, Sunakkhatta, would that man drink that cup of drink when he knew that if he drank it he would incur death or deadly suffering?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'So too, when a bhikkhu practises restraint in the six bases of contact, is without the essentials of existence, liberated with the exhaustion of the essentials of existence through seeing the essentials of existence as the root of suffering, it is not possible that he would employ his body or bestir his mind about any essential of existence.

30. 'Suppose there were an extremely poisonous snake; and then a man came who wanted to live, not to die, and shrank from pain, what do you think, Sunakkhatta, would that man give that extremely poisonous snake his hand or his thumb when he knew that even if he were bitten by it he would incur death or deadly suffering?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'So too, when a bhikkhu practises restraint in the six bases of contact, is without the essentials of existence, liberated with the exhaustion of the essentials of existence through seeing the essentials of existence as the root of suffering, it is not possible that he would employ his body or bestir his mind about any essential of existence.'

This is what the Blessed One said. Sunakkhatta the Licchavi was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

5. Upadhi: essential of existence: Comy. says these are of four kinds: (1) the five aggregates, (2) sensual desire, (3) mental defilements, and (4) kamma (intentional action).

Notes

para. 3. Sunakkhatta's troubles are recorded in D. Sutta 24 and M. Sutta 12.

para. 8. Only *anuvicāra*, not *anuvicāreti* ("exploring") is in P.T.S. Dict.

para. 11. For the form and construction: *ye lokāmisā saṃyojane se pavutte* (he has shed the fetter of worldly material things), and similar constructions in para. 13, 15 and 17, cf. D. ii, 278, and P.T.S. Dict. under *yā* and *sā*. There, however, *ye* and *se* are called neuter accusative singulars, but they appear to be neuter nominative sing. If accusative, what word governs them?

para. 18. 'Now as one who has overestimated what is not actually true'. The best to be made of the various readings would seem to be: '*evaṃmānī assa atatham samānam*'.

para. 19. The 'surgeon-physician' is a simile for the Tathāgata (see para. 27), so the Sinhalese reading '*maññamano*' (he fancies wrongly) seems inappropriate and the Siamese '*jānamāno*' right. But the sense requires *saupādisesa* ('with some trace left') throughout this para. instead of *anupādisesa* ('with no trace left'). Cf. the countersimile in para. 24. But Si. reads *ānupādisesa*. (Burmese Saṅgāyana Ed. has both '*jānamāno*' and '*saupādisesa*' Ed.) However, the Tathāgata cannot either 'fancy' or 'know' what is not a fact.

abbaheyya—pulled out: see note to Sutta 101, para. 7.

assāvī—suppurating: not in P.T.S. Dict.

para. 21. 'Now as one who has overestimated what was not actually true': see note to para. 18.

para. 30. *dajja*—would give (from *dadāti*): not in P.T.S. Dict.

Mahavacchagotta Sutta To Vacchagotta

Introduction

In two previous Suttas (71, 72) Vacchagotta has met the Buddha and obviously become more interested in the Dhamma. This Sutta describes his Going Forth and Admission as a bhikkhu followed by his attainment of Arahantship. The Sutta begins in a very ordinary way with the Buddha listing the ten unprofitable courses of conduct and the profitable too. The latter when followed lead to the final knowledge of Arahantship. Then Vacchagotta's questions begin about those who have actually won to this deliverance. Apart from the Buddha is there any other bhikkhu or bhikkhuni who has won Arahantship? Is there any layman or woman follower leading the life divine by practising the Eight Precepts who has won the fruit of Non-returner? Is there any layman or woman follower enjoying sense desires who has attained the fruit of Stream-winner? The Buddha answers in each case that there are hundreds of his disciples who have won these various attainments. Notice how the attainments are graded with the type of life that is being led. A bhikkhu's or bhikkhuni's life is so organized that it helps the attainment of Arahantship. And since Non-returning is attained by the complete destruction of the fetters of lust and ill-will, it is natural that those who attain to it are celibate and lead a disciplined and somewhat ascetic life as lay people. Stream-winning though can be won by any lay person provided that their moral conduct (of the Five Precepts) is pure and their confidence in the Triple Gem is established. They have then to listen to Dhamma, clear away doubts and meditate. As Vacchagotta says, the Sāsana would be deficient if there were not these attainments and it seems that having listed them his confidence in the Buddha as

his Teacher comes to a peak and he asks for the Going Forth. Within a fortnight after his Going Forth and Full Admission he was already a Noble One (Ariya) having seen Dhamma for himself. He then requested further teaching from the Buddha. By way of calm and insight he was to develop the six direct knowledges—which he did soon after. Notice the way that he intimates that he has won Arahantship: “The Blessed One has been worshipped by me, the Sublime One has been worshipped by me”. Worship of this kind (nirāmisā-pūjā) by practice and attainment, was approved of by the Buddha much more than material offerings and words of praise.

The Sutta (14)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the Squirrels’ Sanctuary.

2. Then the Wanderer Vacchagotta went to the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said:

3. ‘I have had conversations with Master Gotama for a long time. It would be good if Master Gotama would show me the profitable and the unprofitable in brief.’

‘I might show you the profitable and the unprofitable in brief, Vaccha, and I might show you the profitable and unprofitable at length. Still I will show you them in brief. Listen and heed well what I shall say.’

‘Yes, sir,’ he replied. The Blessed One said this:

4. ‘Vaccha, greed is unprofitable, non-greed is profitable; hate is unprofitable, non-hate is profitable; delusion is unprofitable, non-delusion is profitable. In this way these three dhammas are unprofitable and three dhammas are profitable.

5. ‘Killing living beings is unprofitable, abstention from it is profitable; taking what is not given is unprofitable, abstention from it is profitable; misconduct in sexual desires is unprofitable, abstention from it is profitable. False speech is unprofitable, abstention from it is profitable; malicious

speech is unprofitable, abstention from it is profitable; harsh speech is unprofitable, abstention from it is profitable; gossip is unprofitable, abstention from it is profitable; covetousness is unprofitable, uncovetousness is profitable; ill-will is unprofitable, non-ill-will is profitable; wrong view is unprofitable, right view is profitable. In this way these ten dhammas are unprofitable and ten dhammas are profitable.

6. 'As soon as craving has been abandoned, cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, done away with so that it is no longer liable to arise in future, then that bhikkhu is accomplished with taints destroyed, who has lived the life, done what was to be done, laid down the burden, reached the highest goal, destroyed the fetters of being and is rightly liberated through final knowledge.'

7. 'Apart from Master Gotama, is there any one bhikkhu, Master Gotama's disciple, who has by realization himself with direct knowledge here and now entered upon and abode in the deliverance of the heart and the deliverance by understanding that are taint-free with the exhaustion of taints?'

'There are not only one hundred, or two or three or four or five hundred, but far more bhikkhus, my disciples, who have by realization themselves with direct knowledge here and now entered upon and abode in the deliverance of the heart and the deliverance by understanding that are taint-free with the exhaustion of taints.'

8. 'Apart from Master Gotama and the bhikkhus, is there any one bhikkhuni, Master Gotama's disciple, who has by realization... exhaustion of taints?'

'There are not only one hundred... but far more bhikkhunis... exhaustion of taints.'

9. 'Apart from Master Gotama and the bhikkhus and bhikkhunis, is there any one layman follower in white clothes leading the life divine, Master Gotama's disciple, who, with the destruction of the five lower fetters, will reappear spontaneously (in the Pure Abodes) and there attain Nibbāna without ever returning from that world?'

'There are not only one hundred... laymen followers, in white clothes leading the life divine... without ever returning from that world.'

10. 'Apart from Master Gotama and the bhikkhus and bhikkhunis and laymen followers in white clothes leading the life divine, is there any one layman follower in white clothes enjoying sensual desires, Master Gotama's disciple, who carries out the message, responds to advice, has crossed beyond uncertainty, has done with questioning, has gained intrepidity, and become independent of others in the Teacher's message?'

'There are not only one hundred . . . laymen followers in white clothes enjoying sensual desires . . . become independent of others in the Teacher's message.'

11. 'Apart from Master Gotama and the bhikkhus and bhikkhunis and laymen followers in white clothes (both those) leading the life divine and (those) enjoying sensual desires, is there any one laywoman follower in white clothes leading the life divine, Master Gotama's disciple, who with the destruction of the five lower fetters will reappear spontaneously (in the Pure Abodes) and there attain Nibbāna without ever returning from that world?'

'There are not only one hundred . . . laywomen followers in white clothes leading the life divine . . . without ever returning from that world.'

12. 'Apart from Master Gotama and the bhikkhus and bhikkhunis and the laymen followers in white clothes (both these) leading the life divine and (those) enjoying sensual desires and laywomen followers in white clothes leading the life divine is there any one laywoman follower in white clothes enjoying sensual desires, Master Gotama's disciple, who carries out the message, responds to advice, has crossed beyond uncertainty, has done with questioning, has gained intrepidity and become independent of other in the Teachers message?'

'There are not only one hundred . . . laywomen followers in white clothes enjoying sensual desires . . . become independent of others in the Teacher's message.'

13. 'If only Master Gotama testified to this Dhamma and no bhikkhus, then this life divine would be deficient in that part, but since Master Gotama and bhikkhus testify to this Dhamma this life divine is thus complete in that part.'

'If only Master Gotama and bhikkhus testified to this Dhamma and

no bhikkhunis then this life divine would be deficient in that part, but since ...

'If only Master Gotama, bhikkhus and bhikkhunis testified to this Dhamma and no laymen followers leading the life divine, then ...

'If only Master Gotama, bhikkhus, bhikkhunis and laymen followers in white clothes leading the life divine and no laymen followers enjoying sensual desires, then ...

'If only Master Gotama, bhikkhus, bhikkhunis, laymen followers in white clothes (both those) leading the life divine and (those) enjoying sensual desires testified to this Dhamma and no laywomen followers in white clothes leading the life divine, then ...

14. 'If only Master Gotama, bhikkhus, bhikkhunis, laymen followers in white clothes (both those) leading the life divine and (those) enjoying sensual desires, laywomen followers in white clothes leading the life divine testified to this Dhamma and no laywomen followers enjoying sensual desires, then this life divine would be deficient in that part, but since ... this life divine is thus complete in that part.

15. 'Just as the River Ganges inclines towards the sea, slopes towards the sea, tends towards the sea, merges into the sea, so too Master Gotama's assembly with its householders and those gone forth inclines towards Nibbāna, slopes towards Nibbāna, tends towards Nibbāna, merges into Nibbāna.

16-17. 'Magnificent, Master Gotama! ... (as in Sutta 7, para. 27-28) ... I would receive the Going-forth under Master Gotama, I would receive the Full Admission.'

18. 'Vaccha, one who belonged formerly to another sect ... lives on probation for four months ... (as in Sutta 57, para. 17) ... A difference in persons has become known to me in this (probation period).'

'Venerable sir, if those who belonged formerly to another sect ... (as in Sutta 57, para. 17) ... the Going-forth into homelessness and the Full Admission to the bhikkhus' state.'

19. The Wanderer Vacchagotta received the Going-forth, and he received the Full Admission.

20. Not long after his Full Admission, half a month after his Full Ad-

mission, the venerable Vacchagotta went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he told the Blessed One: 'Venerable sir, I have reached what can be reached by the knowledge, the true knowledge of one in the higher training,¹ Let the Blessed One further show me the Dhamma.'

21. 'In that case, Vaccha, develop further two dhammas, namely, peace and insight. These two dhammas when further developed will lead to penetration of the many elements.

22. 'As much as you shall wish: "May I enjoy the various sorts of (supernormal) success; having been one, may I become many; having been many, may I become one; may I appear and vanish; may I go unhindered through a wall, through an enclosure, through a mountain, as though in space; may I dive in and out of the earth as though it were water; may I go on unbroken water as though it were earth; seated crosslegged may I travel in space like a winged bird; with my hand may I touch and stroke the moon and sun so successful and mighty; may I wield bodily mastery even as far as the world of the Divinity (Brahmā)', you shall attain the ability to be a witness in any part therein whenever there is opportunity.

23. 'As much as you shall wish: "May I with the heavenly ear element, which is purified and surpasses the human, hear both kinds of sounds, the heavenly and the human, those that are far as well as near", you shall attain the ability to be a witness in any part therein whenever there is opportunity.

24. 'As much as you shall wish: "May I understand by encompassing with mind other beings', other persons' minds; may I understand mind with lust as with lust, and mind without lust as without lust; may I understand mind with hate as with hate, and mind without hate as without hate; may I understand mind with delusion as with delusion, and mind without delusion as without delusion; may I understand the contracted mind as contracted, and the distracted mind as distracted; may I understand the exalted mind as exalted, and the unexalted mind as unexalted; may I understand the surpassed mind as surpassed, and

1. Sekha: this is a term covering stream-enterers, once-returners and non-returners.

the unsurpassed mind as unsurpassed; may I understand the concentrated mind as concentrated, and the unconcentrated mind as unconcentrated; may I understand the liberated mind as liberated, and the unliberated mind as unliberated", you shall attain the ability to be a witness in any part therein whenever there is opportunity.

25. 'As much as you shall wish: "May I recollect my manifold past life, that is to say, one birth . . . (as in Sutta 4, para. 27) . . . thus with its details and particulars may I recollect my manifold past life", you shall attain the ability to be a witness in any part therein whenever there is opportunity.

26. 'As much as you shall wish: "May I with heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, see beings passing away and reappearing . . . (as in Sutta 4, para. 29) . . . may I understand how beings pass on according to their kammās", you shall attain ability to be a witness in any part therein whenever there is opportunity.

27. 'As much as you shall wish: "May I by myself realizing with direct knowledge here and now, enter upon and abide in the deliverance of the heart and the deliverance by understanding that are taint-free with the exhaustion of taints", you shall attain ability to be a witness in any part therein whenever there is opportunity.'

28. 'Then the venerable Vacchagotta, delighting in the Blessed One's words, rose from his seat, and paying homage to the Blessed One, keeping him on his right, he departed.

29. Then dwelling alone, withdrawn, diligent, ardent, and self-controlled, the venerable Vacchagotta, by realization himself with direct knowledge here and now entered upon and abode in that supreme goal of the life divine, for the sake of which clansmen rightly go forth from the home life into homelessness. He had direct knowledge thus: 'Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come.'

And the venerable Vacchagotta became one of the Arahants.

30. 'Now on that occasion many bhikkhus came to see the Blessed One. The venerable Vacchagotta saw them coming in the distance. Seeing them, he went to them and asked them: 'Where are the venerable ones

going?’

‘We are going to see the Blessed One, friend.’

‘In that case, may the venerable ones pay homage with their heads at the Blessed One’s feet in my name thus: “Venerable sir, the bhikkhu Vacchagotta pays homage with his head at the Blessed One’s feet”, and say thus: “The Blessed One has been worshipped by me, the Sublime One has been worshipped by me.”’

‘Yes, friend,’ they replied. Then they went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him they sat down at one side. When they had done so, they told the Blessed One: ‘Venerable sir, the venerable Vacchagotta pays homage with his head at the Blessed One’s feet, and he says: “The Blessed One has been worshipped by me, the Sublime One has been worshipped by me.”’

31. ‘Bhikkhus, the bhikkhu Vacchagotta was already known to me by encompassing mind with mind thus: “The bhikkhu Vacchagotta has the Three True Knowledges; he has great success and great might”. And gods told me this too: “The bhikkhu Vacchagotta has the Three True Knowledges; he has great success and great might.”’

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One’s words.

Notes

para. 30. Cf. Sutta 144, para. 7. for the word ‘*pariciṇṇa*—worshipped’: According to the Comy. here, this is his declaration of final knowledge —*aññā* (=Arahantaship).

Culagopalaka Sutta

The Cowherd-2

Introduction

Like Sutta 33 this one also brings in similes of incompetent and competent cowherds but they are here applied to different subject matter. An incompetent cowherd is compared with those religious teachers who are unskilled in: *this world* (not knowing how to teach people to live peacefully here, for their own happiness and that of others); *the next world* (not knowing what practices to recommend for reaching a good rebirth, or else holding annihilationist views that there is no future life); *what belongs to Māra* (all worlds based on desire for sensual pleasure, even the heavens of sense desire or upon the fruits of that desire, belong to Māra); *what does not belong to Māra* (are those subtle form and formless realms which are beyond the reach of Māra: their basis is not sense desire but jhāna); *what belongs to Death* (everything conditioned will fall apart, break up, die, etc.); *what does not belong to Death* (this is the Deathless, or Nibbāna, the unconditioned state). A teacher who does not know how to distinguish these things, because his mind is still confused, will lead his followers only to harm and suffering. A skilled cowherd, on the other hand, knows all about these things and so can take the entire herd across the Ganges. The herd that he takes across the river (of defilements) includes the bulls (Arahants), the strong cattle (Non-returners), the heifers and young oxen (Once-returners), the calves and feeble cattle (Stream-winners), and the new-born tender calf (those who are mature in Dhamma, mature in faith). The Buddha declares that he is one who is skilled in knowledge of the above points and hence one who can lead his followers to welfare and happiness.

The Sutta (34)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living in the Vajjian country at Ukkācelā on the banks of the River Ganges. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, there was once a Magadhan herdsman who by nature lacked understanding and in the last month of the Rains, in the Autumn time, omitting to examine the near shore of the Ganges River or its further shore, he drove his cattle in where there was no ford to cross over to the other shore here in the Videhan country. Then the cattle bunched together in mid-stream in the Ganges River, and they came to disaster. Why was that? Because the Magadhan herdsman by nature lacked understanding, and in the last month of the Rains, in the Autumn time, omitting to examine the near shore of the Ganges River or its further shore, he drove his cattle in where there was no ford to cross over to the other shore in the Videhan country.

3. 'So too, when monks or divines are unskilled in this world and the other world, unskilled in what belongs to Māra and what does not belong to him, and unskilled in what belongs to Death and what does not belong to him, it will be long for the harm and suffering of those who shall conceive them as fit to be heard and fit to place faith in.

4. 'Bhikkhus, there was once a Magadhan herdsman who by nature had understanding and in the last month of the Rains, in the Autumn time, after examining the near shore of the Ganges River and its further shore, he drove his cattle in where there was a ford to cross over to the other shore in the Videhan country. He made the bulls, the fathers and leaders of the herd, cross over first, and they breasted the stream of the Ganges and got safely across to the further shore. He made the strong cattle and the cattle to be tamed cross over next, and they too breasted the stream of the Ganges and got safely across to the further shore. He made the heifers and young oxen cross over next, and they too breasted the stream of the Ganges and got safely across to the further shore. He made the calves and the feeble cattle cross

over next, and they too breasted the stream of the Ganges and got safely across to the further shore. There was once a tender calf just born, and being urged on by the mother's lowing, he too breasted the stream of the Ganges and got safely across to further shore. Why was that? Because the Magadhan herdsman by nature had understanding, and in the last month of the Rains, in the Autumn time, after examining the near shore of the Ganges River and its further shore, he drove his cattle in where there was a ford to cross over to the other shore here in the Videhan country.

5. 'So too, when monks or divines are skilled in this world and the other world, skilled in what belongs to Māra and what does not belong to him, skilled in what belongs to Death and what does not belong to him, it will be long for the welfare and happiness of those who shall conceive them as fit to be heard and fit to place faith in.

6. 'Bhikkhus, just as the bulls, the fathers and leaders of the herd, breasted the Ganges' stream and got safely across to the further shore, so too, those bhikkhus who are Arahants, with taints exhausted, who have lived the life, done what was to be done, laid down the burden, reached the highest goal, destroyed the fetters of being, and through right final knowledge are liberated, have, by breasting Māra's stream, got safely across to the further shore.

7. 'Just as the strong cattle and the cattle to be tamed breasted the Ganges' stream and got safely across to the further shore, so too, those bhikkhus who with the destruction of the five lower fetters will reappear spontaneously (in the Pure Abodes) and there attain Nibbāna without ever returning from that world, will also, by breasting Māra's stream, get safely across to the further shore.

8. 'Just as the heifers and young oxen breasted the Ganges' stream and got safely across to the further shore, so too, those bhikkhus who with the destruction of three fetters and with attenuation of lust, hate and delusion, are once-returners, returning once to this world to make an end of suffering, will also, by breasting Māra's stream, get safely across to the further shore.

9. 'Just as the calves and the feeble cattle also breasted the Ganges'

stream and got safely across to the further shore, so too, those bhikkhus who with the destruction of three fetters are stream-enterers, no longer subject to perdition, certain (of rightness), and headed for full enlightenment, will also, by breasting Māra's stream, get safely across to the further shore.

10. 'Just as that tender calf just born which being urged on by the mother's lowing, also breasted the Ganges' stream and got safely across to the further shore, so too, these bhikkhus who are mature in the Dhamma, mature in faith, will also by breasting Māra's stream, get safely across to the further shore.

11. 'Bhikkhus, I am skilled in this world and the next world, skilled in what belongs to Māra and what does not belong to him, and skilled in what belongs to Death and what does not belong to him. It will be long for the welfare and happiness of those who shall conceive me as fit to be heard and fit to place faith in.'

