

A
Treasury
of the

Buddha's
Words

DISCOURSES FROM THE
MIDDLE COLLECTION
TRANSLATED BY NYANAMOLI



The Buddha's Words

NYANA-
MOLI
*
MAHAMAKUT

?

D-24

A Treasury of the
Buddha's Discourses
from the Mahima-nikaya
(Middle Collection)

TILAKA'S LIBRARY (416) 752-2253
44 CLONMERE DR.
TORONTO, ONTARIO
M1N 1X6

translated by
Ven. Nyanamoli Thero

edited and arranged by
Phra Khandipala

TORONTO MAHAVIHARA LIBRARY
4698 KINGSTON ROAD
SCARBOROUGH, ONT. M1E 2P9
TEL: (416) 208-9276

**A Treasury of the
Buddha's Discourses
from the Majjhima-nikaya
(Middle Collection)**

VOLUME II

translated by
Ven. Nyanamoli Thera

edited and arranged by
Phra Khantipalo

A Treasury of the
Buddha's Discourses
from the Majjhima-nikaya
(Middle Collection)

VOLUME II

Printed in Thailand at:
Mahāmakut Rājavidyālaya Press
287 Phra Sumeru Road
Bangkok 2

edited and arranged by
Phra Khantipalo

II

DOING OR TALKING

(a) MIND, MEDITATION AND TRAINING

“What should be done for his disciples out of pity by a Master who seeks their welfare and has pity on them, that I have done for you. There are these roots of trees, these empty huts. Develop meditation, bhikkhus, do not delay lest later you regret it. This is our message to you.”

(Sutta 19)

DOING OR TALKING (B) MIND, MEDITATION AND TRAINING

What would be done for his disciples
out of pity by a Master who sees their
weird and has pity on them, that I have
done for you. There are thousands of these
these empty pots. (Reading meditation, thinking
to the day but later you regret it
This is our message to you.

(1) ...
(2) ...
(3) ...
(4) ...
(5) ...

CONTENTS

Doing or Talking?

Mind, Meditation and Training

- | | |
|--|-----|
| 61. <i>To Rāhula at Ambalaṭṭhika</i> : falsehood and constant reflection on making kammās. | 1 |
| 21. <i>The Simile of the Saw</i> : restraint, non-anger, patience, lovingkindness. | 6 |
| 77. <i>To Saṅkha</i> : why the Teacher is and is not respected. | 15 |
| 14. <i>The Mass of Suffering-2</i> : renunciation, gratification, danger of sense desires. | 35 |
| 13. <i>The Mass of Suffering-1</i> : gratification, danger, escape in the case of sense desires, form and feeling. | 43 |
| 125. <i>The Grade of the Tamed</i> : renunciation, taming, mindfulness, jhāna, reverence. | 53 |
| 10. <i>The Foundations of Mindfulness</i> : of body, feeling, mind and dhammas. | 66 |
| 119. <i>Mindfulness of the Body</i> : and its advantages. | 80 |
| 59. <i>The Many Kinds of Feeling</i> : feelings and pleasure up to cessation. | 92 |
| 19. <i>Two Kinds of Thinking</i> : divided into wholesome / unwholesome. | 97 |
| 20. <i>The Quieting of Thoughts</i> : five methods for calming thoughts. | 102 |
| 8. <i>Effacement</i> : the true meaning of effacing oneself. | 107 |
| 7. <i>The Simile of the Cloth</i> : defiled dyes badly, pure dyes well. | 118 |
| 128. <i>Imperfections</i> : imperfections of jhāna. | 125 |
| 127. <i>Anuruddha</i> : measureless and exalted deliverances of mind. | 136 |
| 106. <i>The Way to the Imperturbable</i> : 4th jhāna and formless states. | 144 |
| 121. <i>Voidness-1</i> : what is perceived as void? | 152 |
| 27. <i>The Simile of the Elephant's Footprint-1</i> : step-by-step training. | 159 |
| 39. <i>At Assapura-1</i> : step-by-step training. | 170 |
| 107. <i>Moggallāna the Accountant</i> : step-by step training. | 180 |

Doing or Talking? Dialogue and Views

95. *To Caṅkī*: on dogmatism and truth. 191
71. *Vacchagotta and the Three True Knowledges*: questions on enlightenment and attainment. 205
11. *The Lion's Roar-1*: Ariyas only in the Buddhasāsaṇa. 210
79. *To Sakuludāyin-2*: a 'radiant soul', happy heaven, and highest aim of Buddhists. 217
35. *To Saccaka-1*: the boast and defeat of Saccaka. 227
101. *At Devadaha*: unfruitful Jain asceticism: fruitful Dhamma practice. 240
75. *To Māgandiya*: sensual desires, dangers and escape. 254
72. *Vacchagotta and Fire*: views and Arahants after death. 266
63. *To Mālunkeyaputta-1*: undeclared views and the declared. 273
74. *To Dighanakha*: abandoning views, body, feelings. 279
76. *To Sandaka*: 4 ways of life which do not lead to purity and 4 kinds of life divine without consolation. 285
102. *Five and Three*: views about future, past and 'Nibbāna' here-now. 300

Ambalatthika Rahulovada Sutta To Rahula at Ambalatthika

Introduction

A Sutta of fundamental importance to open the section on training as it deals with having no falsehood in oneself and constant reflexion upon what one does. With falsehood, a person tries to deceive himself and to deceive others. He has a tricky mind which will involve him in more and more trouble, for lies always make for complications. He need not even lie to others, it is enough just to falsify situations to oneself, to justify one's bad conduct so that the pricks of conscience (hiri) are blunted. If one wishes to train in Dhamma, which is the way of truth and straightforwardness, then it is no good to have such a deceiving mind and worse to speak words which may deceive others. Even in jest one should not speak untruth if one is aiming at the highest truth. On the basis of this truthfulness one's mindfulness can be established so that all actions of body, speech and mind can be examined, before one does them, while doing them, as well as after having completed them, to find out whether they are wholesome (profitable or kusala) or unwholesome (akusala). How does one know this? Whatever will be done, is being done or has been done, should be questioned: 'Does it lead to trouble for me, trouble for others, trouble for both?' If it is unwholesome it will 'ripen' into pain, that is, its fruit will be dukkha of mind or body. But if wholesome, then its fruit will be happiness (or pleasure, sukha) of mind and body. Looked at in this way, it is not difficult to know what should and what should not be done.

The Sutta (61)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the Squirrels' Sanctuary.

2. Now on that occasion the venerable Rāhula¹ was living at Ambalaṭṭhika. Then when it was evening the Blessed One rose from meditation, and went to the venerable Rāhula at Ambalaṭṭhika. The venerable Rāhula saw the Blessed One coming. When he saw him, he made a seat ready and set out water for washing the feet. The Blessed One sat down on the seat made ready, and he washed his feet. The venerable Rāhula paid homage to him and sat down at one side.

3. Then the Blessed One poured the little remaining quantity of water into the water-dipper, and he addressed the venerable Rāhula thus: 'Rāhula, do you see this little remaining quantity of water poured into the water-dipper?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'Unless people are careful not to speak falsehood knowingly, there is as little of the monk in them as this.'

4. Then the Blessed One threw away the little remaining water, and he addressed the venerable Rāhula thus: 'Rāhula, do you see that little remaining water thrown away?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'Unless people are careful not to speak falsehood knowingly, what there is of the monk in them is thrown away like that.'

5. Then the Blessed One turned the water-dipper upside down, and he addressed the venerable Rāhula thus: 'Rāhula, do you see this water-dipper turned upside down?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'Unless people are careful not to speak falsehood knowingly, what there is of the monk in them is turned upside down like that.'

6. Then the Blessed One turned the water-dipper right way up again,

1. The only son of Prince Siddhattha who later became the Buddha. He was given the Going-forth (as the first Sāmanera or novice) when seven years old and still young when this discourse was spoken to him.

and he addressed the venerable Rāhula thus: 'Rāhula, do you see this hollow, empty water dipper?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'Unless people are careful not to speak falsehood knowingly, what there is of the monk in them is as hollow and empty as that.'

7. 'Suppose there were a royal tusker elephant with tusks as long as chariot poles, full-grown in stature, highly bred, and well used to battles, and in a battle he used his fore feet and his hind feet and his fore quarters and his head and his ears and his tusks and his tail, and yet he kept his trunk back, then the man on his back would notice that, and he would think: "He has not yet given up his life to the king." But as soon as the royal tusker elephant . . . in battle uses his fore feet and his hind feet and his fore quarters and his hind quarters and his head and his ears and his tusks and his tail and his trunk, then the man on his back would notice that, and he would think: "He has given up his life to the king. There is nothing more (in training) now for the elephant to do"; so too, Rāhula, as long as anyone is not careful in speaking falsehood knowingly, I do not say that he has nothing more (in training) to do. Therefore, Rāhula, you should train thus: "I shall not utter a falsehood even in jest."

8. 'How do you conceive this, Rāhula; what is the purpose of a looking-glass?'

'For the purpose of reflexion, venerable sir.'

'So too, Rāhula, bodily kamma should be done with continual reflexion, verbal kamma should be done with continual reflexion, mental kamma should be done with continual reflexion.

9. 'When you desire to do any kamma by the body, that same bodily kamma should be reviewed thus: "This kamma that I desire to do by the body, would it lead to the affliction of myself or to the affliction of others or to the affliction of both, and so would it be unprofitable bodily kamma productive of pain and ripening in pain?" If, when you review it, you know thus: "This kamma that I desire to do by the body would lead to affliction of myself or the affliction of others or the affliction of both, and so it is unprofitable bodily kamma productive of pain and ripening in pain", then such kamma should not be done by the body at all. But if, when you review

it, you know thus: "This kamma that I desire to do with the body would not lead to the affliction of myself or to the affliction of others or to the affliction of both, and so it is profitable bodily kamma productive of pleasure and ripening in pleasure", then such bodily kamma can be done by the body.

10. 'Also when you are doing any kamma by the body, that same bodily kamma of yours should be reviewed thus: "This kamma that I am doing by the body, is it leading to the affliction of myself or to the affliction of others or to the affliction of both, and so is it unprofitable bodily kamma productive of pain and ripening in pain?" If when you review it, you know thus: "This kamma that I am doing by the body is leading to affliction of myself or to the affliction of others or to the affliction of both, and so it is unprofitable bodily kamma productive of pain and ripening in pain", then such bodily kamma should be suspended. But if, when you review it, you know thus: "This kamma that I am doing by the body is not leading to the affliction of myself or to the affliction of others or to the affliction of both, and so it is profitable bodily kamma productive of pleasure and resulting in pleasure", then such bodily kamma can be continued.

11. 'Also when you have done any kamma by the body, that same bodily kamma of yours should be reviewed thus: "This kamma that I have done by the body, does it lead to the affliction of myself, to the affliction of others or to the affliction of both, and so is it unprofitable bodily kamma productive of pain and ripening in pain?" If, when you know thus: "This kamma that I have done by the body leads to the affliction of myself, the affliction of others and to the affliction of both, and so it is unprofitable bodily kamma productive of pain and ripening in pain", then such bodily kamma of yours should be confessed and revealed and laid open by you to the Teacher or to wise companions in the life divine, and having done that, restraint should be undertaken for the future. But if, when you review it, you know thus: "This kamma done by the body does not lead to my own affliction or to the others' affliction or to the affliction of both, so it is profitable bodily kamma productive of pleasure, ripening to pleasure", then you can abide happy and glad as one who trains day and night in profitable dhammas.

12. 'When you desire to do any kamma by speech ... (complete as in para. 9, substituting 'speech' for 'body') ...
13. 'When you are doing any kamma by speech ... (complete as in para. 10, substituting 'speech' for 'body') ...
14. 'When you have done any kamma by speech ... (complete as in para. 11, substituting 'speech' for 'body') ...
15. 'When you desire to do any kamma by mind ... (complete as in para. 9, substituting 'mind' for 'body') ...
16. 'When you are doing any kamma by mind ... (complete as in para. 10, substituting 'mind' for 'body') ...
17. 'When you have done any kamma by mind ... (complete as in para. 11, substituting 'mind' for 'body') ...
18. 'Whatever monks and divines there have been in the past, who have purified their bodily, verbal and mental kamma, all of them have done so by continuously reviewing thus.
 'Whatever monks and divines there will be in the future, who will purify their bodily, verbal and mental kamma, all of them will do so by continuously reviewing thus.
 'Whatever monks and divines there are now, who are purifying their bodily, verbal and mental kamma, all of them do so by continuously reviewing thus.
 'Therefore, Rāhula, you should train thus: "We shall purify our bodily kamma and our verbal kamma and our mental kamma by continuous reviewing."'
- That is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Rāhula was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Kakacupama Sutta

The Simile of the Saw

Introduction

A Sutta on *patience* and *forbearance* full of interesting and memorable similes and stories. Each one of them should be considered carefully so that their full meaning is appreciated, especially with regard to one's own conduct. The story of Mistress Vedehikā and her maid Kāli is both amusing and instructive. Are we, like her, patient only when the going is good? Are we kind and gentle so long as we get no rough words from anyone, or while we are quite prosperous with nothing lacking? It is unexpected roughness of speech and hardships which are trials of our Dhamma-strength and will show us how deep Dhamma has permeated into our minds. Four similes (the great earth, drawing pictures on space, warming up the Ganges with a torch, and making a cured catskin bag crackle) follow which show what one's reaction should be to the five kinds of speech—'We shall abide with a mind of loving-kindness extending to that person, and we shall abide with an abundant, exalted, measureless mind of loving-kindness...'. In each of these similes some impossibility is pictured, and it will be just as impossible for someone with a measureless mind of loving-kindness, measureless as the great earth, space or the Ganges water, to become impatient or angry. People who come to annoy such a person would only 'reap weariness and disappointment'. Finally there is the famous simile of the saw and certainly if one can 'keep one's cool' when being dismembered, as the Bodhisatta did in his birth as the Preacher of Patience, one has reached the heights of patience founded on loving-kindness. This is the refrain which runs all through this Sutta: 'Now this is how you should train herein: "Our minds will remain unaffected and we shall utter no bad words, and we shall abide compassionate for welfare with a mind of loving-kindness and no inner hate".'

The Sutta (21)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park.

2. Now on that occasion the venerable Moliya Phagguna was associating over much with the bhikkhunis. He was associating so much with bhikkhunis that if any bhikkhu in his presence spoke dispraise of those bhikkhunis, he would be angry and displeased and would rebuke him, and if any bhikkhu in those bhikkhunis' presence spoke dispraise of the venerable Moliya Phagguna, they would be angry and displeased and would rebuke him, so much was the venerable Moliya Phagguna associating with bhikkhunis.

3. Then a certain bhikkhu went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he recounted what was taking place.

4. Then the Blessed One addressed a certain bhikkhu thus: 'Come, bhikkhu, tell the bhikkhu Moliya Phagguna in my name that the Teacher calls him.'

'Yes, venerable sir,' the bhikkhu replied and he went to the venerable Moliya Phagguna and told him: 'Friend, the Teacher calls you.'

'Yes, friend,' he replied, and he went to the Blessed One and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, the Blessed One asked him:

5. 'Phagguna, is it true, as it seems, that you are associating over much with bhikkhunis, that you are associating so much with bhikkhunis that if any bhikkhu in your presence speaks dispraise of those bhikkhunis, you are angry and displeased and rebuke him, and that if any bhikkhu in those bhikkhunis' presence speaks dispraise of you, they are angry and displeased and rebuke him, so much are you associating, it seems, with bhikkhunis?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'Phagguna, are you not a clansman who has gone forth out of faith from the home life into homelessness?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

6. 'Phagguna, it is not proper for you, as a clansman gone forth out of faith from the home life into homelessness to associate over much with bhikkhunis. Therefore if anyone in your presence speaks dispraise of those bhikkhunis you should abandon any wish and any thoughts based on the home life. And herein you should train thus: "My mind will be unaffected, and I shall utter no bad words, and I shall abide compassionate for welfare, with a mind of loving-kindness and no inner hate"; you should train thus, Phagguna.

'Therefore, if anyone in your presence gives those bhikkhunis a blow with his hand or a blow with a clod or a blow with a stick or a blow with a knife, you should abandon any wish and any thoughts based on the home life . . . you should train thus, Phagguna.

'Therefore, if anyone in your presence speaks dispraise, you should abandon . . . you should train thus, Phagguna.

'Therefore if anyone should give you a blow with the hand . . . with a clod . . . a stick . . . a knife, you should abandon any wish and any thoughts based on the home life. And herein you should train thus: "My mind will be unaffected, and I shall utter no bad words, and I shall abide compassionate for welfare, with a mind of loving-kindness and no inner hate"; you should train thus, Phagguna.

7. Then the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus, there was an occasion when the bhikkhus satisfied my mind. I addressed the bhikkhus thus: "Bhikkhus, I eat food at a single sitting. By doing so I perceive little affliction, little ailment, and also lightness, strength and a comfortable abiding". And I had no need to keep on instructing those bhikkhus: I had only to arouse mindfulness in them.

'Suppose there were a chariot on even ground at the four crossroads, harnessed to thoroughbreds, waiting with whips lying ready, so that a skilled trainer, driver of horses to be tamed, might mount, and, taking the reins in his hand, drive out and back by any road in any way he liked, so too I had no need . . . I had only to arouse mindfulness in them.

8. 'Therefore, bhikkhus, abandon what is unprofitable and devote yourselves to what is profitable, for that is how you will come to growth, increase and fulfilment in this Dhamma and Discipline.

'Suppose there were a big sala-tree grove near a village or town, and it was choked with castor-oil weeds, and some man appeared, seeking

its benefit, its surcease of bondage, and he cut down and threw out the crooked saplings that robbed the sap, and he cleaned up the interior of the grove, and he tended the straight well-formed saplings, so that the sāla-tree grove later on came to growth, increase and fulfilment; so too, bhikkhus, abandon what is unprofitable . . . fulfilment in this Dhamma and Discipline.

9. 'Formerly, bhikkhus, in this same Sāvatti there was a housewife called Vedehikā. And the good name of Mistress Vedehikā had spread thus: "Mistress Vedehikā is kind, Mistress Vedehikā is gentle, Mistress Vedehikā is demure".

'Now Mistress Vedehikā had a maid called Kāli, who was clever, nimble and neat in her work.

'The maid Kāli thought: "My lady's good name has spread thus: 'Mistress Vedehikā is kind, Mistress Vedehikā is gentle, Mistress Vedehikā is demure'. How is it, now, while she does not show anger, is it nevertheless actually present in herself, or is it absent? Or else is it just because my work is neat that my lady shows no anger though it is actually present in herself? Suppose I test my lady?"

'So the maid Kāli got up when it was day. Then Mistress Vedehikā said: "Hey, Kāli!"

"What is it, madam?"

"What is the matter that you get up when it is day?"

"Nothing is the matter, madam."

"Nothing is the matter, you wicked girl, yet you get up when it is day!" and she was angry and displeased, and she scowled.

'Then the maid Kāli (thought:) "The fact is that while my lady does not show anger, it is actually present in herself, not absent; and it is just because my work is neat that my lady shows no anger though it is actually present in herself, not absent. Suppose I test my lady a little more?"

'So the maid Kāli got up when it was later in the day. Then Mistress Vedehikā said: "Hey, Kāli!"

"What is it, madam?"

"What is the matter that you get up when it is day?"

“Nothing is the matter, madam.”

“Nothing is the matter, you wicked girl, yet you get up when it is day!” and she was angry and displeased, and she spoke words of displeasure.

Then the maid Kāli (thought:) “The fact is that while my lady does not show anger, it is actually present in herself, not absent; and it is just because my work is neat that my lady shows no anger though it is actually present in herself not absent. Suppose I test my lady a little more?”

So the maid Kāli got up when it was still later in the day. Then Mistress Vedehikā said: “Hey, Kāli!”

“What is it, madam?”

“What is the matter that you get up when it is day?”

“Nothing is the matter, madam.”

“Nothing is the matter, you wicked girl, yet you get up later in the day!” and she was angry and displeased, and she took a rolling-pin and gave her a blow and broke her head.

Then the maid Kāli, with blood running from her broken head, denounced (her mistress) to the neighbours: “See, ladies, the Kind One’s work! See, ladies, the Gentle One’s work! See, ladies, the Demure One’s work! See how angry and displeased she was with her only maid for getting up when it was day, and how she took a rolling-pin and gave her a blow on the head!”

Then later on the bad name of Mistress Vedehikā spread thus: “Mistress Vedehikā is rough, Mistress Vedehikā is violent, Mistress Vedehikā is merciless.”

10. ‘So too, bhikkhus, some bhikkhu is quite kind, quite gentle, quite demure, so long as no disagreeable words touch him. But it is as soon as disagreeable words touch him that a bhikkhu needs to appear kind and gentle and demure. I do not call a bhikkhu easy to correct, who is only easy to correct by reason of the robes, alms-food, resting-place, and the requisite of medicine as cure for the sick, that he gets. Why is that? Because that bhikkhu is not easy to correct when he gets no robes, alms-food, resting-place, and the requisite of medicine as cure for the sick.

‘But when a bhikkhu is easy to correct since he honours, respects and reveres only the Dhamma, him I call easy to correct. Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train thus: “We shall be easy to correct, honouring, respecting and revering only the Dhamma”; you should train thus.

11. ‘Bhikkhus, there are these five courses of speech that others may use when they address you: their speech may be timely or untimely, true or untrue, gentle or harsh, connected with good or with harm, accompanied by a mind of loving-kindness or by inner hate.

12. ‘When others address you, their speech may be timely or untimely; when others address you, their speech may be true or untrue; when others address you, their speech may be gentle or harsh; when others address you, their speech may be connected with good or with harm; when others address you, their speech may be accompanied by a mind of loving-kindness or by inner hate. Herein, bhikkhus, you should train thus: “Our minds will remain unaffected, and we shall utter no bad words and we shall abide compassionate for welfare with a mind of loving-kindness and no inner hate. We shall abide with a mind of loving-kindness extending to that person, and we shall abide with an abundant, exalted, measureless mind of loving-kindness, without hostility or ill-will, extending over the all-encompassing world (universe) as its supporting object.” That is how you should train.

13. ‘Bhikkhus, suppose a man came with a hoe and a basket and said: “I shall make this Great Earth to be without earth” and he dug here and there, and strewed here and there, and spat here and there, and made water here and there, saying: “Be without earth, be without earth”. How do you conceive this, bhikkhus, would that man make this Great Earth to be without earth?’

‘No, venerable sir. Why is that? Because this Great Earth is deep and immense: it cannot possibly be made to be without earth thus. Eventually the man would reap weariness and disappointment.’

14. ‘So too, bhikkhus, there are these five courses of speech . . . (repeat para. 11) . . . or by inner hate.

15. ‘Herein, bhikkhus, you should train thus: “Our minds will be unaffect-

ed... (repeat para. 12) ... as its supporting object. You should train thus.

16. 'Bhikkhus, suppose a man came with (crimson-) lake or turmeric or indigo or cramine and said: "I shall draw pictures, I shall make pictures appear, on this empty space". How do you conceive this, bhikkhus, would that man draw pictures, would he make pictures appear, on that empty space?'

'No, venerable sir. Why is that? Because that empty space is formless and invisible; he cannot possibly draw pictures, make pictures appear there thus. Eventually the man would reap weariness and disappointment.'

17. 'So too, bhikkhus, there are these five courses of speech ... inner hate.

18. 'Herein, bhikkhus ... you should train thus.

19. 'Suppose bhikkhus, a man came with a burning grass-torch and said: "I shall warm up, I shall heat up, the River Ganges with this burning grass-torch". How do you conceive this, bhikkhus, would that man warm up, would he heat up, the River Ganges with the burning grass-torch?'

'No, venerable sir. Why is that? Because the River Ganges is deep and immense; it cannot possibly be warmed up, heated up, with a burning grass-torch. Eventually the man would reap weariness and disappointment.'

20. 'So too, bhikkhus, there are these five courses of speech ... inner hate.

21. 'Herein, bhikkhus ... you should train thus.

22. 'Bhikkhus, suppose there were a cat (-skin) bag that was rubbed, well-rubbed, thoroughly well-rubbed, soft, silky, rid of rustling, rid of crackling, and a man came with a stick or a potsherd and said: "There is this cat (-skin) bag that is rubbed ... and rid of crackling: I shall make it rustle, I shall make it crackle". How do you conceive this, bhikkhus, would that man make it rustle or make it crackle with the stick or the potsherd?'

'No, venerable sir. Why is that? Because that cat (-skin) bag, being

rubbed . . . rid of crackling, cannot possibly be made to rustle or made to crackle with the stick or the potsherd. Eventually that man would reap weariness and disappointment.'

23. 'So too, bhikkhus, there are these five courses of speech . . . inner hate.

24. 'Herein, bhikkhus . . . you should train thus.