12. This is what the Blessed One said. When the Sublime One had said that, the Master said further:

Both this world and the world beyond
Are well described by He that knows,
And what is still in Māra's reach
And what is out of reach of Death.
Knowing directly all the world,
The Wakened One who understands
Opened the Deathless Gate, whereby
Nibbāna may be safely reached;
For Māra's stream is breasted (now)
And nullified, its reeds removed;
Rejoice then, bhikkhus, mightily
And set your hearts where safety lies.

Notes

para. 10. See Samyutta XXV.I (S. iii, 225) for further details.

Mahagosinga Sutta

Gosinga Wood-2

Introduction

An inspiring Sutta set in surroundings of great beauty (and who says that Arahants cannot appreciate such things?). There is a wrong idea too that Arahants are all the same in character, that having all attained the exhaustion of the taints and penetrated the truth of Not-self they have lost all individuality. It is true that they have all dried up the springs of evil in their hearts so they have none of that worldly egocentricity which springs from evil—greed, hate and delusion. But the good kammās made by them were not the same in every case and their ways of training in Dhamma were not identical in every respect, so the knowledges and abilities that they have as Arahants are not the same either. This can be clearly seen in this Sutta where all, except venerable Ānanda who is a Stream-winner, are Arahants and yet their choice of the kind of bhikkhu who would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood, is not the same. Each one speaks according to his own 'speciality' in Dhamma. A number of the Buddha's disciples, both those in robes and laypeople, were honoured by him when he spoke of their preeminence in some particular quality. A collection of his sayings on this subject are preserved in the Book of the Ones, Anguttara-nikāya. The Buddha, when asked which of them had spoken well, said that all had spoken well 'each in his own way' and then gave his answer to the question of the kind of bhikkhu who would do credit to that wood: One who sits down and resolves 'I shall not break this session of meditation until Arahantship is attained'.

The Sutta (32)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living in the Park of the Gosinga Sāla-tree together with many very experienced elder disciples—the venerable Sāriputta, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna, the venerable Mahā Kassapa, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Revata, the venerable Ananda, and other very experienced elder disciples.

2. Then when it was evening the venerable Mahā Moggallāna rose from meditation, and he went to the venerable Mahā Kassapa and said to him: 'Friend Kassapa, let us go to the venerable Sāriputta to listen to the Dhamma.'

'Even so, friend,' the venerable Mahā Kassapa replied.

Then the venerable Mahā Moggallāna and the venerable Mahā Kassapa and the venerable Anuruddha went to the venerable Sāriputta to listen to the Dhamma.

3. The venerable Ānanda saw them as they were going to the venerable Sāriputta to listen to the Dhamma. When he saw them, he went to the venerable Revata and said to him: 'Friend Revata, these true men are going to the venerable Sāriputta to listen to the Dhamma. Let us also go to the venerable Sāriputta to listen to the Dhamma.'

'Even so, friend,' the venerable Revata replied.

Then the venerable Revata and the venerable Ānanda went to the venerable Sāriputta to listen to the Dhamma.

4. The venerable Sāriputta saw the venerable Revata and the venerable Ānanda coming. When he saw them, he he said to the venerable Ānanda: 'Let the venerable Ānanda come, welcome to the venerable Ānanda, the Blessed One's attendant, who is always near to the Blessed One. Friend Ānanda, the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood is delightful, the night is moonlit, the sāla tress are all in blossom, and the scents abroad seem to savour of heaven: what kind of bhikkhu, then, would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?'

'Here, friend Sāriputta, a bhikkhu has learnt ('heard') much, remembers what he has learnt, and consolidates what he has learnt; such

dhammas as are good in the beginning, the middle and the end with (the right) meaning and phrasing as affirm a life divine that is utterly perfect and pure, such dhammas as these he has learnt much of, remembered, consolidated by word of mouth, looked over by the mind, and well penetrated by (right) view: and he teaches the Dhamma to the four assemblies with phrases and syllables well-rounded and unhesitant for the abolishment of underlying tendencies. That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood.'

5. When this was said, the venerable Sāriputta addressed the venerable Revata thus: 'Friend Revata, the venerable Ānanda has spoken as it occurs to him. Now we ask the venerable Revata: Friend Revata, the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood is delightful, the night is moonlit, the Sāla trees are all in bloom, and the scents abroad seem to savour of heaven: what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?'

'Here, friend Sāriputta, a bhikkhu delights in retreat, takes delight in retreat, is devoted in himself to serenity of mind, unneglectful of jhāna, endowed with insight, and a frequenter of empty huts. That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood.'

6. When this was said, the venerable Sāriputta addressed the venerable Anuruddha thus: 'Friend Anuruddha, the venerable Revata has spoken as it occurs to him. Now we ask the venerable Anuruddha: Friend Anuruddha, the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood is delightful... what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?'

'Here, friend Sāriputta, a bhikkhu surveys a thousand worlds with heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human. Just as a man with (good) eyes when he had gone to the balcony of the upper palace might survey a thousand wheel-rims, so too, a bhikkhu surveys a thousand worlds with heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human. That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood.'

7. When this was said, the venerable Sāriputta addressed the venerable Mahā Kassapa thus: 'Friend Kassapa, the venerable Anuruddha has spoken as it occurs to him. Now we ask the venerable Mahā Kassapa: Friend Kassapa, the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood is delightful... what kind

of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?’

‘Here, friend Sāriputta, a bhikkhu is a forest-dweller himself and a commender of forest-dwelling, he is an alms-food-eater himself and a commender of alms-food-eating, he is a refuse-rag-wearer himself and a commender of refuse-rag-wearing, he is a triple-robe-wearer himself and a commender of triple-robe-wearing, he has few wishes himself and is a commender of fewness of wishes, he is contented himself and a commender of contentment, he is secluded himself and a commender of seclusion, he is not associated (with society) himself and a commender of non-association (with society), he is energetic himself and a commender of energy, he is perfect in virtue himself and a commender of perfection of virtue, he is perfect in concentration himself and a commender of perfection of concentration, he is perfect in understanding himself and a commender of perfection of understanding, he is perfect in deliverance himself and a commender of perfection of deliverance, he is perfect in knowledge and vision of deliverance himself and a commender of perfection of knowledge and vision of deliverance. That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood.’

8. When this was said, the venerable Sāriputta addressed the venerable Mahā Moggallāna thus: ‘Friend Moggallāna, the venerable Mahā Kassapa has spoken as it occurs to him. Now we ask the venerable Mahā Moggallāna: Friend Moggallāna, the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood is delightful... what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?’

‘Here, friend Sāriputta, two bhikkhus engage in a talk on the Higher Dhamma, and they question each other, and each being questioned by the other answers without foundering, and their talk rolls on in accordance with the Dhamma. That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood.’

9. When this was said, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna addressed the venerable Sāriputta thus: ‘Friend Sāriputta, we have all spoken, as it occurs to each of us. Now we ask the venerable Sāriputta: Friend Sāriputta, the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood is delightful, the night is moonlit, the sāla trees are all in blossom, and the scents abroad seem to savour of heaven: what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-

tree Wood?’

‘Here, friend Moggallāna, a bhikkhu wields mastery over his mind, he does not let the mind wield mastery: he abides in the morning in whatever abiding or attainment he wants to abide in the morning; he abides at mid-day in whatever abiding or attainment he wants to abide at mid-day; he abides in the evening in whatever abiding or attainment he wants to abide in the evening. Suppose a king or a king’s minister had a clothes-chest full of variously coloured garments, and he put on in the morning whatever pair of garments he wanted to put on in the morning, he put on at mid-day whatever pair of garments he wanted to put on at mid-day, he put on in the evening whatever pair of garments he wanted to put on in the evening; so too, a bhikkhu wields mastery over his mind, he does not let the mind wield mastery . . . he wants to abide in the evening. That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood.’

10. Then the venerable Sāriputta addressed those venerable ones thus: ‘Friends, we have all spoken as it occurs to each of us. Let us go the Blessed One and tell him this. As the Blessed One answers, so let us remember it.’

‘Even so, friend,’ they replied.

Then they went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, they sat down at one side. When they had done so, the venerable Sāriputta said to the Blessed One:

11. ‘Venerable sir, the venerable Revata and the venerable Ānanda came to me to listen to the Dhamma I saw them coming, and when I saw them, I said to the venerable Ānanda: “Let the venerable Ānanda come, welcome to the venerable Ānanda, the Blessed One’s attendant who is always near to the Blessed One. Friend Ānanda, the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood is delightful, the night is moonlit, the sala trees are all in blossom, and the scents abroad seem to savour of heaven: what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?” When this was said, venerable sir, the venerable Ānanda spoke this to me: “Friend Sāriputta, a bhikkhu has learnt much . . . (as in para. 4) . . . for the abolishment of underlying tendencies. That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood.”’

‘Good, good Sāriputta. Ānanda speaking rightly should speak just as

he did, for he has learnt much, and consolidates what he has learnt; such dhammas as are good in the beginning, the middle and the end with the (right) meaning and phrasing, and as recommend a life divine that is utterly perfect and pure, such dhammas as these has he learnt much of, remembered, consolidated by word of mouth, looked over with the mind, and well penetrated with (right) view: and he teaches the Dhamma to the four assemblies with phrases and syllables well rounded and unhesitant for the abolishment of underlying tendencies.'

12. 'When this was said, venerable sir, I addressed the venerable Revata thus: "Friend Revata ... (as in para. 5)... what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?" When that was said, venerable sir, the venerable Revata spoke to me thus: "Here, friend Sāriputta, a bhikkhu delights in retreat ... (as in para. 5.)... That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood."'

'Good, good, Sāriputta. Revata speaking rightly should speak just as he did, for he delights in retreat, takes delight in retreat, is in himself devoted to serenity of mind, is unneglectful of jhāna, endowed with insight and a frequenter of empty huts.'

13. 'When that was said, venerable sir, I addressed the venerable Anuruddha thus: "Friend Anuruddha ... (as in para. 6)... what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?" When that was said, venerable sir, the venerable Anuruddha spoke to me thus: "Here, friend Sāriputta, a bhikkhu surveys a thousand worlds ... (as in para. 6) ... That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood."'

'Good, good, Sāriputta. Anuruddha speaking rightly should speak just as he did, for Anuruddha surveys a thousand worlds with heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human.'

14. 'When this was said, venerable sir, I addressed the venerable Mahā Kassapa thus: "Friend Kassapa ... (as in para. 7)... what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?" When that was said, venerable sir, the venerable Mahā Kassapa spoke to me thus: "Here, friend Sāriputta, a bhikkhu is a forest-dweller ... (as in para. 7) ... That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood."'

'Good, good, Sāriputta. Kassapa speaking rightly should speak just as he did, for Kassapa is a forest-dweller himself and a commender of forest-dwelling... he is perfect in knowledge and vision of deliverance and a commender of perfection in knowledge and vision of deliverance.'

15. 'When this was said, venerable sir, I addressed the venerable Mahā Moggallāna thus: "Friend Moggallāna... (as in para. 8)... what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?" When that was said, venerable sir, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna spoke to me thus: "Here, friend Sāriputta, two bhikkhus engage in a talk on the Higher Dhamma... (as in para. 8)... That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood."'

'Good, good, Sāriputta. Moggallāna speaking rightly should speak just as he did, for Moggallāna is one to talk on the Dhamma.'

16. When that was said, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna told the Blessed One: 'Then, venerable sir, I addressed the venerable Sāriputta thus: "Friend Sāriputta... (as in para. 9)... what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood?" When that was said, venerable sir, the venerable Sāriputta spoke to me thus: "Here, friend Moggallāna, a bhikkhu wields mastery over his mind... (as in para. 9)... That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood"'

'Good, good, Moggallāna. Sāriputta speaking rightly should speak just as he did, for Sāriputta wields mastery over his mind, he does not let the mind wield mastery: he abides in the morning in whatever abiding or attainment he wants to abide in the morning; he abides at mid-day in whatever abiding or attainment he wants to abide at mid-day; he abides in the evening in whatever abiding or attainment he wants to abide in the evening.'

17. When this was said, the venerable Sāriputta asked the Blessed One: 'Venerable sir, which has spoken well?'

'All have spoken well, Sāriputta, each in his own way. Hear also from me what kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla tree Wood: Here, Sāriputta, when a bhikkhu has returned from his alms-round after his meal, he sits down, folding his legs crosswise, and

he establishes mindfulness before him¹, (resolving) "I shall not break this session till my mind is liberated from taints with the arising of knowledge". That kind of bhikkhu would do credit to the Gosinga Sāla-tree Wood.'

That was what the Blessed One said. The venerable ones were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 4. *dosinā*—moonlit: the word is explained in the Comy, by *dosā-pagata* (free from faults) P.T.S. Dict. derives from Skt. *vyotsnā* from which also Pali *junhā*. If *dosinā* is taken via Skr. as an adj. form from *junhā* (=jyotsnā) the connexion is only apparent (if correct) through Skr. But it is one of the tenets of the Commentaries that Pāli, not Sanskrit, is the '*Mūlabhāsa* (root-speech)' (Vis. Ch. XIV para. 25; VbhA. 387). This is not the place to criticize that standpoint or to enquire whether a claim on behalf of Sanskrit for the status of *mūlabhāsa* is or is not justified, though European philology rather assumes it. Much could doubtless be argued on both sides. However, it follows rather from the standpoint adopted by the Commentaries that any derivation of a Sutta Pāli word from Sanskrit would scarcely be in order.

para. 4. For another form of the sentence '*ye te dhammā ādikalyāna... parisuddham brahmacariyam abhivadanti*' cf Sutta 27, para. 15: 'so dhammam deseti ādikālyanam... parisuddham brahmacariyam pakāseti.

para. 4. The 'four assemblies' are the bhikkhus, bhikkhunis, laymen and laywomen followers.

para. 4. *appabaddha*—unhesitant: neither the neg. nor pos. form in P.T.S. Dict.

para. 6. *nemimaṇḍala*—wheel-rim: reference is to the *cakkavāla*'s (world-system, universe, one among an infinite number) construction.

1. Keeps mindfulness before (or to the fore in) his mind; the minding is keeping mind alert with mindfulness.

para. 8. *samsādentī*—founder: causative form of *samsīdatī*—see Sutta 143, para. 17. but used in active sense, see A.V. 194.

para. 8. *abhidhamma*—the Higher Dhamma: the Abhidhamma in its Abhidhamma-piṭaka sense is probably inappropriate at this stage.

IV

THE BUDDHA

(a) STRIVING AND ENLIGHTENMENT

'I thought: "While my Sakyan father was busy, while I was sitting in the cool shade of a rose-apple tree quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, I had direct knowledge of entering upon and abiding in the first jhāna, which is accompanied by initial and sustained application with happiness and bodily pleasure born of seclusion. Might that be the way to Enlightenment?" Then, following on that memory, came the recognition: "This is the way to Enlightenment."'

(Sutta 36)

Bhayabherava Sutta

Fear and Dread

Introduction

Living comfortably with relatives and friends, surrounded by treasured possessions and well-known places, is normal and fairly easy but it is not the way to liberation. A person who would undertake that course must be prepared to spend a long time in remote places, with few people around and fewer possessions to distract. With silence, a disciplined life and much meditation such a person will follow the way of the Bodhisatta (the ascetic Gotama before he became the Buddha) and of forest monks and nuns in Thailand today. A life like this cannot be very easy but then real spiritual progress is never got by easy ways. Here in this discourse the Buddha speaks of his experiences of fear before his Enlightenment, he analyzes the causes of fear and then gives the cure for it. The causes of fear are those which dwell in our own minds, speech and bodies, from 'unpurified bodily conduct' to being 'devoid of understanding and drivelling' (para. 4 to para. 19). The experiences he had of fear were triggered by going alone to remote and fearful places where it seems, from the use of the word 'shrines', that some kind of powers dwelt. Then his cure consisted of not submitting to the arisen fear but overcoming it in whatever posture he was in at that time. If we think about our own cases we shall find plenty of defilements within us as cause for fear. But as our merits are not as great as the Bodhisatta's, instead of going off on our own to test our anxieties, we shall be well-advised to seek a good Dhamma-teacher in some lonely place and there get down to practice. Our cure will depend on how vigorous our efforts and determination are, balanced by the advice of the Teacher on the best way to proceed. The Sutta ends with an account of the Buddha's Enlightenment, in the same words as are used for his disciples' attainment of Arhantship. If our practice, as His, proceeds causally, the same results may be gained.

The Sutta (4)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park.

2. Then Jānussoṇi of the divine caste went to the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said: 'Master Gotama, when clansmen have gone forth from the home life into homelessness out of faith in Master Gotama, do they have Master Gotama for their leader, their helper and their guide? And do these people follow the implications of Master Gotama's view?'

'That is so, divine, that is so. When clansmen have gone forth from the home life into homelessness out of faith in me, they have me for their leader, their helper and their guide. And these people do follow the implications of my view.'

'But Master Gotama, remote jungle-thicket resting places in the forest are hard to endure, seclusion is hard to achieve and it is hard to enjoy isolation. One would think the jungles must rob a bhikkhu of his mind, if he has no concentration.'

'That is so, divine, that is so. Remote jungle-thicket resting places in the forest are hard to endure, seclusion is hard to achieve and it is hard to enjoy isolation. One would think the jungles must rob a bhikkhu of his mind, if he has no concentration.'

3. 'Before my enlightenment, while I was still only an unenlightened Bodhisatta,¹ I too (considered) thus: "Remote jungle-thicket resting places are hard to endure... the jungles must rob a bhikkhu of his mind, if he has no concentration."

4. 'I considered thus: "Whenever monks or divines resort to remote jungle-thicket resting places in the forest unpurified in bodily conduct, then owing to the defect in their unpurified bodily conduct these worthy monks and divines evoke unprofitable fear and dread. But I do not resort to remote jungle-thicket resting places in the forest unpurified in bodily

1. In the translation originally: 'Being dedicated to Enlightenment'. Other discourses have just 'Bodhisatta'.

conduct. I am purified in bodily conduct. I resort to remote jungle-thicket resting places, as it were, one of the Noble Ones, with bodily conduct purified." Seeing in myself this purity of bodily conduct, I found great solace in dwelling in the forest.

5. 'I (considered) thus: "Whenever monks or divines ... unpurified in verbal conduct ... evoke unprofitable fear and dread. But I ... am purified in verbal conduct ..." I found great solace dwelling in the forest.

6. 'I (considered) thus: "Whenever monks or divines ... unpurified in mental conduct ... evoke great fear and dread. I am purified in mental conduct ..."

7. "'... unpurified in livelihood ... I am purified in livelihood ..."

8. "'... covetous and keenly affected by lust for sensual desires ... I am uncovetous ..."

9. "'... with a mind of ill-will ... I have a mind of loving-kindness ..."

10. "'... obsessed by lethargy and drowsiness ... I am without lethargy and drowsiness ..."

11. "'... with agitated and unquiet mind ... I have a quiet mind ..."

12. "'... doubting and uncertain ... I have gone beyond uncertainty ..."

13. "'... given to self-praise and disparagement of others ... I am not given to self-praise and disparagement of others ..."

14. "'... subject to alarm and terror ... I am not subject to alarm and terror ..."

15. "'... desirous of gain, honour and renown ... I have few wishes ..."

16. "'... idle and wanting in energy ... I am energetic ..."

17. "'... forgetful and unaware ... I have established mindfulness ..."

18. "'... unconcentrated with straying mind ... I am perfect in concentration ..."

19. 'I (considered) thus: "Whenever monks or divines resort to remote

jungle-thicket resting places in the forest devoid of understanding and drivelling, then owing to the defect of their being devoid of understanding and drivelling, these worthy monks and divines evoke unprofitable fear and dread. But I do not resort to remote jungle-thicket resting places in the forest devoid of understanding and drivelling. I am perfect in understanding. I resort to remote jungle-thicket resting places in the forest, as it were, one of the Noble ones perfect in understanding." Seeing in myself this perfection of understanding, I found great solace in dwelling in the forest.

20. 'I (considered) thus: "There are the specially holy nights of the (half-moon of the) Fourteenth, the (half-moon of the) Fifteenth, and the Quarter-moon of the Eighth. Now what if I dwell on such nights as these in such awe-inspiring, horrifying abodes as orchard shrines, woodland shrines, and tree shrines. Perhaps I too might encounter that fear and dread?"

'And later, on such specially holy nights as the (half-moon of the) Fourteenth, the (half-moon) of the Fifteenth, and the quarter-moon of the Eighth, I dwelt in such awe-inspiring, horrifying abodes such as orchard shrines, woodland shrines and tree shrines. And while I dwelt there, a wild animal would come up to me, or a peacock would knock off a branch, or the wind would rustle the leaves. I (thought): "What now if this is the fear and dread coming?" I (thought): "Why do I dwell always expecting fear and dread? What if I subdue that fear and dread while keeping the posture that I am in when it finds me?"

'While he walked, the fear and dread came upon me. I neither stood nor sat nor lay down till I had subdued that fear and dread. While I stood, the fear and dread came upon me. I neither walked nor sat nor lay down till I had subdued that fear and dread. While I sat, the fear and dread came upon me. I neither walked nor stood nor lay down till I had subdued that fear and dread. While I lay down, the fear and dread came upon me. I neither walked nor stood nor sat till I had subdued that fear and dread.