25. 'Even were bandits savagely to sever you limb from limb with a two-handled saw, he who entertained hate in his heart on that account would not be one who carried out my teaching. Now this is how you should train herein: "Our minds will remain unaffected, and we shall utter no bad words, and we shall abide compassionate for welfare with a mind of loving-kindness and no inner hate. We shall abide with a mind of loving-kindness extending to that person, and we shall abide with an abundant, exalted, mind of loving-kindness, without hostility or ill-will, extending over the all-encompassing world as its supporting object." That is how you should train yourselves.

26. 'And, bhikkhus, you should keep this instruction of the Simile of the Saw constantly in mind.

'Bhikkhus, do you see the course of speech, trivial or gross, that you could not endure?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'Therefore, bhikkhus, you should keep this instruction of the Simile of the Saw constantly in mind. That will be long for your welfare and happiness.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 7. See Sutta 65, para. 2. (not in this selection). *odhastā*—lying ready: P.T.S. Dict. gives only 'fallen down, scattered' which is wrong in this context and conflicts with the Comy. Cf. M. vol iii, 97.

para. 8. *tacchetvā*—cut down; see Sutta 5, para. 31. (not in this selection)

para. 9. *aggulasūci*--rendered here as 'rolling-pin' though it might be a bar for a door-fastening.

para. 13. *yāvādeva ca pana so puriso kilamathassa vighātassa bhāgī assa*—eventually this man would reap weariness and disappointment: the phrase recurs at M. vol. i, 241 and elsewhere in the Suttas. The use of *yāvādeva* is idiomatic.

para. 25. *corā carakā*—bandits savagely: cf. same phrase at Samyutta no. III, I. Alternative rendering: 'Even if common bandits.'

Maha Sakuludayi Sutta To Sakuludayin-1

Introduction

In this long Sutta we learn first why the Buddha is not respected—for five quite minor ascetic practices—and then why he is respected: for five aspects of Dhamma. It seems as though the Buddha had something of a reputation among the wanderers for even if they knew nothing of his Dhamma still they could observe the conduct of his disciples, specially when Dhamma was being taught. Their assemblies are always pictured as riotous—‘very clamorous and noisy’ talking about all sorts of worldly things and it must have been surprising for them to observe the Sangha, the bhikkhus all seated in due order of ‘age’ (from ordination), silent and attentive. (Such Sanghas of bhikkhus may still be seen in the forest monasteries of Thailand). Briefly the five categories of Dhamma for which the Buddha is revered by his disciples are:

- i. the Higher Virtue (adhisila)
- ii. knowledge and vision (ñāṇadassana)
- iii. the higher understanding (adhipaññā)
- iv. the Four Noble Truths (ariyasacca)
- v. the way to develop profitable dhammas.

The last section is actually nineteen different methods for development in Dhamma.

The Sutta (77)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the Squirrels’ Sanctuary.

2. Now on that occasion many very well-known wanderers were staying at Wanderers' Park, the Peacocks' Sanctuary, that is to say Anugāra, Varadhara, and the wanderer Sakuḷudāyin, as well as many other well-known wanderers.

3. Then when it was morning, the Blessed One dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Rājagaha for alms. Then he thought: 'It is still too early to wander for alms in Rājagaha. Suppose I went to Sakuḷudāyin in the Wanderers' Park, the Peacocks' Sanctuary?'

4. Then the Blessed One went to Sakuḷudāyin in the Wanderers' Park, the Peacocks' Sanctuary. Now on that occasion the wanderer Sakuḷudāyin was seated with a large assembly of wanderers who were shouting, very clamorous and noisy, talking many kinds of vulgar talk, such as talk of kings . . . (and so on as in Sutta 76, para. 4) . . . Then the wanderers were silent.

5. The Blessed One went to Sakuḷudāyin the wanderer, who said to him: 'Let the Blessed One come, venerable sir, welcome to the Blessed One; it is long since the Blessed One made an occasion to come here. Let the Blessed One be seated; this seat is ready.'

The Blessed One sat down on the seat made ready and Sakuḷudāyin took another lower seat and sat down at one side. When he had done so, the Blessed One asked him: 'For what talk are you gathered here now, Udāyin, and what was your talk meanwhile which was left unfinished?'

6. 'Let it be, venerable sir, let the discussion for which we are now gathered here be. The Blessed One can well hear about that later, venerable sir. In recent days, venerable sir, when monks and divines of various sects have been gathered together and seated in the debating hall, this topic has arisen: It is gain for the people of Aṅga and Magadha, it is great gain for the people of Aṅga and Magadha that these monks and divines, heads of orders, heads of groups and teachers of groups, renowned and famous ford-makers,¹ regarded by most as saints, have come to spend the Rains at Rājagaha. There is this Purāṇa Kas-

1. Those teachers who were thought by people to be capable of leading others across the 'river' of saṁsāra (the wandering-on from life to life). See simile of the cowherd, Sutta 34.

sapa, head of an order, head of a group and teacher of a group, a renowned and famous ford-maker, regarded by most as a saint: he has come to spend the Rains at Rājagaha. There is also this Makkhali Gosāla . . . There is also this Ajita Kesakambalin . . . There is also this Pakudhe Kaccāyana . . . There is also this Sañjaya Belatṭhiputta . . . There is also this Niganṭha Nātaputta, head of an order, head of a group and teacher of a group, a renowned and famous ford-maker, regarded by most as a saint: he too has come to spend the Rains at Rājagaha. There is also this monk Gotama, head of an order, head of a group and teacher of a group, a renowned and famous ford-maker, regarded by most as a saint: he too has come to spend the Rains at Rājagaha. Now among these heads of orders, heads of groups, and teachers of groups, renowned and famous ford-makers, regarded by most as saints, who is honoured, respected, revered and venerated by his disciples, and how honouring and respecting him do they live in dependence on him? Thereupon some said thus: "This Purāna Kassapa is head of an order, head of a group, and teacher of a group, a renowned and famous ford-maker regarded by most as a saint, yet he is not honoured, respected, revered and venerated by his disciples, nor do his disciples live in dependence on him, honouring and respecting him. It has happened that Purāna Kassapa was teaching Dhamma to a following of several hundreds. Then a certain disciple of his made a noise thus: 'Sirs, do not ask Purāna Kassapa this question. He does not know that. We know that. Ask us that question. We will answer that for you, sirs.' It has happened that Purāna Kassapa, though waving his arms and lamenting: 'Be quiet, sirs, make no noise, sirs. They are asking us. We will answer them', did not get his way. Indeed many of his disciples left him after proving his assertions wrong: 'You do not know this Dhamma and Discipline. I know this Dhamma and Discipline. How shall you know this Dhamma and Discipline! Your way is wrong. My way is right. I am consistent. You are inconsistent. What should have been said first, you said after. What should have been said after, you said first. What you had so carefully considered has been overturned. Your assertion is proved wrong. You are refuted. Try and retrieve yourself if you can!' So Purāna Kassapa is not honoured or respected or revered or venerated by his disciples, nor do his disciples live in dependence on him, honouring and respecting him; indeed he is scorned by the scorning of his Dhamma."

And some said thus: "This Makkhali Gosāla is head of an order . . . scorned by the scorning of his Dhamma." And some said thus: "This Ajita Kesakambalin . . ." "This Pakudha Kaccayana . . ." "This Sañjaya Belatthiputta . . ." "This Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta is head of an order . . . scorned by the scorning of his Dhamma." And some said thus: "This monk Gotama is head of an order, head of a group, and teacher of a group, renowned and famous ford-maker regarded by most as a saint, and he is honoured, respected, revered and venerated by his disciples, and his disciples live in dependence on him, honouring him and respecting him. It has happened that the monk Gotama was teaching Dhamma to a following of several hundreds, and there a certain disciple of his cleared his throat. Thereupon one of his companions in the life divine nudged him with his knee, (saying:) 'Quiet, venerable sir, make no noise; the Master is teaching the Dhamma.' When the monk Gotama is teaching the Dhamma to a following of several hundreds, there is no sound of the Blessed One's disciples' hawking or clearing their throats. For then that following is poised in expectancy: 'Let us hear the Dhamma the Blessed One is about to teach.' Just as though a man were at the four crossroads pressing out pure honey and a group of people were poised in expectancy, so too, when the monk Gotama is teaching . . . 'Let us hear the Dhamma the Blessed One is about to teach.' And even those disciples of his who fall out with their companions in the life divine and forsake the training to return to what they had abandoned—even they praise the Master and the Dhamma and the Sangha, they blame themselves instead of others, (saying:) 'We were unlucky, we have little merit; for though we went forth into homelessness thus with a well-proclaimed Dhamma, we were unable to live for a lifetime the life divine in perfect purity', and having become monastery attendants or lay followers, they keep the five precepts. That is how the monk Gotama is honoured, respected, revered and venerated by his disciples and how they live in dependence on him, honouring and respecting him."

7. 'But, Udāyin, how many dhammas do you see in me on account of which my disciples honour, respect, revere and venerate me and live in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me?'

8. 'Venerable sir, I see five dhammas in the Blessed One which are

reasons why his disciples honour, respect, revere and venerate him and live in dependence on him, honouring and respecting him. What five? First, venerable sir, the Blessed One eats little and commends eating little. And this I see as the first dhamma which is a reason why his disciples honour, respect, revere and venerate him and live in dependence on him, honouring and respecting him. Again, venerable sir, the Blessed One is content with any kind of robe and commends contentment with any kind of robe. And this I see as the second dhamma . . . Again, venerable sir, the Blessed One is content with any kind of alms-food. And this I see as the third dhamma . . . Again, venerable sir, the Blessed One is content with any kind of resting place and he commends contentment with any kind of resting place. And this I see as the fourth dhamma . . . Again, venerable sir, the Blessed One is secluded and he commends seclusion. And this I see as the fifth dhamma . . . Venerable sir, these are the five dhammas in the Blessed One which I see as reasons why his disciples honour, respect, revere and venerate him and live in dependence on him, honouring and respecting him.'

9. 'Suppose, Udāyin, a reason why my disciples honoured, respected, revered and venerated me and lived in dependence on me, honouring and revering me, were (as you say, the thought:) "The monk Gotama eats little and commends eating little." Now there are disciples of mine who live on a cupful or on half a cupful or a bilva fruit or on half a bilva fruit,² while I occasionally eat the full contents of my bowl or even more. But if the reason were what you suppose, then disciples of mine such as these would not honour me for that reason. Suppose, Udāyin, a reason why my disciples honoured, respected, revered and venerated me and lived in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me were, (as you say, the thought:) "The monk Gotama is content with any kind of robe and commends contentment with any kind of robe." Now there are disciples of mine who as refuse-rag-wearers, wearers of coarse robes, collect rags from charnel grounds or rubbish heaps or shops

2. In 'The Entrance to the Vinaya' Vol. II, p 32-33 (Mahāmakut Press, Bangkok), it is explained that kosa (here translated 'cupful') is the name of the fruit of *Hydnocarpus anthelmintica*, just as bila is the name of the Indian 'bael' or Sinhalese 'beli'. It is further explained that disciples live on amounts of food equal to these fruits, not on the fruits themselves.

and make patched outer robes of them to wear, while I occasionally wear robes given by householders so fine that pumpkin hair³ is coarse in comparison. But if the reason were what you suppose, then disciples of mine such as these would not honour me for that reason. Suppose, Udāyin, the reason why my disciples honoured, respected, revered and venerated me and lived in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me were, (as you say, the thought): "The monk Gotama is content with any kind of alms-food and commends contentment with any kind of alms-food." Now there are disciples of mine who as alms-food-eaters go from house to house and, preferring the duty of gleaning, will not consent when invited to sit down, while I occasionally eat on invitation fine rice with the dark grains picked out and many sauces and curries. But if the reason were what you suppose, then disciples of mine such as these would not honour me for that reason. Suppose, Udāyin, the reason why my disciples honoured, respected, revered and venerated me and lived in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me were, (as you say, the thought): "The monk Gotama is content with any kind of resting place and commends contentment with any kind of resting place." Now there are disciples of mine who as tree-root-dwellers and open-air-dwellers do not use a roof for eight months (in the year⁴) while I occasionally live in gabled mansions plastered within and without, ceiled, secured by bars and with shuttered windows. But if the reason were what you suppose, then disciples of mine such as these would not honour me for that reason. Suppose, Udāyin, a reason why my disciples honoured, respected, revered and venerated me and lived in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me were, (as you say, the thought): "The monk Gotama is secluded and commends seclusion." Now there are disciples of mine who as forest-dwellers live in retirement in remote jungle-thicket resting places, returning to the Sangha's midst once each half-month for the recitation of the Pāṭimokkha (Rules), while I occasionally live surrounded by bhikkhus, bhikkhunis, laymen followers, laywomen followers, kings, king's ministers, (other) sectarians, and (other) sectarians' disciples. But if the reason were what you suppose, then disciples of

4. This is literally what the Pāli says, possibly the meaning is the very fine fibres of some species of gourd?

5. During the four months of the Rains residence bhikkhus must have a shelter with roof, four walls and a door.

mine such as these would not honour me for that reason. So, Udāyin, these five dhammas are not reasons why my disciples honour, respect, revere and venerate me and live in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me.

10. 'However, Udāyin, there are five other dhammas, which are reasons why my disciples honour, respect, revere and venerate me and live in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me. What are the five ?

(I. The Higher Virtue)

11. 'Here, Udāyin, my disciples esteem me for the Higher Virtue thus: "The monk Gotama has virtue, the Virtue Aggregate is perfect in him." This is the first dhamma on account of which my disciples honour, respect, revere and venerate me and live in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me.

(II. Knowledge And Vision)

12. 'Again, my disciples esteem me for outstanding Knowledge and Vision thus: "Only when knowing, the monk Gotama says 'I know'; only when seeing, he says 'I see'; he teaches the Dhamma from direct knowledge, not without direct knowledge; he teaches the Dhamma with its origins, not without origin⁵; he teaches the Dhamma with its marvels, not without marvels⁶." This is the second dhamma on account of which my disciples honour . . . me.

(III. The Higher Understanding)

13. 'Again my disciples esteem me for the Higher Understanding thus: "The monk Gotama has understanding: the Understanding Aggregate is perfect in him. That he should not foresee a future logical consequence of an assertion, and that he should not be able rightly to confute others' assertions—that is not possible." How do you conceive this, Udāyin, would my disciples knowing and seeing thus interrupt me?'

5. That is, everything taught by the Buddha arose out of a causal occasion and was taught with reference to mental states, persons, places, etc.

6. The word translated 'marvels' is difficult to render into English and the Dhamma is marvellous because it is meaningful and therefore convincing, two other meanings of this word which have to be borne in mind.

'No, venerable sir.'

'I do not expect instruction from my disciples: on the contrary, my disciples expect instruction from me. This is third dhamma on account of which my disciples honour . . . me.

(IV. The Four Noble Truths)

14. 'Again, when victims of suffering, at the mercy of suffering, through some form of suffering, my disciples come and question me about the Noble Truth of suffering. Being questioned, I reply. My reply interests them. They question me about the Noble Truth of the origin of suffering . . . about the Noble Truth of the cessation of suffering . . . about the Noble Truth of the way leading to the cessation of suffering. Being questioned, I reply. My reply interests them. This is the fourth dhamma on account of which my disciples honour . . . me.

(V. The Way to Develop Profitable Dhammas)

1. The Four Foundations of Mindfulness

15. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop the four Foundations of Mindfulness. Here a bhikkhu abides contemplating the body as a body, ardent, fully aware and mindful, having put away covetousness and grief for the world. He abides contemplating feelings as feelings . . . He abides contemplating mind as mind . . . He abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas, ardent, fully aware and mindful, having put away covetousness and grief for the world. And thereby many disciples of mine have reached the consummation, the perfection, of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

2. The Four Right Endeavours

16. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop the four Right Endeavours. Here a bhikkhu arouses zeal for the non-arising of unarisen evil unprofitable dhammas, for which he makes efforts, arouses energy, exerts his mind and endeavours. He arouses zeal for the abandoning of arisen evil unprofitable dhammas . . . He arouses zeal for the arising of unarisen profitable dhammas . . . He arouses zeal for the continuance, non-disappearance, strengthening, increase, development

and perfection of arisen profitable dhammas, for which he makes efforts, arouses energy, exerts his mind and endeavours. And thereby many disciples of mine have reached the consummation, the perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

3. The Four Bases for Success

17. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop four Bases for Success. Here a bhikkhu develops the basis for success that possesses both concentration due to zeal (desire-to-act) and the volitional formation of endeavour. He develops the basis for success that possesses both concentration due to energy and the volitional formation of endeavour. He develops the basis for success that possesses both concentration due to (purity of) mind and the volitional formation of endeavour. He develops the basis for success that possesses both the concentration due to inquiry and the volitional formation of endeavour. And thereby many disciples of mine have reached the consummation, the perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

4. The Five Faculties

18. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop five Faculties. Here a bhikkhu develops the faith faculty, which leads to peace, leads to full enlightenment. He develops the energy faculty... the mindfulness faculty... the concentration faculty... the understanding faculty which leads to peace, leads to full enlightenment. And thereby many disciples of mine have reached the consummation, the perfection, of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

5. The Five Powers

19. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop five Powers. Here a bhikkhu develops the faith power, which leads to peace, leads to full enlightenment. He develops the energy power... the mindfulness power... the concentration power... the understanding power, which leads to peace, leads to full enlightenment. And thereby... perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

6. The Seven Enlightenment Factors

20. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop seven Enlightenment Factors. Here a bhikkhu develops the mindfulness enlightenment factor, which has seclusion, fading out, and cessation for its support and changes to relinquishment. He develops the investigation-of-dhammas enlightenment factor . . . the energy enlightenment factor . . . the happiness enlightenment factor . . . the tranquillity enlightenment factor . . . the concentration enlightenment factor . . . He develops the equanimity enlightenment factor, which has seclusion, fading out, and cessation for its support and changes to relinquishment. And thereby . . . perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

7. The Noble Eightfold Path

21. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop the Noble Eightfold Path. Here a bhikkhu develops right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration. And thereby . . . perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

8. The Eight Liberations

22. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop eight Liberations. Possessed of form, he sees instances of form: this is the first liberation. Unpercipient of form in himself, he sees instances of form externally: this is the second liberation. He is resolved upon only the Beautiful: this is the third liberation. With the complete surmounting of perceptions of form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, with non-attention to perceptions of difference, (aware that) "space is infinite", he enters upon and abides in the base consisting of infinity of space: this is the fourth liberation. By completely surmounting the base consisting of space, (aware that) "consciousness is infinite", he enters upon and abides in the base consisting of infinity of consciousness: this is the fifth liberation. By completely surmounting the base consisting of infinity of consciousness, (aware that) "there is nothing", he enters upon and abides in the base consisting of nothingness: this is the sixth liberation. By completely surmounting the base consisting of nothingness, he enters upon and abides in the base consisting of neither-perception-

nor-non-perception: this is the seventh liberation. By completely surmounting the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, he enters upon and abides in the cessation of perception and feeling. This is the eighth liberation. And thereby . . . perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

9. The Eight Bases for Transcendence

23. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop eight Bases for Transcendence. Percipient of form in himself, one sees instances of form externally, limited and fair or ugly; it is by transcending them that he perceives thus: "I know, I see." This is the first base for transcendence. Percipient of form in himself, one sees instances of form externally, measureless and fair or ugly; it is by transcending them that he perceives thus: "I know, I see." This is the second base for transcendence. Unpercipient of form in himself, one sees instances of form externally, limited and fair or ugly; it is by transcending them that he perceives thus: "I know, I see." This is the third base for transcendence. Unpercipient of form in himself, one sees instances of form externally, measureless and fair or ugly; it is by transcending them that he perceives thus: "I know, I see." This is the fourth base for transcendence. Unpercipient of form in himself, one sees instances of form externally, blue, of blue colour, visible as blue, with blue luminosity. Just as a flax flower which is blue, of blue colour, visible as blue, with blue luminosity, or just as Benares cloth smoothed on both sides which is blue, of blue colour, visible as blue, with blue luminosity, so too, unpercipient of form in himself . . . with blue luminosity: it is by transcending them that he perceives thus: "I know, I see." This is the fifth base for transcendence. Unpercipient of form in himself, one sees instances of form externally, yellow, of yellow colour, visible as yellow, with yellow luminosity. Just as a kannikāra flower which is yellow, of yellow colour, visible as yellow, with yellow luminosity, or just as Benares cloth smoothed on both sides, which is yellow, of yellow colour, visible as yellow, with yellow luminosity, so too, unpercipient of form . . . with yellow luminosity; it is by transcending them that he perceives thus: "I know, I see." This is the sixth base for transcendence. Unpercipient of form in himself, one sees instances of form externally, red, of red colour,

visible as red, with red luminosity. Just as a hibiscus flower which is red, of red colour, visible as red, with red luminosity, or just as Benares cloth smoothed on both sides, which is red, of red colour, visible as red, with red luminosity, so too, unpercipient of form . . . with red luminosity; it is by transcending them that he perceives thus: "I know, I see." This is the seventh base for transcendence. Unpercipient of form in himself, one sees instances of form externally, white, of white colour, visible as white, with white luminosity, just as the Healing Star⁷ which is white, of white colour, visible as white, with white luminosity, or just as Benares cloth smoothed on both sides, which is white, of white colour, visible as white, with white luminosity, so too, unpercipient of form . . . with white luminosity; it is by transcending them that he perceives thus: "I know, I see." This is the eighth base for transcendence. And thereby . . . perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

10. The Ten Wholenesses (Kasiṇa)⁸

24. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop the ten bases of wholeness (totality).

'One contemplates earth as a wholeness above, below and around, absolute and measureless.

'Another contemplates water as a wholeness . . .

'Another contemplates fire as a wholeness . . .

'Another contemplates air as a wholeness . . .

'Another contemplates blue as a wholeness . . .

'Another contemplates red as a wholeness . . .

'Another contemplates white as a wholeness . . .

'Another contemplates space as a wholeness . . .

'Another contemplates consciousness as a wholeness above, below, and around, absolute and measureless. And thereby . . . perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

11. The Four Jhānas

25. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to develop the four jhānas.

7. The Morning Star, or Venus.

8. Also translated by the author as 'Totality'.

'Here, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the first jhāna, which is accompanied by initial and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of seclusion.

'He makes happiness and pleasure born of seclusion drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, so that there is nothing of this whole body to which happiness and pleasure born of seclusion do not extend. Just as a skilled bathman's apprentice heaps bath-powder in a metal basin and, sprinkling it gradually with water, kneads it up till the moisture wets his ball of bath-powder, soaks it, extends over it, within and without, while it does not itself become liquid, so too, the bhikkhu makes happiness and pleasure born of seclusion drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, so that there is nothing of this whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of seclusion do not extend.

26. 'Again, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application he enters upon and abides in the second jhāna, which has self-confidence and singleness of mind without initial application, without sustained application, with happiness and (bodily) pleasure born of concentration.

'He makes happiness and pleasure born of concentration drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of concentration do not extend. Just as though there were a lake whose waters welled up (from below), having no inflow from east, west, north or south, nor yet replenished from time to time by the skies with showers, then the cool fount of water welling up in the lake would make the cool water drench, steep, fill and extend throughout the lake, and there would be nothing of the whole lake to which the cool water did not extend, so too, the bhikkhu makes happiness and pleasure born of concentration drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, so that there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of concentration do not extend.

27. 'Again, with the fading as well of happiness he abides in equanimity and mindful and fully aware, still feeling pleasure with the body, he enters upon and abides in the third jhāna, on account of which the Noble

Ones announce: "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful."

'He makes pleasure divested of happiness drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the pleasure divested of happiness does not extend. Just as, in a water-lily pond or a white lotus pond or a red lotus pond, some waterlilies or white lotuses or red lotuses are born under the water, grow under the water, do not stand up out of the water, flourish immersed under the water, and cool water drenches, steeps, fills and extends throughout them, to their tips and to their roots, and there is nothing of the whole of those water lilies, those white lotuses, those red lotuses, to which the cool water does not extend, so too the bhikkhu makes pleasure divested of happiness drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which pleasure divested of happiness does not extend.

28. 'Again, with the abandoning of bodily pleasure and pain, with the previous disappearance of joy and grief, he enters upon and abides in the fourth jhāna, which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure, and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.

'He sits with a pure bright mind extending over this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the pure bright mind does not extend. Just as though a man were sitting clothed from head to foot in white cloth, and there were nothing of his whole body to which the white cloth did not extend, so too, the bhikkhu sits with a pure bright mind extending over this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the pure bright mind does not extend.