21. "There are monks and divines who perceive day when it is night and perceive night when it is day. I say that on their part that is a deluded man's abiding. Now I perceive night when it is night and per-

ceive day when it is day. Rightly speaking, were it to be said of someone: "A being not subject to delusion has appeared in the world for the welfare and happiness of many, out of pity for the world, for the benefit, welfare and happiness of gods and men", it is of me indeed that rightly speaking it should be said thus.

22. 'Tireless energy was aroused in me and unforgetting mindfulness established, my body was tranquil and untroubled, my mind was concentrated and unified.

23. 'Quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, I entered upon and abode in the first jhāna which is accompanied by initial and sustained application with happiness and (bodily) pleasure born of seclusion.

24. 'With the stilling of initial and sustained application, I entered upon and abode in the second jhāna, which has self-confidence and singleness of mind, without initial application and without sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of concentration.

25. 'With the fading as well of happiness I abode in equanimity, mindful and fully aware, still feeling pleasure with the body, I entered upon and abode in the third jhāna, on which account Noble Ones announce: "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful."

26. 'With the abandoning of (bodily) pleasure and pain, and with the previous disappearance of (mental) joy and grief, I entered upon and abode in the fourth jhāna, which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.

27. 'When the concentrated mind was thus quite purified, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, I directed, I inclined the mind to knowledge of the recollection of past life.

'I recollected my manifold past life, that is to say, one birth, two births . . . five births, ten births . . . fifty births, a hundred births, a thousand births, a hundred thousand births, many aeons of (world)² con-

2. 'World' here has the meaning of 'universe'.

traction, many aeons of (world) expansion, many aeons of (world) contraction and expansion: "There I was so named, of such a race, with such (qualities of) appearance, such was my nutriment, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-term; and passing away from there, I appeared elsewhere; and there too I was so-named, of such a race, with such (qualities of) appearance, such was my nutriment, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-term; and passing away from there I appeared here. Thus with details and particulars I recollected my manifold past life.

28. 'This was the first True Knowledge attained by me in the first watch of the night. Ignorance was banished and true Knowledge arose; darkness was banished and light arose, as (happens) in one who abides diligent, ardent and self-controlled.

29. 'When the concentrated mind was thus quite purified, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, wieldy, steady and attained to imperturbability, I directed, I inclined the mind to knowledge of the passing away and reappearance of beings.

'With the heavenly eyesight which is purified and surpasses the human, I saw beings passing away and reappearing inferior and superior, fair and ugly, well-behaved and ill-behaved; I understood how beings pass on according to their kammās, thus: "These worthy beings who are ill-conducted in body, speech and mind, revilers of Noble Ones, wrong in their views, giving effect to wrong view in their kammās (actions), have, on the dissolution of the dissolution of the body, after death, appeared in a state of deprivation, in a bad destination in perdition, even in hell; but these worthy beings, who are well-conducted in body, speech and mind, not revilers of Noble Ones, right in their views, giving effect to right view in their kammās (actions), have, on the dissolution of the body, after death, appeared in a good destination, even in the heavenly world", thus with heavenly eyesight which is purified and surpasses the human, I saw beings passing away and reappearing, inferior and superior, fair and ugly, well-behaved and ill-behaved; I understood how beings pass on according to their kammās.

30. 'This was the second True Knowledge attained by me in the second

watch of the night. Ignorance was banished and True Knowledge arose; darkness was banished and light arose as (happens) in one who abides diligent ardent and self-controlled.

31. 'When the concentrated mind was thus purified and bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, and become malleable, wieldy, steady and attained to unperturbability, I directed, I inclined the mind to knowledge of exhaustion of taints.

I had direct knowledge thus: "This is suffering"; I had direct knowledge thus: "This is the origin of suffering"; I had direct knowledge thus: "This is the cessation of suffering"; I had direct knowledge thus: "This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering." I had direct knowledge thus: "These are taints"; I had direct knowledge thus: "This is the origin of taints"; I had direct knowledge thus: "This is the cessation of taints"; I had direct knowledge thus: "This is the way leading to the cessation of taints."

32. 'When I knew and saw thus, the mind was liberated from the taints of sensual desire, from the taints of being and from the taints of ignorance. When liberated there came the knowledge: "It is liberated". I had direct knowledge thus: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived out, what can be done is done, there is no more of this in the beyond."

33. 'This was the third True Knowledge attained by me in the third watch of the night. Ignorance was banished and True Knowledge arose; darkness was banished and light arose as (happens) in one who abides diligent, ardent and self-controlled.

34. 'Now, divine, it might be that you (think) thus: "Perhaps the monk Gotama is not free from lust, hate and delusion even today, which is why he still resorts to remote jungle-thicket resting places in the forest." But you should not think thus. It is because I see two benefits that I still resort to remote jungle-thicket resting places in the forest: I see a pleasant abiding for myself here and now, and I have pity on the future generations.'³

3. Of bhikkhus (and laypeople) who will be encouraged to seek solitude knowing that even the Blessed One practised this.

35. 'Indeed it is because Master Gotama is an Arahant and Fully Enlightened that he has pity on future generations.

36. 'Magnificent, Master Gotama! Magnificent, Master Gotama! The Dhamma has been made clear in many ways by Master Gotama, as though he were righting the overthrown, revealing the hidden, showing the way to one who was lost, holding up a lamp in the darkness for those with eyesight to see forms.

37. 'I go to Master Gotama for refuge, and to the Dhamma and to the Sangha. From today let Master Gotama remember me as a follower who has gone to him for refuge for life.'

Notes

para. 2. *Brahmana*—divine caste: See introduction for the plays on the words associated with *Brahma*.

para. 2. 'courteous and amiable' is more literally 'gladdening and memorable'.

para. 20. There are three seasons each of four lunar months (with an extra month included every so many years to regulate the irregularities of the moon). The month ends on the day of the Full Moon and begins on the day after the full moon. The third and seventh new moons in each four-month season are 'of the Fourteenth' (i.e., fourteen days after the last moon-day), while the other six (two new-moons and four full moons) are 'of the Fifteenth' (this compensates the daily lunar irregularities). The 'Eighth' is the quarter-moon (i.e., halfway between full and new, or new and full).

para. 22. *āneñja*—imperturbability: a term for the fourth meditation, and also for the four formless states. See Sutta 66 para. 24. ff and also Sutta 106.

para 25. *yantam* is sometimes taken to refer back to *sukham*, which

comes before; but from the Vis. Ch. IV. para. 176 (P.T.S. Ed. p. 163), it is plain that *yantam* refers forward to *tatiyam jhānam*: it is not the 'pleasure' of which Noble Ones announce, but the 'third *jhāna*' of which they announce. The sense, too, requires this.

Mahasaccaka Sutta

Saccaka-2

Introduction

Here is Saccaka who, though his name means 'truthful', actually cared little for the truth. He was interested in demonstrating the superiority of his own views and in defeating his opponents. In the previous Sutta (35) he did not succeed for as the saying goes, 'he bit off more than he could chew' and was humbled in the presence of many others by the Buddha. Here we see another side of Saccaka's unpleasant nature: his sceptical criticism which is mixed with sarcasm—a nasty blend arising from hate and delusion. Even when the truth is made plain to him, his mind, full of uncertainty or scepticism (*vicikicchā*), will not accept it. He is an expert, not with truth, but at needling people for it seems that he has gone round to various religious teachers trying to provoke them to anger. He did not succeed though, when he came to the Buddha. Our Teacher had the great compassion to spend an hour or two even with people like Saccaka, whose defilements were so dense that he could not, in that life, understand Dhamma. And the time he gave to Saccaka was not the usual teaching time in the afternoon or evening, but just before going out on the alms-round. The Buddha is quite unperturbed by all of Saccaka's provocations, a point which astonishes Saccaka. Other (and unenlightened) teachers when engaged in debate with Saccaka did three things (still to be seen among those who cling to views): they prevaricated, led the talk aside, and showed anger, hate and surliness, but the Buddha even when personal remarks were directed at him—his skin brightened and his face cleared.

The Sutta (36)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Vesāli in the Hall with the Peaked Roof in the Great Wood.

2. Now on that occasion, it being morning, the Blessed One had finished dressing and had taken his bowl and (outer) robe, being desirous of going into Vesāli for alms.

3. Then as Saccaka the Nigantha's son was walking and wandering for exercise he came to the Great Wood, to the Hall with the Peaked Roof. The venerable Ānanda saw him coming in the distance. When he saw him, he said to the Blessed One: 'Venerable sir, here comes Saccaka the Nigantha's son; he is a debater, a clever speaker, and regarded by many as a saint. He wants to decry the Enlightened One, to decry the Dhamma, to decry the Sangha. It would be good if the Blessed One would sit down for a while out of compassion.'

The Blessed One sat down on the seat made ready. Then Saccaka the Nigantha's son went up to him and exchanged greetings with him, and after the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said to the Blessed One:

4. 'Master Gotama, there are some monks and divines who abide in pursuit of the practice of developing the body without developing the mind. They are touched by bodily painful feeling. It has happened that a man who is touched by bodily painful feeling got a paralysis of the thigh or his heart burst or hot blood gushed from his mouth or he went mad, out of his mind. So then the mind was subservient to the body, it let the body wield mastery. Why is that? Because the mind was not developed. But there are some monks and divines who abide in pursuit of developing the mind, without developing the body. They are touched by mental painful feeling. It has happened that a man touched by mental painful feeling also got a paralysis of the thigh or his heart burst or hot blood gushed from his mouth or he went mad, out of his mind. So then the body was subservient to the mind, it let the mind wield mastery. Why is that? Because the body was not developed. Master Gotama, it has occurred to me: surely Master Gotama's disciples abide in pursuit of developing the mind, without developing the body?'

5. 'But Aggivessana, how has development of body¹ been learnt by you?'

'Well, there are, for example, Nanda Vaccha, Kisa Sankicca, Makkhali Gosāla. They go naked, rejecting conventions, licking their hands, not coming when asked, not stopping when asked, they do not accept anything brought, or anything specially made, or an invitation; they receive nothing out of a pot, from out of a bowl, across a threshold, across a stick, across a pestle, from two eating together, from a woman with child, from a woman giving suck, from (where) a woman is lying with a man, from where food is advertized to be distributed, from where a dog is waiting, from where flies are buzzing; they accept no fish or meat, they drink no wine or spirits or fermented liquor. They keep to one house, to one morsel; they keep to two houses, to two morsels; . . . they keep to seven houses, to seven morsels. They live on one saucerful, on two saucerfuls . . . on seven saucerfuls, a day. They take food once each day, once each two days . . . once each seven days; and so up to once each fortnight, they dwell devoted to such practice of taking food at stated intervals.'

6. 'But do they always subsist like that, Aggivessana?'

'No, Master Gotama, sometimes they chew good hard food, eat good soft food, taste good relishes, drink good drinks. With that they pick up strength, wax and get fat.'

'What they once abandoned, Aggivessana, they later gather together again. That is how there is amassing and dispersal of this body. Now how has development of mind been learnt by you?'

When Saccaka the Nigantha's son was asked by the Blessed One about development of mind, he was unable to answer.

7. Then the Blessed One told him: 'What you have just spoken of as development of body, Aggivessana, is not developing the body according to Dhamma in the Noble Discipline. Since you do not know what devel-

1. Saccaka understands by this the extreme of self-mortification (see the bodily austerities below) but for the Buddha development of the body consists of developing restraint of the senses and the mindfulness exercises under contemplation of the body (*kayanupassana*). Comy. too narrowly identifies development of the body with insight-meditation and development of mind with the development of calm.

opment of body is, how should you know what developing the mind is? Nevertheless, Aggivessana, listen how a man is undeveloped in body and undeveloped in mind, and how he is developed in body and developed in mind, and heed well what I shall say.'

'Even so, sir,' Saccaka the Nigantha's son replied. The Blessed One said this:

8. 'How is man undeveloped in body and undeveloped in mind?

'Here, Aggivessana, pleasant feeling arises in an untaught ordinary man. Touched by that pleasant feeling, he lusts after that pleasant feeling, and he keeps lusting after that pleasant feeling. That pleasant feeling of his ceases. With the cessation of the pleasant feeling painful feeling (later) arises. Touched by that painful feeling he sorrows, grieves and laments, beating his breast, he weeps and becomes distraught. When that pleasant feeling is arisen in him, it invades the mind and remains because the body is not developed. And when that painful feeling is arisen in him, it invades the mind and remains because the mind is not developed.² Anyone in whom, in this double manner, pleasant feeling arisen invades the mind and remains because the body is not developed, and painful feeling arisen invades the mind and remains because the mind is not developed, is thus undeveloped in body and undeveloped in mind.

9. 'And how is man developed in body and developed in mind?

Here, Aggivessana, pleasant feeling arises in a well-taught noble disciple. Touched by that pleasant feeling, he does not lust after that pleasant feeling, he does not keep lusting after that pleasant feeling. That pleasant feeling of his ceases. With the cessation of the pleasant feeling, painful feeling (later) arises. Touched by that painful feeling, he does not sorrow, grieve or lament, he does not, beating his breast, weep and become distraught. When that pleasant feeling is arisen in him it does not invade the mind and remain because the body is developed. And when that painful feeling is arisen in him, it does not invade the mind and remain because the mind is developed. Anyone in whom, in this

2. Comy. says: Insight (development of body) is near to dukkha (suffering) and far from sukha (happiness); while Calm (development of mind) is near to happiness (the bliss of jhāna-experience) and far from dukkha.

double manner, pleasant feeling arisen does not invade the mind and remain because the body is developed, and painful feeling arisen does not invade the mind and remain because the mind is developed, is thus developed in mind and developed in body.'

10. 'I have confidence in Master Gotama thus: "He is developed in body and developed in mind."'

'Surely, Aggivessana, the words you have spoken are directly personal. Nevertheless I shall answer you. Since I shaved off my hair and beard, put on the yellow cloth, and went forth from the home life into homelessness, that pleasant feeling arisen might invade my mind and remain, that is not possible.'

11. 'Has there perhaps never arisen in Master Gotama a feeling so pleasant as to invade his mind and remain? Has there perhaps never arisen in Master Gotama a feeling so painful as to invade his mind and remain?'

12. 'Why not, Aggivessana? Here, before my enlightenment, while I was still only an unenlightened Bodhisatta I thought: "House life is a constraint and it is a place of dirt; life gone forth is wide open. It is not possible while living in a house to lead the life divine as utterly perfect and pure as a polished shell. Suppose I shaved off my hair and beard, put on the yellow cloth, and went forth from the home life into homelessness?'

13-16. 'Later, while still young, a black-haired boy endowed with the blessing of youth, in the first phase of life—though my mother and father . . . (and so on as in M. 26 para. 14-17 up to) . . . There is this agreeable piece of ground, this delightful grove, this clear-flowing river with pleasant smooth banks, and nearby a village as alms resort. This will serve for the endeavour of a clansman who seeks endeavour. And I sat down there (thinking): "This will serve for endeavour."'

17. 'Now these three similes occurred to me spontaneously, never heard before.

'Suppose there were a wet, sappy piece of wood lying in water, and a man came with an upper fire-stick, thinking: "I shall light a fire, I

shall produce heat"; how do you conceive this, Aggivessana, would the man light a fire and produce heat by taking the upper fire-stick and rubbing with it the wet, sappy piece of wood lying in water?'

'No, Master Gotama. Why not? Because it is a wet, sappy piece of wood, and besides, it is lying in water. So the man would reap weariness and disappointment.'

'So, Aggivessana, while a monk or divine lives still bodily and mentally not withdrawn from sensual desires, and while his lust, affection, passion, thirst and fever for sensual desires are not quite abandoned and quieted within him, then, even if the good monk or divine feels painful, racking, piercing feelings due to striving,³ he is incapable of knowledge and vision and the supreme enlightenment, and even if the good monk or divine does not feel painful, racking, piercing feelings due to striving, he is incapable of knowledge and vision and the supreme enlightenment. This was the first simile that occurred to me spontaneously, never heard before.

18. 'Again, suppose there were a wet, sappy piece of wood lying on dry land far from water, and a man came with an upper fire-stick, thinking: "I shall light a fire, I shall produce heat"; how do you conceive this, Aggivessana, would the man light a fire and produce heat by taking the upper fire-stick and rubbing with it the wet, sappy piece of wood lying on dry land far from water?'

'No, Master Gotama. Why not? Because it is a wet, sappy piece of wood, though it is lying on dry land far from water. So the man would reap weariness and disappointment.'

'So, Aggivessana, while a monk or divine lives still only bodily withdrawn from sensual desires, and while his lust, affection, passion, thirst and fever, for sensual desires are not quite abandoned and quieted within him, then even if the good monk or divine feels painful, racking, piercing feelings due to striving, he is incapable of knowledge and vision and the supreme enlightenment. And even if the good monk or divine does not feel painful, racking, piercing feelings due to striving, he is incapable of knowledge and vision and the supreme enlightenment. This was the second simile that occurred to me spontaneously, never heard before.

3. 'Due to striving' refers to the extreme of self-mortification.

19. 'Again, suppose there were a dry sapless piece of wood lying on dry land far from water, and man came with an upper fire-stick, thinking: "I shall light a fire, I shall produce heat"; how do you conceive this, Aggivessana, would the man light a fire and produce heat by rubbing with it the dry, sapless piece of wood lying on dry land far from water?'

'Yes, Master Gotama. Why so? Because it is a dry, sapless piece of wood, and besides, it is lying on dry land far from water!'

'So, Aggivessana, while a monk or divine lives both bodily and mentally withdrawn from sense-desires, and while his lust, affection, passion, thirst and fever, for sensual desires are quite abandoned and quieted within him, then, even if the good monk or divine feels painful, racking, piercing feelings due to striving, he is capable of knowledge and vision and the supreme enlightenment, and even if the good monk or divine does not feel painful, racking, piercing feelings due to striving, he is capable of knowledge and vision and the supreme enlightenment. This was the third simile that occurred to me spontaneously, never heard before.

20. 'I thought: "Suppose, with my teeth clenched and my tongue pressed against the roof of my mouth, I beat down, constrain and crush mind with mind?" So, with my teeth clenched and my tongue pressed against the roof of my mouth, I beat down, constrained and crushed mind with mind. While I did so, sweat ran from my armpits. Just as a strong man might seize a weaker by the head or shoulders and beat him down, constrain and crush him, so too, while with my teeth clenched and my tongue pressed against the roof of my mouth, I beat down, constrained and crushed mind with mind, sweat ran from my armpits. But although tireless energy was aroused in me and unremitting mindfulness was established, yet my body was overwrought and uncalm because I was exhausted by the painful endeavour. But such painful feeling as arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

21. 'I thought: "Suppose I practise the meditation without breathing?" So I stopped the in-breaths and out-breaths in my mouth and nose. While I did so, there was a loud sound of winds coming from my ear-holes. Just as there is a loud sound when a smith's bellows are blown,

so too, while I stopped the in-breaths and out-breaths in my nose and ears, there was a loud sound of winds coming from my earholes.

'But although tireless energy was aroused in me ... painful feeling ... did not invade my mind and remain.

22. 'I thought: "Suppose I practise further the meditation without breathing?" So I stopped the in-breaths and out-breaths in my mouth, nose and ears. While I did so, violent winds harried my head. Just as if a strong man were splitting my head open with a sharp sword, so too, while I stopped the in-breaths and the out-breaths in my mouth, nose and ears, violent winds harried my head.

'But although tireless energy was aroused in me ... painful feeling ... did not invade my mind and remain.

23. 'I thought: "Suppose I practise further the meditation without breathing?" So I stopped the in-breaths and out-breaths in my mouth, nose and ears. While I did so, there were violent pains in my head. Just as if a strong man were tightening a tough leather strap round my head as a headband, so too, while I stopped the in-breaths and out-breaths in my mouth, nose and ears, there were violent pains in my head.

'But although tireless energy was aroused in me ... painful feeling ... did not invade my mind and remain.

24. 'I thought: "Suppose I practise further the meditation without breathing?" So I stopped the in-breaths and out-breaths in my mouth, nose and ears. While I did so, violent winds carved up my belly. Just as a clever butcher or his apprentice carves up an ox's belly with a sharp knife, so too, while I stopped the in-breaths and out-breaths in my mouth, nose and ears, violent winds carved up my belly.

'But although tireless energy was aroused in me ... painful feeling ... did not invade my mind and remain.

25. 'I thought: "Suppose I practise further the meditation without breathing?" So I stopped the in-breaths and out-breaths in my mouth, nose and ears. While I did so, there was violent burning in my body. Just as if two strong men had seized a weaker by both arms and were roasting him over a pit of hot coals, so too, while I stopped the in-

breaths and out-breaths in my mouth, nose and ears, there was a violent burning in my body.

'But although tireless energy was aroused in me . . . painful feeling . . . did not invade my mind and remain.

26. 'Now when gods saw me, they said: "The monk Gotama is dead." Other gods said: "The monk Gotama is not dead, he is dying." Other gods said: "The monk Gotama is neither dead nor dying; he is an Arahant, for such is the way of Arahants."

27. 'I thought: "Suppose I entirely cut off food?" Then gods came to me and said: "Good sir, do not entirely cut off food. If you do so, we shall inject heavenly food into your pores and you will live on that." I thought: "If I claim to be completely fasting and these gods inject heavenly food into my pores and I live on that, then I shall be lying." I dismissed those gods, saying: "There is no need."