'And thereby . . . perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

12. Insight Knowledge

29. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to understand, thus: "This my body has form, consists of the four great elements, is procreated by a mother and father, is built up out of boiled rice and bread, it has the nature of impermanence, of being worn and rubbed away, of dissolution and disintegration" and thus: "my consciousness has that for its support and is bound up with it. Just as though there were a beautiful beryl gem of purest water, eight-faceted, well-cut, clear and

limpid, possessed of all the (requisite) qualities, and through it is threaded a blue, yellow, red, white or brown thread, so that a man with good sight, taking it in his hand might review it thus: 'This is a beautiful beryl gem of purest water, eight-faceted, well-cut, clear and limpid, possessed of all the (requisite) qualities, and through it is threaded a blue, yellow, red, white or brown thread', so too, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to understand thus: "This my body . . . my consciousness has that for its support and is bound up with it."

'And thereby . . . perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

13. The Mind-Made Body

30. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to create from this body another body having form, mind-made, with all its limbs, lacking no faculty. Just as though a man pulled out a reed from its sheath and thought thus: "This is the sheath, this is the reed; the sheath is one, the reed is another; it is from the sheath that the reed has been pulled out"; or just as though a man pulled out a sword from its scabbard and thought thus: "This is the sword, this is the scabbard; the sword is one, the scabbard another; it is from the scabbard that the sword has been pulled out"; or just as though a man pulled a snake out of its slough and thought thus: 'This is the snake, this is the slough; the snake is one, the slough another; it is from the slough that the snake has been pulled out"; so too, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to create from this body another body having form, mind-made, with all its limbs, lacking no faculty.

'And thereby . . . the perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

14. The Kinds of Supernormal Success

31. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to wield the various kinds of supernormal success: having been one, they are many; having been many, they are one; they appear and vanish; they go unhindered through walls, through enclosures, through mountains, as though in space; they dive in and out of earth as though in water; they go on unbroken water as though on earth; seated crosslegged they travel in space like winged birds; with their hands they touch and stroke the moon and sun so mighty and powerful; they wield bodily mastery even as far as the

world of the Divinity (Brahmā). Just as a skilled potter or his apprentice might make, might create, out of well-prepared clay whatever shape of pot he wished; or just as a skilled ivory-worker or his apprentice might make, might create, out of well-prepared ivory whatever ivory work of art he wished; or just as a skilled goldsmith or his apprentice might make, might create out of well-prepared gold whatever gold work of art he wished, so too, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to wield the various kinds of supernormal success . . . they wield bodily mastery even as far as the world of the Divinity (Brahmā).

‘And thereby . . . the perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

15. The Heavenly Ear-Element

32. ‘Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to hear with the heavenly ear-element, which is purified and surpasses the human, both kinds of sounds, the heavenly and the human, those that are far as well as near. Just as though a vigorous hornblower might make himself heard without difficulty in the four directions, so too, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to hear . . . far as well as near.

‘And thereby . . . the perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

16. Encompassing of Mind

33. ‘Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to understand by encompassing with mind the mind of other beings, of other persons. They understand mind affected by lust as affected by lust, mind unaffected by lust as unaffected by lust; they understand mind affected by hate as affected by hate, mind unaffected by hate as unaffected by hate; they understand mind affected by delusion as affected by delusion, mind unaffected by delusion as unaffected by delusion; they understand the contracted mind as contracted and the distracted mind as distracted; they understand the exalted mind as exalted, the unexalted mind as unexalted; they understand the surpassed mind as surpassed, and the unsurpassed mind as unsurpassed; they understand the concentrated mind as concentrated, and the unconcentrated mind as unconcentrated; they understand the liberated mind as liberated and the unliberated mind as unliberated. Just as a woman—or a man—young, youthful, fond of finery, on regarding the image of her own face in a clean, bright looking-glass or in a bowl of

clear water would know if there were a spot thus: "There is a spot", or would know if there were no spot thus: "There is no spot", so too, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to understand . . . and unliberated mind as unliberated.

'And thereby . . . the perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

17. Recollection of Past Life

34. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to recollect their manifold past life, that is to say one birth, two, three, four, five births, ten births, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty births, a hundred births, a thousand births, a hundred-thousand births, many aeons of world⁹ contraction, many aeons of world expansion, many aeons of world contraction and expansion: "There I was so named, of such a race, with such an appearance, such was my food, such my acquaintance with pleasure and pain, such the end of my life-span; and passing away from there, I appeared elsewhere; and there too I was so named . . . and passing away from there, I reappeared here." Thus with its details and particulars they recollect their manifold past life. Just as though a man went from his own village to another village, and then he went from that village to another village and then he went back again to his own village and thought: "I went from my own village to that village and there such was the way I stood, such the way I sat, such the way I spoke, such the way I was silent; and from that village I went on to that other village and there such was the way I stood, such the way I sat, such the way I spoke, such the way I was silent; and from that village I came back to my own village"; so too, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to recollect their manifold past life . . . thus they recollect their manifold past life with its details and particulars.

'And thereby . . . the perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

18. The Heavenly Eyesight

35. 'Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way whereby with heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, to see beings passing away and reappearing, inferior and superior, fair and ugly, well-behaved and ill-behaved. They understand how beings pass

9. Meaning universal.

on according to their kammās thus: “These worthy beings who are ill-conducted in body, speech and mind, revilers of Noble Ones, wrong in their views, giving effect to wrong view in their actions, have, on the dissolution of the body, after death, appeared in a state of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, even in hell; but these worthy beings who are well-conducted in body, speech and mind, not revilers of the Noble Ones, right in their views, giving effect to right view in their actions, have, on the dissolution of the body, after death, appeared in a happy destination, even in the heavenly world; thus with the heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, they see beings passing away and reappearing, inferior and superior, fair and ugly, well-behaved and ill-behaved; they understand how beings pass on according to their kammās. Just as though there were two houses with doors and a man with good eyes standing there in between saw men entering the houses and coming out and going to and fro; so too, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way to see, with heavenly eyesight, . . . how beings pass on according to their kammās.

‘And thereby . . . the perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

19. The Exhaustion of Taints

36. ‘Again, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way whereby, through realization themselves with direct-knowledge here and now, they enter upon and abide in the deliverance of the heart and deliverance by understanding that are taint-free with exhaustion of taints. Just as if there were a lake in a mountain recess, clear, limpid and unturbid, so that a man with good eyes standing there on the bank saw shells, gravel and pebbles and also shoals of fish swimming about and resting, and he might think: “There is this lake, clear, limpid and unturbid, and there are these shells, gravel and pebbles, and also these shoals of fish swimming about and resting”; so too, I have proclaimed to my disciples the way whereby through realization themselves with direct-knowledge here and now, they enter upon and abide in the deliverance of the heart and deliverance by understanding that are taint-free with the exhaustion of taints.

‘And thereby many disciples of mine have reached the consummation, the perfection of direct-knowledge and abide in it.

37. 'This Udayin, is the fifth dhamma on account of which my disciples honour, respect, revere and venerate me and live in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me.

38. 'These, Udāyin, are five dhammas on account of which my disciples honour, respect, revere and venerate me and live in dependence on me, honouring and respecting me.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The wanderer Udāyin was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 14. For the expression *dukkhotiṇṇo* see M.i, 192. '*cittam ārādemī*—interests them': lit. 'I capture their mind'.

para. 23. *Abhibhāyatana*—Base for Transcendence: i.e. for 'transcendence of defilement' according to Comy. Often rendered 'Basis of Mastery', which seems, however, both unclear and wide of the point, if 'Mastery' is used to render *vasi*; for *vasi* and *abhibhū* do not mean the same in Pāli. For other references to *abhibhavati*, see *abhibhuyya* at M. ii, 262, and in another sense at M.i, 33; also *abhibhū* at M.i, 2.

para. 24. *Kasiṇa* as 'wholeness', see use of this word in Sutta 49, para. 8. This is explained at length in Vis. Ch. IV, where it is said that successful *kasiṇa* contemplation arrives at complete withdrawal of mind from the five-door sensual sphere (that is, from eye-consciousness and its objective field and its association with the other four doors) and concentration exclusively on a single 'wholeness' as a mental object, idea or concept.

The Eight Liberations, Eight Bases for Transcendence and Ten *Kasiṇas* are closely related. The correspondence is roughly as follows:

Liberation (<i>vimokkha</i>)	Wholeness (<i>kasīna</i>)	Base for Transcendence (<i>abhibhāyatana</i>)
1 and 2	{ earth water fire air	} 1—4
3 (or= loving-kindness)	{ blue yellow red white	} 5—8
4 (?)	space	—
4 (?)	consciousness	—

In the Visuddhimagga the 9th and 10th Wholenesses are replaced by *light* and *limited space*. Liberations nos. 4-7—the four formless states and no. 8 the Attainment of Cessation of perception and feeling.

From the above, it may be inferred that *abhibhūyā* in the Bases for Transcendence refers to the transcendence, by mind, of the field of eye-consciousness towards the field of mind-consciousness: i.e., the five-sense field to the generalized mind-door field.

Cula Dukkakkhandha Sutta

The Mass of Suffering-2

Introduction

Here is Mahānāma, a learned layman follower of the Buddha, saying that in spite of his knowledge that greed, hate and delusion are imperfections of mind, still they arise from time to time. Is this not the case with us too? And the Buddha shows that our attachment to sense pleasures will continue until we 'attain to the happiness and pleasure that are quite apart from sensual desires, apart from unprofitable dhammas' (=the four jhānas) 'or to something more peaceful even than that' (=Paths and Fruits). Until that time we are 'still not averse to sensual desires'. Having taught Mahānāma the gratification and danger of sensual desires, the Buddha goes on to illustrate some of the more twisted ways that these desires lead to. He presents a picture of Jain ascetics torturing themselves by continuously standing up, their theory being that by doing so they are wearing away the bad kamma made in the past, compelling it to fruit as pain now. This is also 'a danger in the case of sensual desires', for when people have had their pleasures and get twinges of conscience, burning remorse and perhaps 'get religion', or when they are inclined by their nature to be repressive of emotions such as greed and lust due to an over-strong root of hate, then they may try the way of self-torture, either in some religious community, or off by themselves. This is unhealthy and leads to much more suffering than the ordinary sensual person has to bear. In both cases, the *escape* is not known. The sensualist thinks the escape is more sensuality. The bodily mortifier thinks that the escape lies in pain and torture of himself. Neither is right and only Satipaṭṭhāna, the training in mindfulness leading to insight, will cause 'the removal of lustful desire', the true way out.

The Sutta (14)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living in the Sakyan country at Kapilavatthu in Nigrodha's Park.

2. Then Mahānāma the Sakyan went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so he said: 'Venerable Sir, I have long known the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One thus: "Greed is an imperfection of mind, hate is an imperfection of mind, delusion is an imperfection of mind." Yet while I know the Dhamma as taught by the Blessed One thus, at times ideas (dhammas) of greed invade my mind and remain, ideas of hate invade my mind and remain, ideas of delusion invade my mind and remain: I (have wondered), venerable sir, what dhamma is still unabandoned by me in myself owing to which at times these ideas (dhammas) invade my mind and remain.'

3. 'Mahānāma, there is still a dhamma unabandoned in you, owing to which at times ideas (dhamma) of greed...of hate...of delusion invade your mind and remain; for were that dhamma already abandoned by you in yourself you would not be living the house life, you would not be enjoying sensual desires. It is because there is still that dhamma unabandoned by you in yourself that you are living the house life and enjoying sensual desires.¹

4. 'If, though a Noble Disciple has clearly seen, as it actually is, with right understanding how sensual desires provide little gratification and much suffering and despair, and how great is the danger in them, then for as long as he still does not attain to the happiness and pleasure that are quite apart from sensual desires, apart from unprofitable dhammas, or to something more peaceful even than that, he is still not averse to sensual desires.

'But when a noble disciple has clearly seen, as it actually is, with right understanding how sensual desires provide little gratification and much suffering and despair and how great is the danger in them, then

1. Remember that kāmā refers to both desires (=defilements) and pleasures (=sense-objects).

when he attains to the happiness and pleasure that are quite apart from sensual desires, apart from unprofitable dhammas, or to something more peaceful even than that, he is no more unaverse to sensual desires.²

5. 'Before my enlightenment, while I was still only an unenlightened Bodhisatta, when I too saw clearly as it actually is, with right understanding, how sensual desires provide little gratification and much suffering and despair, and how great is the danger in them, then for as long as I still did not attain to the happiness and pleasure that are quite apart from sensual desires, apart from unprofitable dhammas, or to something more peaceful even than that, I recognized that I was still not averse to sensual desires.

'But when I clearly saw, as it actually is, with right understanding, how sensual desires provide little gratification and much suffering and despair, and how great is the danger in them, then when I attained to the happiness and pleasure that are quite apart from sensual desire, apart from unprofitable dhammas, or to something more peaceful even than that, I recognized that I was no more unaverse to sensual desires.

6. (i) 'And what is the gratification in the case of sensual desires? Mahānāma, there are... these five cords of sensual desires. What are the five? Forms cognizable through the eye that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likable, connected with sensual desire, and provocative of lust. Sounds cognizable through the ear... Odours cognizable through the nose... Flavours cognizable through the tongue... Tangibles cognizable through the body that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likable, connected with sensual desire, and provocative of lust. These are the five cords of sensual desire.

'Now the pleasure and joy that arise dependent on those five cords of sensual desire are the gratification in the case of sensual desires.

7. (ii) 'And what is the danger in the case of sensual desires?

'Here, bhikkhus, on account of the calling by which a clansman makes a living, whether checking or accounting or calculating or ploughing or

² Note that here though the two negatives make a positive (in English) 'he is averse' has the wrong meaning. Aversion has been overcome by higher attainment and he has equanimity.

trading or cattle farming or archery or as a king's man, or whatever the calling may be, he has to face cold, he has to face heat, he is harassed by mosquitoes and flies, wind and sun and creeping things, risking death by hunger and thirst.

'Now this danger in the case of sensual desires, (this) mass of suffering visible here and now, has sensual desires for its reason, sensual desires for its source, sensual desires for its cause, the reason being simply sensual desires.

8. 'If no property comes to the clansman while he works and strives and makes efforts thus, he sorrows, grieves and laments, beating his breast he weeps till he is distraught, (crying:) "My work is vain, my work is fruitless!"

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires . . . the reason being simply sensual desires.

9. 'If property comes to the clansman while he works and strives and makes efforts thus, he experiences pain and grief in protecting it: "How shall neither kings nor thieves make off with my property nor fire burn it nor water sweep it away nor hateful heirs make off with it?" And as he guards and protects his property, kings or thieves make off with it or fire burns it or water sweeps it away or hateful heirs make off with it. And he sorrows, grieves and laments, beating his breast he weeps till he is distraught, (crying:) "What I had I have no more."

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires . . . the reason being simply sensual desires.

10. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason, sensual desires for the source, sensual desires for the cause, the reason being simply sensual desires, kings quarrel with kings, warrior-nobles with warrior-nobles, divines with divines, householders with householders, mother with child, child with mother, father with child, child with father, brother with brother, brother with sister, friend with friend. And here in their quarrels, brawls and disputes they attack each other with fists or with clods or with sticks or with knives, whereby they incur death or deadly suffering.

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires . . . the reason being simply sensual desires.

11. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason... (men) take swords and shields and buckle on bows and quivers, and they charge into battle massed in double array with arrows and spears flying and swords flashing; and there they are wounded by arrows and spears, and their heads are cut off by swords, whereby they incur death or deadly suffering.

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires... the reason is simply sensual desires.

12. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason... (men) take swords and shields and buckle on bows and quivers, and they charge slippery bastions, with arrows and spears flying, and swords flashing; and there they are wounded by arrows and spears and splashed with boiling liquids and crushed under heavy weights, and their heads are cut off by swords, whereby they incur death or deadly suffering.

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires... the reason is simply sensual desires.

13. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason... (men) break in and steal, turn bandit, rob highways, seduce others' wives; so that when they are caught, kings have many kinds of torture inflicted on them. They have them flogged with whips, beaten with canes, beaten with clubs, they have their hands cut off, their feet cut off, their hands and feet cut off, their ears cut off, their noses cut off, their ears and noses cut off, they have them subjected to the "porridge-pot", to the "polished-shell shave", to the "eclipse's mouth", to the "fiery wreath", to the "fiery hand", to the "blades of grass", to the "bark dress", to the "antelope", to the "meat-hooks", to the "coins", to the "lye-pickling", to the "pivotting-pin", to the "rolled-up palliasse", and they have them splashed with boiling oil, and they have them thrown to dogs to devour, and they have them impaled alive on stakes, and they have their heads cut off with swords, whereby they incur death or deadly suffering.

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires... the reason is simply sensual desires.

14. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason, sensual desires for the source, sensual desires for the cause, the reason being simply sensual desires, (men) indulge in misconduct of body, speech and mind: on the

dissolution of the body, after death, they reappear in states of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, even in hell. Now this danger in the case of sensual desires, this mass of suffering in lives to come, has sensual desires for its reason, sensual desires for its source, sensual desires for its course, the reason being simply sensual desires.

15. 'Now, Mahānāma, on one occasion I was living at Rājagaha on the Vulture Peak Rock. On that occasion a number of Niganthas (Jains) living on the Black Rock on the slopes of the Anchorets' Gullet (Isigili) were practising continuous standing, rejecting seats, and experiencing painful, racking, piercing feelings due to striving.

16. 'Then when it was evening, I rose from meditation, and went to the Niganthas there. I asked them: "Friends, why do you practise continuous standing, rejecting seats, and experiencing painful, racking, piercing feelings due to striving?"

17. 'When this was said, they replied: "Friend, the Nigantha Nātaputta, the Omniscient All-seer, claims to have complete knowledge and vision thus: 'Whether I am walking or standing or sleeping or waking, my knowledge and vision are continuously, unceasingly maintained.' He says thus: 'Niganthas, you have done evil kammās in the past; exhaust them with piercing mortification. And when you are here and now restrained in body, speech and mind, that is doing no evil kammās for the future. So by annihilating with penance past evil kammās, and by doing no fresh evil kammās, there will be no consequence in the future. With no consequence in the future there is exhaustion of kammās. With exhaustion of kammās there is exhaustion of suffering. With exhaustion of suffering there is exhaustion of feeling. With the exhaustion of feeling all suffering will be used up.' This is our preference and to our liking, and we are satisfied with it."

18. 'When this was said, I told them: "But, friends, do you know that you were (existed) in the past, and that it is not that your were (existed) not?"'

"No, friend."

"But, friends, do you know that you did evil kammās in that past and did not abstain from them?"

"No, friend."

‘“But, friends, do you know that so much suffering has already been used up or that so much suffering has still to be used up or that when so much suffering has been used up all suffering will have been used up?”’

‘“No, friend.”’

‘“But, friends, do you know what the abandoning of unprofitable dhammas is and the cultivation of profitable dhammas here and now?”’

‘“No, friend.”’

19. ‘“So, friends, it seems that you do not know that you were in the past and that it is not that you were not; or that you did evil kammās in the past and did not abstain from them; or that you did such and such evil kammās; or that so much suffering has already been used up; or that when so much suffering has been used up, all suffering will have been used up; or what the abandoning of unprofitable dhammas is and the cultivation of profitable dhammas here and now. That being so, those who are murderers, bloody-handed evil-doers in the world go into homelessness as Niganthas when they are reborn among human beings?”’

‘“Friend Gotama, pleasure is not to be gained through pleasure; pleasure is to be gained through pain. For were pleasure to be gained through pleasure, then Seniya Bimbisāra king of Madagha would gain pleasure, since he abides in greater pleasure than the venerable Gotama does.”’

‘“Surely the venerable Niganthas have uttered those words rashly and without reflection. Rather it is I who ought to be asked: ‘Who abides in greater pleasure, Seniya Bimbisāra king of Magadha, or the venerable Gotama?’”’

‘“Surely, friend Gotama, we uttered those words rashly and without reflection. But let that be. Now we ask the venerable Gotama: ‘Who abides in greater pleasure, Seniya Bimbisāra of Magadha, or the venerable Gotama?’”’

22. ‘“Then, friends, I shall ask you a question in return. Answer it as you like. How do you conceive this, friends, can Seniya Bimbisāra king of Magadha abide without moving this body or uttering a word for seven days experiencing unremitting pleasure?”’

‘“No, friend.”’

“How do you conceive this, friends, can Seniya Bimbisāra . . . without moving his body . . . six days . . . five . . . four . . . three . . . two . . . one day experiencing unremitting pleasure?”

“No, friend.”

23. “Friends, I can abide without moving my body or uttering a word for one day . . . two . . . three . . . four . . . five . . . six . . . seven days experiencing unremitting pleasure.

“How do you conceive this, friends, that being so, who dwells in greater pleasure, Seniya Bimbisāra king of Magadha, or I?”

“That being so, the venerable Gotama abides in greater pleasure than Seniya Bimbisāra king of Magadha does.”

That is what the Blessed One said. Mahānāma the Sakyan was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One’s words.

Maha Dukkakkhandha Sutta

The Mass of Suffering-I

Introduction

The contents of this important Sutta could be summarized in this way:

	<i>gratification</i>	<i>danger</i>	<i>escape</i>
<i>sensual desires:</i>	the five cords of sensual desires	the sufferings from livelihood, ownership conflicts, punishments	the removal of lustful desire
<i>form:</i>	gratification arising from a beautiful girl (or young man)	the change and decay inherent in that beauty.	the removal of lustful desire
<i>feelings:</i>	the attainment of the four jhānas	the impermanence of feelings	the removal of lustful desire

Though religious teachers may claim a complete knowledge of sensual desires, forms (=physical bodies) and feelings, yet unless they can clearly and without distortion list the gratification, danger and the way out or way beyond them (escape from them), they cannot substantiate their claims. The Buddha, for instance, does not deny that there is gratification to be had from the beauty of youth, but he does point out that such satisfaction is impermanent and unreliable. Those who cling to beauty as their bodies inevitably decay, how pitiful they are! They do not want to know the danger and have no idea about the escape. Similarly,

he does not deny gratification from the senses, but he warns us about the dangers. And those dangers which he lists are exactly the same now as they were 2500 years ago. In all three cases, the escape is the same: *the removal of lustful desire*. We can look at the above classification in another way. The *dangers* are the first Noble Truth. The *gratification* is the second N.T. which keeps our sufferings in saṃsāra increasing. While *escape* is the third N.T. whereby sufferings are stopped with the cessation of their cause—lustful desire.

The Sutta (13)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park.

2. Then, it being morning, a number of bhikkhus dressed, and taking their bowls and (outer) robes, they went into Sāvatti for alms.

3. Then they thought: 'It is still too early to wander for alms in Sāvatti; suppose we went to the Other Sectarian Wanderers' Park?'

4. So they went to the Other Sectarian Wanderers' Park, and they exchanged greetings with the Other Sectarian Wanderers, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, they sat down at one side. When they had done so, the Wanderers said to them:

5. 'Friends, the Monk Gotama makes known full-knowledge of sensual desires, and so too do we; the Monk Gotama makes known full-knowledge of form, and so too do we; the Monk Gotama makes known full-knowledge of feelings, and so too do we. What then is the distinction here, what is the variance, what is the difference between the Monk Gotama's teaching of the Dhamma and ours, between his message and ours?'

6. Then without agreeing or disagreeing with these words, the bhikkhus got up from their seats and went away, (thinking:) 'We shall come to know the meaning of these words in the Blessed One's presence.'

7. When they had wandered for alms in Sāvatti and had returned from their alms-round after the meal, they went to the Blessed One, and after

paying homage to him, they sat down at one side. When they had done so, they told him what had taken place.

8. 'Bhikkhus, wanderers of other sects who say thus should be questioned thus: "But, friends, what is the gratification, what is the danger, and what is the escape, in the case of sensual desire? What is the gratification, what is the danger, and what is the escape, in the case of form? What is the gratification, what is the danger, and what is the escape, in the case of feelings?" Being questioned thus wanderers of other sects will fail to account for the matter, and what is more, they will get into difficulties. Why is that? Because it is not their province. Bhikkhus, I see no one in the world with its gods, its Māras and Divinities, in this generation with its monks and divines, with its kings and its men, who could satisfy the mind a reply to these questions, unless it were a Tathāgata or a Tathāgata's disciple, or else one who has learnt it from that (source).

(Sensual Desires)

9. (i) 'And what is gratification in the case of sensual desires?

'Bhikkhus, there are these five cords of sensual desires. What are the five? Forms cognizable through the eye that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likable, connected with sensual desire, and provocative, of lust. Sounds cognizable through the ear . . . Odours cognizable through the nose . . . Flavours cognizable through the tongue . . . Tangibles cognizable through the body that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likable, connected with sensual desires, and provocative of lust. These are the five cords of sensual desire.

'Now the pleasure and joy that arise dependent on those five cords of sensual desire are the gratification in the case of sensual desires.

10. (ii) 'And what is the danger in the case of sensual desires?

'Here, bhikkhus, on account of the calling by which a clansman makes a living, whether checking or accounting or calculating or ploughing or trading or cattle farming or archery or as a king's man, or whatever the calling may be, he has to face cold, he has to face heat, he is harassed by mosquitoes and flies, wind and sun and creeping things, risking death by hunger and thirst.

'Now this danger in the case of sensual desires, (this) mass of suffering visible here and now, has sensual desires for its reason, sensual desires for its source, sensual desires for its cause, the reason being simply sensual desires.

11. 'If no property comes to the clansman while he works and strives and makes efforts thus, he sorrows, grieves and laments, beating his breast he weeps till he is distraught, (crying:) "My work is vain, my work is fruitless!"

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires . . . the reason being simply sensual desires.

12. 'If property comes to the clansman while he works and strives and makes efforts thus, he experiences pain and grief in protecting it: "How shall neither kings nor thieves make off with my property nor fire burn it nor water sweep it away nor hateful heirs make off with it?" And as he guards and protects his property, kings or thieves make off with it or fire burns it or water sweeps it away or hateful heirs make off with it. And he sorrows, grieves and laments, beating his breast he weeps till he is distraught, (crying): "What I had I have no more."

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires . . . the reason being simply sensual desires.

13. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason, sensual desires for the source, sensual desires for the cause, the reason being simply sensual desires, kings quarrel with kings, warrior-nobles with warrior-nobles, divines with divines, householders with householders, mother with child, child with mother, father with child, child with father, brother with brother, brother with sister, friend with friend. And here in their quarrels, brawls and disputes they attack each other with fists or with clods or with sticks or with knives, whereby they incur death or deadly suffering.

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires . . . the reason being simply sensual desires.

14. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason . . . (men) take swords and shields and buckle on bows and quivers, and they charge into battle

massed in double array with arrows and spears flying and swords flashing; and there they are wounded by arrows and spears, and their heads are cut off by swords, whereby they incur death or deadly suffering.

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires . . . the reason is simply sensual desires.

15. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason . . . (men) take swords, and shields and buckle on bows and quivers, and they charge slippery bastions, with arrows and spears flying, and swords flashing; and there they are wounded by arrows and spears and splashed with boiling liquids and crushed under heavy weights, and their heads are cut off by swords, whereby they incur death or deadly suffering.

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires . . . the reason is simply sensual desires.

16. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason . . . (men) break in and steal, turn bandit, rob highways, seduce others' wives; so that when they are caught, kings have many kinds of torture inflicted on them. They have them flogged with whips, beaten with canes, beaten with clubs, they have their hands cut off, their feet cut off, their hands and feet cut off, their ears cut off, their noses cut off, their ears and noses cut off, they have them subjected to the "porridge-pot", to the "polished-shell shave", to the "eclipse's mouth", to the "fiery wreath", to the "fiery hand", to the "blades of grass", to the "bark dress", to the "antelope", to the "meat-hooks", to the "coins", to the "lye-pickling", to the "pivotting-pin", to the "rolled-up palliasse", and they have them splashed with boiling oil, and they have them thrown to dogs to devour, and they have them impaled alive on stakes, and they have their heads cut off with swords—whereby they incur death or deadly suffering.

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires . . . the reason is simply sensual desires.

17. 'Again, with sensual desires for the reason, sensual desires for the source, sensual desires for the cause, the reason being simply sensual desires, (men) indulge in misconduct of body, speech and mind: on the dissolution of the body, after death, they reappear in states of deprivation, in an unhappy destination, in perdition, even in hell.

'Now this danger too in the case of sensual desires, this mass of suffering in life to come, has sensual desires for its reason, sensual desires for its source, sensual desires for its cause, the reason being simply sensual desires.

18. (iii) 'And what is escape in the case of sensual desires? It is the removal of lustful desire, the abandonment of lustful desire, for sensual pleasures.¹

'This is the escape in the case of sensual desires.

19. 'That those monks and divines who do not understand, as it actually is, the gratification as gratification, the danger as danger and the escape as escape, in the case of sensual desires, can either themselves fully know sensual desires or instruct so that another can fully know sensual desires—that is not possible.

'That those monks and divines who understand, as it actually is, the gratification as gratification, the danger as danger and the escape as escape, in the case of sensual desires, can either themselves fully know sensual desires or instruct so that another can fully know sensual desires—that is possible.

(Form)

20. (i) 'And what is the gratification in the case of form?

'Suppose there were a girl of warrior-noble caste or divine caste or householder stock, in her fifteenth or sixteenth year, neither too tall nor too short, neither too thin nor too fat, neither too dark nor too fair: is her beauty and loveliness then at its height?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'Now the pleasure and joy that arise in dependence on that beauty and loveliness are the gratification in the case of form.

21. (ii) 'And what is the danger in the case of form?

'Later on one might see that same woman here at eighty, ninety or a hundred years, aged, as crooked as a roof, doubled up, tottering with the aid of sticks, frail, her youth gone, her teeth broken, grey-haired,

1. This paragraph is an example of where a rigid scheme for translation fails. 'Lustful desire' is *chanca-rāga*, and 'sensual pleasures', *kāmā*, elsewhere translated 'sensual desires'.

scanty-haired, bald, wrinkled, with limbs all blotchy: how do you conceive this, bhikkhus, has her former beauty and loveliness vanished and the danger become evident?’

‘Yes, venerable sir.’

‘Bhikkhus, this is the danger in the case of form.

22. ‘Again, one might see that same woman afflicted, suffering and gravely ill, lying fouled in her own excrement and urine, lifted up by some and set down by others. How do you conceive this, bhikkhus, has the former beauty and loveliness vanished and the danger become evident?’

‘Yes, venerable sir.’

‘Bhikkhus, this too is the danger in the case of form.

23. ‘Again, one might see that same woman as a corpse thrown on the charnel ground, one-day dead, two-days dead, three-days dead, bloated, livid and oozing with matter. How do you conceive this, bhikkhus, has the former beauty and loveliness vanished and the danger become evident?’

‘Yes, venerable sir.’

‘Bhikkhus, this too is the danger in the case of form.

24. ‘Again, one might see that the same woman as a corpse thrown on a charnel ground, devoured by crows, kites, vultures, dogs, jackals and various kinds of worms. How do you conceive this...? ... the danger in the case of form.

25. ‘... a skeleton with flesh and blood held together by sinews ...

26. ‘... a fleshless skeleton smeared with blood and held together by sinews ...

27. ‘... a skeleton without flesh or blood held together by sinews ...

28. ‘... bones without sinews, scattered in all directions, here a hand-bone there a foot-bone, there a shin-bone, there a thigh-bone, there a hip-bone, there the back-bone, there the skull ...

29. ‘... bones bleached white, the colour of shells ...

30. '... bones heaped up, more than a year old . . .

31. 'Again, one might see that same woman as a corpse thrown on a charnel ground: bones rotted and crumbled to dust. How do you conceive this, bhikkhus, has the former beauty and loveliness vanished and the danger become evident?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'Bhikkhus, this too is the danger in the case of form.

32. (iii) 'And what is the escape in the case of form? It is the removal of lustful desire, the abandonment of lustful desire, for form.

'This is the escape in the case of form.

33. 'That those monks and divines who do not understand, as it actually is, the gratification as gratification, the danger as danger and the escape as escape, in the case of form, can either themselves fully know or instruct so that another can fully know form—that is not possible.

(Feelings)

34. (i) 'And what is the gratification in the case of feelings?

'Here, bhikkhus, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the first jhāna, which is accompanied by initial and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of seclusion.

'On such an occasion he does not choose for his own affliction, or for another's affliction, or for the affliction of both. On that occasion he feels only feeling that is free from affliction. Gratification in the case of feeling in its highest aspect is freedom from affliction, I say.

35. 'Again, with the stilling of initial and sustained application, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the second jhāna, which has self-confidence and singleness of mind without initial application and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of concentration.

'On such an occasion . . . freedom from affliction, I say.

36. 'With the fading as well of happiness a bhikkhu abides in equanimity, mindful and fully aware, feeling pleasure with his body he enters upon and abides in the third jhāna, on account of which Noble Ones announce: "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful."

'On such an occasion . . . freedom from affliction, I say.

37. 'With the abandoning of pleasure and pain and with the previous disappearance of joy and grief, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the fourth jhāna, which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.

'On such an occasion he does not choose for his own affliction, or for another's affliction, or for the affliction of both. On that occasion he feels only feeling that is free from affliction. Gratification in the case of feeling in its highest aspect is freedom from affliction, I say.

38. (ii) 'And what is the danger in the case of feelings ?

'Feelings are impermanent, painful, and inseparable from changefulness.

'This is the danger in the case of feelings.

39. (iii) 'And what is the escape in the case of feelings ?

'It is the remove of lustful desire, the abandonment of lustful desire, for feelings.

'This is the escape in the case of feelings.

40. 'That those monks and divines who do not understand, as it actually is, the gratification as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape as escape, in the case of feelings, can either themselves fully know feelings or instruct so that another can fully know feelings—that is not possible.

'That these monks and divines who understand, as it actually is, the gratification as gratification, the danger as danger and the escape as escape, in the case of feelings, can either themselves fully know feelings or instruct so that another can fully know feelings—that is possible.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

15. *upakāra*—bastion: not in the P.T.S. Dict.

abhivagga—heavy weight: P.T.S. Dict. (this ref.) does not agree with the Commentary.

34. *n'eva tasmim samaye atta-byābādhāya ceteti*—on such an occasion he

does not choose for his own affliction: *byābādha* needs to be taken as 'affliction' in the sense of *ābādhi* (afflicted) as at e.g. Sutta 143, para. 2 rather than in the sense *sambādha* (cramped, restricted, crowded) as at e.g. Sutta 36, para. 12.

Ceteti is the verb properly for both *citta* and *cetanā* and so can be rendered either by 'to be cognizant of' or 'to will'. The first seems to be required by the context. In the triple formula 'gratification-danger-escape' as applied to sensual desires (*kāma*) in para. 9 the 'gratification' is pleasant feeling. So it is too in the case of feeling (para. 34), and pleasant feeling, as the gratification in the case of feeling in general, is non-affliction in its most refined form. Feeling is dealt with in Suttas 10, para. 32; 38, para. 22, 39; 43, para. 23; 44, paras. 22ff; 59, paras. 3, 5; 137, paras. 9ff; and Sutta 140, para. 20.

Dantabhumi Sutta

The Grade of the Tamed

Introduction

When one is down in a valley, one has no way of knowing what the mountaineer on the heights can see. His view of things is incomprehensible and may quite easily be disbelieved. Only when one actually climbs up with him can one see what he sees. This is one of the Buddha's striking similes in this Sutta. The valley that one is in, hedged in by steep sides, is attachment to sense-pleasures. This is a limitation and prevents one seeing very far. And one may not believe one's friend's account of the view from the top. But if one has such a friend, a *kalyāna-mitta*, a noble friend, he may guide one to renounce indulgence in the senses, to discipline one's body and speech, to have few wishes and to love secluded places, to be mindful and fully aware and to meditate much. This is called climbing the mountain, and as with an actual mountain the view widens, so one's own understanding and wisdom deepens and penetrates the nature of oneself—impermanence, dukkha and not self are clearly seen. Unobstructed by ignorance the view from the top is perfect!

The Sutta (125)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the Squirrels' Feeding Place.

2. Now on that occasion the novice Aciravata was living in a forest hut. Then as Prince Jayasena was wandering and walking for exercise

he went to the novice Aciravata and exchanged greetings with him, and when this courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said: 'Aggivessana, I have heard this: A bhikkhu who lives here diligent, ardent and self-controlled might achieve unification of mind.'

'That is so, Prince, that is so: A bhikkhu who lives here diligent, ardent and self-controlled might achieve unification of mind.'

3. 'It would be good if Master Aggivessana taught me the Dhamma according as he has heard and mastered it.'

'I cannot teach you the Dhamma, Prince, according as I have heard and mastered it. And then, Prince, were I to teach you the Dhamma according as I have heard and mastered it, you might not know the meaning of what I said; and that would be wearisome and a bother for me.'

4. 'Let Master Aggivessana teach me the Dhamma according as he has heard and mastered it. Perhaps I might know the meaning of what Master Aggivessana said.'

'I might teach you the Dhamma, Prince . . . If you know the meaning of what I say, that will be good. If you do not know the meaning of what I say, then leave it at that and question me no further about it.'

5. Then the novice Aciravata taught Prince Jayasena the Dhamma according as he had heard and mastered it.

When this was said, Prince Jayasena remarked: 'It is impossible, Master Aggivessana, it cannot be, that a bhikkhu who lives diligent and self-controlled might achieve unification of mind.'

Then, having told the novice Aciravata that it was impossible and could not be, Prince Jayasena got up from his seat and went away.

6. Then soon after Prince Jayasena had gone, the novice Aciravata went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he recounted to the Blessed One all his conversation with Prince Jayasena. When this was said, the Blessed One said:

7. 'Aggivessana, how could it possibly happen that what is to be known through renunciation, seen through renunciation, reached through renun-

ciation, realized through renunciation, will ever be known, seen, reached or realized by Prince Jayasena, who lives in the midst of sensual desires¹, enjoys sensual desires, is devoured by sensual desires, is consumed by the fever of sensual desires, is bent on seeking sensual desires? That is not possible.

8. 'Suppose there were two tamable elephants, or two tamable horses, or two tamable oxen, that were well-tamed and well-disciplined, and also tamable elephants or tamable horses or tamable oxen that were untamed and undisciplined. How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, those two tamable elephants, horses or oxen, well-tamed and well-disciplined, would they perhaps being tamed, go as the tamed go, would they reach the grade of the tamed?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'But those two tamable elephants, horses or oxen, untamed and undisciplined, would they, being untamed, go as the tamed go, would they reach the grade of the tamed as those two well-tamed, well-disciplined elephants, horses or oxen did?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'So too, Aggivessana, that what is to be known through renunciation . . . will ever be known . . . by Prince Jayasena who lives in the midst of sensual desires . . . that is not possible.

9. 'Suppose there were a high rock not far from a village or town and two friends went out from the village or town and approached the rock hand in hand, and having done so, one of them remained below at the foot of the rock while the other climbed up on the rock; then the one who remained below said to the other at the summit: "Well, friend, what do you see, standing on top of the rock?" And the other replied: "Standing on top of the rock, friend, I see beautiful parks and groves and meadows and lakes." Then the first said: "It is impossible, friend, it cannot be, that you standing on top of the rock should see beautiful parks and groves and meadows and lakes." Then the other came down from the top of the rock and taking his companion at the foot of the rock below by the arm, he made him climb to the top of the rock, and then, after letting him breathe a little, he asked: "Well, friend, what do

1. Remember, kāma refers to the objects of sense-pleasure as well as the interior desire.

you see standing on the top of the rock?" And the first replied: "Standing on the top of the rock, friend, I see beautiful parks and groves and meadows and lakes." Then the other said: "Friend, just a little earlier we heard you speak thus: 'It is impossible, friend, it cannot be, that you standing on the top of the rock should see beautiful parks and groves and meadows and lakes'; but just now we heard you say this." Then the first replied: "I was so obstructed by this great rock that I did not see what was there to be seen."

10. 'So too, Aggivessana, Prince Jayasena is obstructed, screened, blocked and shut off by a still greater mountain of ignorance, that what is to be known through renunciation... will ever be known... by Prince Jayasena, who lives in the midst of sensual desires... that is not possible.

11. 'Aggivessana, if these two similes had occurred to you spontaneously (while talking) to Prince Jayasena, he would have acquired confidence in you, and having acquired confidence he would have acquainted you with the fact.'

'Venerable sir, how should these two similes occur to me as spontaneous and never heard before, as they have done to the Blessed One?'

12. 'Aggivessana, suppose a head-anointed warrior-noble king addressed his elephant woodsman thus: "Good elephant woodsman, mount the king's elephant and go into the elephant wood, then when you see a forest elephant, fasten him to the king's elephant's neck." Then replying: "Even so, sire", the elephant woodsman mounted the king's elephant and went into the elephant wood. Then when he saw a forest elephant, he fastened him to the king's elephant's neck. Then the king's elephant led him out into the open—and that is how the forest elephant comes into the open, since a forest elephant cleaves to that, that is to say, the elephant wood—then the elephant woodsman informed the head-anointed warrior-noble king: "Sire, the forest elephant has come into the open." Then the head-anointed warrior-noble king addressed (his) elephant-tamer thus: "Come, good elephant-tamer, tame the forest elephant in order to subdue his forest habits, in order to subdue his forest memories and intentions, in order to subdue his forest distress, fatigue and fever, in order to get him to take delight within the town, and in order to inculcate in him habits

to men's liking." "Even so, sire", the elephant-tamer replied. Then he embedded a large post in the earth and fastened the forest elephant to it by the neck in order to subdue his forest habits . . . and in order to inculcate in him habits to men's liking. Then he treated the forest elephant with such words as are innocent, pleasing to the ear, and lovable, as go to the heart, are civil, desired of many and dear to many; and as soon as he was treated with such words, he was willing to hear, gave ear, and established his mind in knowledge; then the elephant-tamer rewarded him with grass fodder and water; and as soon as the forest elephant accepted the grass fodder and water from him he knew "Now he will live; he is the king's elephant". Then the elephant-tamer makes him act thus: "Take up, sir! Put down, sir!" and as soon as the king's elephant obeyed the elephant-tamer's orders to take up and put down, and carried out his instructions, then the elephant-tamer further makes him act thus: "Forward, sir! Back, sir!" and as soon as the king's elephant obeyed the elephant-tamer's orders to go forward and back, and carried out his instructions, then the elephant-tamer further makes him act thus: "Get up, sir! Sit down, sir!" and as soon as the king's elephant obeyed the elephant-tamer's orders to get up and sit down and carried out his instructions, then the elephant-tamer further makes him act in the way called imperturbability: he fastened a giant's shield to his trunk, and a man with a lance in his hand was seated on his neck, and men with lances in their hands surrounded him on all sides, and the elephant-tamer (himself) stood in front of him with a long lance pole in his hand, and in doing his act of imperturbability he moved neither his fore feet nor his hind feet, nor the fore part nor the hind part of his body, nor his head nor his ears nor his tusks nor his tail nor his trunk; the king's elephant endured blows from spears, swords, arrows and other beings, and sounds of drums, kettledrums and trumpets, and, being rid of all faults and defects, with fears removed, he was worthy of the king, in the king's employ, and counted as one of the king's limbs.

13. 'So too, Aggivessana, here a Tathāgata appears in the world, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, perfect in true knowledge and conduct, sublime, knower of worlds, incomparable leader of men to be tamed, teacher of gods and men, enlightened, blessed.

14. 'He declares this world with its gods, its Māras and its (Brahmā) Divinities, this generation with its monks and divines, with its kings and men, which he has himself realized by direct knowledge.

15. 'He teaches Dhamma good in the beginning, good in the middle and good in the end, with (the right) meaning and phrasing, and he announces a life divine that is utterly perfect and pure.

16. 'A householder or householder's son or one born in some clan hears that Dhamma. On hearing the Dhamma he acquires faith in the Tathāgata. Possessing that faith, he considers thus: "House life is crowded and dirty; life gone forth is wide open. It is not possible, living in a household, to lead a life divine as utterly perfect and pure as a polished shell. Suppose I shaved off hair and beard, put on the yellow cloth, and went forth from the home life into homelessness?"

'And on another occasion, abandoning perhaps a small, perhaps a large fortune, abandoning perhaps a small, perhaps a large circle of relatives, he shaves off hair and beard, puts on the yellow cloth, and goes forth from the home life into homelessness.

'Being thus gone forth and possessing the bhikkhus' training and way of life, abandoning killing living beings, he becomes one who abstains from killing living beings; with rod and weapon laid aside, gentle and kindly, he abides compassionate to all beings.

'Abandoning taking what is not given, he becomes one who abstains from taking what is not given; taking (only) what is given, expecting (only) what is given, he abides pure in himself by not stealing.

'Abandoning what is not the life divine¹, he becomes one who lives the life divine, who lives apart, abstaining from vulgar lechery.

'Abandoning false speech, he becomes one who abstains from false speech, he speaks truth, cleaves to truth, is trustworthy, reliable and undeceiving of the world.

'Abandoning malicious speech, he becomes one who abstains from malicious speech: as one who is neither a repeater elsewhere of what is heard here for the purpose of causing division from these, nor a

1. Meaning here 'not indulging in sexual intercourse but practising celibacy'.

repeater to these of what is heard elsewhere for the purpose of causing division from those, who is thus a reuniter of the divided, a promoter of friendships, and enjoying concord, rejoicing in concord, delighting in concord, he becomes a speaker of words that promote concord.

‘Abandoning harsh speech, he becomes one who abstains from harsh speech: he becomes a speaker of such words as are innocent, pleasing to the ear and lovable, as go to the heart, are civil, desired of many and dear to many.

‘Abandoning gossip, he becomes one who abstains from gossip: as one who tells in season what is true and beneficial and the Dhamma and Discipline, he becomes a speaker of timely words, worth recalling, reasoned, measured and connected with good.

‘He becomes one who abstains from injuring seeds and plants.

‘He becomes one who eats in only one part of the day, refusing (food) at night and late meals.

‘He becomes one who abstains from dancing, singing, music and theatrical shows.

‘He becomes one who abstains from wearing of garlands, smartening with scent and embellishment with unguents.

‘He becomes one who abstains from high and large couches.

‘He becomes one who abstains from accepting gold and silver, and goes forth from the house life into homelessness.

‘And that is how a noble disciple comes into the open since gods and men cleave to that, that is to say, the five cords of sensual desire.

17. ‘Then the Tathāgata further disciplines² him thus: “Come, bhikkhu, be virtuous, restrained with the Pāṭimokkha³ restraint (of the bhikkhus’ Rule), perfect in conduct and resort, and, seeing fear in the slightest fault, train by undertaking the training precepts.”

‘As soon as the bhikkhu is virtuous, restrained with the Pāṭimokkha restraint, perfect in conduct and resort, and, seeing fear in the slightest fault, trains himself by undertaking the training precepts, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

2. Lit: ‘leads him away’—from evil unwholesome conduct.

3. This is the name for the code of 227 rules which are fundamental to the bhikkhu life. They are recited on Full and New Moon days in the presence of all bhikkhus resident in a monastery.

18. “Come bhikkhu, keep the doors of the faculties guarded. On seeing a form with the eye, apprehend no signs or features through which, if you leave the eye-door unguarded, evil unprofitable dhammas of covetousness and grief might invade you; practise the way of its restraint, guard the eye-faculty, undertake the restraint of the eye-faculty. On hearing a sound with the ear . . . On smelling an odour with the nose . . . On tasting a flavour with the tongue . . . On touching a tangible with the body . . . On cognizing a dhamma with the mind, apprehend no signs or features through which, if you leave the mind-door unguarded, evil unprofitable dhammas of covetousness and grief might invade you. Practise the way of its restraint, guard the mind-faculty, undertake the restraint of the mind-faculty.”

‘As soon as the bhikkhu keeps the doors of the faculties guarded, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

19. “Come bhikkhu, be one who knows the right amount in eating. Reflecting wisely you should nourish yourself with nutriment neither for amusement nor for intoxication nor for smartening nor for embellishment, (but) only for the endurance and continuance of this body, for the ending of discomfort, and for assisting the life divine. ‘Thus I shall terminate old feelings without arousing new feelings and blameless, I shall live in comfort and health.’”

‘As soon as the bhikkhu knows the right amount in eating, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

20. “Come bhikkhu, abide devoted to wakefulness. By day while walking and sitting purify the mind of obstructive dhammas. In the first watch of the night while walking and sitting, purify the mind of obstructive dhammas. In the middle watch of the night, lie down on the right side in the lion’s sleeping pose with one foot overlapping the other, mindful and fully aware, after noting in the mind the time for arising. After rising, in the third watch while walking and sitting, purify the mind of obstructive dhammas.

‘As soon as the bhikkhu is devoted to wakefulness, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

21. “Come bhikkhu, be possessed of mindfulness and full awareness. Be one who acts in full awareness when moving forward and moving

backward; who acts in full awareness when looking towards and looking away; who acts in full awareness when flexing and extending; who acts in full awareness when wearing the patched cloak, bowl and robes; who acts in full awareness when eating, drinking, chewing and tasting; who acts in full awareness when evacuating the bowels and making water; who acts in full awareness when walking, standing, sitting, falling asleep, waking up, talking and keeping silent.”

‘As soon as the bhikkhu is possessed of mindfulness and full awareness, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

22. ‘“Come bhikkhu, resort to a secluded resting place: to a forest, to the root of a tree, to a rock, to a hill-cleft, to a mountain cave, to a charnel ground, to a woodland solitude, to an open space, to a heap of straw.”