28. 'I thought: "Suppose I take very little food, say, a handful each time, whether it is bean soup or lentil soup or vetch soup or pea soup?" While I did so, my body reached a state of extreme emaciation. Because of eating so little my limbs became like the jointed segments of vine stems or bamboo stems. Because of eating so little my backside became like a camel's hoof. Because of eating so little the projections on my spine stood forth like corded beads. Because of eating so little my ribs jutted out as gaunt as the crazy rafters of an old roofless barn. Because of eating so little the gleam of my eyes sunk far down in their sockets looked like the gleam of water sunk far down in a deep well. Because of eating so little my scalp shrivelled and withered as a green gourd shrivels and withers in the wind and sun. Because of eating so little, if I touched my belly skin, I encountered my backbone too; if I touched my backbone I encountered my belly skin too. Because of eating so little, if I made water or evacuated my bowels, I fell over on my face there. Because of eating so little, if I tried to ease my body by rubbing my limbs with my hands, the hair, rotted at its roots, fell away from my body as I rubbed.

29. 'Now when human beings saw me, they said: "The monk Gotama is a black man." Other human beings said: "The monk Gotama is not

a black man, he is a brown man." Other human beings said: "The monk Gotama is neither a black nor a brown man, he is a fair-skinned man." So much had the clear, bright colour of my skin deteriorated through eating so little.

30. 'I thought: "Whenever a monk or divine in the past has felt painful, racking, piercing feeling due to striving, it can equal this but not exceed it. And whenever a monk or divine in the future will feel painful, racking, piercing feeling due to striving, it can equal this but not exceed it. And whenever a monk or divine at present feels painful, racking, piercing feeling due to striving, it can equal this but not exceed it. But by this gruelling penance I have attained no distinction higher than the human state (dhamma) worthy of a Noble One's knowledge and vision. Might there be another way to enlightenment?"

31. 'I thought: "While my Sakyan father was busy, while I was sitting in the cool shade of a rose-apple tree quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, I had direct knowledge of entering upon and abiding in the first jhāna which is accompanied by initial and sustained application with happiness and (bodily) pleasure born of seclusion. Might that be the way to Enlightenment?" Then, following on that memory, came the recognition: "This is the way to enlightenment."

32. 'I thought: "Why am I afraid of that pleasure? It is pleasure that has nothing to do with sensual desires and unprofitable dhammas."

'I thought: "I am not afraid of that pleasure, since it has nothing to do with sensual desires and unprofitable dhammas."

33. 'I thought: "It is not possible to attain that pleasure with a body so excessively emaciated. Suppose I ate some solid food—some boiled rice and bread?" And I ate some solid food—some boiled rice and bread. But at that time five bhikkhus were waiting upon me, thinking: "If the monk Gotama achieves something he will tell us." As soon as I ate the boiled rice and bread the five bhikkhus were disgusted and left me (thinking): "The monk Gotama has turned self-indulgent, he has given up the endeavour and reverted to luxury."

34. 'Now when I had eaten solid food and regained strength, then quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, I entered upon and abode in the first jhāna, which is accompanied by initial and sustained application, with happiness and (bodily) pleasure born of seclusion.

'But such pleasant feeling as arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

35. 'With the stilling of initial application and sustained application . . . second jhāna . . .

'But such pleasant feeling as arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

36. 'With the fading as well of happiness . . . third jhāna . . .

'But such pleasant feeling as arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

37. 'With the abandoning of (bodily) pleasure and pain . . . fourth jhāna.

'But such pleasant feeling as arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

38. 'When my concentrated mind was thus purified, clear, unblemished, rid of imperfection, and had become malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, I directed my mind to the knowledge of recollection of past life . . . (as in M. 4, para. 27) . . . thus with details and particulars I recollected my manifold past life.

39. 'This was the first true knowledge attained by me in the first watch of the night. Ignorance was banished and true knowledge arose; darkness was banished and light arose; as (happens) in one who abides diligent, ardent and self-controlled.

'But such pleasant feeling as arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

40. 'When my concentrated mind was thus purified . . . I directed my mind to the passing-away and reappearance of beings . . . (as in M. 4, para. 29) . . . thus with heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, I saw . . . how beings pass on according to their kammās.

41. 'This was the second true knowledge attained by me in the second watch of the night. Ignorance was banished and true knowledge arose; darkness was banished and light arose; as (happens) in one who dwells diligent, ardent and self-controlled.

'But such pleasant feeling as arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

42-43. 'When my concentrated mind was thus purified . . . I directed my mind to the knowledge of exhaustion of taints. I had direct knowledge as it actually was: "This is suffering" . . . (as in M. 4, para. 31-2) . . . "There is no more of this to come."

44. 'This was the third true knowledge attained by me in the third watch of the night. Ignorance was banished and true knowledge arose; darkness was banished and light arose; as (happens) in one who dwells diligent, ardent and self-controlled.

'But such pleasant feeling as arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

45. 'I have had direct knowledge of preaching the Dhamma to an assembly of many hundreds. Perhaps someone or other has imagined: "The monk Gotama is preaching the Dhamma at me." But it should not be regarded so: a Tathāgata preaches the Dhamma to others only to give them knowledge. When the talk is finished, Aggivessana, then I settle my mind in myself, quiet it, bring it to singleness and concentrate it on that same sign for concentration as before, in which I constantly abide.'

'That is believable (as a statement) of Master Gotama's since he is Arahant and Fully Enlightened. But perhaps Master Gotama has also had direct knowledge of sleeping by day?'

46. 'In the last month of the hot season, Aggivessana, on return from the alms-round after the meal, I have had direct knowledge of laying out my cloak of patches folded in four, and lying down on the right side and falling asleep, mindful and fully aware.'

'Some monks and divines call that a deluded man's abiding, Master Gotama.'

47. 'That is not how a man is deluded or not deluded, Aggivessana.'

Listen rather how a man is deluded or not deluded, and heed well what I shall I say.'

'Even so, sir,' Saccaka the Nigantha's son replied. The Blessed One said this:

48. 'Him I call deluded, Aggivessana in whom taints that defile, produce renewal of being, give trouble, ripen in suffering, and lead to future birth, ageing and death are unabandoned; for it is with the non-abandoning of taints that a man is deluded. Him I call undeluded in whom such taints as defile, as produce renewal of being, as give trouble, as ripen in suffering, and lead to future birth, ageing and death, are abandoned; for it is with the abandoning of taints that a man is undeluded. In a Tathāgata, such taints as produce renewal of being, as give trouble, as ripen in suffering, and lead to future birth, ageing and death, are abandoned, cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, done away with so that their nature to arise in the future is no more. Just as a palm tree with its top cut off is incapable of growing, so too, in a Tathāgata the taints that defile, produce renewal of being, give trouble, ripen in suffering, and lead to future birth, ageing and death, are abandoned, cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, done away with so that their nature to arise in future is no more.'

49. When this was said, Saccaka the Nigantha's son said: 'It is wonderful, Master Gotama, it is marvellous, how, when Master Gotama has personal remarks directed at him again and again thus, the colour of his skin brightens and the colour of his face clears, as (is to be expected) in one who is Arahant and Fully Enlightened! I have had direct knowledge of engaging Purāṇa Kassapa in argument, and then he prevaricated, led the talk aside, and showed anger, hate and surliness. But when Master Gotama has personal remarks directed at him again and again thus, the colour of his skin brightens and the colour of his face clears, as (is to be expected) in one who is Arahant and Fully Enlightened. I have had direct knowledge of engaging Makkhali Gosāla... Ajita Kesakambalin... Pakudha Kaccāyan... Sañjaya Belatthiputta... the Nigantha Nātaputta in argument, and then he prevaricated, led the talk aside, and showed anger, hate and surliness. But when Master Gotama has personal remarks directed at him again and again thus, the

colour of his skin brightens and the colour of his face clears, as (is to be expected) in one who is Arahant and Fully Enlightened. And now, Master Gotama, we depart; we are busy and have much to do.'

'It is time now to do as you think fit, Aggivessana.'

Then Saccaka the Nigantha's son was satisfied, and delighting in the Blessed One's words, he got up from his seat and departed.

Notes

para. 8. *Body* is developed by refraining from the happiness to be derived from sensual pleasures (Kāma-sukha); *mind* is developed by detachment from bodily pain.

para. 17. *uttarāraṇi*—upper fire-stick: (not in P.T.S. Dict.)=*uttara* + *araṇi*: *araṇi* is given in P.T.S. Dict. but not quite in this sense. See M. 93, para. 13.

para. 17-19: I have taken the readings in the three similes as '*kāyena c'eva cittena ca kāmehi avūpakaṭṭhā*' (p. 241. 1. 3 text); *kāyane ni kho (kāyen'eva kho?) kāmehi vūpakaṭṭhā* (p. 241, 1. 26); and '*kāyene'eva cittena ca kāmehi vūpakaṭṭhā*' (p. 242. 1. 11) which the sense demands; see variant readings.

para. 17. The expression '*dukkha tiṭṭhā katukā vedanā* (painful, racking, piercing feelings)' occurs in many places (e.g. M. i, 74). Here, however, it is preceded by the word '*opakkamikā* (due to striving)' which refers particularly to self-mortification.

para. 29. It is clear from M. 79 (ii, 33) where the three words *kāla*, *sāma* and *manguracchavi* ('black', 'brown' and 'fair-skinned') are applied to a 'country beauty (*janapada-kalyāṇī*)' that they must refer to three accepted types of complexion. It is not clear on what authority P.T.S. Dict. says 'gold-coloured.'

para. 30. *etāva-paraṃ* lit. 'this much at most'. (Cf. *eta-paraṃ* at M. i, 339). *Etāvā*, not in P.T.S. Dict.

para. 33. *odāna-kummāsa*—rice and bread: (see M. 23). According to

P.T.S. Dict. *kummāsa*='curds', but according to the Vinaya and Comy. it is made of grain (yava), which suggests something made of dough (bread, say, or chapattis). Cf. Sutta 12, para. 33.

para. 45. For 'sign of concentration' (*samadhi-nimittā*) see M. 122, (not in this selection). It is defined in M. Sutta 44, para. 12 as the four Foundations of Mindfulness.

Ariyapariyesana Sutta¹

The Noble Search

Introduction

One of the great biographical Suttas, this discourse naturally falls into five parts. After the introductory setting, the Buddha talks of the two kinds of search, the one that most people engage in being called ignoble, and the way that the Bodhisatta took, the noble search. Someone might object: 'Why should he praise his own way while condemning the way taken by almost everyone else in the world? Can so many be mistaken?' Unfortunately, the criterion of what is noble and what is ignoble depends not upon majorities but upon paññā (wisdom, or as the translator renders, 'understanding'). And there is no doubt that a search for what is 'subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement' (=everything, living and nonliving) is a good deal less noble than the search for 'the unborn, unageing, unailing, deathless, sorrowless, undefiled, supreme surcease of bondage, which is Nibbāna'. The search for enlightenment follows with the Bodhisatta's meditative experience with two of the foremost Teachers of those days. Immediately after para. 17 there should follow the accounts of the Bodhisatta's severe austerities (which are contained in Suttas 12 and 36, see also 4). Enlightenment, rather briefly described here is next, with Great Brahmā's plea to the Buddha to teach Dhamma and his consideration of who he should teach. Then comes teaching the Dhamma with the incident of Upaka and their exchange of verses leading up to finding the five ascetics again and teaching them. The substance of this teaching, as contained in the first and second discourses, is omitted here. When the Buddha had inspired the listening bhikkhus with this account of his striving, enlightenment and the beginning of the Sangha, he brought them back to their own unenlightened state with the section beginning

1. Also called Pāsārāsi Sutta, "The Mass of Snares" see para. 32, 33.

with sensual desires and progressing step by step to the exhaustion of taints or Arahantship. Such a person 'walks without fear, stands without fear, sits without fear, lies down without fear. Why is that? He is out of the Evil One's sight'. All those desires, all those pleasures, all those possessions to which one is attached, which are all 'subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement'—these are in the Evil One's sight. What one should search for is clear enough . . .

The Sutta (39)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park.

2. Then when it was morning, the Blessed One dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Sāvatti for alms.

Then many bhikkhus went to the venerable Ānanda and said to him: 'Friend Ānanda, it is long since we heard a talk on the Dhamma from the Blessed One's own lips. It would be good if we could do so, friend Ānanda.'

'Then let the venerable ones go to Rammaka the divine's retreat; perhaps you will hear a talk on the Dhamma from the Blessed One's own lips.'

'Even so, friend,' they replied.

3. Now when the Blessed One had wandered for alms in Sāvatti and had returned from his alms-round after his meal, he addressed the venerable Ānanda: 'Ānanda let us go to the Eastern Park, to the Palace of Migāra's mother, for the day's abiding.'

'Even so, venerable sir,' the venerable Ānanda replied. Then the Blessed One went with the venerable Ānanda to the Eastern Park, the Palace of Migāra's mother, for the day's abiding.

Now when it was evening, the Blessed One rose from meditation, and he addressed the venerable Ānanda: 'Ānanda, let us go to the Eastern bathing place and bathe our limbs.'

‘Even so, venerable sir,’ the venerable Ānanda replied.

Then the Blessed One went with the venerable Ānanda to the Eastern bathing place to bathe his limbs. When he had done so, he came up out of the water and stood in one robe drying his limbs. Then venerable Ānanda said: ‘Venerable sir, Rammaka the divine’s retreat is nearby. That retreat is agreeable and delightful. Venerable sir, it would be good if the Blessed One went there out of pity.’

The Blessed one consented in silence.

4. Then the Blessed One went to Rammaka the divine’s retreat. Now on that occasion many bhikkhus had gathered together there to discuss the Dhamma. The Blessed One stood outside the door waiting for the end of their discussion. When he knew that it was finished, he coughed and knocked. The bhikkhus opened the door for him. Then he went inside and sat down on a seat made ready. When he had done so he addressed the bhikkhus thus: ‘Bhikkhus, for what discussion are you gathered here now? And what was your discussion meanwhile, which was left unfinished?’

‘Venerable sir, our discussion which was left unfinished was about the Dhamma and it was about the Blessed One himself. Then the Blessed One arrived.’

‘Good, bhikkhus. It becomes you that as clansmen who have gone forth from the home life into homelessness out of faith, you gather for discussion of the Dhamma. When you are gathered together there are two alternatives: discussion of the Dhamma or the Noble Ones’ silence.

(Kinds of Search)

5. ‘Bhikkhus, there are these two kinds of search: the noble search and the ignoble search.

‘And what is the ignoble search?’

‘Here someone, himself subject to the birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement, seeks what is also subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement.

6. ‘And what may be said to be subject to birth? Wife and children

are subject to birth, and so are bondswomen and bondsmen, goats and sheep, fowls and pigs, elephants, cattle, horses and mares, gold and silver. These essentials of existence are subject to birth; and one who is entangled with these and unwarily committed to them is one who, being himself subject to birth, seeks what is also subject to birth.

7. 'And what may be said to be subject to ageing? Wife and children are subject to ageing and so are... gold and silver. These essentials of existence are subject to ageing; and one who is entangled with these and unwarily committed to them is one who, being himself subject to ageing, seeks what is also subject to ageing.

8. 'And what be may be said to be subject to ailment? Wife and children are subject to ailment and so are... gold and silver. These essentials of existence are subject to ailment... seeks what is also subject to ailment.

9. 'And what may be said to be subject to death? Wife and children are subject to death and so are... gold and silver. These essentials of existence are subject to death... seeks what is also subject to death.

10. 'And what may be said to be subject to sorrow? Wife and children are subject to sorrow and so are... gold and silver. These essentials of existence are subject to sorrow... seeks what is also subject to sorrow.

11. 'And what may be said to be subject to defilement? Wife and children are subject to defilement and so are bondswomen and bondsmen, goats and sheep, fowls and pigs, elephants, cattle, horses and mares, gold and silver. These essentials of existence are subject to defilement, and one who is entangled with these and unwarily committed to them is one who being himself subject to defilement, seeks what is also subject to defilement.

'This is the ignoble search.

12. 'And what is the noble search?

'Here someone, himself subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement, and knowing the danger in these dhammas, seeks the unborn, unageing, unailing, deathless, sorrowless, undefiled, supreme surcease of bondage, which is Nibbāna.

'This is the noble search.

(The Search For Enlightenment)

13. 'Bhikkhus, before my enlightenment, while I was still only an un-enlightened Bodhisatta, I too, being myself subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement, sought what was also subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement.

'I (considered) thus: "Why, being myself subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement, do I seek what is also subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement? Suppose that, myself being subject to these dammas, knowing the danger in these dhammas, I seek the unborn, unageing, unailing, deathless, sorrowless, undefiled, supreme surcease of bondage, which is Nibbāna?"

14. 'Later, while still a boy, a black-haired youth endowed with the blessing of youth, in the first phase of life, I shaved off my hair and beard—though my mother and father wished otherwise and grieved with tearful faces—I put on the yellow cloth and went forth from the house life into homelessness.

15. 'Having gone forth in search of what is profitable, seeking the supreme state of sublime peace, I went to Ālāra Kālāma and I said to him: "Friend Kālāma, I want to lead the life divine in this Dhamma and Discipline."

'When this was said, Ālāra Kālāma replied: "The venerable one may stay here. This Dhamma is such that in no long time a wise man can enter upon and abide in it, himself realizing through direct knowledge his own teacher's doctrine."

'I soon learnt the Dhamma. I claimed that as far as mere lip-reciting and rehearsal of his teachings went I could speak with knowledge and assurance, and that I knew and saw—and there were others that did likewise.

'I (considered): "It is not through mere faith alone the Ālāra Kālāma declares his Dhamma; (he does so) because he enters upon and abides in it, himself realizing it through direct knowledge. Certainly Ālāra Kālāma abides in this Dhamma knowing and seeing."

"Then I went to Ālāra Kālāma, and I said I said to him. "Friend Kālāma, in what way do you declare to have entered upon this Dhamma, yourself realizing it through direct knowledge?"

"When this was said, he declared the base consisting of nothingness.

"I (considered): "Not only Ālāra Kālāma has faith; I too have faith. Not only Ālāra Kālāma has energy; I too have energy. Not only Ālāra Kālāma has mindfulness; I too have mindfulness. Not only Ālāra Kālāma has concentration; I too have concentration. Not only Ālāra Kālāma has understanding; I too have understanding. Suppose I exercise control in order to realize the Dhamma that he declares to have entered upon, himself realizing it through direct knowledge?"

"I soon entered upon and abode in that Dhamma, myself realizing it through direct knowledge. Then I went to Ālāra Kālāma, and I said to him: "Friend Kālāma, is it in this way that you declare to have entered upon this Dhamma, yourself realizing it through direct knowledge?"

"It is in this way, friend, that I declare to have entered upon this Dhamma, myself realizing it through direct knowledge."

"Friend, I too in this way enter upon and abide in this Dhamma, myself realizing it through direct knowledge."

"It is gain for us, friend, it is great gain for us that we have such a venerable one as our companion in the life divine. So the Dhamma that I declare to have entered upon, myself realizing it through direct knowledge, that Dhamma you enter upon and abide in, yourself realizing it through direct knowledge. And the Dhamma that you enter upon and abide in, yourself realizing it through direct knowledge, that Dhamma I declare to have entered upon, myself realizing it through direct knowledge. So you know the Dhamma that I know; I know the Dhamma that you know. As I am, so you are; as you are, so am I. Come, friend, let us now lead this community together."

"Thus Ālāra Kālāma, my Teacher, placed me, his pupil, on an equal footing with himself, and awarded me the highest honour.

"I (considered): "This Dhamma does not lead to dispassion, to fading of lust, to cessation, to peace, to direct knowledge, to full enlightenment, to Nibbāna, but only to the base consisting of nothingness."

"I was not satisfied with that Dhamma. I left it and went away.

16. 'Still in search of what is profitable, seeking the supreme state of

sublime peace, I went to Uddaka Rāmaputta, and I said to him: "Friend, I went to lead the life divine in this Dhamma and Discipline."

'When this was said, Uddaka Rāmaputta replied: "The venerable one may stay here. This Dhamma is such that in no long time a wise man can enter upon and abide in it, himself realizing through direct knowledge his own teacher's doctrine."

'I soon learned the Dhamma. I claimed that as far as mere lip-reciting and rehearsal of his teaching went I could speak with knowledge and assurance, and that I knew and saw—and there were others who did likewise.

'I (considered): "It is not through mere faith alone that Rāma declares his Dhamma, but (he does so) because he enters upon and abides in it, himself realizing it through direct knowledge. Certainly Rāma abides in this Dhamma knowing and seeing."

'Then I went to Uddaka Rāmaputta, and I said to him: "Friend Rāma, in what way do you declare to have entered upon this Dhamma, yourself realizing it through direct knowledge?"

'When this was said, he declared the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception.

'I (considered): "Not only Rāma has faith; I too have faith. Not only Rāma has energy; I too have energy. Not only Rāma has mindfulness; I too have mindfulness. Not only Rāma has concentration; I too have concentration. Not only Rāma has understanding; I too have understanding. Suppose I exercise control in order to realize the Dhamma that he declares to have entered upon, himself realizing it through direct knowledge?"

'I soon entered upon and abode in that Dhamma, myself realizing it through direct knowledge. Then I went to Uddaka Rāmaputta and I said to him: "Friend Rāma, is it in this way that you declare to have entered upon the Dhamma, yourself realizing it through direct knowledge?"