‘He resorts to a secluded resting place: to a forest... On return from his alms-round after his meal he sits down, folding his legs cross-wise, setting his body erect and establishing mindfulness before him. Abandoning covetousness for the world he abides with his mind free from covetousness, he purifies his mind from covetousness; abandoning ill-will and hatred, he abides with his mind free from ill-will and compassionate to all living beings he purifies his mind from ill-will and hatred; abandoning lethargy-and-drowsiness, he abides free from lethargy-and-drowsiness, percipient of light and mindful and fully aware he purifies his mind from lethargy-and-drowsiness; abandoning agitation-and-worry, he abides unagitated with a mind calmed in himself, he purifies his mind of agitation-and-worry; abandoning uncertainty, he abides with uncertainty crossed over, undoubting about profitable dhammas, he purifies his mind from uncertainty.

23. ‘Having abandoned these five hindrances, defilements of the mind that weaken understanding, he abides contemplating the body as a body, ardent, fully aware and mindful, having put away covetousness and grief for the world; he abides contemplating feelings as feelings... he abides contemplating mind as mind... he abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas, ardent, fully aware and mindful, having put away covetousness and grief for the world.

24. ‘Just as the elephant-tamer embedded a large post in the earth and fastened the forest elephant to it by the neck in order to subdue his

forest habits . . . and in order to inculcate in him habits to men's liking, so too these four foundations of mindfulness are the fastening for the noble disciple's mind in order to subdue his house-based habits, in order to subdue his house-based intentions, and in order to subdue his house-based distress, fatigue and fever, for the attaining of the true way and the realization of Nibbāna.

25. 'Then the Tathāgata further disciplines him thus: "Come, bhikkhu, abide contemplating the body as a body but do not think thoughts connected with the body: abide contemplating feelings as feelings . . . mind as mind . . . abide contemplating dhammas as dhammas but do not think thoughts⁴ connected with dhammas.

26. 'With the stilling of initial application⁴ and sustained application he enters upon and abides in the second jhāna . . .

27. ' . . . third jhāna . . . who has equanimity and is mindful.

28. 'When his concentrated mind, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs, he inclines the mind to knowledge of the recollection of past life.

'He recollects his manifold past life, that is to say, one birth . . . five births, ten births . . . fifty births, a hundred births, a thousand births, a hundred thousand births, many aeons of (world)⁵ contraction, many aeons of (world) expansion, many aeons of (world) contraction and expansion: "There I was so named, of such a race, with such (qualities of) appearance, such was my nutriment, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-term; and passing away from there, I appeared elsewhere; and there too I was so-named, of such a race, with such (qualities of) appearance, such was my nutriment, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-term; and passing away from there he appeared here. Thus with details and particulars he recollects his manifold past life.

4. The 'thoughts' of para. 25 and the 'initial application' of para. 26 are both translations of vitakka. Thought is too gross to use in connection with jhāna (meditation), so uniformity must be sacrificed.

5. 'World' here has the meaning of 'universe'.

29. 'When the concentrated mind was thus quite purified, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directed, he inclined the mind to knowledge of the passing away and reappearance of beings.

'With the heavenly eyesight which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees beings passing away and reappearing, inferior and superior, fair and ugly, well-behaved and ill-behaved; he understands how beings pass on according to their kammās, thus: "These worthy beings who are ill-conducted in body, speech and mind, revilers of Noble Ones, wrong in their views, giving effect to wrong view in their kammās (actions), have, on the dissolution of the body, after death, appeared in a state of deprivation, in a bad destination, in perdition, even in hell; but these worthy beings, who are well-conducted in body, speech and mind, not revilers of Noble Ones, right in their views, giving effect to right view in their kammās (actions), have, on the dissolution of the body, after death, appeared in a good destination, even in the heavenly world." Thus with heavenly eyesight which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees beings passing away and reappearing, inferior and superior, fair and ugly, well-behaved and ill-behaved: he understands how beings pass on according to their kamma.

30. 'When the concentrated mind is thus purified and bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, and become malleable, wieldy, steady and attained to unperturbability, he directed, he inclines the mind to knowledge of exhaustion of taints.

'He has direct knowledge thus: "This is suffering". He has direct knowledge thus: "This is the origin of suffering". He has direct knowledge thus: "This is the cessation of suffering". He has direct knowledge thus: "This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering". He has direct knowledge thus: "These are taints". He has direct knowledge thus: "This is the origin of taints". He has direct knowledge thus: "This is the cessation of taints". He has direct knowledge thus: "This is the way leading to the cessation of taints".

'When he knows and sees thus, the mind is liberated from the taints of sensual desire, from the taints of being and from the taints of ignor-

ance. When liberated there comes the knowledge "It is liberated". He has direct knowledge thus: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived out, what can be done is done, there is no more of this to come."

31. 'That bhikkhu is one who bears cold and heat, hunger and thirst, and contact with mosquitoes and flies, wind, sun and creeping things, who endures ill-spoken unwelcome words, and arisen bodily feelings that are painful, racking, sharp, piercing, disagreeable, distressing, and menacing to life; being rid of all lust, hate and delusion, with flaws removed, he is fit for gifts, fit for hospitality, fit for offerings, fit for reverential salutation, an incomparable field of merit for the world.

32. 'If the king's elephant when old dies untamed and undisciplined, it is an untamed death that he is reckoned to have died. If the king's elephant when middle-aged dies untamed and undisciplined, it is an untamed death that he is reckoned to have died. If the king's elephant when young dies untamed and undisciplined, it is an untamed death that he is reckoned to have died. So too, if an elder bhikkhu dies with the taints unexhausted, it is an untamed death that he is reckoned to have died. If a middle bhikkhu . . . If a new bhikkhu⁵ dies with taints unexhausted, it is an untamed death that he is reckoned to have died.

'If the king's elephant when old dies well-tamed and well-disciplined, it is a tamed death that he is reckoned to have died. If the king's elephant when middle-aged . . . If the king's elephant when young dies well-tamed and well-disciplined, it is a tamed death that he is reckoned to have died. So too, if an elder bhikkhu dies with the taints exhausted, it is a tamed death that he is reckoned to have died. If a middle bhikkhu . . . If a new bhikkhu dies with the taints exhausted, it is a tamed death that he is reckoned to have died.'

33. This is what the Blessed One said. The novice Aciravata was satisfied and delighted in the Blessed One's words.

5. A bhikkhu is an elder (thera) after ten years in the Sangha, a middle bhikkhu over five years, a new bhikkhu under five years.

Notes

para. 12. *etagedhā*: non. sing. of *etad* + *gedhar*?

para. 12. This is an instruction to one who has already gained the first jhāna (para. 24.) to effect the stilling of initial and sustained applications necessary for realizing the second jhāna.

Satipatthana Sutta

The Foundations of Mindfulness

Introduction

These days there are heaps of books on Buddhism. People read this and that from different Buddhist teachings and become thoroughly confused. Where to go from there? The practice of Dhamma is the answer. This can only be done using the principles of this profound and wide-ranging Sutta. Ven. Nyānamoli Thera, the translator, calls it 'the cornerstone of the Buddha's instruction', for nothing good can be accomplished without mindfulness. Generosity cannot be practised without it, neither can the moral precepts. And how far will one get with the development of the mind without mindfulness? The principles of this Sutta, when practised, establish mindfulness or awareness in the mind as immovably as a foundation stone. This means that forgetfulness, distraction, boredom, worry, dullness—all deluded states of mind—are gradually replaced by mindfulness, full awareness and wisdom-understanding. All kinds of mental troubles, whether born of greed, hate or delusion, however strong they are, can be overcome with mindfulness. This is because to be mindful, as taught in this Sutta, is not to add something new to the mind, it is strengthening a mental factor which is already there, making the occurrences of the mindful mind stronger and more frequent than they had been. The wandering mind distracted by the senses here and there and pursuing all sorts of unwholesome thoughts occurs less frequently. This makes for more happiness and less suffering. Try out the Satipatthāna Teachings and find out for yourself! But when you do so it is advisable to have someone who can guide your efforts and help with your problems.

The Sutta (10)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living in the Kuru country. There is town of theirs called Kammāssadamma, and there he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, this path, namely the four foundations of mindfulness, is a path that goes in one way only: to the purification of beings, to the surmounting of sorrow and lamentation, to the disappearance of pain and grief, to the attainment of the true way, to the realization of Nibbāna.

3. 'What are the four? Here a bhikkhu abides contemplating a body as a body¹ fully aware and mindful, having put away covetousness and grief for the world. He abides contemplating feelings as feelings, ardent, fully aware and mindful, having put away covetousness and grief for the world. He abides contemplating mind as mind, ardent, fully aware and mindful, having put away covetousness and grief for the world. He abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas, ardent, fully aware and mindful, having put away covetousness and grief for the world.

CONTEMPLATION OF THE BODY**(I. Mindfulness of Breathing)**

4. 'And how does a bhikkhu abide contemplating the body as a body?

'Here a bhikkhu, gone to the forest, or to the root of a tree, or to an empty hut, sits down; having folded his legs crosswise, set his body erect, established mindfulness (on the breath) in front of him, always mindful he breaths in, mindful he breathes out.²

'Breathing in long, he understands: "I breathe in long"; breathing out long, he understands: "I breathe out long". Breathing in short, he un-

1. 'Body as a body': this means not confusing, during meditation, body with feeling, mind, etc. The body is contemplated just as body, feelings just as feelings, etc.
2. N. The exercise described is one mental observation not in bodily development or breath control as in Hatha-yoga. This Sutta is much recited today as a basis for meditation. Its subject, the establishment of mindfulness, forms the cornerstone of the Buddha's instruction.

derstands: "I breathe in short"; breathing out short, he understands: "I breathe out short". He trains thus: "I shall breathe in experiencing a whole body"; he trains thus: "I shall breathe out experiencing a whole body". He trains thus: "I shall breathe in tranquillizing the body process"; he trains thus: "I shall breathe out tranquillizing the bodily process".

'Just as skilled turner or his apprentice, when making a long turn understands: "I make a long turn"; or when making a short turn understands: "I make a short turn"; so too, breathing in long, he understands: "I breathe in long"; . . . he trains thus: "I shall breathe out tranquillizing the bodily process".

(INSIGHT)

5. 'In this way he abides contemplating the body as a body in himself, or he abides contemplating the body as a body externally,³ or he abides contemplating the body in himself and externally.

'Or else he abides contemplating in the body its arising factors, or he abides contemplating in the body its vanishing factors, or he abides contemplating in the body its arising and vanishing factors.⁴

'Or else mindfulness that "there is a body" is simply established in him to the extent of bare knowledge and remembrance (of it), while he abides independent, not clinging to anything in the world.

'That is how a bhikkhu abides contemplating the body as a body.

(II. The Four Postures)

6. 'Again, a bhikkhu, when walking, understands: "I walk"; when standing, understands: "I stand"; when sitting, understands: "I sit"; when lying down, understands: "I am lying down"; or however his body is disposed he understands accordingly.

3. N. According to the Commentary, 'externally' means someone else's body, etc.; (but it could also refer to pure objectivity seen in one's own body too); this first paragraph of the refrain emphasizes concentration (samādhi). The second paragraph on arising and falling (decaying), refers to insight (Right View). (These two notes, marked N, and others in this Sutta, are by the translator and quoted from his 'Life of the Buddha' (B.P.S. Kandy, Sri Lanka).

4. Factor is elsewhere untranslated: dhammas. By seeing in oneself dhammas arising and vanishing (or passing away) the first characteristic of all living beings, impermanence, is verified.

7. '... contemplating ... in himself ... externally ... in himself and externally.

'... contemplating ... arising factors ... vanishing factors ... arising and vanishing factors.

'... mindfulness that "there is a body" ... not clinging to anything in the world.

'That also is how a bhikkhu abides contemplating the body as a body.

(III. Full Awareness)

8. 'Again, a bhikkhu is one who acts in full awareness when moving to and fro, who acts in full awareness when looking at and away, who acts in full awareness when flexing and extending, who acts in full awareness when wearing the patched cloak, bowl and robes, who acts in full awareness when feeding, drinking, chewing and supping, who acts in full awareness when evacuating the bowels and making water, who acts in full awareness when walking, standing, sitting, falling asleep, waking up, talking, and keeping silent.

9. '... contemplating ... in himself ... externally ... in himself and externally ... contemplating ... arising factors ... vanishing factors ... arising and vanishing factors ... mindfulness that 'there is a body' ... not clinging to anything in the world.

'That also is how a bhikkhu abides contemplating the body as a body.

(IV. Foulness—The Bodily Parts)

10. 'Again, a bhikkhu reviews this same body up from the soles of the feet and down from the top of the hair as full of many kinds of filth, thus: "In this body there are head-hairs, body-hairs, nails, teeth, skin, flesh, sinews, bones, bone-marrow, kidneys, heart, liver, midriff,⁵ spleen, lungs, bowels, entrails,⁶ gorge, dung, bile, phlegm, pus, blood, sweat, fat, tears, grease,⁷ spittle, snot, oil of the joints and urine."

'Just as though there were a bag with an opening at both (ends) full of many sorts of grain such as hill rice, red rice, beans, peas, millet and white rice, and a man with (clear) eyes had opened it and were

5. This means not only the midriff but all the fascia or tough membranes which bind the various bits and pieces together and keep them in place.

6. In Thai these last two are translated 'large gut, small gut'.

7. 'Grease' means 'skin-grease'.

reviewing it thus: "This is hill rice, this is red rice, these are beans, these are peas, this is millet, this is white rice", so too, a bhikkhu reviews this same body up from the soles of the feet and down from the top of the hair as full of many kinds of filth . . . and urine.

11. ' . . . contemplating . . . in himself . . . externally . . . in himself and externally . . . contemplating . . . arising factors . . . vanishing factors . . . arising and vanishing factors . . . mindfulness that "there is a body" . . . not clinging to anything in the world.

(V. Elements)

12. 'Again, however it is placed, however disposed, a bhikkhu reviews this same body (consisting of) elements, thus: "In this body there are the earth element, the water element, the fire element, and the air element."

'Just as though a skilled butcher or his apprentice had a killed a cow and were seated at the four crossroads with it cut up into pieces; so too, however it is placed, however disposed, a bhikkhu reviews this same body . . . and the air element.

13. ' . . . contemplating . . . in himself . . . externally . . . in himself and externally . . . contemplating . . . arising factors . . . arising and vanishing factors . . . mindfulness that "there is a body" . . . not clinging to anything in the world.

(VI—XIV. The Nine Charnel Grounds)⁸

14. 'Again, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown on a charnel ground, one day dead, two days dead, three days dead, bloated, livid, and oozing matter, thus: "This body too is of such a nature, it will be like that, it is not exempt from that."

15. ' . . . contemplating . . . in himself . . . not clinging to anything in the world.

16. 'Again, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown on a charnel ground, being devoured by crows,

8. Meaning, a place where corpses were thrown and rotted away, common in ancient India where they were used also by monks who wished to stimulate *samvega*, a sense of being deeply stirred or moved by the condition of birth and death.

kites, vultures, dogs, jackals, and the multitudinous kinds of worms, thus: "This body too is of such a nature, it will be like that, it is not exempt from that."

17. '... contemplating ... in himself ... not clinging to anything in the world.

18. 'Again, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown on a charnel ground, a skeleton with flesh and blood held together with sinews, thus: "This body too is of such a nature ..."

19. '... contemplating ... in himself ... not clinging to anything in the world.

20. 'Again, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, a fleshless skeleton smeared with blood and held together with sinews, ...

21. '... contemplating ... in himself ... not clinging to anything in the world.

22. 'Again, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, a skeleton without flesh and blood held together with sinews ...

23. '... contemplating ... in himself ... not clinging to anything in the world.

24. 'Again, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, bones without sinews scattered in all directions, here a hand-bone, there a foot-bone, there a thigh-bone, there a hip-bone, there a back-bone, there a rib-bone, there a breast-bone, there an arm-bone, there a shoulder-bone, there a neck-bone, there a jaw-bone, there a tooth-bone, there the skull ...

25. '... contemplating ... in himself ... not clinging to anything in the world.

26. 'Again, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, bones bleached white, the colour of shells ...

27. '... contemplating ... in himself ... not clinging to anything in the world.

28. 'Again, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, bones heaped up, more than a year old ...

29. '... contemplating ... in himself ... not clinging to anything in the world.

30. 'Again, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, bones rotted and crumbled to dust, thus: "This body too is of such a nature, it will be like that, it is not exempt from that."

(INSIGHT)

31. 'In this way he abides contemplating the body as a body in himself,⁹ or he abides contemplating the body as a body externally, or he abides contemplating the body as a body in himself and externally.

'Or else he abides contemplating in the body its arising factors, or he abides contemplating in the body its vanishing factors, or he abides contemplating in the body its arising and vanishing factors.

'Or else mindfulness that "there is a body" is simply established in him to the extent of bare knowledge and remembrance (of it), while he abides independent, not clinging to anything in the world.

'That also is how a bhikkhu abides contemplating the body as a body.

CONTEMPLATION OF FEELING

32. 'And how does a bhikkhu abide contemplating feelings as feelings?

'Here, when feeling a pleasant feeling, a bhikkhu understands: "I feel a pleasant feeling"; when feeling a painful feeling, he understands: "I feel a painful feeling"; when feeling a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, he understands: "I feel a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling".

When feeling a materialistic pleasant feeling¹⁰ he understands: "I feel

9. In himself, seeing his own body like these corpses; externally perceiving a corpse in a charnel ground.

10. N. 'Materialistic' (āmisā) refers to such physical things as food, clothing etc.; here to the feeling connected with them.

a materialistic pleasant feeling"; when feeling an unmaterialistic pleasant feeling,¹¹ he understands: "I feel an unmaterialistic pleasant feeling"; when feeling a materialistic painful feeling, he understands: "I feel a materialistic painful feeling; when feeling an unmaterialistic painful feeling, he understands: "I feel an unmaterialistic painful feeling"; when feeling a materialistic neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, he understands: "I feel a materialistic neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling"; when feeling an unmaterialistic neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, he understands: "I feel an unmaterialistic neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling".

(INSIGHT)

33. 'In this way he abides contemplating feelings as feelings in himself, or he abides contemplating feelings as feelings externally,¹² or he abides contemplating feelings as feelings in himself and externally.

'Or else he abides contemplating in feeling its arising factors, or he abides contemplating in feeling its vanishing factors, or he abides contemplating in feeling its arising and vanishing factors.

'Or else mindfulness that "there is feeling" is simply established in him to the extent of bare knowledge and remembrance (of it), while he abides independent, not clinging to anything in the world.

'That is how a bhikkhu abides contemplating feelings as feelings.

CONTEMPLATION OF MIND

34. 'And how does a bhikkhu abide contemplating mind as mind?

'Here a bhikkhu understands mind affected by lust as affected by lust, and mind unaffected by lust as unaffected by lust. He understands mind affected by hate as affected by hate, and mind unaffected by hate as unaffected by hate. He understands mind affected by delusion as affected by delusion, and mind unaffected by delusion as unaffected by delusion. He understands contracted mind as contracted,¹³ and distracted mind as distracted. He understands exalted mind as exalted,¹³

11. One associated with making good kamma, for instance from generosity or from meditation practice.

12. He infers the feelings in others. This is only for reflection. since insight can only be practised on the arising and falling of feelings in himself.

13. N. 'Contracted' by lethargy, 'exalted' from the sensual state to a state of jhāna, 'surpassed' in jhāna or in realization.

and unexalted mind as unexalted. He understands surpassed mind as surpassed,¹³ and unsurpassed mind as unsurpassed. He understands concentrated mind as concentrated, and unconcentrated mind as unconcentrated. He understands liberated mind as liberated and unliberated mind as unliberated.

(INSIGHT)

35. 'In this way he abides contemplating mind as mind in himself, or he abides contemplating mind as mind externally,¹⁴ or he abides contemplating mind as mind in himself and externally.

'Or else he abides contemplating in the mind its arising factors, or he abides contemplating in the mind its vanishing factors, or he abides contemplating in the mind its arising and vanishing factors.

'Or else mindfulness that "there is a mind" is simply established in him to the extent of bare knowledge and remembrance (of it), while he abides independent, not clinging to anything in the world.

'That is how a bhikkhu abides contemplating the mind as mind.

CONTEMPLATION OF DHAMMAS

36. 'And how does a bhikkhu abide contemplating dhammas as dhammas?

(I. The Five Hindrances)

'Here a bhikkhu abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the five hindrances.¹⁵

'How does a bhikkhu abide contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the five hindrances?

'Here, there being desire for sensual pleasures in him, a bhikkhu understands: "There is desire for sensual pleasure in me", or there being no desire for sensual pleasures in him, he understands: "There is no desire for sensual pleasures in me", and also he understands how there comes

14. Either only by inference for reflection, or by using the knowledge of others' minds—if he possesses it.

15. N. 'Hindrance' should be taken rather in the sense of, as it were, hedges that keep one in the traffic-stream of lust, hate and delusion, rather than an obstacle that blocks the way.

to be the arising of unarisen desire for sensual pleasures, and he understands how there comes to be the abandoning of arisen desire for sensual pleasures, and he understands how there comes to be the future non-arising of abandoned desire for sensual pleasures.

'There being ill-will in him . . .

'There being lethargy-and-drowsiness in him . . .

'There being agitation-and-worry in him . . .

'There being uncertainty in him . . . the future non-arising of abandoned uncertainty.

(INSIGHT)

37. 'In this way he abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in himself, or he abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas externally, or he abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in himself and externally.

'Or else he abides contemplating in dhammas their arising factors, or he abides contemplating in dhammas their vanishing factors, or he abides contemplating in dhammas their arising and vanishing factors

'Or else mindfulness that "there are dhammas" is simply established in him to the extent of bare knowledge and remembrance (of it), while he abides independent, not clinging to anything in the world.

'That is how a bhikkhu abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the five hindrances.

(II. The Five Aggregates)

38. 'Again, a bhikkhu abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the five aggregates affected by clinging.

'And how does a bhikkhu abide contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the five aggregates affected by clinging?

'Here a bhikkhu (knows): "Such is form, such its origin, such its disappearance; such is feeling, such its origin, such its disappearance; such is perception, such its origin, such its disappearance; such are formations, such their origin, such their disappearance; such is consciousness, such its origin, such its disappearance".

39. ' . . . contemplating . . . in himself . . . externally . . . in himself and externally . . . contemplating . . . arising factors . . . vanishing factors . . . arising and vanishing factors . . . mindfulness that "there are dhammas" . . . not clinging to anything in the world.

(III. The Six Bases)

40. 'Again, a bhikkhu abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the six in-oneself/external bases.

'And how does a bhikkhu abide contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the six in-oneself/external bases?

'Here a bhikkhu understands the eye, he understands forms, and he understands the fetter that arises dependent on both; he understands how there comes to be the arising of the unarisen fetter, he understands how there comes to be the abandoning of the arisen fetter, and he understands how there comes to be the future non-arising of the abandoned fetter.

'He understands the ear, he understands sounds . . .

'He understands the nose, he understands odours . . .

'He understands the tongue, he understands flavours . . .

'He understands the body, he understands tangibles . . .

'He understands the mind, he understands dhammas, and he understands the fetter that arises dependent on both, he understands how there comes to be the arising of the unarisen fetter, he understands how there comes to be the abandoning of the arisen fetter, and he understands how there comes to be the future non-arising of the abandoned fetter.

41. ' . . . contemplating . . . in himself . . . externally . . . in himself and externally . . . contemplating . . . arising factors . . . vanishing factors . . . arising and vanishing factors . . . mindfulness that "there are dhammas" . . . not clinging to anything in the world.

(IV. The Seven Enlightenment Factors)

42. 'Again, a bhikkhu abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the seven enlightenment factors.

'And how he does a bhikkhu abide contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the seven enlightenment factors?

'Here, there being the mindfulness enlightenment factor in him, a bhikkhu understands: "There is the mindfulness enlightenment factor in me", there being no mindfulness enlightenment factor in him, he understands: "There is no mindfulness enlightenment factor in me"; and also he understands how there comes to be the arising of the unarisen mindfulness enlightenment factor, and he understands how the arisen mindfulness enlightenment factor comes to be developed and perfected.

'There being the investigation-of-dhammas enlightenment factor in him ...

'There being the energy enlightenment factor in him ...

'There being the happiness factor in him ...

'There being the tranquillity enlightenment factor in him ...

'There being the concentration enlightenment factor in him ...

'There being the equanimity enlightenment factor in him ... he understands: "There is the equanimity enlightenment factor in me", there being no equanimity enlightenment factor in him, he understands: "There is no equanimity enlightenment factor in me", and also he understands how there comes to be the arising of the unarisen equanimity enlightenment factor, and he understands how the arisen equanimity enlightenment factor comes to be developed and perfected.