"It is in this way, friend, that Rāma declares to have entered upon the Dhamma, himself realizing it through direct knowledge."

"Friend, I too in this way enter upon and abide in this Dhamma, myself realizing it through direct knowledge."

"It is gain for us, friend, it is great gain for us, that we have such a venerable one for our companion in the life divine. So the Dhamma

that Rāma declares to have entered upon, himself realizing it through direct knowledge, that Dhamma you enter upon and abide in, yourself realizing it through direct knowledge. And the Dhamma that you enter upon and abide in, yourself realizing it through direct knowledge, that Dhamma Rāma declares to have entered upon, himself realizing it through direct knowledge. So you know that Dhamma that Rāma knows; Rāma knows the Dhamma that you know. As Rāma is, so you are; as you are, so Rāma is. Come, friend, do you now lead this community."

"Thus Uddaka Rāmaputta, my companion in the life divine, placed me in the Teacher's place and accorded me the highest honour.

"I (considered): "This Dhamma does not lead to dispassion, to fading of lust, to cessation, to peace, to direct knowledge, to full enlightenment, to Nibbāna; but only to the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception."

"I was not satisfied with that Dhamma. I left it and went away.

17. 'Still in search of what is profitable, seeking the supreme state of sublime peace, I wandered by stages through the Magadhan country, till at length I arrived at Senānigama near Uruvelā. There I saw an agreeable piece of ground, a delightful grove, a clear-flowing river with pleasant smooth banks, and nearby a village as alms resort. I (considered): "There is this agreeable piece of ground, this delightful grove, this clear-flowing river with pleasant smooth banks, and nearby a village for alms resort. This will serve for the endeavour of a clansman who seeks endeavour." And I sat down there (thinking): "This will serve for endeavour."

(Enlightenment)

18. 'Being myself subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement, knowing the danger in these dhammas, seeking the unborn, unageing, deathless, sorrowless, undefiled supreme surcease of bondage, which is Nibbāna, I attained the unborn, unageing, unailing, deathless, sorrowless, undefiled supreme surcease of bondage, which is Nibbāna.

"The knowledge and vision arose in me: "My deliverance is unassailable. This my last birth. There is now no renewal of being."

19. 'I (considered). "This Dhamma that I have attained is profound, hard to see and hard to discover. It is (the most) peaceful and superior (goal of all), unattainable by (mere) ratiocination, subtle, and for the wise to experience. But this generation loves something to rely on, delights in something to rely on, is glad of something to rely on.¹ It is hard for such a generation to see this truth, namely, specific conditionality, dependent origination. And it is hard to see this truth, namely, the stilling of all formations, relinquishing of all essentials of existence, exhaustion of craving, fading of lust, cessation, Nibbāna. And if I taught the Dhamma, others would not understand me, and that would be weariness and a bother for me."

'In fact, there came to me spontaneously these stanzas never heard before:

Enough, nor teach the Dhamma
That even I found hard to reach;
For it will never be perceived
By those who live in lust and hate.
Men dyed in lust, and whom a cloud
Of darkness laps, will never see
What goes against the stream, is subtle,
Deep, and hard to see, abstruse.

'Considering thus, my mind favoured inaction instead of teaching the Dhamma.

20. "Then the (Brahmā) Divinity Sahampati knew in mind the thought in my mind, and he (considered): "The world will be lost, the world will be utterly lost, since the mind of the Tathāgata, Arahant and Fully Enlightened One, favours inaction instead of teaching the Dhamma."

'Then just as soon as a strong man might extend his flexed arm or flex his extended arm, the Divinity Sahampati vanished in the world of the Divinity and appeared before me. Then he arranged his upper robe on one shoulder and raising his hands palms together towards me, he said: "Venerable sir, let the Blessed One teach the Dhamma. There are beings with little dust in their eyes who are wasting through not hear-

1. Such as sense-desires and pleasures, attachment to the concepts 'I' and 'mine', religious rites and dogmas.

ing the Dhamma. Some of them will gain final knowledge of the Dhamma."

"The Divinity Sahampati spoke thus, and having done so, he said further:

"In Magadha till now have Dhammas been
Unpurified, thought out by those still stained.
Open the Deathless gateway, let them hear
The Dhamma the Immaculate has found;
And, just as one sees all the folk around.
Who stands upon a solid pile of rock,
Survey, O sorrowless, all-seeing sage,
This human breed engulfed in sorrowing
That Birth has at its mercy, and Old Age.
Arise victorious Hero, Knowledge-bringer
Free from all debt, and wander in the world.
Proclaim the Dhamma; there are some,
O Blessed One, will understand."

21. 'Then I listened to the Divinity's pleading. Out of compassion for beings I surveyed the world with the eye of a Buddha. Surveying the world with the eye of a Buddha, I saw beings with little dust in their eyes and with much dust in their eyes, with keen faculties and with dull faculties, with good qualities and with bad qualities, easy to teach and hard to teach, and some that dwelt seeing fear in blame and in the other world.

'Just as in a pond of blue or red or white lotuses, some lotuses that are born and grow in the water thrive immersed in the water without rising out of it, and some other lotuses that are born and grow in water rest on the water's surface, and some other lotuses that are born and grow in the water rise out of the water and stand clear, unwetted by it, so too, surveying the world . . . and some that dwelt seeing fear in blame and in the other world.

"Then I replied to the Divinity Sahampati in stanzas:

Open for them are the Deathless' doors,
Let those that hear now show their faith,

Seeing the bother I spoke not for men
Dhamma subtle and sublime, Divinity.

'Then the Divinity Sahampati (thought): "I have made it possible for the Dhamma to be taught by the Blessed One." And after paying homage to me, keeping me on the right, the Divinity departed.

22. 'I (considered) thus: "To whom should I first teach the Dhamma? Who will soon understand this Dhamma?"

'I (considered) thus: "Ālāra Kālāma is wise, learned and discerning. He has long had little dust in his eyes. Suppose I taught the Dhamma first to Ālāra Kālāma? He will soon understand it."

'Then gods approached me and said: "Venerable sir, Ālāra Kālāma died seven days ago." And the knowledge and vision arose in me: "Ālāra Kālāma died seven days ago." I (considered) thus: "Ālāra Kālāma's loss is a great one. If he had heard this Dhamma, he would soon have understood it."

23. 'I (considered) thus: "To whom should I first teach the Dhamma? Who will understand this Dhamma?"

'I (considered) thus: "Uddaka Rāmaputta is wise, learned and discerning. He has long had little dust in his eyes. Suppose I taught the Dhamma first to Uddaka Rāmaputta? He will soon understand it."

'Then gods approached me and said: "Venerable sir, Uddaka Rāmaputta died last night." And the knowledge and vision in me: "Uddaka Rāmaputta died last night." I (considered) thus: "Uddaka Rāmaputta's loss is a great one. If he had heard this Dhamma, he would soon have understood it."

24. 'I (considered) thus: "To whom should I first teach the Dhamma? Who will understand this Dhamma?"

'I (considered) thus: "The bhikkhus of the group of five, who attended me while I was engaged in the struggle for control were very helpful. Suppose I taught the Dhamma first to them?"

'I (considered) thus: "Where are the bhikkhus of the group of five living now?" And with the heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, I saw that they were living at Benares in the Deer Park at Isipatana.

(The Teaching of the Dhamma)

25. "Then when I had stayed at Uruvela as long as I chose, I set out to go by stages to Benares. Between Gayā and the Place of Enlightenment the monk Upaka saw me on the road. Seeing me, he said: "Friend, the colour of your skin is pure and bright. Under whom have you gone forth, friend? Or who is your Teacher? Or whose Dhamma do you confess?"

'When this was said, I replied to the monk Upaka in stanzas:

Transcender of all being, All-knower am I,
 Unsullied in all dhammas, renouncing them all
 By craving's ceasing freed. And this do I owe
 To my own wit, to whom should I concede it?
 I have no Teacher, and my like
 Exists nowhere in all the world
 With all its gods, because I have
 No person for my counterpart.
 I am the Teacher in the world
 Without a peer, an Arahant too
 And I alone am Full enlightened
 Quenched, whose fires are quite extinct.
 I go to Kāsi's city now
 To set in motion the Dhamma's Wheel:
 In a world that's blind-become
 I go to beat the Deathless Drum.

"By your claims, friend, you ought to be a Victor Universal."

"The Victors like me, Upaka,
 Are these won to exhaustion of taints.
 I vanquished all evil dhammas:
 For that I am a Victor.

'When this was said, the monk Upaka said: "May it be so, friend." Shaking his head, he took a by-path and departed.

26. 'Then wandering by stages, I came at length to Benares, to the Deer Park at Isipatana, where the bhikkhus of the group of five were.

"They saw me coming at a distance, and they agreed among themselves thus: "Friends, here comes the monk Gotama who turned self-indulgent, shirked control and reverted to luxury. We ought not to pay homage to him or rise up for him or receive his bowl and robe. But a seat can be prepared for him. If he likes, he will sit down."

"However, as soon as I approached, they found themselves unable to keep their pact. One came to meet me and took my bowl and (outer) robe; another prepared a seat; and another got water ready for my feet; and they addressed me by name as "friend".

27. "When this was said, I told them: "Bhikkhus, do not address a Tathāgata by name as 'friend'. A Tathāgata is an Arahant and Fully Enlightened. Listen, bhikkhus, the Deathless has been attained. I shall instruct you; I shall teach you the Dhamma. By practising as you are instructed, you will, by realization yourselves here and now through direct knowledge enter upon and abide in that supreme goal of the life divine on account of which clansmen rightly go forth from the home life into homelessness."

"When this was said, the bhikkhus of the group of five answered me thus: "Friend Gotama, with the behaviour the way, and the difficult feats, which you practised you achieved no distinction worthy of a Noble One's knowledge and vision higher than the human state (dhamma). Since you have now turned self-indulgent, shirked control and reverted to luxury, how will you have achieved any such distinction?"

"When this was said, I told them: "A Tathāgata is not one who has turned self-indulgent, nor has he shirked control and reverted to luxury. A Tathāgata is an Arahant and Fully Enlightened. Listen, bhikkhus, the Deathless has been attained... from the home life into homelessness."

"A second time the bhikkhus of the group of five said to me: "Friend Gotama... how will you have achieved any such distinction?"

"A second time I told them: "A Tathāgata is not one who has turned self-indulgent... from the home life into homelessness."

"A third time the bhikkhus of the group of five said to me: "Friend Gotama... how will you have achieved any such distinction?"

28. "When this was said I asked them: "Bhikkhus, have you ever known me

to speak like this before?"

"No, venerable sir."

"Bhikkhus, a Tathāgata is an Arahant and Fully Enlightened. Listen, bhikkhus, the Deathless has been attained. I shall instruct you; I shall teach you the Dhamma. By practising as you are instructed, you will, by realization yourselves here and now through direct knowledge enter upon and abide in that supreme goal of the life divine on account of which clansmen rightly go forth from the home life into homelessness."

29. 'I was able to convince the bhikkhus of the group of five. Sometimes I instructed two bhikkhus while three went for alms; and we six lived upon what the three brought back from their alms-round. Sometimes I instructed three bhikkhus while two went for alms: and we six lived upon what the two brought back from their alms-round.

30. 'Then the bhikkhus of the group of five, thus taught and instructed by me, being themselves subject to birth, ageing, ailment, death, sorrow and defilement, knowing the danger in these dhammas, seeking the unborn, unageing, unailing, deathless, sorrowless, undefiled supreme surcease of bondage which is Nibbāna, attained to the unborn, unageing, unailing, deathless, sorrowless, undefiled supreme surcease of bondage which is Nibbāna.

'The knowledge and vision arose in them: "My deliverance is unassailable. This is my last birth. There is now no renewal of being."

(Sensual Desires)

31. 'Bhikkhus, there are these five cords of sensual desire. What are the five? Forms cognizable by the eye that are wished-for, desired, agreeable and likeable, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust. Sounds cognizable by the ear . . . Odours cognizable by the nose . . . Flavours cognizable by the tongue . . . Tangibles cognizable by the body . . . provocative of lust. These are the five cords of sensual desire.

32. 'When any monks and divines are entangled with and unwarily committed to these five cords of sensual desire and cultivate them with no vision of the danger in them and no understanding of the escape

from them, it may be understood of them thus: "They are bound for disaster, bound for ruin, to be done with as he likes by the Evil One."

'Suppose a forest deer were tied to, and lay down on, a mass of snares, it might be understood of him thus: "He is bound for disaster, bound for ruin, to be done with as he likes by the hunter", so too when any monks and divines . . . " . . . to be done with as he likes by the Evil One."

33. 'When any monks and divines are not entangled with nor unwarily committed to these five cords of sensual desire and do not cultivate them, having vision of the danger in them and understanding the escape from them, it may be understood of them thus: "They are not bound for disaster, not bound for ruin, not to be done with as he likes by the Evil One."

'Suppose a forest deer were not tied to but lay down on a mass of snares, it might be understood of him thus. "He is not bound for disaster, not bound for ruin, not to be done with as he likes by the hunter", so too when any monks and divines . . . " . . . not to be done with as he likes by the Evil One."

34. 'Suppose a forest deer is wandering in the forest wilds, he walks without fear, stands without fear, sits without fear, lies down without fear. Why is that? Because he is out of the hunter's sight—so too, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the first jhāna which is accompanied by initial and sustained application, with happiness and bliss born of seclusion. And this bhikkhu is said to have blindfolded Māra, to have become invisible to the Evil One by depriving Māra's eye of its opportunity.

35. 'Again, with the stilling of initial and sustained application . . . second jhāna . . . born of concentration. And this bhikkhu is said to have blindfolded Māra, to have become invisible to the Evil One by depriving Māra's eye of its opportunity.

36. 'Again, with the fading as well of happiness . . . third jhāna . . . "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful." And this bhikkhu is said to have blindfolded Māra . . . depriving Māra's eye of its opportunity.

37. 'Again, with the abandoning of (bodily) pleasure and pain . . . fourth jhāna . . . and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity. And this bhikkhu is said to have blindfolded Māra . . . depriving Māra's eye of its opportunity.

38. 'Again, with the complete surmounting of perceptions of form, with the disappearance of the perceptions of resistance, with not giving attention to perceptions of difference, (aware that) "space is infinite", a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the base consisting of the infinity of space. And this bhikkhu is said to have blindfolded Māra . . . depriving Māra's eye of its opportunity.

39. 'Again, by completely surmounting the base consisting of the infinity of space, (aware that) "consciousness is infinite", a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the base consisting of the infinity of consciousness. And this bhikkhu is said to have blindfolded Māra . . . depriving Māra's eye of its opportunity.

40. 'Again, by completely surmounting the base consisting of the infinity of consciousness, (aware that) "there is nothing", a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the base consisting of nothingness. And this bhikkhu is said to have blindfolded Māra . . . depriving Māra's eye of its opportunity.

41. 'Again, by completely surmounting the base consisting of nothingness a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception. And this bhikkhu is said to have blindfolded Māra . . . depriving Māra's eye of its opportunity.

42. 'Again, by completely surmounting the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the cessation of perception and feeling. And his taints are exhausted by his seeing with understanding. And this bhikkhu is said to have blindfolded Māra, to have become invisible to the Evil One by depriving Māra's eye of its opportunity, and to have crossed beyond attachment to the world.

'He walks without fear, stands without fear, sits without fear, lies down without fear. Why is that? He is out of the Evil One's sight.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 15. For other references to Ālara Kālāma, see D. 16.

para. 16. For other references to Uddaka Rāmaputta, see S. iv, 83

para. 19. *Ālaya*—reliance: see Sutta 35, para. 5.

para. 21. 'ye sotavanto pamuñcantu saddham—let those who hear show faith': a controverted passage. But the usually accepted 'let them renounce their faith' comes from misinterpreting the word *vissajjentu* (here = 'put forth', not 'renounce') in the Comy and ignoring the end of the Comy paragraph '*saddhā—bhājanam upanetu*' ('let him bring forth the faith-vessel'). Again, the idiom 'saddham pamuñcati' occurs at Sn. 1146 where it cannot be rendered 'to renounce faith', (Fausboll has unfortunately confused '*mutta-saddho*' here with another idiom '*saddhā-vimutti*'= one liberated by faith—see Sutta 70) but only as 'to show faith' or 'to produce faith'.

para. 32. *Adhisayeyya*—lay down: only noun *adhisayana* in P.T.S. Dict. and no Piṭaka reference.

Sangarava Sutta To Sangarava

Introduction

A brahminee faithful to the Triple Gem utters, rather superstitiously "Namo tassa Bhagavato Arahato Samma sambuddhassa!" when she has stumbled, to ward off ill luck it seems. A young brahmin does not like this habit of hers which he thinks disrespectful to the brahmin caste. She warns him not to abuse what he does not know and eventually tells him when the Buddha comes to that place again. The young brahmin goes to see the Buddha and asks him whether having perfected direct-knowledge he claims to teach the principles of the life divine (here meaning 'dispensation' or 'religion'). Again, the Buddha analyzes before he answers. His analysis is interesting as it divides the teachers of those days into three groups (the types are still with us now): 1) those who rely on a religious tradition, in those days an oral one but in our days usually a written one; 2) those who have reasoned out a path and merely have faith in its efficacy; 3) those who have seen for themselves (through meditation) some teaching "not heard before". While the Buddha says he belongs to the third group, it does not mean that all teachers who teach what has so far not been known are Enlightened or Buddhas. It is very easy to see only part of the truth (and then declare it to be the whole) or to misinterpret what one has seen (but to teach that as the true way).

The Buddha then illustrates what he means by "the perfection of direct knowledge . . ." with reference to his own life, for which you must turn to Suttas 26, 36 and 4. Finally the young brahmin who is rather shaken by the Buddha's account, asks about whether the gods (devas) exist. The Buddha replies that they do. Take note, sceptics!

The Sutta (100)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was wandering in the Kosalan country with a large Sangha of bhikkhus.

2. Now on that occasion Dhanañjāni of the divine caste was staying at Caṇḍalakappa. She had complete confidence in the Buddha, the Dhamma and the Sangha.

(It so happened that) she stumbled, and (on recovering her balance) she uttered an exclamation three times: 'Honour to the Blessed One, Arahant an Fully Enlightened! Honour to the Blessed One, Arahant and Fully Enlightened! Honour to the Blessed One, Arahant and Full Enlightened!'

3. On that occasion, however, there was also a student (divine) called Sangāra staying at Caṇḍalakappa. An expert in the Three Vedas, he knew the text and the context of the Histories, the fifth (of the divines' authorities), with their invocations, liturgy and word-analysis, and he was fully versed in Natural Science and that of the Marks of the Great Man. He heard Dhanañjāni of the divine caste utter those words, and he said: 'Dhanañjāni of the divine caste seems disgraced and degraded when she praises that monkish shaveling with divines actually present.'

'But bless you, my dear, you know nothing about that Blessed One's virtue or his understanding. If you did you would never think of despising and abusing him.'

'Then, madam, tell me when the monk Gotama comes to Caṇḍalakappa.'

'So I shall, my dear, bless you,' she replied.

4. Now after wandering by stages in the Kosalan country, the Blessed One at length arrived at Caṇḍalakappa. There he lived in Caṇḍalakappa in the Mango Grove belonging to the Todeyya divines.

5. Dhanañjāni of the divine caste heard about it so she went to the student (divine) Sangāra and told him, adding: 'It is time now, bless you my dear, to do as you think fit.'

'Yes, madam,' he replied. Then he went to the Blessed One and ex-

changed greetings with him, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one said. When he had done so, he said:

6. 'Master Gotama sir, there are some monks and divines who lay claim to (teach) the principles¹ of the life divine after having reached here and now the consummation, the perfection, of direct knowledge. Is Master Gotama one of these?'

7. 'Bhāradvāja, I say that there is diversity among those monks and divines who lay claim to (teach) the principles of the life divine after having reached here and now the consummation, the perfection, of direct knowledge.

'There are some monks and divines who, (being satisfied) with (oral) tradition and having reached here and now the consummation, the perfection, of direct knowledge in (oral) tradition (alone), lay claim to (teach) the principles of the life divine. Such are the divines (who are masters) of the Three Vedas.

'There are some monks and divines who having reached here and now the consummation, the perfection, of direct knowledge by mere faith alone, lay claim to (teach) the principles of the life divine. Such are the Rationalist Sceptics.

'There are some monks and divines who having reached here and now the consummation, the perfection, of direct knowledge through directly-knowing by themselves alone the Dhamma about dhammas not heard before, lay claim to (teach) the principles of the life divine.

'I belong to the last of these, Bhāradvāja. How that is so should be understood in this way.

9. 'Here Bhāradvāja, before my Enlightenment, while I was still only an unenlightened Bodhisatta, I thought: "House life is crowded and dirty. Life gone forth is wide open. It is not possible living in a household, to lead a life divine as utterly perfect and pure as a polished shell. Suppose I shaved off my hair and beard, put on the yellow cloth and went forth from the home life into homelessness?"'

10-13. 'Later, while still young . . . (as in Sutta 26, paras. 14-17) . . . This

1. Ādibrahmacariya, principles, fundamentals, more literally the principia of the holy life.

will serve for endeavour.

14-30. 'Now these three similes occurred . . . (as in Sutta 36, paras. 17-33 . . . reverted to luxury.

31-44. 'Now when I had eaten solid food and had regained strength, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, I entered upon and abode in the first jhāna . . . (as in Sutta 4, paras. 23-33) . . . This was the third True Knowledge . . . in one who abides diligent, ardent and self-controlled.'

42. When this was said, the student (divine) Sangārava said: 'Sir, Master Gotama's endeavour was no ordinary one; Sir, Master Gotama's endeavour was a heroic one, as (happens) in one who is Arahant and Fully Enlightened. But, Master Gotama, are there gods?'

'It is known to me, Bhāradvāja, as reasonable that there are gods.'

'How is this, Master Gotama? When you are asked: "Are there gods?" you say: "It is known to me as reasonable that there are gods!" If that is so, is it not empty and false (what you say)?'

'Bhāradvāja, on being asked: "Are there gods?", whether one says: "There are gods" or whether one says: "It is known to me as reasonable that there are gods" the conclusion can be drawn here without reserve by any wise man that there are gods.'

'Then why did Master Gotama answer me only in the first way?'

'Bhāradvāja, it is widely accepted in the world that there are gods.'

43. When this was said, the student (divine) Sangārava said: 'Magnificent, Master Gotama! . . . as one who has gone to him for refuge for life.'

Notes

para. 42. The whole final passage is corrupt in the Text, the Commentary and the Tikā.

- a) According to the sense of the Comy. (Hew. Ed.) the P.T.S. reading
2. The brahmin's sudden change of subject is striking, as though the long story of the Bodhisatta's striving and attainment of Buddhahood caused him to feel unsure of himself, and so he asked a question concerning his own tradition to gain reassurance.

'*aṭṭhita vata bho Gotamassa padhānaṃ ahoṣi*' is right and stands for *a-ṭṭhita-padhānaṃ vata bho Gotamassa ahoṣi*. *Vata* is then an exclamatory particle. Another reading is *aṭṭhitavataṃ bho Gotamassa padhānaṃ ahoṣi* in which case *aṭṭhitavataṃ* is gen. pl. of *a-ṭṭhitavant* and the rendering would be (literally) "Master Gotama's endeavour was of those who possess what is not common". The Tika says *aṭṭhitāpadhāna vatan'ti* (Sinh. Comy, has *aṭṭhitāpadhānaṃ vata*) *aññattha kismiñci puḅgala aṭṭhitāpadhānavataṃ* (read *aṭṭhitāpadhānaṃ vata?*) *anuññasādhāraṇaṃ bho Gotamassa padhānaṃ ahoṣi*: *Sappurisāpadhānavataṃ* (read *sāppurisāradhānaṃ vata*) *ahoṣi sappurisāpadhānavatādhigatānaṃ* (read *sappurisāpadhānaṃ vat'ādhigatānaṃ?*) *etādisānaṃ arahataṃ acchariyapuggalānaṃ yeva āveṇikāpadhānavataṃ* (read *āveṇikāpadhānaṃ vata?*) *ahoṣi*. The first seems a better reading though grammatically strange.

b) The Tika implies a reading as follows (appearing as alternative in Sinh. Comy): "... *kiṃ nu kho bho Gotama, atthi devatā?*

—*Thānaso me taṃ Bhāradvāja viditaṃ yadidaṃ adhidevā'ti*.

—*Kiṃ nu kho bho Gotama, atthi devā'ti puṭṭho samāno 'Thānaso me taṃ Bhāradvāja viditaṃ yadidaṃ adhidevā'ti vadesi, na me bho Gotama evam sante tucchā musā hoti'ti*

—*'Atthi devā'ti Bhāradvāja puṭṭho samāno 'atthi devā'ti yo vadeyya Thānaso me viditā'ti vadeyya ...'*

For the use of *thānaso* see Tirokudda Sutta verse 12 (Khp. 6) *thānaso upakappati*.

IV

THE BUDDHA

(b) THE TATHAGATA

'Rightly speaking, were it to be said of someone:
"A being not subject to delusion has appeared
in the world for the welfare and happiness of
many, out of pity for the world, for the benefit,
welfare and happiness of gods and men", it is of
me indeed that rightly speaking it should be said.'

(Sutta 12)

Vimamsaka Sutta¹

The Inquirer

Introduction

Religious teachers usually want their disciples to believe in their actions and words, they do not ask them to inquire deeply into the nature of the teacher. In this way they may gain many followers while disguising some of their failings. The Buddha is exceptional in that he encourages people both to inquire into himself and his actions, as well as to adopt an open, non-dogmatic attitude to the Dhamma. He did not want people to *believe* that he was a Sāmmā-sambuddha (One perfectly enlightened by himself), he wanted them to investigate whether in his own case they could see or hear anything about him which indicated in him defiled states of mind, or whether there were indications of mixed part-good, part-evil states, whether he was affected by fame, restrained only by fear—and so on. Because of this the Buddha is the incomparable Teacher, for who else has issued such an invitation to his disciples? The Buddha can do so because he has no fear of inquiry, not only is he famed for his standard of ‘as speaking, so doing; as doing, so speaking’ but also his mind is utterly purified with no taints remaining. He has no cause for fear. In this Sutta besides inviting inspection of himself, he also shows what is a good criterion for any teacher in our days. Those who have attained Arahantship also have nothing to fear from close inspection by disciples. A caution: this must be done courteously and without critical scepticism compounded out of hatred and delusion. Neither should one fall into that extreme, nor into the opposite extreme of blind worship of the guru. This Sutta shows how understanding (paññā) should be used to examine a teacher.

1. This Sutta is much altered in the original MS, but the renderings there have been compared with a later typed sheet of the Sutta in translation. The latter version is sometimes preferable to the former.

The Sutta (47)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvattthi in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, when a bhikkhu is an inquirer who knows (how to gauge) the state of another's heart, research should be made by him with respect to a Tathāgata in order to recognize or not he is fully enlightened.'

3. 'Venerable sir, our dhammas are rooted in the Blessed One, they are guided by the Blessed One, they are centred in the Blessed One. It is good that the meaning of these words should occur to the Blessed One. Having heard it from the Blessed One, the bhikkhus will remember it.'

'Then listen, bhikkhus, and heed well what I shall say.'

'Even so, venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

4. 'Bhikkhus, when a bhikkhu is an inquirer who knows (how to gauge) the state of another's heart, a Tathāgata should be searched with respect to two kinds of dhammas: with respect to dhammas cognizable through the eye and the ear thus: "Whether in a Tathāgata's case dhammas cognizable through the eye and ear are found to be defiled, or not?" When he searches, he comes to know that they are not.

5. 'With that he makes a further search thus: "Whether in a Tathāgata's case dhammas cognizable through the eye and ear are found to be mixed² or not?" When he searches, he comes to know that they are not.

6. 'With that he makes a further search thus: "Whether in a Tathāgata's case dhammas cognizable through the eye and ear are found to be cleansed, or not?" When he searches, he comes to know that they are.

7. 'With that he makes a further search thus: "Has this venerable one long perfected this profitable dhamma, or recently perfected it." When

2. 'Mixed' means partly good (bright) and partly evil (dark). See paras. 15-16 below.

he searches, he comes to know that it has been long, not recently, perfected.

8. 'With that he makes a further search thus: "Has this venerable one acquired renown, has he reached fame? Are certain dangers in this connexion found in him?"; for, bhikkhus, as long as a bhikkhu has not acquired renown or reached fame certain dangers in this connexion are not found in him, but as soon as he has, they are found. When he searches, he comes to know that he has acquired renown and reached fame but certain dangers in this connexion are not found in him.

9. 'With that he makes a further search thus: "Is this venerable one fearlessly restrained, and not restrained out of fear, and when he does not indulge in sensual desires is it because he is without lust, because of the exhaustion of lust?" When he searches, he comes to know that he is restrained not out of fear and his non-indulgence in sensual desires is because of exhaustion of lust.

10. 'Now if others should ask that bhikkhu: "What is his evidence and what is his inference whereby the venerable one speaks as he does of that venerable one?" Then, answering rightly, he would answer thus: "Whether that venerable one dwells in a sangha or alone, while there may be some who are well behaved, there and some who are ill behaved there and some who teach a group, there and some who show themselves (concerned about) material things and some who are unsullied by material things, still that venerable one belittles no one for that. And I have heard and learnt this from that Blessed One's own lips, namely: 'I am fearlessly restrained and not restrained out of fear, and that I do not indulge in sensual desires is because I am without lust, because of the exhaustion of lust.'"

11. 'About that, bhikkhus, a Tathāgata should be questioned further thus: "Whether in a Tathāgata's case dhammas cognizable through the eye and ear are found to be defiled, or not?" Then, answering, he would answer that they are not.

12. '(To the question): "Whether in a Tathāgata's case dhammas cognizable through the eye and ear are found to be mixed, or not?"—answer-

ing, he would answer that they are not.

13. '(To the question): "Whether in a Tathāgata's case dhammas cognizable through the eye and ear are found to be cleansed, or not?"—answering, he would answer that they are.

14. '(He would also say): "While I have that for my sphere and that for my range, I remain aloof from it."

15. 'The teacher who speaks thus is fit for a disciple to approach for the sake of hearing the Dhamma. The teacher shows him the Dhamma at each higher (level), at each superior (stage), with the dark and bright counterparts. According as the teacher shows the Dhamma to a bhikkhu in this way, so (the bhikkhu) by directly-knowing some dhamma (namely, a Path) among the dhammas (namely, the four Paths taught) in that Dhamma, reaches (his) goal. He has confidence in the Teacher thus: "The Blessed One is fully enlightened, the Dhamma is well proclaimed, the Sangha has entered on the good way."

16. 'Now if others should ask that bhikkhu: "What is his evidence and what is his inference that the venerable one speaks as he does?" Then, answering rightly, he would answer thus: "Here, friends, I approached that Blessed One for the sake of hearing the Dhamma. The Teacher showed me the Dhamma at each higher (level), at each superior (stage), with the dark and bright counterparts. According as he did so, I came to direct-knowledge here and now of a certain dhamma (namely, a Path) among the dhammas (namely, the four Paths taught) in that Dhamma, and I reached (my) goal. I had confidence in the Teacher thus: 'The Blessed One is fully enlightened, the Dhamma is well proclaimed, the Sangha has entered on the good way.'"

17. 'Bhikkhus, when someone's faith in a Tathāgata has by these evidences, these terms and phrases been planted, made to take root and established, then his faith is called supported by evidence, rooted in vision, sound, and invincible by monk or divine or Māra or Divinity or anyone in the world. That is how research with respect to a Tathāgata is according to the Dhamma, and that is how a Tathāgata is well sought in accordance with the Dhamma.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 8. *ñattajjhāpanna*—has acquired renown: *ñatta* not in P.T.S. Dict.

para. 14. *no tammaya*—aloof.

para. 16. The treatment of the intricate use of the word 'dhamma' here is guided by the *Tikā* (Sub-commentary).

para. 17. For '*saddhā nivitthā*' cf. Sutta 95, para. 20 *saddham niveseti*.

Bahitika Sutta

The Cloak

Introduction

Why should one think, speak and act in this way rather than that? is the main point of this Sutta. Evil and goodness are clearly defined with reference to the effect they cause the doer. Evil is: censurable by the wise, unprofitable, worthy of blame, bringing affliction, ripening in suffering, leading to affliction of oneself, others or both and to increase of unprofitable states of mind and to diminishing of profitable states. Goodness is the reverse of this. The Buddha 'has abandoned all unprofitable states and he is possessed of all profitable states' so he could not have been implicated in the wanderers' plot to discredit him (see Notes).

King Pasenadi, who questions venerable Ānanda about this, is very impressed with the clarity of Dhamma and, grateful for this guidance, he offers some fine robe material. It is noticeable that venerable Ānanda does not keep it for himself but gives it to the Buddha. In this way the king's gift will have become even more fruitful.

The Sutta (88)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park.

2. Then, when it was morning the venerable Ānanda dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Sāvatti for alms. When he had wandered for alms in Sāvatti and had returned from his alms-round after the meal, he went to the Eastern Park, to the palace of Migāra's 'Mother', for the day's abiding.

3. 'Now on that occasion King Pasenadi of Kosala had mounted the elephant Ekapundarika and was riding out from Sāvatti at midday. He saw the venerable Ānanda coming in the distance. When he saw him, he spoke to the minister Sirivaddha: 'That is the venerable Ānanda, is it not?'

'Yes, sire, that is the venerable Ānanda.'

4. Then King Pasenadi of Kosala told a man: 'Come, good man, go to the venerable Ānanda and pay homage in my name with your head at his feet, (saying:) "Venerable sir, King Pasenadi of Kosala pays homage with his head at the venerable Ānanda's feet", and says this: "Venerable sir, if the venerable Ānanda has no urgent business, perhaps the venerable Ānanda would wait a moment, out of compassion?"'

5. 'Yes, sire,' the man replied, and he went to the venerable Ānanda, and after paying homage to him, he stood at one side. Then he said to the venerable Ānanda: 'Venerable sir, King Pasenadi of Kosala pays homage with his head at the venerable Ānanda's feet and he says this: "Venerable sir, if the venerable Ānanda has no urgent business, perhaps the venerable Ānanda would wait a moment, out of compassion?"'

6. The venerable Ānanda consented in silence. Then King Pasenadi went with the elephant as far as elephants could go, and then he dismounted and went to the venerable Ānanda on foot, and after paying homage to him, he stood at one side. Then he said to the venerable Ānanda: 'If, venerable sir, the venerable Ānanda has no urgent business, it would be good if he would go to the banks of the River Aciravati, out of compassion.'

7. The venerable Ānanda consented in silence. He went to the bank of the River Aciravati and sat down at the root of a tree on a seat made ready. Then the King Pasenadi went with the elephant as far as elephants could go, and then he dismounted and went to the venerable Ānanda on foot, and after paying homage to him, he stood at one side. Then he said to the venerable Ānanda: 'Here, venerable sir, is an elephant rug; let the venerable Ānanda be seated on it.'

'There is no need, great king. Sit down. I am sitting on my own mat.'

8. King Pasenadi of Kosala sat down on a seat made ready. When he had done so, he said: 'Venerable Ānanda, would the Blessed One do any bodily behaviour such that it could be censurable by wise monks and divines?'

'No, great king, the Blessed One would not do any bodily behaviour such that it could be censurable by wise monks and divines.'

'Venerable Ānanda, would the Blessed One do any verbal behaviour such that it could be censurable by wise monks and divines?'

'No, great king...'

'Venerable Ānanda, would the Blessed One do any mental behaviour such that it could be censurable by wise monks and divines?'

'No, great king...'

9. 'It is wonderful, venerable sir, it is marvellous! For what we were unable to accomplish with a question has been accomplished by the venerable Ānanda with the answer to the question.¹ We place no credence in those ignorant fools who speak praise and blame of others without (first) fathoming and investigating. But we place credence in wise men of learning and knowledge who speak praise and blame of others after fathoming and investigating. Now, venerable Ānanda, what bodily behaviour is censurable by wise monks and divines?'

10. 'Any bodily behaviour that is unprofitable, great king.'

'Now, venerable Ānandā, what bodily behaviour is unprofitable?'

'Any bodily behaviour that is worthy of blame, great king.'

'Now, venerable Ānanda, what bodily behaviour is worthy of blame?'

'Any bodily behaviour that brings affliction, great king.'

'Now, venerable Ānanda, what bodily behaviour brings affliction?'

'Any bodily behaviour that ripens in suffering, great king.'

'Now, venerable Ānanda, what bodily behaviour ripens in suffering?'

'Any bodily behaviour, great king, that leads to one's own affliction, or to another's affliction or the affliction of both and on account of

1. Perhaps since the king's questions are straightforward and the answers likewise this is an elaborate expression of praise used in the royal court. Comy and Subcomy are not helpful.

which unprofitable dhammas increase and profitable dhammas diminish. Such bodily behaviour is censurable by wise monks and divines, great king.'

11. 'Now, venerable Ānanda, what verbal behaviour is censurable by wise monks and divines?'

'Any verbal behaviour that is unprofitable ... (complete as para. 10) ...'

12. 'Now, venerable Ānanda, what mental behaviour is censurable by wise monks and divines?'

'Any mental behaviour that is unprofitable ... (complete as para. 10) ...'

13. 'Now, venerable Ānanda, does the Blessed One only commend the abandoning of all unprofitable dhammas?'

'The Tathāgata, great king, has abandoned all unprofitable dhammas; he is possessed of all profitable dhammas.'

14. 'Now, venerable Ānanda, what bodily behaviour is uncensurable by wise monks and divines?'

'Any bodily behaviour that is profitable, great king.'

'Now, venerable Ānanda, what bodily behaviour is profitable?'

'Any bodily behaviour that is blameless, great king.'

'Now, venerable Ānanda, what bodily behaviour is blameless?'

'Any bodily behaviour that does not bring affliction, great king.'

'Now, venerable Ānanda, what bodily behaviour does not bring affliction.'

'Any bodily behaviour that ripens in pleasure, great king.'

'Now, venerable Ānanda, what bodily behaviour ripens in pleasure?'

'Any bodily behaviour, great king, that does not lead to one's affliction or to another's affliction or to the affliction of both and on account of which unprofitable dhammas diminish and profitable dhammas increase; such bodily behaviour, great king, is uncensurable by wise monks and divines.'

15. 'Now, venerable Ānanda, what verbal behaviour is uncensurable by wise monks and divines?'

'Any verbal behaviour that is profitable ... (complete as in para.

14.) ...'

16. 'Now, venerable Ānanda, what mental behaviour is uncensurable by wise monks and divines?'

'Any mental behaviour that is profitable... (complete as in para. 14) ...'

17. 'Now, venerable Ānanda, does the Blessed One only commend the possession of all profitable dhammas?'

'The Tathāgata, great king, has abandoned all unprofitable dhammas; he is possessed of all profitable dhammas.'

18. 'It is wonderful, venerable sir, it is marvellous how well that has been expressed by the venerable Ānanda! And we are satisfied and pleased by what has been so well expressed by him. Venerable sir, we are so satisfied and pleased with what has been so well expressed by the venerable Ānanda that if the Elephant Treasure² were allowed to him, we would give even that to him. If the Horse Treasure² were allowed to him we would give even that to him. If a valuable village were allowed to him we would give even that to him. But we know, venerable sir, that this is not allowable for the venerable Ānanda. But there is this cloak of mine, venerable sir, which was sent to me packed in a (royal) umbrella case by King Ajātasattu of Magadha. It is sixteen (hands) wide and eight (hands) broad.³ Let the venerable Ānanda accept it out of compassion.'

'It is not necessary, great king. My triple robe is complete.'

19. 'Venerable sir, this River Aciravati has been seen both by the venerable Ānanda and by ourselves when a great cloud has rained heavily on the mountains; then this River Aciravati overflows both its banks—so too, venerable sir, the venerable Ānanda will make a triple robe for himself out of this cloak, and his old triple robe will be shared out

2. These are two of the seven treasures characteristic of the universal emperor ruling according to Dhamma. See D.26.

3. Calculating the average 'hand' (more properly, 'forearm' or 'cubit') at 15 inches, the cloak was 20 feet by 10 feet, which seems a lot of cloth, but below the king says that he can make a new set of three robes (one of double thickness) from it, which requires much material.

among his companions in the life divine. In this way, I fancy, our offering will overflow. Venerable sir, let the venerable Ānanda accept the cloak.'

20. The venerable Ānanda accepted the cloak. Then King Pasenadi of Kosala said: 'And now, venerable sir, we depart; we are busy and have much to do.'

'It is time now, great king, to do as you think fit.'

Then, delighting in venerable Ānanda's words and agreeing, King Pasenadi of Kosala rose from his seat, and after paying homage to the venerable Ānanda, keeping him on his right, he departed.

21. Then soon after he had gone, the venerable Ānanda went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he related to him all his conversation with King Pasenadi of Kosala. And he presented the cloak to the Blessed One.

22. The the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus: 'It is gain, bhikkhus, it is great gain for King Pasenadi of Kosala that he has the opportunity of seeing and honouring Ānanda.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 7. According to the Comy., the king's questions were asked in connexion with the affair related in Udāna, iv, 8 where wanderers murdered a wanderer nun, buried her body in the ditch of Jeta's Grove and accused the bhikkhus of raping and murdering her.⁴ This incident consequently must have happened in the last eight years of the Buddha's life. See also reference to King Ajātasattu in para. 18.

para. 8. *oparambha*—censurable: giving only this reference, P.T.S. Dict. gives the meaning as "acting as support, supporting, helpful", which contradicts the Comy and makes nonsense with the context (but see *uparambha*)

4. See also the Dhammapada Comy., version (The Murder of Sundari), in 'Buddhist Legends, Part 3, p. 189f. (P.T.S. London).