43. '... contemplating ... in himself ... externally ... in himself and externally ... contemplating ... arising factors ... vanishing factors ... arising and vanishing factors ... mindfulness that "there are dhammas" ... not clinging to anything in the world.

(V. The Four Noble Truths)

44. 'Again, a bhikkhu abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the Four Noble Truths.

'And how does a bhikkhu abide contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the Four Noble Truths?

'Here a bhikkhu understands as it actually is that: "Such is suffering"; he understands as it actually is: "Such is the origin of suffering"; he understands as it actually is: "Such is the cessation of suffering"; he understands as it actually is: "Such is the way leading to the cessation of suffering".

45. 'In this way he abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in himself, or he abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas externally, or he abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in himself and externally.

'Or else he abides contemplating in dhammas their arising factors, or he abides contemplating in dhammas their vanishing factors or he abides contemplating in dhammas their arising and vanishing factors.

'Or else mindfulness that "there are dhammas" is simply established in him to the extent of bare knowledge and remembrance (of it), while

he abides independent, not clinging to anything in the world.

'That is how a bhikkhu abides contemplating dhammas as dhammas in (terms of) the Four Noble Truths.

(Conclusion)

46. 'Bhikkhus, were anyone to develop these four foundations of mindfulness for seven years, one of two fruits could be expected for him: either final knowledge here and now, or if there is a trace of clinging left, non-return.¹⁶

'Let alone seven years, were anyone to develop these four foundations for six years . . .

'Let alone six years . . . for five years . . .

'Let alone five years . . . for four years . . .

'Let alone four years . . . for three years . . .

'Let alone three years . . . for two years . . .

'Let alone two years . . . for one year . . .

'Let alone one year . . . for seven months . . .

'Let alone seven months . . . for six months . . .

'Let alone six months . . . for five months . . .

'Let alone five months . . . for four months . . .

'Let alone four months . . . for three months . . .

'Let alone three months . . . for two months . . .

'Let alone two months . . . for one month . . .

'Let alone one month . . . for half a month . . .

'Let alone half a month, were anyone to develop these four foundations of mindfulness for seven days, one of two fruits could be expected for him: either final knowledge here and now, or if there is a trace of clinging left, non-return.

47. 'So it was in reference to this that it was said: "Bhikkhus, this path, namely, the four foundations of mindfulness, is a path that he goes in one way only: to the purification of beings, to the surmounting of sorrow and lamentation, to the disappearance of pain and grief, to the attainment of the true way, to the realization of Nibbāna."

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and delighted in the Blessed One's words.

16. That is it could be expected that a diligent practitioner would reach either Arahantship or become a Non-returner.

Notes

para. 2. *ekāyana*—goes in one way only: Cf. Sutta 12, para. 37 and KhpA. 15.

For the construction of the sentence '*Kammāssa dammam nāma kūrūnam nigamo*' cf. M.ii, 119: '*atthi Mahārāja, Medalumpani nāma sakyānam nigamo*.'

para. 3. *loka*—world=this body and its world.

para. 4. *sabbakāya-ṭṭisaṃvedī*—experiencing the whole body: the 'body' here=the breaths taken as a 'body' in the sense of a group in continuity. See Sutta 118, para. 37 (end). (For the author's translation of this Sutta, Mindfulness of Breathing, see the book of this title published by B.P.S., Kandy).

'*Kaya-samkhāra*—the bodily process' is defined as in-breaths and out-breaths' at Sutta 44, para. 14.

para. 34. The meaning of the word 'exalted' (*mahaggata*—lit. 'gone big') is usually that of consciousness exalted from the sensual-desire element to the form element or formless element (i.e. by the Eight Attainments); Cf. also use at Sutta 127, para. 8.

para. 40. Compare Sutta 18, para. 16 and Sutta 148, para. 37, for how the fetter arises and ceases. For the future non-arising of what is abandoned, cf. Sutta 22, para. 34, cte. (The Simile of the Snake, not included in this selection. See Ven. Nyānaponika Mahāthera's translation in "The Wheel" series, B.P.S. Kandy).

Kayagatasati Sutta¹

Mindfulness of the Body

Introduction

Since this body is normally reckoned as 'mine', most people would say that they were sufficiently aware of it. But this is not the case when one knows what the Buddha means by mindfulness of the body. One discovers that one's body, which one thought one knew so well, is like the unexplored lands on old maps—largely a blank. And because this 'land' has not been explored using the various exercises for contemplation, so lust and attachment can continue to lurk in the dark jungles of the mind. The subject of this Sutta has been highly praised by the Buddha in many short sayings which are now gathered together in the Book of the Ones, Anguttara-Nikaya. Here is an example of such a saying: 'Bhikkhus, they do not savour the Deathless who do not savour mindfulness of the body; they savour the Deathless who savour mindfulness of the body.' (A.i, 45). So our usual unmindfulness of the body is the way to keep ourselves in the painfulness of repeated birth and death, while this mindfulness directed to the body 'when developed and repeatedly practised' leads to the Deathless State, to Nibbāna. Good reason to practise it, then, specially when one reads at the conclusion of this Sutta the ten advantages which can be expected.

1. For the translator's rendering of Sutta 118—Mindfulness of Breathing see the separate book of that name issued by B.P.S. Kandy.

The Sutta (85)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park.

2. Then a number of bhikkhus were sitting in the assembly hall where they had met together on return from their alms-round after their meal was over. Meanwhile it was being said among them: 'It is wonderful, friends, it is marvellous, how mindfulness of the body¹ has been said by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, to be of great fruit, of great benefit when developed and repeatedly practised!'

Then their talk meanwhile was left unfinished for the Blessed One rose from meditation now when it was evening, and he came to the assembly hall and sat down on a seat made ready. When he had done so, he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'For what talk are you gathered here together now, bhikkhus? And what was your talk meanwhile which was left unfinished?'

'Here, venerable sir, we were sitting in the assembly hall where we had met together on return from our alms-round after our meal. Meanwhile it was being said amongst us: "It wonderful, friends . . . and repeatedly practised!" This was our talk meanwhile, venerable sir, which was left unfinished, for then the Blessed One arrived.'

3. 'And how developed, bhikkhus, how repeatedly practised is mindfulness of the body of great fruit, of great benefit?

'Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu gone to the forest or to the root of a tree or to an empty hut, sits down; having folded his legs crosswise, set his body erect, established mindfulness before him, just mindful he breathes in, mindful he breathes out.

'Breathing in long, he understands: "I breathe in long"; breathing out long, he understands: "I breathe out long". Breathing in short, he understands: "I breathe in short"; breathing out short, he understands: "I breathe out short". He trains thus: "I shall breathe in experiencing a whole body"; he trains thus: "I shall breathe out experiencing a whole body".

1. In some places the translator has 'mindfulness occupied with the body'; it would also be possible to translate 'mindfulness directed at the body': in both cases translating 'gata' (lit. 'gone to').

trains thus: "I shall breathe in tranquillizing the body process"; he trains thus: "I shall breathe out tranquillizing the bodily process".

'Just as a skilled turner or his apprentice, when making a long turn understands: "I make a long turn"; or when making a short turn understands: "I make a short turn"; so too, breathing in long, he understands: "I breathe in long";...he trains thus: "I shall breathe out tranquillizing the bodily process".

4. 'As he abides thus diligent, ardent and self-controlled, his memories and intentions based on the household life are abandoned; with their abandoning his mind becomes settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated. That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

5. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu when walking, understands: "I walk"; when standing, understands: "I stand"; when sitting, understands: "I sit"; when lying down, understands: "I am lying down"; or however his body is disposed he understands accordingly.

6. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

7. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu is one who acts in full awareness when moving to and fro, who acts in full awareness when looking at and away, who acts in full awareness when flexing and extending, who acts in full awareness when wearing the patched cloak, bowl and robes, who acts in full awareness when feeding, drinking and supping, who acts in full awareness when evacuating the bowels and making water, who acts in full awareness when walking, standing, sitting, falling asleep, waking up, talking, and keeping silent.

8. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

9. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu reviews this same body up from the soles of the feet and down from the top of the hair as full of many kinds of filth, thus: "In this body there are head-hairs, body-hairs, nails, teeth, skin, flesh, sinews, bones, bone-marrow, kidneys, heart, liver,

midriff,² spleen, lungs, bowels, entrails,³ gorge, dung, bile, phlegm, pus, blood, sweat, fat, tears, grease,⁴ spittle, snot, oil of the joints and urine”.

‘Just as though there were a bag with an opening at both (ends) full of many sorts of grain such as hill rice, red rice, beans, peas, millet and white rice, and a man with (clear) eyes had opened it and were reviewing it thus: “This is hill rice, this is red rice, these are beans, these are peas, this is millet, this is white rice”, so too, a bhikkhu reviews this same body up from the soles of the feet and down from the top of the hair as full of many kinds of filth “. . . and urine”.

10. ‘As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

11. ‘Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu reviews this same body however it is placed (consisting of) elements, thus: “In this body there are the earth element, the water element, the fire element, and the air element”.

‘Just as though a skilled butcher or his apprentice had killed a cow and were seated at the four crossroads with it cut up into pieces; so too, however it is placed, however disposed, a bhikkhu reviews this same body “. . . and the air element”.

12. ‘As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

13. ‘Again, bhikkhus, as though a bhikkhu here were looking at bodily remains thrown on a charnel ground one day dead, two days dead, three days dead, bloated, livid, and oozing matter, thus: “This body too is of such a nature, it will be like that, it is not exempt from that”.

14. ‘As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

15. ‘Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown on a charnel ground, being devoured by crows, kites, vultures, dogs, jackals, and the multitudinous

2. This means not only the midriff but all the fascia or tough membranes which bind the various bits and pieces together and keep them in place.

3. In Thai these last two are translated ‘large gut, small gut.’

4. ‘Grease’ means ‘skin-grease’.

kinds of worms, thus: "This body too is of such a nature, it will be like that, it is not exempt from that".

16. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

17. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown on a charnel ground, a skeleton with flesh and blood held together with sinews, thus: "This body too is of such a nature, it is not exempt from that".

18. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

19. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, a fleshless skeleton smeared with blood and held together with sinews "... it is not exempt from that".

20. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

21. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, a skeleton without flesh and blood held together with sinews "... it is not exempt from that".

22. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

23. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, bones without sinews scattered in all directions: here a hand-bone, there a foot-bone, there a shin-bone, there a thigh-bone, there a hip-bone, there a back-bone, there a rib-bone, there a breast-bone, there an arm-bone, there a shoulder-bone, there a neck-bone, there a jaw-bone, there a tooth-bone, there the skull "...it is not exempt from that".

24. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

25. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, bones bleached white, the colour of shells "... it is not exempt from that".

26. 'As he abides thus diligent ... That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

27. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, bones heaped up, more than a year old "... it is not exempt from that".

28. 'As he abides thus diligent ... That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

29. 'Again, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu judges this same body as though he were looking at bodily remains thrown in a charnel ground, bones rotted and crumbled to dust, thus: "This body too is of such a nature, it will be like that, it is not exempt from that".

30. 'As he abides thus diligent, ardent and self-controlled, his memories and intentions based on the household life are abandoned; with their abandoning his mind becomes settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated. That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

31. 'Again, bhikkhus, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, he enters upon and abides in the first jhāna which is accompanied by initial and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of seclusion.

32. 'He makes happiness and pleasure born of seclusion drench, steep, fill and extend throughout his whole body, so that there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of seclusion do not extend. Just as a skilled bath man or bath man's apprentice heaps bath powder in a metal basin and, sprinkling it gradually with water, kneads it up till the moisture wets his ball of bath powder, soaks it, and extends over it within and without though it does not itself become liquid, so too, a bhikkhu makes happiness and pleasure born of seclusion drench, steep, fill, and extend throughout this whole body, so that there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of seclusion do not extend.

33. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . mindfulness of the body.

34. 'Again, bhikkhus, with the stilling of initial and sustained application he enters upon and abides in the second jhāna, which has self-confidence and singleness of mind, without initial application and without sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of concentration.

35. 'He makes happiness and pleasure born of concentration drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of concentration do not extend. Just as though there were a lake whose waters welled up (from below), having no inflow from east, west, north or south, nor yet replenished from time to time by the skies with showers, then the cool fount of water welling up in the lake would make the cool water drench, steep, fill and extend throughout the lake, and there would be nothing of the whole lake to which the cool water did not extend, so, too, the bhikkhu makes happiness and pleasure born of concentration drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, so that there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of concentration do not extend.

36. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . mindfulness of the body.

37. 'Again, bhikkhus, with the fading as well of happiness he abides in equanimity, and mindful and fully aware, still feeling pleasure with the body, he enters upon and abides in the third jhāna, on account of which the Noble Ones announce: "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful."

38. 'He makes pleasure divested of happiness drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the pleasure divested of happiness does not extend. Just as, in a water-lily pond or a white lotus pond or a red lotus pond some water-lilies or white lotuses or red lotuses are born under the water, grow under the water, do not stand up out of the water, flourish immersed under the water, and cool water drenches, steeps, fill and extends throughout them, to their tips and to their roots, and there is nothing of the whole of those water-lilies, those white lotuses, those red lotuses, to which the cool water does not extend, so too, the bhikkhu makes

pleasure divested of happiness drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which pleasure divested of happiness does not extend.

39. 'As he abides thus diligent . . . mindfulness of the body.

40. 'Again, bhikkhus, with the abandoning of pleasure and pain and with the previous disappearance of joy and grief, he enters upon and abides in the fourth jhāna, which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure, and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.

41. 'He sits with pure bright mind extending over this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the pure bright mind does not extend. Just as though a man were sitting clothed from head to foot in white cloth, and there were nothing of his whole body to which the white cloth did not extend, so too, the bhikkhu sits with a pure bright mind extending over this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the pure bright mind does not extend.

42. 'As he abides thus diligent, ardent and self-controlled, his memories and intentions based on the household life are abandoned; with their abandoning his mind becomes settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness, and concentrated. That is how a bhikkhu develops mindfulness of the body.

43. 'When anyone has developed and repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, he has included whatever profitable dhammas there are that partake of true knowledge.

'Just as anyone who extends his mind over the great ocean has included whatever streams there are that flow into the ocean, so too, when anyone has developed and repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, he has included whatever profitable dhammas there are that partake of true knowledge.

44. 'When anyone has not developed or repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, Māra finds an opportunity and a support in him.

45. 'Suppose a man were to throw a heavy stone ball at a heap of wet clay; what do you think, bhikkhus, would that heavy stone ball find an entry into that heap of wet clay?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'So too, bhikkhus, when anyone has not developed or repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, Māra finds an opportunity and a support in him.

46. 'Suppose there were a dry sapless piece of wood and man came with an upper fire-stick, thinking: "I shall light a fire, I shall produce heat"; what do you think, bhikkhus, would the man light a fire and produce heat by rubbing the dry sapless piece of wood with an upper fire-stick?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'So too, bhikkhus, when anyone has not developed or repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, Māra finds an opportunity and a support in him.

47. 'Suppose there were a hollow empty water pot standing on a stand and a man came with a load of water; what do you think, bhikkhus, would he be able to pour water into it?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'So too, bhikkhus, when anyone has not developed or repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, Māra finds an opportunity and a support in him.

48. 'When anyone has developed and repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, Māra finds no opportunity or support in him.

49. 'Suppose a man were to throw a light ball of string at a door-panel all made of heartwood; what do you think, bhikkhus, would that light ball of string find an entry into that door-panel all made of heartwood?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'So too, bhikkhus, when anyone has developed and repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, Māra finds no opportunity or support in him..

50. 'Suppose there were a wet sappy piece of wood, and a man came with an upper fire-stick, thinking, "I shall light a fire, I shall produce heat"; what do you think, bhikkhus, would the man light a fire and produce heat by taking the upper fire-stick and rubbing the wet sappy piece of wood with it?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'So too, bhikkhus, when anyone has developed and repeatedly prac-

tised mindfulness of the body, Māra finds no opportunity or support in him.

51. 'Suppose there were a water pot full of water, brimming so that crows could drink out of it, standing on a stand, and man came with a load of water; what do you think, bhikkhus, would he be able to pour water into it?'

'No, venerable sir.'

'So too, bhikkhus, when anyone has developed and repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, Māra finds no opportunity or support in him.

52. 'When anyone has developed and repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, (then) he attains the ability to be a witness, through realization by direct knowledge, of any dhamma realizable by direct knowledge to which he inclines his mind, whenever there is opportunity.

53. 'Suppose there were a water pot full of water, brimming so that crows could drink out of it, standing on a stand, then as soon as a strong man tipped it would water come (from it) each time?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'So too, bhikkhus, when anyone has developed and repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body, (then) he attains the ability to be a witness, through realization by direct knowledge, of any dhamma realizable by direct knowledge to which he inclines his mind, whenever there is opportunity.

54. 'Suppose there were a square pond on a level piece of ground, surrounded by an embankment, full of water, brimming so that crows could drink out of it, then as soon as a strong man loosened the embankment would water come (from it) each time?'

'Yes, venerable sir.'

'So too, bhikkhus, when anyone has developed and repeatedly practised mindfulness of the body . . . whenever there is opportunity.

55. 'Suppose there were a chariot on even ground at the four cross-roads, harnessed to thoroughbreds, waiting with whips lying ready, so that a skilled trainer, a driver of horses to be tamed, might mount, and taking the reins in his hand, drive out and back by any road in any way he liked, so too, bhikkhus, when anyone has developed and re-

peatedly practised mindfulness of the body... whenever there is opportunity.

56. 'When mindfulness of the body is developed, repeatedly practised, made the vehicle, made the basis, established, consolidated, and properly undertaken, these ten rewards may be expected. What ten?

57. 'He becomes a conqueror of aversion and delight and aversion does not conquer him, and he abides transcending aversion as it arises.

58. 'He becomes a conqueror of fear and dread, fear and dread do not conquer him, and he abides transcending fear and dread as they arise.

59. 'He becomes one who bears cold and heat, hunger and thirst and contact with mosquitoes, flies, wind, sun and creeping things, who endures ill-spoken unwelcome words and arisen bodily feelings that are painful, racking, sharp, piercing, disagreeable, distressing, and menacing to life.

60. 'He becomes one who obtains at will with no trouble and easily the four jhānas which are the higher mind and provide a pleasant abiding here and now.

61. 'He wields the various kinds of supernormal success... (as in Sutta 77, para. 31)... even as far as the world of the Divinity (Brahmā).

62. 'With the heavenly ear element... (Sutta 77, para. 32)... far as well as near.

63. 'He encompasses with his mind the minds of other beings... (Sutta 77, para. 33)... the unliberated mind as unliberated.

64. 'He recollects his manifold past life... (Sutta 77, para. 34)... with its details and particulars.

65. 'With the heavenly eyesight... (Sutta 77, para. 35)... according to their kammās.

66. 'By realization himself with direct knowledge here and now, he enters upon and abides in the deliverance of the heart and the deliverance by understanding that are taint-free with exhaustion of taints.

67. 'When mindfulness of the body is developed, repeatedly practised,

made the vehicle, made the basis, established, consolidated, and properly undertaken, these ten rewards may be expected.'

This is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 52. See VisA 248-9 for commentary: *sati sati āyātane'ti* tasmim tasmim pubbahetu-ādi kāraṇe sati.

Bahuedaniya Sutta

The Many Kinds Of Feeling

Introduction

People who have rigid minds adhere to the wording of doctrines. Even when those doctrines are true, their rigidity makes for disputes because they adopt an uncompromising attitude towards someone else's teaching—which may also be true. When we speak about standards of truth, for Buddhists this must mean that what is being taught does not run counter to the Four Noble Truths, especially not to the third of these, which is Nibbāna. Those who do not measure their statements against the four truths may easily adhere to false views, but even when Dhamma is spoken the wording of it should not be clung to. The meaning also should be investigated. This is why the Buddha's teaching is characterized as 'with right meaning and phrasing' in which not only the words must be remembered but the meaning considered too. Where great learning—expertness with words, is combined with intelligence which understands the right meaning, and backed up with practice and perhaps penetration too, then there can be no disputes. The Buddha continues discoursing upon the various kinds of feeling—which are not explained in this Sutta (but see the translator's notes), and then deals with the various experiential levels based on which dogmatic statements could be made that 'this is the apex of pleasant feeling'. The Buddha does not accept any of these statements, and even the cessation of perception and feeling is described as pleasure.

The Sutta (59)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park.

2. Then the Carpenter Pañcakanga went to the venerable Udāyin, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he asked him:

3. 'Venerable sir, how many kinds of feeling have been stated by the Blessed One?'

'Three kinds of feeling have been stated by the Blessed One, householder: pleasant feeling, painful feeling, and neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling. These three kinds of feeling have been stated by the Blessed One.'

'Not three kinds of feeling have been stated by the Blessed One, venerable Udāyin; two kinds of feeling have been stated by the Blessed One: pleasant feeling and painful feeling. This neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling has been stated by the Blessed One as a peaceful and superior (type of) pleasure.'

A second time . . .

A third time the venerable Udāyin told the carpenter Pañcakanga: 'Not two kinds of feeling have been stated by the Blessed One, householder; three kinds of feeling have been stated by the Blessed One: pleasant feeling, painful feeling, and neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling. These three kinds of feeling . . .'

For the third time the carpenter Pañcakanga said: 'Not three kinds of feeling . . . venerable Udāyin; two kinds of feeling . . . Neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling . . . a peaceful and superior (type of) pleasure.'

The venerable Udāyin could not make the carpenter Pañcakanga perceive nor could the carpenter Pañcakanga make the venerable Udāyin perceive.

4. The venerable Ānanda heard their conversation. Then he went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he reported to the Blessed One the conversation

between the venerable Udāyin and Pañcakanga the carpenter. When this was said, the Blessed One told the venerable Ānanda:

5. 'Ānanda, it was actually a true presentation that Pañcakanga the carpenter would not accept from Udāyin, and it was actually a true presentation that Udāyin would not accept from Pañcakanga the carpenter. I have stated two kinds of feeling in one presentation. I have stated three kinds of feeling in another presentation. I have stated five kinds of feeling in another presentation. I have stated six kinds of feeling in another presentation. I have stated eighteen kinds of feeling in another presentation. I have stated thirty-six kinds of feeling in another presentation. I have stated one hundred and eight kinds of feeling in another presentation. That is how the Dhamma has been shown by me in (different) presentations; and when the Dhamma has been shown by me in (different) presentations thus, it may be expected of those who will not concede, allow and accept what is well-stated, well-spoken, by each that they will abide quarelling, brawling and disputing, stabbing each other with verbal daggers. That is how the Dhamma has been shown by me in (different) presentations; and when the Dhamma has been shown by me in (different) presentations thus, it may be expected of those who concede, allow and accept what is well-stated, well-spoken, by each that they will abide in concord as friendly and undisputing as milk with water, viewing each other with kindly eyes.

6. 'There are these five cords of sensual desire. What are the five? Forms cognizable by the eye that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likeable, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust. Sounds cognizable by the ear . . . odours cognizable by the nose . . . flavours cognizable by the tongue . . . tangibles cognizable by the body that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likeable, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust. These are the five cords of sensual desire.

'Now the pleasure and joy that arise dependent on these five cords of sensual desire is called pleasure in sensual desires.

7. 'Should anyone say: "The pleasure and joy that beings experience is that at the utmost", I would not concede that to him. Why is that? Because there is another kind of pleasure loftier than that pleasure and superior. And what is that? Here quite secluded from sensual desires,

secluded from unprofitable dhammas, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the first jhāna, which is accompanied by initial application and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of seclusion. This is the other kind of pleasure loftier than that pleasure and superior.

8. 'Should anyone say: "The pleasure and joy that beings experience is that at the utmost", I would not concede that to him. Why is that? Because there is another kind of pleasure loftier than that pleasure and superior. And what is that? Here with the stilling of initial and sustained application . . . second jhāna . . .

9. ' . . . third jhāna . . .

10. ' . . . fourth jhāna . . .

11. ' . . . base consisting of the infinity of space . . .

12. ' . . . base consisting of the infinity of consciousness . . .

13. ' . . . base consisting of nothingness . . .

14. ' . . . base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception . . .

15. 'Should anyone say: "The pleasure and joy that beings experience is that at the utmost", I would not concede that to him. Why is that? Because there is another kind of pleasure loftier than that pleasure and superior. And what is that? Here, by completely surmounting the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the cessation of perception and feeling. This is the other kind of pleasure loftier than that pleasure and superior.

16. 'An instance might be found of Wanderers of other sects saying thus: "The monk Gotama speaks of cessation of perception and feeling and he describes that as pleasure: What is this, and how is this?" Wanderers of other sects who say thus can be told: "Friends, the Blessed One describes pleasure with reference not only to pleasant feeling; rather, friends, a Tathāgata describes as pleasure any kind of pleasure wherever and whereinsoever it is obtained."'