Abhaya Rajakumara Sutta To Prince Abhaya

Introduction

One of the techniques used in the religious debates of those days was to present your opponent with a dilemma—a 'two-horned question', so that whatever he answered could be faulted. This Sutta shows Mahāvira, the Jain teacher, having concocted such a question, teaching it to a prince so that he can trap the Buddha. Of course, it was impossible that this should happen since the Buddha could always know what people had in their minds when they came to him, while sometimes he knew events taking place at a distance. So this attempt to trap the Buddha was doomed to fail. As the example was about speech, the rest of this Sutta explains what speech a Tathāgata would utter and what he would not. It is important to realize why he would speak words which were 'true, connected with good but unwelcome and disagreeable'. On this point the Buddha has given the illustration of the baby with a stone in its mouth. What do you do about it? he asks the Prince. The reply is of course that you get it out somehow, even if it causes pain to the child, and you do that because you pity the baby and want it to live. The Buddha too had compassion with those who took a wrong path and he would use even words like 'fool' and 'misguided man' to help lead people away from what caused dukkha. But though he occasionally used such words, more potent since they were spoken by him, he had no aversion, anger or hatred in his heart. One thing he never did was to use any sort of bodily action, such as a blow to bring people to their senses. Such actions, common among the unenlightened, cannot be 'connected with good' and are therefore not allowed. Moreover, any allowance to do such things leaves a door open for all sorts of violence to enter—disguised as 'skilful means' of religious cultivation.

The Sutta (58)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the Squirrels' feeding place.

2. Then Prince Abhaya went to the Nigaṇṭhā (Jain) Nātaputta, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta said to him:

3. 'Come, Prince, prove the monk Gotama's theory wrong, and a good report of you will be spread to this effect: "The theory of the monk Gotama, successful and mighty as he is, has been proved wrong by Prince Abhaya."'

'But, venerable sir, how shall I prove wrong the theory of the monk Gotama, successful and mighty as he is?'

4. 'Come, Prince, go to the monk Gotama and say thus: "Venerable sir, would a Tathāgata utter such speech as would be unwelcome and disagreeable to others?" If the monk Gotama, on being asked thus, answers thus: "A Tathāgata, Prince, would utter such speech as would be unwelcome and disagreeable to others", then say to him thus: "Then, venerable sir, what is the difference between you and an ordinary man? For an ordinary man also utters such speech as would be unwelcome and disagreeable to others." But if the monk Gotama, on being asked thus, answers thus: "A Tathāgata, Prince, would not utter such speech as would be unwelcome and disagreeable to others", then say to him: "Then, venerable sir, why has Devadatta been declared by you to be thus: 'Devadatta belongs to the states of deprivation, Devadatta belongs to hell, Devadatta will remain (in hell) for the aeon, Devadatta is incorrigible'? Devadatta was disturbed and dissatisfied with that speech of yours." When the monk Gotama is posed this two-horned question¹ by you, he will not be able either to gulp it down or throw it up. If an iron-spiked pod² were stuck in a man's throat, he would not be able

1. A dilemma. Sutta 27, para. 4 ff.

2. Lit: 'an iron water-chestnut', *Trapa bicornis*, ('Ikiliya' in Sinhalese) an edible nut having a tough two horned shell in the form a miniature bull's head. See the translator's note also.

either to gulp it down or throw it up, so too, Prince, when the monk Gotama is posed this two-horned question by you, he will not be able either to gulp it down or throw it up.'

5. 'Yes, venerable sir,' Prince Abahya replied. He rose from his seat and after paying homage to the Niganṭha Nātaputta, keeping him on his right, he (left. He) went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he looked at the sun, and he (considered): 'It is too late today to prove the Blessed One's theory wrong. I shall prove the Blessed One's theory wrong in my own house tomorrow', and he said to the Blessed One: 'Venerable sir, let the Blessed One with three others accept tomorrow's meal from me.' The Blessed One accepted in silence.

6. Then, knowing that the Blessed One had accepted, Prince Abhaya rose from his set, and after paying homage to him, keeping him on his right, he departed.

7. Then when the night was ended, it being morning, the Blessed One dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went to Prince Abhaya's house and he sat down on the seat made ready. Then with his own hands Prince Abhaya served and satisfied the Blessed One with various kinds of good food. Then when the Blessed One had eaten and no longer had the bowl in his hand, Prince Abhaya took another, lower, seat and sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said:

8. 'Venerable sir, would a Tathāgata utter such speech as would be unwelcome and disagreeable to others?'

'There is no outright (answer) to that, Prince.'

'Then, venerable sir, the Niganṭhas have lost in this.'

'Why do you say so, Prince: "Then, venerable sir, the Niganṭhas have lost in this"?''

9. Prince Abhaya then recounted his conversion with the Niganṭha Nātaputta.

10. Now on that occasion a young tender recumbent infant was sitting on Prince Abhaya's lap. Then the Blessed One said to Prince Abhaya: 'How do you conceive this, Prince? If this child, while you or your

nurse were not attending, put a stick or a pebble in his mouth, what would you do to him?’

‘Venerable sir, I should take it away from him. If I could not take it away from him at once, I should take his head in my left hand, and crooking a finger of my right hand, I should take it away even if it meant drawing blood. Why is that? Because I have pity on the child.’

11. ‘So too, Prince, such speech as a Tathāgata knows does not represent what is, does not accord with reality, and is unconnected with good, which speech is also unwelcome and disagreeable to others: such speech a Tathāgata does not utter. Such speech as a Tathāgata knows does represent what is, does accord with reality, but is unconnected with good, and which speech is also unwelcome and disagreeable to others: such speech a Tathāgata does not utter. Such speech as a Tathāgata knows does represent what is, does accord with reality, and is connected with good, but which speech is unwelcome and disagreeable to others: a Tathāgata knows the time to use that speech. Such speech as a Tathāgata knows does not represent what is, does not accord with reality, and is unconnected with good, but which speech is welcome and agreeable to others: such speech a Tathāgata does not utter. Such speech as a Tathāgata knows does represent what is, does accord with reality, but is unconnected with good, and which speech is welcome and agreeable to others: such speech a Tathāgata does not utter. Such speech as a Tathāgata knows does represent what is, does accord with reality, and is connected with good, and which speech is welcome and agreeable to others: a Tathāgata knows the time to use that speech. Why is that? Because a Tathāgata has pity on beings.’³

12. ‘Venerable sir, when warrior-noble caste scholars and divine-caste scholars and householder-scholars and monk-scholars determine a formulated question and then go to the Blessed One and pose it, has there already been in the Blessed One’s mind the thought: “Whoever comes and asks me thus, I shall answer him thus”, or does that (answer) occur to a Tathāgata on the spot?’

3. To make clear what speech a Tathāgata speaks and does not speak, see the table: on page 237.

13. 'As to that, Prince, I shall ask you a question in return; answer it as you choose. How do you conceive this, Prince, are you skilled in the parts of a chariot?'

'Yes, venerable sir, I am.'

'How do you conceive this, Prince, when people come to you and ask: "What is the name of this part of the chariot?", has there already been in your mind the thought: "Whoever comes and asks me thus, I shall answer him thus", or does that (answer) occur to you on the spot?'

'Venerable sir, I am well-known as a chariotman skilled in the parts of a chariot. All the parts of a chariot are well known to me. That answer would occur to me on the spot.'

14. 'So too, Prince, when warrior-noble caste scholars or divine-caste scholars or householder scholars or monk scholars determine a formulated question and then come to a Tathāgata and pose it, the (answer) occurs to a Tathāgata on the spot. Why is that? The element of dhammas has been fully penetrated by a Tathāgata, owing to the full penetration of which element of dhammas the (answer) occurs to a Tathāgata on the spot.'

15. When this was said, Prince Abhaya said: 'Magnificent, Master Gotama . . . (as in Sutta 4, paras. 36-37) . . . as a follower who has gone to him for refuge for life.'

Notes

para. 7. *ayosiṅghātaka*—an iron tetrapod: (Ven. Nyanamoli's original translation). The exact meaning is uncertain, but the general sense is clear from the context. P.T.S. Dict., says 'perhaps an iron ring (in the shape of a square or triangle)', which seems rather to 'square the circle'.

A Tathāgata:		does not speak	does not speak	speaks at right time	does not speak	does not speak	speaks at right time
untrue unconnected with good	true unconnected with good	true connected with good	untrue unconnected with good	true unconnected with good	true unconnected with good	true connected with good	true connected with good
unwelcome disagreeable	unwelcome disagreeable	unwelcome disagreeable	welcome agreeable	welcome agreeable	welcome agreeable	welcome agreeable	welcome agreeable
lies spoken to harm others	worldly— 'news' which pains others to hear	a reprimand to a wrong- doer (or the state- ment about Devadatta)	flattery	worldly matters which though true are unprofitable	teaching Dhamma and Discipline.		

Examples:

The two permutations 'untrue, connected with good, welcome' and 'untrue, connected with good, unwelcome' are not considered as they are contradictory.

Mahasihanada Sutta

The Lion's Roar-2

Introduction

Sunakkhatta, whose words open this Sutta, had been a bhikkhu but left because of his sceptical doubt, a lack of confidence which did not help his practice. When he says that the Buddha's teaching '(only) leads rightly to the exhaustion of suffering in him when he practises it', though he intends to condemn the Buddha yet he praises him by those words. For the exhaustion of suffering is indeed the most meaningful goal offered to man by a Teacher. What is more desired in this world than to be free of bodily and mental suffering, to be free of defilement of mind, to be free of fear, anxiety and worry? It is the deepest urge in mankind to be happy, untroubled by suffering and unburdened by grief—and the Buddha offers the way whereby this can be accomplished. He offers a way beyond the theories and dogmas of the different religions, for he is not concerned that people should *believe* this doctrine or that, but only that they shall practise in the way of cause and effect to remove the troubles from their own minds. He continues in this Sutta to list various accomplishments and powers which are aspects of Enlightenment but about which Sunakkhatta (and other doubt-filled people) will know nothing and so not place their confidence in him. This Sutta is like a map of part of the country called Sammāsambodhi (the perfect Enlightenment of a Buddha). The different states of birth possible are a large part of this Sutta and from this we can be quite sure that the Buddha does indeed teach rebirth in both sub- and super-human realms. A part of the Bodhisatta's extreme practice of asceticism is also included, together with accounts of his ex-

periments with the 'enlightenment-through-food' theories of those days. The Buddha was old when he spoke this Sutta but he says of himself, and this Sutta illustrates, 'even if you have to carry me about on a bed, still there will be no change in the lucidity of the Tathāgata's understanding'.

The Sutta (12)

1. Thus I heard.

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Vesāli in the grove outside the city to the west.

2. Now on that occasion Sunakkhatta, son of the Licchavis had recently forsaken this Dhamma and Discipline. He was making this statement before the Vesāli Assembly: 'The monk Gotama has no distinction worthy of a Noble One's knowledge and vision (that is) higher than the human state (dhamma). The monk Gotama teaches a Dhamma (merely) hammered out by human thought, following his own line of inquiry as it occurs to him, and whoever is taught that Dhamma for his benefit, it (only) leads rightly to the exhaustion of suffering in him when he practises it, (but not to anything else).'

3. Then, it being morning, the venerable Sāriputta dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe he went into Vesāli for alms. Then he heard of (what) Sunakkhatta, son of the Licchavis, was saying.

When he had wandered for alms in Vesāli and had returned from his alms-round, after his meal, he went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he told the Blessed One what had taken place.

4. 'Sāriputta, the misguided man Sunakkhatta is angry, and his words are spoken out of anger. Thinking to condemn the Tathāgata, he actually commends the Tathāgata; for it is a commendation of the Tathāgata to say of him "and whoever is taught the Dhamma for his benefit, it (only) leads rightly to the exhaustion of suffering in him who practises it (but not to anything else)''.

5. 'Sāriputta, this misguided man Sunakkhatta will never infer of me according to Dhamma that: "That Blessed One is such since he is Arahant, Fully Enlightened, perfect in true knowledge and conduct, sublime, knower of worlds, incomparable leader of men to be tamed, teacher of gods and men, Enlightened, Blessed."
6. 'And he will never infer of me according to Dhamma: "That Blessed One is such that he enjoys the various kinds of (supernormal) success; having been one he becomes many, having been many he becomes one: he appears and vanishes; he goes unhindered through a wall, through an enclosure, through a mountain, as through space; he dives in and out of earth as though it were water; he goes on unbroken water as though it were earth; seated cross-legged he travels in space like a winged bird; with his hand he touches and strokes the moon and sun so mighty and powerful; he wields bodily mastery even as far as the world of Divinity (Brahmā)."
7. 'And he will never infer of me according to Dhamma: "That Blessed One is such that with the heavenly ear element, which is purified and surpasses the human, he hears both kinds of sounds, the heavenly and the human, those that are far as well as near."
8. 'And he will never infer of me according to Dhamma: "That Blessed One is such that he encompasses with his mind the minds of other beings, other persons. He understands the mind affected by lust as affected by lust and the mind unaffected by lust as unaffected by lust; he understands the mind affected by hate as affected by hate and the mind unaffected by hate as unaffected by hate; he understands the mind affected by delusion as affected by delusion and the mind unaffected by delusion as unaffected by delusion; he understands the contracted mind as contracted and the distracted mind as distracted; he understands the exalted mind as exalted and the unexalted mind as unexalted; he understands the surpassed mind as surpassed and the unsurpassed mind as unsurpassed; he understands the concentrated mind as concentrated and the unconcentrated mind as unconcentrated; he understands the liberated mind as liberated and the unliberated mind as unliberated."

(Ten Powers of a Tathāgata)

9. 'Sāriputta, a Tathāgata has these ten powers of a Tathāgata, possessing which he claims the herd-leader's place, roars his lion's roar before the assemblies, and sets the Divine Wheel rolling forward. What are the ten?
10. (1) 'Here a Tathāgata understands, as it actually is, the possible as possible and the impossible as impossible. And that is a Tathāgata's power that a Tathāgata has by virtue of which he claims the herd-leader's place, roars his lion's roar before the assemblies, and sets the Divine Wheel rolling forward.
11. (2) 'Again, a Tathāgata understands, as it actually is, the ripening of kammās undertaken, past, future and present, with possibilities and with causes. And that is a Tathāgata's power . . .
12. (3) 'Again, a Tathāgata understands, as it actually is, whither all ways lead. And that is a Tathāgata's power . . .
13. (4) 'Again, a Tathāgata understands, as it actually is, the world with its many and differing elements. And that is a Tathāgata's power . . .
14. (5) 'Again, a Tathāgata understands, as it actually is how beings have different inclinations. And that is a Tathāgata's power . . .
15. (6) 'Again, a Tathāgata understands, as it actually is, the disposition of the faculties of other beings, other persons. And that is a Tathāgata's power . . .
16. (7) 'Again, a Tathāgata understands, as it actually is, the defilement of, the cleansing of and the emergence from the jhānas, liberations, concentrations and attainments. And that is a Tathāgata's power . . .
17. (8) 'Again, a Tathāgata recollects his manifold past life, that is to say, one birth, two births . . . five births, ten births . . . fifty births, a hundred births, a thousand births, a hundred thousand births, many aeons of (universal) contraction, many aeons of (universal) expansion, many aeons of (universal) contraction and expansion: There I was so named, of such a race, with such (qualities of) appearance, such was my nutriment, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-

term; and passing away from there I appeared elsewhere; and there too I was so named . . . such my life-term; and passing away from there I appeared here. Thus with details and particulars he recollects his manifold past life. And that is a Tathāgata's power . . .

18. (9) 'Again, a Tathāgata, with the heavenly eyesight which is purified and surpasses the human, sees beings passing away and reappearing, inferior and superior, fair and ugly, well-behaved and ill-behaved: understands how beings pass on according to their kammās, thus: "These worthy beings who are ill-conducted in body, speech and mind, revilers of the Noble Ones, wrong in their views, giving effect to wrong view in their kammās, have, on the dissolution of the body, after death, appeared in a state of deprivation, in a bad destination, in perdition, even in hell; but these worthy beings who are well-conducted in body, speech and mind, not revilers of the Noble Ones, right in their views, giving effect to right view in their kammās, have, on the dissolution of the body after death, appeared in a good destination, even in the heavenly world", thus with heavenly eyesight . . . he sees beings passing away and reappearing . . . He understands how beings pass on according to their kammās. And that is a Tathāgata's power . . .

19. (10) 'Again, a Tathāgata, by realization himself with direct knowledge, here and now enters upon and abides in the deliverance of the heart and deliverance by understanding that are taintless, with (final) exhaustion of taints. And that is a Tathāgata's power that a Tathāgata has, by virtue of which he claims the herd-leader's place, roars his lion's roar in the assemblies, and sets the Divine Wheel rolling forward.

20. 'A Tathāgata has these ten Tathāgata's Powers, possessing which he claims the herd-leader's place . . .

21. 'Sāriputta, should anyone knowing and seeing me thus, say: "The monk Gotama has no distinction worthy of a Noble One's knowledge and vision (that is) higher than the human state. The monk Gotama teaches a Dhamma (merely) hammered out by thought, following his own line of inquiry as it occurs to him", then unless he abandons that assertion and that (state of) mind and unless he recants that view, he (will find himself) in hell (sure as if he had been) carried off (and put

there). Just as a bhikkhu perfected in virtue, concentration and understanding would here and now enjoy final knowledge, so it (will) happen in this case, I say, that unless he abandons that assertion and that (state of) mind and unless he recants that view, then as (sure as if he had been) carried off (and) put (there) so he (will find himself) in hell.

(Four Kinds of Intrepidity)

22. 'Sāriputta, there are four kinds of intrepidity, possessing which a Tathāgata claims the herd-leader's place, roars his lion's roar in the assemblies, and sets the Divine Wheel rolling forward. What are the four?

23. 'Here I can see no reason why any monk or divine or god or māra or divinity at all in the world could, in accordance with the Dhamma, accuse me thus: "While you claim discovery of full enlightenment, you are not enlightened in these dhammas." And seeing no reason for that, I abide in safety, fearlessness and intrepidity.

24. 'I can see no reason why any monk . . . could . . . accuse me thus: "While you claim to have exhausted the taints, these taints are unexhausted in you." And seeing no reason for that, I abide in . . . intrepidity.

25. 'I can see no reason why any monk . . . could . . . accuse me thus: "Those dhammas which are said by you to be obstructive are not in fact obstructive to one who practises them." And seeing no reason for that, I abide in . . . intrepidity.

26. 'I can see no reason why any monk . . . could . . . accuse me thus: "Whoever is taught the Dhamma by you for his benefit, it does not lead rightly to the exhaustion of suffering in him when he practises it." And seeing no reason for that, I abide in safety, fearlessness and intrepidity.

27. 'These are the four kinds of intrepidity possessing which a Tathāgata claims the herd-leader's place, roars his lion's roar in the assemblies and sets the Divine Wheel rolling forward.

28. 'Sāriputta, should anyone knowing and seeing me thus . . . unless he abandons the assertion . . . carried off (and) put . . . in hell.

(The Eight Assemblies)

29. 'Sāriputta, there are these eight assemblies. What are the eight? A warrior-nobles' assembly, a divines' assembly, a householders' assembly, a monks' assembly, an assembly of gods of the Four Kings, an assembly of gods of the Thirty-three, a Māra's assembly, a Divinities' assembly. Possessing these four kinds of intrepidity, a Tathāgata approaches and goes into these eight kinds of assembly.

30. 'I have had direct knowledge, as a visitor, of many hundred warrior-noble caste assemblies. And formerly, I had sat with them there and talked and held converse with them. I see no reason why fear or timidity should come upon me there. And seeing no reason for that, I abide in safety, fearlessness and intrepidity.

'I have had direct knowledge, as a visitor, of many hundred divine-caste assemblies . . .

'... householders' assemblies . . .

'... monks' assemblies . . .

'... assemblies of gods of the Four Kings . . .

'... assemblies of gods of the Thirty-Three . . .

'... Māra's assemblies . . .

'... Divinities' assemblies . . . I abide in safety, fearlessness and intrepidity. (These are the eight kinds of assemblies).

31. 'Sāriputta, should anyone knowing and seeing me thus . . . unless he abandons that assertion . . . carried off (and) put . . . in hell.

(Four Kinds of Generation)

32. 'Sāriputta, there are these four kinds of generation. What are the four? Egg-born generation, womb-born generation, moisture-born generation, spontaneous generation.

33. 'What is egg-born generation? There are beings born by breaking out of the shell of an egg; this is called egg-born generation.

'What is womb-born generation? There are those beings born by breaking out from the caul; this is called womb-born generation.

'What is moisture-born generation? There are those beings born in a rotten fish, in a rotten corpse, or in rotten dough, or in a cesspit or in

a sewer; this is called moisture-born generation.

'What is spontaneous generation? There are gods and denizens of hell and certain human beings and certain denizens of the states of deprivation, of spontaneous generation; this is called spontaneous generation.

'These are the four kinds of generation.

34. 'Sāriputta, should anyone knowing and seeing me thus... unless he abandons that assertion... carried off (and) put... in hell.

(The Five Destinations And Nibbāna)

35. 'Sāriputta, there are these five destinations. What are the five? Hell, the animal womb, the realm of ghosts, human beings and gods.

36. (1) 'I understand hell; and the path and the way leading to hell, whereon he who has entered will, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in states of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, in hell; that too I understand.

(2) 'I understand the animal womb; and the path and the way leading to the animal womb, where he who has entered will, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in the animal womb; that too I understand.

(3) 'I understand the realm of ghosts; and the path and way leading to the realm of ghosts, whereon he who has entered will, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in the realm of ghosts; that too I understand.

(4) 'I understand human beings; and the path and the way leading to the human world, whereon he who has entered will, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear among human beings; that too I understand.

(5) 'I understand the gods; and the path and the way leading to the world of gods, whereon he who has entered will, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in a happy destination, in the heavenly world; that too I understand.

(6) 'I understand Nibbāna; and the path and the way leading to Nibbāna, whereon he who has entered will, by realization himself with direct knowledge, here and now enter upon and abide in the deliverance

of mind and deliverance of understanding that are taint-free, with exhaustion of taints; that too I understand.

37. (1) 'By encompassing mind with mind I understand a certain person thus: "This person so behaves, his deportment is such, the path he has taken is such, that, on the dissolution of the body, after death, he will reappear in the states of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, in hell." And then later on with the heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, I see that on the dissolution of the body, after death, he has reappeared in the states of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, in hell and is experiencing unremitting, painful, racking, piercing feelings.

'Suppose there were a charcoal pit deeper than a man's height full of glowing coals without flame or smoke; and then a man, scorched and exhausted by the hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a path going in one way only and directed to the same charcoal pit; then a man with (good) eyes on seeing him would say: "This person so behaves, his deportment is such, the path he has taken is such, that he will come to this same charcoal pit"; and then later on he sees that he has fallen into that charcoal pit and is experiencing unremitting painful, racking, piercing feelings; so too, by encompassing mind with mind... piercing feelings.

38. (2) 'By encompassing mind with mind I understand a certain person thus: "This person so behaves, his deportment is such, the path he has taken is such, that, on the dissolution of the body, after death, he will reappear in the animal womb." And then later on, with the heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, I see that on the dissolution of the body, after death, he has reappeared in the animal womb and is experiencing painful, racking, piercing feelings.

'Suppose there were a cesspit more than a man's height deep, full of filth; and then a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a path going in one way only and directed to that same cesspit; then a man with (good) eyes on seeing him would say: "This person so behaves, his deportment is such, the path he has taken is such, that he will come to this same cesspit"; and then later on he sees that he has fallen into the cesspit and is experiencing

painful, racking, piercing feelings: so too, by encompassing mind with mind . . . piercing feelings.

39. (3) 'By encompassing mind with mind I understand a certain person thus: "This person so behaves, his deportment is such, the path he has taken is such, that, on the dissolution of the body, after death, he will reappear in the realm of ghosts. And then later on . . . I see that . . . he has reappeared in the realm of ghosts and is experiencing much painful feeling.

'Suppose there were a tree growing on uneven ground with scanty foliage casting a dappled shade; and then a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a path going in one way only and directed to that same tree; then a man with (good) eyes on seeing him would say: "This person so behaves, his deportment is such, the path he has taken is such, that he will come to this same tree"; and then later on he sees that he is sitting or lying in the shade of that tree experiencing much painful feeling; so too by encompassing mind with mind . . . much painful feeling.

40. (4) 'By encompassing mind with mind I understand a certain person thus: "This person so behaves, his deportment is such, the path he has taken is such, that, on the dissolution of the body, after death, he will reappear among human beings." And then later on . . . I see that . . . he has reappeared among human beings and is experiencing much pleasant feeling.

'Suppose there were a tree growing on even ground with thick foliage casting a deep shade; and then a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a path going in one way only and directed to that same tree; then a man with (good) eyes on seeing him would say: "This person so behaves . . . that he will come to this same tree"; and then later on he sees that he is sitting or lying in the shade of that tree experiencing much pleasant feeling; so too, encompassing mind with mind . . . much pleasant feeling.

41. (5) 'By encompassing mind with mind I understand a certain person thus: "This person so behaves . . . that . . . after death, he will reappear in a happy destination, in the heavenly world." And then later on . . . I

see that . . . he has reappeared in a happy destination, in the heavenly world and is experiencing unremitting pleasant feelings.

'Suppose there were a mansion, and in it an upper chamber plastered within and without, shut off, secured by bars, and with shuttered windows, and in it a couch spread with rugs and blankets and sheets, with a deerskin coverlet, and with a canopy as well as crimson pillow for both (head and feet); and then a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a path going in one way only and directed to that same mansion; then a man with (good) eyes on seeing him would say: "This person so behaves . . . that he will come to this same mansion; and then later on he sees that he is sitting or lying in that upper chamber in that mansion experiencing unremitting pleasant feelings, so too, by encompassing mind with mind . . . unremitting pleasant feelings.

42. (6) 'By encompassing mind with mind I understand a certain person thus: "This person so behaves, his deportment is such, the path he has taken is such that, by realizing for himself with direct knowledge, he here and now enters upon and abides in the heart's deliverance and deliverance by understanding that are taint-free, with exhaustion of taints." And then later on I see that by realization for himself with direct knowledge he here and now enters upon and abides in the heart's deliverance and deliverance by understanding that are taint-free, with exhaustion of taints, and is experiencing unremitting pleasant feeling.

'Suppose there were a pond with clean, agreeable, cool water, transparent, with smooth banks and delightful, and nearby a dense wood; and then a man scorched and exhausted by hot weather, weary, parched and thirsty, came by a path going in one way only and directed towards that same pond; then a man with (good) eyes on seeing him would say: "This person so behaves, his deportment is such, the path he has taken is such, that he will come to this same pond; and then later on he sees that he has gone down to the pond and bathed and drunk and relieved all his distress, fatigue and fever and has come out again and is sitting or lying in the wood experiencing unremitting pleasant feelings; so too, by encompassing mind with mind . . . unremitting pleasant feelings.

'These are the five kinds of destination

43. 'Sāriputta, should anyone, knowing and seeing me thus say: "The monk Gotama has no distinction worthy of a Noble One's knowledge and vision (that is) higher than the human state. The monk Gotama teaches a Dhamma (merely) hammered out by thought, following his own line of inquiry as it occurs to him", then unless he abandons that assertion and that (state of) mind, and unless he recants that view, he (will find himself) in hell (sure as if he had been) carried off (and put there). Just as a bhikkhu perfected in virtue, concentration and understanding would here and now enjoy final knowledge, so it (will) happen in this case, I say, that unless he abandons that assertion and that (state of) mind, and unless he recants that view, he (will find himself) in hell (sure as if he had been) carried off (and put there).

44. 'Sāriputta, I have had direct knowledge of (what is called) the four-factored life divine as one who has lived it. I have practised the extreme of asceticism, of coarseness, of scrupulousness, and of seclusion.

45. 'Such was my asceticism here that I went naked, rejecting conventions, licking my hands, not coming when asked, not stopping when asked; I did not accept a thing brought or a thing specially made or an invitation; I received nothing from out of a pot, from out of a bowl, across a threshold, across a stick, across a pestle, from two eating together, from a woman with child, from a woman giving suck, from (where) a woman was lying with a man, from where food was advertized to be distributed, from where a dog was waiting, from where flies were buzzing; I accepted no fish or meat, I drank no liquor, wine or besotting drink. I kept to one house, to one morsel; I kept to two houses, to two morsels . . . I kept to seven houses, to seven morsels. I lived on one saucerful, on two saucerfuls . . . on seven saucerfuls, a day; I took food once a day, once each two days, . . . once each seven days; and so on, up to once each fortnight. I dwelt pursuing the practice of taking food at stated intervals. I was an eater of greens, or millet, or wild rice, or hide-parings, or moss, or ricebran, or rinsings, or sesamum flour, or grass, or cowdung. I lived on forest roots and on fruits as a feeder on windfalls. I clothed myself in hemp, in hemp mixed cloth, in shrouds, in refuse rags, in tree bark, in antelope hide, in kusa-grass fabric, in bark fabric, in wood (shavings) fabric, in head-hair wool, in

animal wool, in owls' wings. I was one who pulled out hair and beard, pursuing the practice of pulling out hair and beard. I was one who stood continuously, rejecting seats. I was one who squatted continuously, devoted to maintaining the squatting position. I was one who used a mattress of spikes; I made a mattress of spikes my bed. I dwelt pursuing the practice of bathing in water for the third time by nightfall. Such was my asceticism.

46. 'Such was my coarseness that, just as the bole of a plane tree, accumulating over the years, cakes and flakes off, so too, the dust and dirt, accumulating over the years, caked on my body and flaked off. It never occurred to me: "Oh, let me rub this dust and dirt off with my hand, or let another rub this dust and dirt off with his hand"—it never occurred to me thus. Such was my coarseness.

47. 'Such was my scrupulousness that I was always mindful in stepping forwards and stepping backwards: So much so that I was full of pity for even a drop of water, thus: "Let me not hurt the tiny breathing things in the crevices of the ground". Such was my scrupulousness.

48. 'Such was my seclusion that I would go away into some forest and dwell there. And when I saw a cowherd or a shepherd or someone gathering grass or sticks, or a woodsman, I would flee from grove to grove, from thicket to thicket, from hollow to hollow, from hillock to hillock—why was that? So that they should not see me or I see them. Just as a forest-bred deer on seeing human beings flees from grove to grove, from thicket to thicket, from hollow to hollow, from hillock to hillock, so too, when I saw . . . or I them. Such was my seclusion.

49. 'I would go on all fours to the byres when the cattle had gone out and the cowherds had left them, and I would feed on the young suckling-calves' dung. As long as my own excrement and urine lasted, I fed on my own excrement and urine. Such was my great distortion in feeding.

50. 'I would go off to some awe-inspiring grove and dwell there—a grove so awe-inspiring that normally it would make a man's hair stand up if he were not free from lust. I would dwell by night in the open

and by day in the grove when those cold wintry nights came during the Eight-days Interval of Frost. I would dwell by day in the open and by night in the grove in the last month of the hot season. And there came to me spontaneously this stanza never heard before:

Chilled by night and scorched by day,
 Alone in awe-inspiring groves,
 Naked, no fire to sit beside,
 The hermit yet pursues his quest.

51. 'I would make my bed in a charnel ground with the bones of the dead for a pillow. And cowherd boys came up and spat on me, made water on me, threw dirt at me, and poked sticks into my ears. Yet I never knew the arising of an evil mind (thoughts) about them. Such was my abiding in equanimity.

52. 'Sāriputta, there are certain monks and divines whose theory and whose view is thus: "Purification comes about through food", and they say: "Let us live on kola-fruits"¹, and they eat kola-fruits, and they eat kola-fruit powder, and they drink kola-fruit water, and they make many kinds of kola-fruit concoctions. Now I have had direct knowledge of eating a single kola-fruit a day. But, Sāriputta, you may think that the kola-fruit was bigger at that time, yet you should not regard it so: the kola-fruit was then at most the same size as now. Through feeding on a single kola-fruit a day, my body reached a state of extreme emaciation. Because of eating so little my limbs became like the jointed segments of vine stems or bamboo stems. Because of eating so little my backside became like a camel's hoof. Because of eating so little the projections on my spine stood out like corded beads. Because of eating so little my ribs jutted out as gaunt as the crazy rafters of an old roofless barn. Because of eating so little the gleam of my eyes sunk far down in their sockets looked like the gleam of water sunk far down in a deep well. Because of eating so little my scalp shrivelled and withered as a green gourd shrivels and withers in the wind and sun. Because of eating so little, if I touched my belly skin, I encountered my backbone too; if I touched my backbone, I encountered my bell-skin too. Because

1. Kola fruit are the black date-like fruits of *Zizyphus jujuba*, the jujube.

of eating so little, if I made water or evacuated my bowels, I fell over on my face there. Because of eating so little, if I tried to ease my body by rubbing my limbs with my hands, the hair, rotted at its roots, fell away from my body as I rubbed.

53. "There are certain monks and divines whose theory and whose view is thus: "Purification comes about through food", and they say: "Let us live on beans" . . .

54. ". . . "Let us live on sesamum" . . .

55. ". . . "Let us live on rice." And they eat rice, and they eat rice powder, and they drink rice water, and they make various kinds of rice concoctions. Now I have had direct knowledge of eating a single rice grain a day. But, Sāriputta, you may think that the rice grain was bigger at that time; yet you should not regard it so: the rice grain was at most the same size as now. Through feeding on a single rice grain a day my body reached a state of extreme emaciation. Because of eating so little . . . the hair, rotted at its roots, fell away from my body as I rubbed.

56. "Yet, Sāriputta, by such deportment, by such practice, by such performance of difficult feats, I attained no distinction worthy of a Noble One's knowledge and vision higher than the human state (dhamma). Why was that? Because I did not attain this Noble Understanding, which, on being attained, being Noble and an outlet, rightly leads to the exhaustion of suffering in him who practise it.

57. "Sāriputta, there are certain monks and divines whose theory and whose view is thus: "Purification comes about through (the process of) a round of rebirths (itself)." But it is impossible to find the round of rebirths that I have not already gone the round of in this long journey, except for the gods of the Pure Abodes: and had I gone the round as a god in the Pure Abodes, I should never have returned to this world.

58. "There are certain monks and divines whose theory and whose view is thus: "Purification comes through (some particular kind of) rebirth." But it is impossible to find the kind of rebirth that I have not been reborn in already in this long journey, except for the gods of the Pure

Abodes: . . .

59. ' . . . "Purification comes about through (some particular) abode." But it is impossible to find the kind of abode that I have not dwelt in . . . except for the Pure Abodes. . . .

60. ' . . . "Purification comes about through sacrifice." But it is impossible to find the kind of sacrifice that has not already been offered up by me in this long journey, either as a head-anointed warrior-noble king or as a divine with great property.

61. ' . . . "Purification comes about through fire-worship." But it is impossible to find the kind of fire that has not already been worshipped by me in this long journey, either as a head-anointed warrior-noble king or as divine of great property.

62. 'Sāriputta, there are certain monks and divines whose theory and whose view is thus: "As long as this good man is still young, a black-haired boy endowed with the blessing of youth, in the first phase of life, so long is he perfect in his lucid understanding. But when this good man is old, aged, burdened with years, advanced in life, and come to the last stage, being eighty, ninety or a hundred years old, then the lucidity of his understanding is lost." But it should not be regarded so. I am now old, aged, burdened with years, advanced in life, and come to the last stage: my years have turned eighty. Now suppose that I had four disciples with a hundred years' life, a hundred years' span, perfect in mindfulness, attentiveness, memory and lucidity of understanding—just as a well-equipped archer, trained, practised and tested, could easily shoot a light arrow across a palm's shadow: suppose they were even to that extent perfect in mindfulness, attentiveness, memory and lucidity of understanding—and suppose that they continuously asked about the Four Foundations of Mindfulness and that I answered when asked and that they remembered each answer of mine and never asked a subsidiary question or paused except to eat, drink, chew, taste, make water, evacuate the bowels and rest in order to remove sleepiness and tiredness: still the Tathāgata's exposition of the Dhamma, his explanations of factors of the Dhamma, and his replies to questions, would be unexhausted. But meanwhile those four disciples of mine with their hundred-

years' life, their hundred-years' span, would have died at the end of those hundred years. Sāriputta, even if you have to carry me about on a bed, still there will be no change in the lucidity of the Tathāgata's understanding.

63. 'Rightly speaking, were it to be said of someone. "A being not subject to delusion has appeared in the world for the welfare and happiness of many, out of pity for the world, for the benefit, welfare and happiness of gods and men", it is of me indeed that rightly speaking it should be said.'

64. Now on that occasion the venerable Nāgasamāla was standing behind the Blessed One fanning him. Then he said to the Blessed One: 'It is wonderful, venerable sir, it is marvellous! As I listened to this discourse the hairs of my body stood up. Venerable sir, what is the name of this discourse on the Dhamma?'

'As to that, Nāgasamāla, you may remember this discourse on the Dhamma as the Hair-raising Discourse.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Nāgasamāla was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 2. Sunakkhatta is denying the Buddha's attainment of supernormal power while grudgingly admitting that he can show the way to end suffering. The sense requires the word '(only)' in the last sentence of Sunakkhatta's accusation, which is rather elliptically put.

para. 5. *dhammaṅvaya*—inference according to Dhamma (Ven Nyānamoli had also experimented with 'inferential knowledge according to Dhamma' and 'the necessity of the Dhamma (idea)', as translations). For *anvaya* cf. D.ii, 83. Here *dhamma* might refer to the *uttarimanussadhamma* of para. 2. (*anvaya*, refs: M.i. 237, 238, 266, 319, 500; M.ii 120; M.iii 292). (Note:) in logic *anvaya*=*anugamana* (positive), opposite of *byatireka*.

para. 10. *thānañca atthānañca*—the possible and impossible. See Sutta 115, paras. 12 ff. and A: iv, 33.

para. 12. For the idiom *yathābhatam nikkhitto evam niraye*; dealt with in P.T.S. Dict. under *yathā*. The rendering here follows the Commentary. Cf. also Sutta 97, para. 6. See verse at Iti. 12f.

para. 30. For the idiom *abhiñānāmi . . . upasāṅkamitā* (upasāṅkamitar=verbal noun of consonantal decl.) cf. para. 49 and also Sutta 36, para. 31, etc. etc.

para. 31. (end). the concluding sentence in () is not in the P.T.S. Text, but seems required.

para. 33. *Kummāsa*—dough: this meaning is not given in P.T.S. Dict., but the meaning 'junket' seems wrong since it is explained as made of *yava* (corn or wheat in the Vinaya. And cf. Khuddasikkhā V. 85. Sutta 23, para. 4.

para. 41. *Upadhāna*—pillow: not in P.T.S. Dict. See para. 51 upadhā.

para. 45. For idiom '*Tatr'assu me idam tapassitāya* (loc)—such was my asceticism' cf. para. 50 etc.

Sāṅkitti—where food is advertized to be distributed: this is probably the meaning.

'*Sā* is nom. sing of '*san*—a dog'.

daddula—hide-parings: P.T.S. gives *daddula* as 'a kind of rice' with this ref. But that meaning seems to have no support at all either for this ref. or for any of the other six refs. given. These should in fact be under *daddula* 2) with *daddula* 1) cancelled.

'*ācāma*—rinsings': an alternative would be 'rice-scum'; but *ācāmeti* is the normal word for 'to rinse'.

para. 46. *tinduka*—the tree is not actually a plane tree, but the plane tree, like the sycamore, exhibits this phenomenon.

para. 49. *paṭṭhita*—gone out=nikkhanta (Comy): not in P.T.S. Dict.

mahāvikaṭabhojanasmim—my eating of the great distortions: for four other *mahāvikaṭāni* as excrement, urine, clay, and ashes, see Vin.i, 206.

para. 50. *antarattḥaka*—the Eight-Days Interval: P.T.S. Dict. has wrongly connected the 'eight' with the 'Eighth of the half moon', apparently. But this refers to the cold spell called 'the Eight-Days Interval' which

falls at the end of the month of Māgha and the beginning of the month of Phagguna (Dec. Jan.) See. Comy.

para. 51. *Upadhā*—pillow: not in P.T.S. Dict.; see *upadhāna* para. 41. above.

para. 52. *etāparama*—that at most: not in P.T.S. Dict. Cf. M.i. 339, and *etāva parama*, M.i, 246; iii, 262.

Kisabhava—emaciation: not in P.T.S. Dict.

para. 54. *dukkarakārikā*—performance of difficult feats: not in P.T.S. Dict.

para. 57. *Suddhāvāsā*—the Pure Abodes: a part of the *rūpadhātu* or *rūpabrahma* world, where only Non-returners go to attain Nibbāna there without returning to this world at all. Had the Buddha been reborn there, he would, as a Non-returner, not have returned to this world. However, it can, like any other heaven, be visited by men with the ability to do so through supernormal power. See also Sutta 6, para. 3.

para. 61. The simile of the arrow shooting is given to show how easily this thing might be done, and so seems to require the sense of shooting an arrow across a palm trunk's shadow lying on the ground, not the sense of shooting an arrow over the top of a palm-tree.

atīpateyya—might shoot: not in this sense in P.T.S. Dict.

“A Treasury of the Buddha’s Discourses”

The selection of 90 Suttas from the Majjhima-Nikaya was made on the following principles:

1. The majority of readers of this book are likely to be Buddhist lay people, therefore most of the Suttas on lay practice have been included in the first section—“Lay people”.

2. But to complement this, the next section is on “Bhikkhu Life” and while not quite so long as the preceding section, is still nearly 20 Suttas. Some Suttas only of interest to bhikkhus (such as the Anumana Sutta) have been omitted.

3. Most of the Suttas dealing with various aspects of Training in Dhamma fall in this section. At the end of it come three Suttas which illustrate the step-by-step training of a bhikkhu.

4. Suttas which are on the various views held by non-Buddhists at that time, and conversations between non-Buddhists and Buddhist practisers find a place in this section.

5. Among the numerous Suttas in the Majjhima on ‘wisdom’ (pañña) which are phrased in terms of dhammas rather than persons, some have been omitted, like the Mūlapariyāya Sutta, because of their complexity and the need of many explanations. This section is still nevertheless one of the biggest.

6. This group of Suttas illustrates the attainment of Arahantship and so follows logically upon the last section, as well as section three.

7. The few Suttas which give biographical details of the Bodhisatta’s practices before Enlightenment and continue in some cases to speak of later events, such as the teaching of the first five bhikkhus, could hardly be omitted as they are so important. Four Suttas make up this short section.

8. The last section shows the Buddha speaking about himself as the Tathāgata and from the four Suttas here we gain an impression of the Buddha’s majesty.

This note summarizes the contents of the various sections of this anthology. The guiding principle in making it was to bring out all the major features of the Buddha’s teaching.