That is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Ānanda was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 5. See S.iv, 231:

2 kinds of feeling: bodily and mental.

3 kinds of feeling: pleasant, painful, neither-painful-nor-pleasant. Sutta 44, para. 22

5 kinds of feeling: (bodily) pleasure, (mental) joy, (bodily) pain, (mental) grief, neither-pain-nor-pleasure.

6 kinds of feeling: according to the six bases: eye, etc.

(6 kinds of feeling: pleasure, joy, pain, grief, neither-pain-nor-pleasure (bodily), neither-pain-nor-pleasure (mental). Sutta 44, para. 23).

18 kinds of feeling: according to the six bases multiplied by pleasure, pain, neither-pain-nor-pleasure. (See, the eighteen mental approaches, *manopavicara*, Sutta 137, para. 8).

36 kinds of feeling: the 18 kinds multiplied by: in oneself, and external (Also, as the last but based on household life and based on renunciation, M. 137)

108 kinds of feeling: the 36 kinds multiplied by past, future and present.

Dvedhavitakka Sutta

Two Kinds of Thinking

Introduction

This Sutta opens with the words 'before my enlightenment, while I was still only an unenlightened Bodhisatta'. We may not be Bodhisattas but we are unenlightened so the Dhamma of this Sutta has some application to our condition. If we are to apply it, then we shall need mindfulness enough to distinguish Wrong Intention—which is thoughts of sensual desire, ill-will and cruelty, from the second factor of the Noble Eightfold Path, Right Intention—thoughts of renunciation, non-ill-will and non-cruelty. The last two are, positively phrased, loving-kindness (*mettā*) and compassion (*karunā*). On becoming aware of thoughts of sensual desire, ill-will or cruelty, one should consider them in this way: *They harm me* or *They harm others* or *They harm both* or *They prevent the development of insight-wisdom, increase trouble and lead away from Nibbāna*. It is well to note the warning that the way a person habitually thinks will increase his tendency to think like that in future. The other kind of thinking, with renunciation, loving-kindness and compassion, should be cultivated because it will never lead to any being's harm and does lead to Nibbāna. Still, continuous thought of this sort could be tiring (and all kinds of thinking is tiring) which makes for a troubled mind and loss of concentration. So even this stage of training should be transcended by meditation to become one-pointed in *jhāna*. The Sutta closes with the famous simile of the herd of deer which illustrates the Buddha's Great Compassion to lead beings out of the marsh of sensual desires to the safe and good path that leads to their happiness.

The Sutta (19)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable Sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, before my enlightenment, while I was still only an unenlightened Bodhisatta, it occurred to me: "Suppose that I divide my thinking into two classes?" Then I set on one side thinking with sensual desires, thinking with ill-will, and thinking with cruelty, and I set on the other side thinking with renunciation, thinking with non-ill-will,¹ and thinking with non-cruelty.

3. 'As I dwelt thus, diligent, ardent and self-controlled, thinking with sensual desire arose in me. I understood thus: "There is this thinking with sensual desire arisen in me. And that leads to my own affliction, to others' affliction and to the affliction of both; it obstructs understanding, promotes annoyance, and leads away from Nibbāna." When I considered: "This leads to my own affliction", it subsided in me; when I considered: "This leads to others' affliction", it subsided in me; when I considered: "This leads to the affliction of both", it subsided in me; when I considered: "This obstructs understanding, promotes annoyance and leads away from Nibbāna", it subsided in me. Whenever thinking with sensual desire arose in me, I abandoned it, removed it, did away with it.

'As I dwelt thus, diligent, ardent and self-controlled, thinking with ill-will arose in me . . . I abandoned it, removed it, did away with it.

'As I dwelt thus, diligent, ardent, and self-controlled, thinking with cruelty arose in me . . . I abandoned it, removed it, did away with it.

4. 'In whatever way a bhikkhu keeps thinking and pondering, that will effect the inclination of his mind accordingly.

5. 'If he keeps thinking with sensual desire and pondering with sensual desire, he has abandoned thinking with renunciation to cultivate think-

1. 'Non-ill-will' is all states of mind based upon mettā or loving-kindness while 'non-cruelty' includes all those based upon karunā or compassion.

ing with sensual desire, and then his mind is inclined to thinking with sensual desire.

'If he keeps thinking with ill-will . . . his mind his mind is inclined to thinking with ill-will.

'If he keeps thinking with cruelty . . . his mind is inclined to thinking with cruelty.

6. 'Just as, in the last month of the Rains, in the autumn season when the crops thicken, a herdsman would guard his cows (constantly) tapping and poking them on this side and that with a stick to check and curb them. Why is that? Because he foresees the flogging or imprisonment or loss or blame that could befall (him if he let them stray into the crops), so too, I foresaw in unprofitable dhammas a danger of degradation and defilement, and in profitable dhammas a blessing in renunciation, which blessing is on the side of cleansing.

7. 'As I dwelt thus, diligent, ardent and self-controlled thinking with renunciation arose in me. I understood thus: "There is this thinking with renunciation arisen in me. And that does not lead to my own affliction, or to others' affliction or to the affliction of both, it aids understanding, does not promote annoyance and leads to Nibbāna. If I think with that and ponder with that even for a night, even for a day, even for a night and day, I foresee nothing to fear from it: only that with the continuous thinking and pondering I might tire my body, and a tired body harries the mind, and a harried mind is far from concentration." (Accordingly), I settled mind in myself, quieted it, brought it to singleness and concentrated it. Why is that? So that my mind should not be harried.

'As I dwelt thus, diligent ardent and self-controlled, thinking with non-ill-will arose in me . . . my mind should not be harried.

'As I dwelt thus, diligent, ardent and self-controlled, thinking with non-cruelty arose in me . . . my mind should not be harried.

8. 'In whatever way a bhikkhu keeps thinking and pondering, that will affect the inclination of his mind accordingly.

9. 'If he keeps thinking with renunciation and pondering with renunciation, he has abandoned thinking with sensual desire to cultivate thinking

with renunciation, and then his mind is inclined to thinking with renunciation.

'If he keeps thinking with non-ill-will . . . his mind is inclined to thinking with non-ill-will.

'If he keeps thinking with non-cruelty . . . his mind is inclined to thinking with non-cruelty.

10. 'Just as in the last month of the Heat, when all the crops have been brought inside the villages, a herdsman would guard his cows while staying at the root of a tree out in the open since he needs only to be mindful that the cows are there; so too there was need for me only to be mindful that those dhammas were there.

11-22. 'Tireless energy was aroused in me (as in Sutta 4, para. 22-33) as (happens) in one who abides diligent, ardent and self-controlled.

23. 'Suppose that in a wooded range there was a great low-lying marsh, near which a big herd of deer lived, and then a man appeared seeking what was not their good, their welfare, their surcease of bondage, and he closed the safe and good path that led to their happiness and opened a false path, and he put out a decoy and set up a dummy, so that later on the big herd of deer might come to loss, ruin and calamity; but suppose some man came seeking their good, their welfare, their surcease of bondage, and he reopened the safe and good path that led to their happiness and closed the false path, and he harried away the decoy and destroyed the dummy, so that later on the big herd of deer might come to growth, increase and fulfilment.

24. 'Bhikkhus, I have given you this simile in order to intimate a meaning. Now the meaning here is this: The great low-lying marsh stands for sensual desires; the big herd of deer stands for beings, the man who sought what was not their good, their happiness and their surcease of bondage stands for Māra the Evil One; the false path stands for the wrong Eightfold Path, that is to say, wrong view, wrong intention, wrong speech, wrong action, wrong livelihood, wrong effort, wrong mindfulness, wrong concentration, the decoy stands for delight and lust, the dummy stands for ignorance, the man seeking their good, their happiness and their surcease of bondage stands for the Tathāgata, Arahant and

Full Enlightened, the safe and good path that led to their happiness stands for the Noble Eightfold Path, that is to say, right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.

25. 'So, bhikkhus, the safe and good path that leads to happiness has been reopened by me, the wrong path has been closed, the decoy harried away, and the dummy destroyed.

26. 'What should be done for his disciples out of pity by a Master who seeks their welfare and has pity (on them), that I have done for you. There these roots of trees, these empty huts. Develop meditation, bhikkhus, do not delay lest you later regret it. This is our message to you.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 7. and 23: *ūhanati*—to harry: See also Sutta 36, para. 22.

para. 3. *okacāra*—decoy and *okacarika*—dummy: the Comy. explains as a (male) spotted deer and a (female) doe attached by a long rope, but then the use of the respective verbs remains unexplained, unless *ūhanati* here has a different meaning to para. 7 (it seems unlikely that such an unusual word should be used in two senses in the same Sutta) and is taken as 'to remove'.

para. *bandha*—imprisonment: this meaning is not in P.T.S. Dict.; cf. *Va-dhabandhana*.

Vitakkasanthana Sutta

The Quieting of Thoughts

Introduction

The subject here must interest all meditators! At the beginning of the Sutta, though, it is mentioned that the five methods described here can be used *by one who is pursuing the Higher Mind*. This means making intensive efforts towards mental purity *based on the Higher Moral Conduct*. Meditation will never succeed when one's bodily and verbal conduct is not purified. These methods will only be effective with that basis. They are in order:

replacement of evil thoughts
the danger of them
forgetting and non-attention to them
the settling of thought-formations, and
the forcible suppression of them.

Before use of the last one, the first four should always be tried. In fact the last method is only to be used if the first four methods fail. Each of them has a simile which illustrates what they mean and if further explanation is needed, the Commentary to this Sutta has also been translated¹.

When one is trained well in the Dhamma then one 'will think the thoughts he wishes, and he will not think the thoughts he does not wish' and such a person is called 'master of the courses of thought processes'. Such a person is also an Arahant. There is plenty left for us to do!

1. "The Removal of Distracting Thoughts", Wheel No. 21, B.P.S., Kandy.

The Sutta (20)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Savatthi in Jeta's Grove, Anathapindka's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this.

2. 'Bhikkhus, when a bhikkhu is pursuing the Higher Mind, five signs¹ can be given attention by him from time to time. What are the five?

3. (i) 'When, owing to some sign² to which he is giving attention there arise in him evil, unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion, then some sign other than that sign and connected with what is profitable should be given attention by him. When he gives attention to some sign other than that sign and connected with what is profitable, then any evil unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion, are abandoned in him and subside. With the abandoning of them his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

'Just as a skilled joiner or his apprentice might knock out, remove and extract a coarse peg by means of a fine one, so too, when, owing to some sign . . . his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

4. (ii) 'If, while he is giving attention to some sign other than that sign [first mentioned] and connected with what is profitable, there still arise in him evil, unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion, then the danger in those thoughts should be scrutinized by him thus: "These thoughts are such that they are unprofitable, that they are reprehensible, that they result in suffering." When he scrutinizes the danger in those thoughts then any evil unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion are abandoned in him and subside. With the abandoning of them his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

'Just as a woman—or a man—young, youthful and fond of ornaments would be horrified, humiliated and disgusted if a snake's or a dog's or a

1. Five topics, means or methods (nimitta).

2. Here meaning 'mental subject' (nimitta).

human being's carcass, were hung round her neck, so too, if, while he is giving attention ... his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

5. (iii) 'If, when he is scrutinizing the danger in those thoughts, there still arise in him evil, unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion, then forgetting of those thoughts and non-attention to them should be tried. When he tries forgetting those thoughts and non-attention to them then any evil unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion are abandoned in him and subside. With the abandoning of them his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

'Just as a man with [good] eyes who did not want to see forms that had come within [the eyes'] range, would either shut his eyes or look away, so too, if, when he scrutinizes ... his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

6. (iv) 'If, when he tries forgetting those thoughts and non-attention to them, there still arise in him evil unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion, then settling of thought-formations should be given attention by him with respect to these thoughts. When he gives attention to settling thought-formations with respect to those thoughts any evil unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion are abandoned in him and subside. With the abandoning of them his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

'Just as a man walking fast might [consider]: "Why am I walking fast? What if I walk slowly?"; [and] he walked slowly; [and then] he [considered]: "Why am I walking slowly? What if I stand?"; [and] he stood; [and then] he [considered]: "Why am I standing? What if I sit?"; [and] he sat; [and then] he [considered]: "Why am I sitting? What if I lie down?" [and] he lay down; for by doing so he would substitute for each grosser mode of deportment one that was subtler; so too, if when he tries forgetting ... his mind is settled in himself quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

7. (v) 'If, while he is giving attention to settling of thought-formations with respect to those thoughts, there still arise in him evil unprofitable

thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion, then with his teeth clenched and his tongue pressed against the roof of his mouth he should beat down, constrain and crush mind with mind. When with his teeth clenched and his tongue pressed against the roof of his mouth, he beats down, constrains and crushes mind with mind, then any evil unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate and with delusion are abandoned in him and subside. With the abandoning of them his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

‘Just as a strong man might seize a weaker one by the head or shoulders and beat him down, constrain and crush him, so too, if, while he is giving attention to settling . . . his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated.

8. ‘Bhikkhus, as soon as, after evil unprofitable thoughts connected with desire, with hate, and with delusion have arisen in a bhikkhu owing to some sign to which sign he was giving attention, any [such] evil unprofitable thoughts are abandoned in him and subside, when he gives attention to a sign other than that and connected with what is profitable, and so his mind is settled in himself, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated—and [as soon as] any [further] evil unprofitable thoughts . . . are abandoned in him and subside when he scrutinizes the danger in those thoughts, and so with the abandoning of them his mind is settled, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated—and [as soon as] any [further] evil unprofitable thoughts . . . are abandoned in him and subside when he tries forgetting these thoughts and non-attention to them, and so his mind is settled, brought to singleness and concentrated—and [as soon as] any [further] evil unprofitable thoughts . . . are abandoned in him and subside when he gives attention to the settling of thought-formations with respect to those thoughts, and so with the abandoning of them his mind is settled, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated—and [as soon as] any [further] evil unprofitable thoughts . . . are abandoned in him and subside when, with his teeth clenched and his tongue pressed against the roof of his mouth, he beats down, constrains and crushes mind with mind, and so with the abandoning of them his mind is settled, quieted, brought to singleness and concentrated, then that bhikkhu is called a master of the courses of thought processes, he will think the thoughts that he wishes, and he will not think the thoughts

that he does not wish. He has severed craving, flung off the fetters, and rightly made an end of suffering with the penetration of conceit.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 2. *adhicitta*—the Higher Mind is a term for *jhāna* (meditation).

para. 3. for the idiom *yam nimittam āgamma yam nimittam manasikarati*—owing to some sign, to which sign he is giving attention, cf. A.

Chakka—nipāta XXVII para. 8. *yasmim samaye bhikkhu yam nimittam āgamma yam nimittam manasikaroto anantara āsāvānaṃ khayō hoti, tām nimittam na jānāti na passati. tasmim sāmāye ...*

for *nimitta* (sign) cf. *samādhi-nimitta* as A. Sixes, Sutta xxviii

for *upasamhita* (connected with) cf. Sutta 7, para. 10. note.

Sallekha Sutta

Effacement

Introduction

This Sutta opens with a rather obscure question, at least, so it appears in translation, for what is the meaning of '(now) does the abandoning and relinquishing of such views come about in a bhikkhu *who is giving attention only to the beginning?*' The views which are the object of this question are 'self-doctrines and world-doctrines'. A Dhamma-practicer may think, through some meditation experience, that he has abandoned such views but the Buddha teaches that they are not cut off before Stream-winning when the fetter of embodiment-view, the doctrines of identifying self-soul with one of the aggregates, is cut off. Each of the eight attainments, the four jhānas of form and the four formless ones, are then reviewed and it is shown that the defiling tendencies of mind are not cut off through them, in fact 'effacement' is defined in relation to others and their actions. 'Others will kill but we shall not'—this shows our restraint, our effacement, not strengthening the ego-self through defiled actions but rather effacing it. Forty-four occasions for effacement are given and then the same list is applied to arising of mind, avoidance, the higher state and Nibbāna. Before the last section the pointed simile is given of the slough and how one who is floundering in it cannot pull out another in the same state. For instance, a person fancies himself as a Bodhisatta (a trip that is likely swell the ego) and vows to save all beings, while he does little or nothing about his own defilements, particularly about the size of his head. Not being able to 'save' himself, how can he save others? This is not the way to preserve the Sāsana, it is the way to destroy it. Only those who have tried hard with Dhamma-practice and purified their hearts to some extent will not disappoint those to whom they offer a helping hand. People like this have at least one foot securely on firm ground. Better still the Arahants who have

both feet on firm ground. An Arahant 'who is himself tamed, disciplined and attained to Nibbāna' can 'tame another, discipline him and lead him to Nibbāna'. The Buddha's compassion is shown in his final words of exhortation.

The Sutta (8)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park.

2. Then when it was evening, the venerable Mahā Cunda rose from meditation, and he went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said:

3. 'Venerable sir, (there are) these various views that arise in the world associated either with self-doctrines or with world-doctrines; (now) does the abandoning and relinquishing of such views come about in a bhikkhu who is giving attention only to the beginning?'

'There are, Cunda, these various views that arise in the world associated either with self-doctrine or with world-doctrine: (Now) whatever (the basis) those views arise on, whatever they underlie, whatever they are exercised on, when a man sees (that basis) as it actually is with right understanding thus: "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not myself", then in that way comes about in him the abandoning of such views, and likewise the relinquishment of them.

(The Eight Attainments)

4. 'It is possible here that secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, some bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the first jhāna which is accompanied by initial application and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of seclusion. He might (think) thus: "I am abiding in effacement". But it is not these (attainments) that are called "effacement" in the Noble One's discipline: these are called "a pleasant abiding here and now" in the Noble One's discipline.

5. 'It is possible here that with the stilling of initial and sustained appli-

ation, some bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the second jhāna which has self-confidence and singleness of mind without initial and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of concentration. He might (think) thus: "I am abiding in effacement". But it is not these (attainments) that are called "effacement" in the Noble One's discipline: these are called "a pleasant abiding here and now" in the Noble One's discipline.

6. 'It is possible here that with the fading as well of happiness some bhikkhu abides in equanimity, and mindful and fully aware, still feeling pleasure with the body, he enters upon and abides in the third jhāna on account of which Noble Ones announce: "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful". He might (think) thus: "I am abiding in effacement". But it is not these (attainments) that are called "effacement" in the Noble One's discipline: these are called "a pleasant abiding here and now" in the Noble One's discipline.

7. 'It is possible here that with the abandoning of pleasure and pain, and with the previous disappearance of joy and grief, some bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the fourth jhāna, which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity. He might (think) thus: "I am abiding in effacement". But it is not these (attainments) that are called "effacement" in the Noble One's discipline: these are called "a pleasant abiding here and now" in the Noble One's discipline.

8. 'It is possible here that with complete surmounting of perceptions of form, with disappearance of perceptions of resistance,¹ with non-attention to perceptions of difference, (aware that) "space is infinite", some bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the base consisting of the infinity of space. He might (think) thus: "I am abiding in effacement". But it is not these attainments that are called "effacement" in the Noble One's discipline: these are called "quiet abidings" in the Noble One's discipline.

9. 'It is possible here that by completely surmounting the base consisting of the infinity of space, (aware that) "consciousness is infinite", some bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the base consisting of the infinity

1. There is no consciousness connected with the five doors (or senses) though this has not operated in any of the four jhāna.

of consciousness. He might . . . “quiet abidings” in the Noble One’s discipline.

10. ‘It is possible here that by completely surmounting the base consisting of the infinity of consciousness, (aware that) “there is nothing”, some bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the base consisting of nothingness. He might . . . these are called “quiet abidings” in the Noble One’s discipline.

11. ‘It it possible here that by completely surmounting the base consisting of nothingness, some bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception. He might (think) thus: “I am abiding in effacement”. But these (attainments) are not called “effacement” in the Noble One’s discipline; these are called “quiet abidings” in the Noble One’s discipline.

(Effacement)

12. ‘Now, Cunda, here is where effacement can be effected:

‘1. Others will be cruel; we shall not be cruel here: effacement can be effected thus.

‘2. Others will kill living beings; we shall abstain from killing living beings here: effacement can be effected thus.

‘3. Others will take what is not given; we shall abstain from taking what is not given here: effacement . . .

‘4. Others will not live the life divine; we shall live the life divine here: effacement . . .

‘5. Others will speak falsehood; we shall abstain from flase speech here: effacement . . .

‘6. Others will speak maliciously; we shall abstain from malicious speech here: effacement . . .

‘7. Others will speak harshly; we shall abstain from harsh speech here: effacement . . .

‘8. Others will gossip; we shall abstain from gossip here: effacement . . .

‘9. Others will be covetous; we shall be uncovetous here: effacement . . .

‘10. Others will have a mind of ill-will; we shall have no mind of ill-will here: effacement . . .

- '11. Others will have wrong view; we shall have right views here: effacement . . .
- '12. Others will have wrong intention; we shall have right intention here: effacement . . .
- '13. Others will have wrong speech; we shall have right speech here: effacement . . .
- '14. Others will have wrong action; we shall have right action here: effacement . . .
- '15. Others will have wrong livelihood; we shall have right livelihood here: effacement . . .
- '16. Others will have wrong effort; we shall have right effort here: effacement . . .
- '17. Others will have wrong mindfulness; we shall have right mindfulness here: effacement . . .
- '18. Others will have wrong concentration; we shall have right concentration here: effacement . . .
- '19. Others will have wrong knowledge; we shall have right knowledge here: effacement . . .
- '20. Others will have wrong deliverance; we shall have right deliverance here: effacement . . .
- '21. Others will be obsessed by sleepiness and drowsiness; we shall be free from sleepiness and drowsiness here: effacement . . .
- '22. Others will be agitated, we shall not be agitated here: effacement . . .
- '23. Others will be uncertain; we shall get beyond uncertainty here: effacement . . .
- '24. Others will be angry; we shall not be angry here: effacement . . .
- '25. Others will be inimical; we shall be without enmity here: effacement . . .
- '26. Others will be contemptuous; we shall not be contemptuous here: effacement . . .
- '27. Others will be domineering; we shall not be domineering here: effacement . . .
- '28. Others will be envious; we shall not be envious here: effacement . . .
- '29. Others will be avaricious; we shall not be avaricious here: effacement . . .
- '30. Others will be fraudulent; we shall not be fraudulent here: effacement . . .

'31. Others will be deceitful; we shall not be deceitful here: effacement . . .

'32. Others will be obdurate; we shall not be obdurate here: effacement . . .

'33. Others will be haughty; we shall not be haughty here: effacement . . .

'34. Others will be difficult to admonish; we shall be easy to admonish here: effacement . . .

'35. Others will have bad friends; we shall have good friends here: effacement . . .

'36. Others will be negligent; we shall be diligent here: effacement . . .

'37. Others will be faithless; we shall be faithful here: effacement . . .

'38. Others will be conscienceless; we shall be conscience-minded here: effacement . . .

'39. Others will be shameless; we shall have shame here: effacement . . .

'40. Others will be of little learning; we shall be of great learning here: effacement . . .

'41. Others will be idle; we shall have aroused energy here: effacement . . .

'42. Others will be unmindful; we shall have established mindfulness here: effacement . . .

'43. Others will have poor understanding; we shall possess understanding here: effacement can be effected thus.

'44. Others will misapprehend according to their individual views, hold on (to them) tenaciously and relinquish (them) with difficulty; we shall not misapprehend according to individual views, shall not hold on tenaciously, and shall relinquish with ease: effacement can be effected thus.

(Arising of Consciousness)

13. 'Cunda, I say that even the arising of mind in profitable dhammas is of great importance, so what should be said of bodily and verbal operations consequent thereupon? Therefore, Cunda:

'1. Mind should be aroused thus: Others will be cruel; we shall not be cruel here.

'2. Mind should be aroused thus: Others will kill living beings; we shall not kill living beings here.

'3-43 ...

'44. Mind should be aroused thus: Others will misapprehend according to individual views, hold on (to them) tenaciously and relinquish (them) with difficulty; we shall not misapprehend according to individual views, shall not misapprehend according to individual views, shall not hold on tenaciously, and shall relinquish with ease.

(Avoidance)

14. 'Cunda, suppose there were an uneven path and another even path by which to avoid it; and suppose there were an uneven ford and another even ford by which to avoid it, so too:

'1. A person given to cruelty has non-cruelty by which to avoid it.

'2. One given to killing living beings has abstention from killing living beings by which to avoid it.

'3. One given to taking what is not given has abstention from taking what is not given by which to avoid it.

'4. One given to what is not the life divine has the life divine by which to avoid it.

'5. One given to false speech has abstention from false speech by which to avoid it.

'6. One given to malicious speech has abstention from malicious speech by which to avoid it.

'7. One given to harsh speech has abstention from harsh speech by which to avoid it.

'8. One given to gossip has abstention from gossip by which to avoid it.

'9. One given to covetousness has uncovetousness by which to avoid it.

'10. One given to a mind of ill-will has non-ill-will by which to avoid it.

'11. One given to wrong view has right view by which to avoid it.

'12. One given to wrong intention has right intention by which to avoid it.

'13. One given to wrong speech has right speech by which to avoid it.

'14. One given to wrong action has right action by which to avoid it.

'15. One given to wrong livelihood has right livelihood by which to avoid it.

'16. One given to wrong effort has right effort by which to avoid it.

'17. One given to wrong mindfulness has right mindfulness by which to avoid it.

'18. One given to wrong concentration has right concentration by which to avoid it.

'19. One given to wrong knowledge has right knowledge by which to avoid it.

'20. One given to wrong deliverance has right deliverance by which to avoid it.

'21. One obsessed by sluggishness and drowsiness has freedom from sluggishness and drowsiness by which to avoid it.

'22. One given to distraction has non-distraction by which to avoid it.

'23. One given to uncertainty has the state of having got beyond uncertainty by which to avoid it.

'24. One given to anger has non-anger by which to avoid it.

'25. One given to enmity has non-enmity by which to avoid it.

'26. One given to contempt has non-contempt by which to avoid it.

'27. One given to domineering has non-domineering by which to avoid it.

'28. One given to envy has non-envy by which to avoid it.

'29. One given to avarice has non-avarice by which to avoid it.

'30. One given to fraud has non-fraud by which to avoid it.

'31. One given to deceit has non-deceit by which to avoid it.

'32. One given to obduracy has non-obduracy by which to avoid it.

'33. One given to haughtiness has non-haughtiness by which to avoid it.

'34. One given to difficulty of admonishment has ease of admonishment by which to avoid it

'35. One given to making bad friends has making good friends by which to avoid it.

'36. One given to negligence has diligence by which to avoid it.

'37. One given to faithlessness has faith by which to avoid it.

'38. One given to lack of conscience has conscience by which to avoid it.

'39. One given to shamelessness has shame by which to avoid it.

'40. One given to little learning has great learning by which to avoid it.

'41. One given to idleness has aroused energy by which to avoid it.

'42. One given to forgetfulness has establishment of mindfulness by which to avoid it.

'43. One given to lack of understanding has perfection of understanding by which to avoid it.

'44. One given to misapprehension according to individual views, to holding on (to them) tenaciously, and to difficulty in relinquishing them, has not misapprehending according to individual views, not holding on tenaciously, and ease in relinquishment, by which to avoid it.

(The Lower and The Higher State)

15. 'Cunda, just as no matter what unprofitable dhammas there are, they all lead to a lower state; and just as, no matter what profitable dhammas there are, they all lead to a higher state, so too:

'1. A person given to cruelty has non-cruelty as a higher state.

'2. One given to killing living beings has abstention from killing living beings as a higher state.

'3-43 ...

'44. One given to misapprehension according to individual views, to holding on (to them) tenaciously, and to difficulty in relinquishing (them), has not misapprehending according to individual views, not holding on tenaciously, and ease in relinquishing, as a higher state.

16. 'Cunda, that one who is himself floundering in a slough should pull out another who is floundering in the slough is not possible; that one who is not himself floundering in a slough should pull out another who is floundering in the slough is possible; that one who is himself untamed, undisciplined, and unattained to Nibbāna, should tame another, discipline him, and lead him to Nibbāna, is not possible; that one who is himself tamed, disciplined and attained to Nibbāna should tame another, discipline him and lead him to Nibbāna, is possible. So too:

'1. A person given to cruelty has non-cruelty by which to attain Nibbāna.

'2. One given to killing living beings has abstention from killing living

beings by which to attain Nibbāna.

‘3-43....

‘44. One given to misapprehension according to individual views, to holding on (to them) tenaciously, and to difficulty in relinquishing (them), has not misapprehending according to individual views, not holding on tenaciously, ease in relinquishing, by which to attain Nibbāna.

(Conclusion)

17. ‘So, Cunda, the way of effacement has been shown by me, the way of arising of mind has been shown by me, the way of avoidance has been shown by me, the way of the higher state has been shown by me, and the way of Nibbāna has been shown by me.

18. ‘What should be done for his disciples out of pity by a Master who seeks their welfare and has pity (on them), that I have done for you, Cunda. There are these roots of trees, these empty huts. Develop jhāna, Cunda, do not delay, lest you later regret it. This is our message for you.’

That is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Mahā Cunda was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One’s words.

Notes

(translation of Ven. Bodhi Bhikkhu).

para. 3. “giving attention only to the beginning”. *Commentary*: This is the meaning: Does the abandoning and relinquishment of these views, Lord, take place for a bhikkhu “attending only to the beginning” (ādi-meva adhikarontassa)—i.e. attending only to the first attention combined with insight (vipassanā) without even having reached the Path of Stream Entrance (appatvā pi sotapattimaggaṃ vipassanāmissakapathamanasikārameva manasikarontassa bhikkhuno)—do they come about merely by this means? This Thera, though free from self-overestimation himself, asked the question as though he was subject to self-overestimation, in order that those who were victims of self-overestimation might abandon it. Others explain: Some pupils of this Thera thought that the

eradication of these views comes about merely by the initial attention (ādīmanasikāreṇeva), some by abiding in the meditative attainments, some by effacement. For their sake he questioned the Exalted One.

Vatthupama Sutta

The Simile of The Cloth

Introduction

Dirty, stained cloth takes dye badly, like a dirty, stained mind takes one to low states of birth full of suffering. New cloth well washed, on the other hand, takes dye well, likewise a pure mind when good rebirth can be expected. What are the dirt and stains of the mind? Things we know well like covetousness and unrighteous greed, ill-will, anger, revenge and so on—these are our stained and dirty states of mind. Getting to know them is good for then they are seen as a source of trouble (*dukkha*) and so more easily abandoned. As one practises Dhamma and sees for oneself that the defilements are becoming steadily less powerful so one gains strong faith in the Buddha, Dhamma and Sangha. One's insight eventually reaches to the Noble Paths and Fruits when that faith becomes unshakeable. The Discourse goes on to show how after practising the Divine Abidings (in which one lives like Brahma or God), one then should aspire to Arahantship and attain Nibbāna. No doubt the Buddha was aware that a divine (*brahmin*) sitting nearby was interested in his discourse as well as being a spiritually capable person, hence his mention of the Divine (*Brahmā*) Abidings. The brahmin's interest was indeed aroused and he asked whether the Buddha went to bathe his sins away in the supposedly holy river Bahukā. This question has caused the splendid flow of the Buddha's reply in verse. This ability to speak impromptu verse was much esteemed by the brahmins and it seems as though this and the straightforward content of their teaching reached to that brahmin's heart so that he said: 'Magnificent, Master Gotama . . . And the venerable Bhāradvāja became one of the Arahants.'

The Sutta (7)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, suppose a cloth were defiled and stained, and a dyer dipped it in some dye or other, whether blue or yellow or red or pink, it would look ill-dyed and impure in colour. Why is that? Because of the impurity of the cloth; so too, when mind is defiled, an unhappy destination may be expected.

'Bhikkhus, suppose a cloth were pure and bright, and a dyer dipped it in some dye or other, whether blue or yellow or red or pink, it would look well-dyed and pure in colour. Why is that? Because of the purity of the cloth; so too, when mind is undefiled, a happy destination may be expected.

3. 'What are the imperfections that defile mind? Covetousness and unrighteous greed is an imperfection that defiles mind. Ill-will ... Anger ... Revenge ... Contempt ... Domineering ... Envy ... Avarice ... Deceit ... Fraud ... Obduracy ... Presumption ... Conceit ... Pride (haughtiness) ... Vanity ... Negligence ... is an imperfection that defiles mind.

4. 'When a bhikkhu knows that covetousness and unrighteous greed is an imperfection that defiles mind, he abandons it. When he knows that ill-will ... negligence are imperfections that defile mind, he abandons them.

5. 'As soon as it is known¹ that covetousness and unrighteous greed is an imperfection that defiles mind, it is abandoned in him; as soon as it is known that ill-will ... negligence are imperfections that defile mind, they are abandoned in him.

6. 'Thereupon, he becomes possessed of perfect confidence in the Buddha thus: "That Blessed One is such since he is Arahant, fully enlightened, perfect in true knowledge and conduct, sublime, knower of worlds,

1. 'Known' means 'known by insight meditation'.

incomparable leader of men to be tamed, teacher of gods and men, enlightened, blessed.”

7. ‘And he becomes possessed of confidence in the Dhamma thus: “The Dhamma is well-proclaimed by the Blessed One, (it has effect) visible here and now, not (after a lapse) of time; it invites inspection, is onward-leading, and experienceable by the wise each for himself.”

8. ‘And he becomes possessed of perfect confidence in the Sangha thus: “The Sangha of the Blessed One’s disciples has entered on the good way, has entered on the straight way, has entered on the true way, has entered on the proper way, that is to say, the four Pairs of Men, the Eight (types of) Persons; this Sangha of the Blessed One’s disciples is fit for gifts, fit for hospitality, fit for offerings, and fit for reverential salutation, as the incomparable field of merit for the world.”

9. ‘And whatever (from among those imperfections) has, according to the limitation (set by whichever of the first three paths he has attained), been given up, has been (for ever) dropped, let go, abandoned, relinquished.

10. ‘He (considers) thus: “I am possessed of perfect confidence in the Buddha” and he gains experience of meanings, he gains experience of dhammas, and so he finds gladness connected with the Dhamma.²

11. ‘When he is glad, happiness is born in him; being happy in mind, his body becomes tranquillized; when his body is tranquil, he feels pleasure; feeling pleasure, his mind becomes concentrated.

12. ‘He (considers) thus: “I am possessed of perfect confidence in the Dhamma” and he gains experience of meanings, he gains experience of dhammas, and so he finds gladness connected with the Dhamma.

13. ‘When he is glad . . . his mind becomes concentrated.

14. ‘He (considers) thus: “I am possessed of perfect confidence in the Sangha” and he gains experience of meanings, he gains experience of dhammas, and so he finds gladness connected with the Dhamma.

15. ‘When he is glad . . . his mind becomes concentrated.

2. See Sutta 33, para. 10, footnote 3.

16. 'He (considers) thus: "And whatever has, according to limitation, been given up, it has been dropped, let go, abandoned, relinquished, and he gains experience of meanings, he gains experience of dhammas, and so he finds gladness connected with the Dhamma.

17. 'When he is glad . . . his mind becomes concentrated.

18. 'If a bhikkhu of such virtue, such dhammas and such understanding eats alms-food consisting of rice with the dark grains picked out accompanied by many sauces and curries, even that will be no obstacle for him.

'Just as a cloth that is defiled and stained becomes pure and bright with the help of clear water, or just as gold becomes pure and bright with the help of a furnace, so too, if a bhikkhu of such virtue . . . eats alms-food . . . that will be no obstacle for him.

19. 'He abides with his heart endued with loving-kindness extending over one quarter, likewise the second, likewise the third, likewise the fourth, and so above, below, around and everywhere, and to all as to himself; he abides with his heart abundant with loving-kindness, exalted, measureless, without hostility or ill-will extending over the all-encompassing world.

20. 'He abides with his heart endued with compassion . . . over the all-encompassing world.

21. 'He abides with his heart endued with gladness³ . . . over the all-encompassing world.

22. 'He abides with his heart endued with equanimity . . . over the all-encompassing world.

23. '(Of that) he understands thus: "There is this (pure state of Divine Abiding), there is the inferior (state of defilements abandoned), there is the superior (goal of the Arahant Path yet to be attained), and there is the escape (which is Nibbāna) from this (whole) field of perception."

24. 'When he knows and sees in this way, the mind becomes liberated from the taint of sensual desire, liberated from the taint of being, and

3. At the happiness and joy of others.

liberated from the taint of ignorance. When liberated, there is knowledge: "It is liberated". He understands: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived out, what can be done is done, there is no more of this in the beyond."

25. 'This bhikkhu is called "bathed with the inner bathing."'

26. Now on that occasion Sundavika Bhāradvāja of the divine caste had seated himself not far from the Blessed One. Then he said to the Blessed One: 'But does Master Gotama go to the Bahukā River to bathe?'

'Why, divine, (go) to the Bahukā River? What can the Bahukā River do?'

'Master Gotama, the Bahukā River is held by many to give liberation; it is held by many to give merit, and many wash away in the Bahukā River the evil kammās they have done.'

27. Then the Blessed One addressed Sundarika Bhāradvāja of the divine caste in stanzas:

'Bahukā and Adhikakkā
Gayā, and Sundarikā, too
Payāga and Sarassati
And the stream Bahumati—
Yet will not wash black kamma white.

What can Sundarikā bring to pass?
What the Payāga? What the Bahukā?
They cannot purify an evil-doer,
A man that has done brutal acts and cruel.

One pure in heart has evermore
The Feast of Spring, the Holy Day;
One fair in act, one pure in heart
Has every virtue perfect.

'Tis here, divine, that thou shouldst come to bathe,
To make thyself safe refuge for all beings.

And if thou speakest no untruth,
Nor workest harm for living beings,
Nor takest what is offered not,

With faith and with no avarice,
To Gayā gone what wouldst thou do?
Let any well thy Gayā be.'

28. When this was said, Sundarika Bhāradvāja of the divine caste said: 'Magnificent, Master Gotama! Magnificent, Master Gotama! The Dhamma has been made clear in many ways by Master Gotama as though he were righting the overthrown, revealing the hidden, showing the way to one who is lost, holding up a lamp in the dark for those with eyesight to see forms.

29. 'I go to Master Gotama for refuge and to the Dhamma and to the Sangha. I would receive the Going-forth under Master Gotama, I would receive the Full Admission.'

30. And Sundarika Bhāradvāja of the divine caste received the Going-forth under the Blessed One, and he received the Full Admission. And not long after his Full Admission, dwelling alone, withdrawn, diligent, ardent and self-controlled, the venerable Bhāradvāja, by realization himself with direct knowledge here and now, entered upon and abode in that supreme goal of the life divine, for the sake of which clansmen rightly go forth from the home life into homelessness. He had direct knowledge thus: 'Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived, what is to be done is done, there is no more of this to come.'

And the venerable Bhāradvāja became one of the Arahants.

Notes

para. 3. The 'imperfections' (*upakkilesa*) from 'anger (*kodha*)' to 'negligence (*pamāda*)' are known in the Commentaries as the 14 imperfections. They appear in other suttas, e.g. Sutta 3, 8, etc.

para. 5-6 Cf. construction at Sutta 128, para. 28 and 37.

para. 7. *Sanditthiko akāliko*: visible here and now not (after a lapse of) time: Cf. use of these two terms in Sutta 70, para. 4. The passage occurs in Sutta 38, para. 27. See S. iv, 21 and S. XXXV, 70 (vol iv. 41).

para. 6, 7, 8, 9 can be taken to represent the four factors of Stream-entry discussed at S.v.

para. 9. *yathodhi*—according to limitation: the Commentary has been followed. *Yathodhi*=*yathā* + *odhi*. By para. 9 the stage reached is any of the first three Paths, by each one of which certain defilements corresponding to or associated with certain of the Fetters are successively given up for ever. But the first three Paths do not give up all defilements as the last one does and so each has its limitation (*odhi*). See Vibh. 246. ‘*odhiso kilesānaṃ pahānā bhikkhu, anodhiso kilesānaṃ pahānā bhikkhu*’.

para. 10. There are many ways of rendering this difficult paragraph, which is repeated elsewhere. For ‘*dhammuṭpassaṃhita*’ as ‘connected with Dhamma’ cf. use of *uṭpassaṃhavati* at Sutta 140, para. 20, and Sutta 10, para. 14, and Sutta 20, para. 3.

para. 18. Cf. Sn. 81.

para. 19. *pharati*—extends over. See use of *pharati* in the similes for the four *jhānas* (meditations) in Sutta 39 para. 15-18, particularly in the last, where ‘pervasion’ (the alternative rendering) will not fit for the ‘white cloth’.

para. 19. *sabbattatāya*—to all as to himself: this seems the reading more widely accepted than *sabbatthatāya* for this adverb. The word is explained in Ch. IX of the *Visuddhimagga*.

para. 23. The Commentary relates these four references to the Four Truths thus: ‘There is this’=the state of pure contemplation as the Truth of Suffering; ‘There is the inferior (the abandoned)’=craving as the Truth of Origin: ‘There is the superior’=the Truth of the Path as the Arahant Path yet to be reached and so a superior goal: ‘There is the escape from the field of perception’=Nibbāna, where craving and its resultant Five-aggregate process is extinguished. For *hina-majjhima* and *pañita-dhātu*, see e.g. A.i, 223-4.

Upakkilesa Sutta

Imperfections

Introduction

The first part of this Sutta shows the gross influence of the defilements on people's speech and bodily actions, while the second part illustrates the subtle ways in which defilements, called 'imperfections' here, can cause meditation to fail. Even when the Buddha was alive there were people who openly quarrelled with him and even among bhikkhus there was this infamous 'stabbing of each other with verbal daggers'. Like many quarrels in the world now it began with a very small matter in Vinaya which was badly handled by the bhikkhus concerned. A learned Sutta-Teacher went to the latrine and after he had finished, a Vinaya-Master entered. He found some water left in the water scoop used for cleaning oneself after excretion. He reproved the Sutta-Teacher for this who excused himself saying that he did not know that it was an offence (of wrong-doing) and had not done it intentionally. At this, the Vinaya-Master said: 'Well, if you did not do it intentionally, then you have not fallen into an offence'. So the Sutta-Teacher thought: 'I am free from offence'. It ought to have ended here but unwisely the Vinaya-Master said rather self-righteously to his pupils: 'You know that Sutta-Teacher? He does not know what is and what is not an offence! He has done like this and that.' Those pupils spoke to the Sutta-Teacher's pupils: 'Your Teacher is guilty of an offence...—and they went and told their Teacher. He said: 'That Vinaya-Master first says I have no offence and now he says I have. He is a liar... And so the quarrel spread! It is a good illustration of the way things 'catch fire', one person's heart fired by another. And all from a little water in a water dipper! By contrast with these quarrelsome bhikkhus, venerable Bhagu lives peacefully by himself, while the three Anuruddhas live 'in concord and agreement as undisputing as milk with water'. How they do so can be read in detail

in Sutta 31. Here they are developing meditation and have not yet reached Arahantship while in Sutta 31 they have already won to the highest attainment. After leaving the Anuruddhas, the Buddha spent the three months of the Rains alone in the forest where even animals had the wisdom to recognize his loving-kindness and compassion, ignored by the quarrelsome bhikkhus of Kosambi. An elephant and a monkey served him faithfully, while back in Kosambi the laypeople would not serve those bhikkhus since they had driven the Buddha away! All the bhikkhus of Kosambi had to go to ask the pardon of the Buddha after the Rains. They were shamed into humility by the pointing fingers of people: 'Look, there they go, those stupid quarrelling bhikkhus of Kosambi . . .' So the whole incident closed and the Sangha of bhikkhus was united peacefully again.

The Sutta (128)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Kosambi in Ghosita's Park.

2. Now on that occasion, Kosambi bhikkhus had taken to quarrelling and brawling, and were deep in disputes, stabbing each with verbal daggers.

3. Then a certain bhikkhu went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he stood at one side, and he said: 'Venerable sir, bhikkhus here at Kosambi have taken to quarrelling and brawling, and are deep in disputes, stabbing each other with verbal daggers. Venerable sir, it would be good if the Blessed One went to those bhikkhus out of compassion.'

The Blessed One consented in silence.

4. Then the Blessed One went to those bhikkhus and said to them: 'Enough, bhikkhus, no quarrelling, no brawling, no wrangling, no disputing.'

5. When this was said, a certain bhikkhu said to the Blessed One: 'Venerable sir, let the Blessed One, Lord of the Dhamma, wait; venerable sir, let the Blessed One abide inactive and devoted to pleasant abiding

here and now. It is we who shall be known for this quarrelling, brawling, wrangling and disputing.'

For the second time . . .

For the third time the Blessed One said to them: 'Enough, bhikkhus, no quarrelling, no brawling, no wrangling, no disputing.'

For the third time that bhikkhu said to the Blessed One: 'Venerable sir, let the Blessed One, Lord of the Dhamma, wait; venerable sir, let the Blessed One abide inactive and devoted to pleasant abiding here and now. It is we who shall be known for this quarrelling, brawling, wrangling and disputing.'

6. Now it being morning, the Blessed One dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Kosambi for alms. When he had wandered for alms and had returned from his alms-round after his meal, he set his resting place in order, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he uttered these stanzas while standing:

- 7.
- i. 'When many voices shout at once
There is none thinks himself a fool;
The Sangha being split none thinks
"I too took part, I helped in this".
 - ii. They have forgot wise speech, they talk
With minds obsessed by words alone;
Uncurbed their mouths, they bawl at will;
None knows what leads him so to do.
 - iii. "This he abused me, he that beat me,
He that worsted me, that robbed me!"
Hate never is allayed in men
Who cherish suchlike enmity.
 - iv. "This he abused me, he that beat me,
He that worsted me, that robbed me!"
Hate surely is allayed in men
Who cherish no such enmity
 - v. For enmity by enmity
Is never in this world allayed.
It is allayed by amity—
That is an ancient law.
 - vi. Those others do not recognize

- That here we should restrain ourselves;
 Still there are some who are aware
 And so their quarrels are appeased.
- vii. Breakers of bones and murderers,
 Stealers of cattle, horses, wealth
 While bent on pillaging the realm,
 Even these can act in concord;
 So why can you not do so too?
- viii. If you can find a trustworthy companion
 With whom to walk, both virtuous and steadfast,
 Then walk with him content and mindfully,
 And overcoming any threat of danger.
- ix. If you can find no trustworthy companion
 With whom to walk, both virtuous and steadfast,
 Then, as a king who leaves a vanquished kingdom,
 Walk like a tusker in the woods alone.
- x. Better it is to walk alone,
 There is no fellowship with fools.
 Walk alone, harm none, and know no conflict;
 Be like a tusker in the woods alone.'

8. Then having uttered these stanzas standing, the Blessed One went to Bālakaloṇakāra-gāma.¹ The venerable Bhagu was living there on that occasion. When he saw the Blessed One coming in the distance, he prepared a seat and water for the feet. The Blessed One sat down on the seat prepared, and having done so, he washed his feet. The venerable Bhagu paid homage and sat down at one side. When he had done so, the Blessed One said to him: 'I hope that you are keeping well, bhikkhu, that you are comfortable and that you have no trouble on account of alms-food?'

'I am keeping well, Blessed One, I am comfortable and have no trouble on account of alms-food.'

Then the Blessed One instructed, urged, roused and encouraged the venerable Bhagu with talk on the Dhamma, after which he got up from his seat and left for the Eastern Bamboo Park.

1. The village of.

9. Now on that occasion the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila were living there. The park-keeper saw the Blessed One coming. He told him; 'Do not come to this park, monk. There are three clansmen here seeking their own good. Do not disturb them.'

10. The venerable Anuruddha heard the park-keeper speaking to the Blessed One. He told him: 'Friend park-keeper, do not keep the Blessed One out. It is our own Master, the Blessed One, who has come.'

The venerable Anuruddha went to the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila and said: 'Come out, venerable sirs, come out! Our Master has come.'

11. Then all three went to meet the Blessed One: one took his bowl and (outer) robe, one prepared a seat, and one placed water for washing the feet. The Blessed One sat down on the seat prepared, and having done so, he washed his feet. Then they paid homage to him and sat down at one side. When they had done so, the Blessed One said to them: 'I hope that you are all keeping well, Anuruddha, that you are comfortable, and that you have no trouble on account of alms-food.'

'We are all keeping well, Blessed One. We are comfortable and have no trouble on account of alms-food.'

12. 'I hope that you all live in concord and agreement, Anuruddha, as undisputing as milk with water, viewing each other with kindly eyes?'

'Surely we do so, venerable sir.'

13. 'But, Anuruddha, how do you live thus?'

'Venerable sir, as to that, I think thus: "It is gain for me, it is great gain for me here that I am living with such companions in the life divine." I maintain bodily, verbal and mental acts of loving-kindness towards these venerable ones both in public and in private. I think: "Why should I not set aside what I am minded to do and do only what they are minded to do?" And I act accordingly. We are different in body, venerable sir, but only one in mind, I think.'

The venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila each spoke likewise. They added: 'That is how we live in concord, venerable sir, as

friendly and undisputing as milk with water, viewing each other with kindly eyes.'

14. 'Good, good, Anuruddha. I hope you all dwell diligent, ardent and self-controlled?'

'Surely we do so, venerable sir.'

15. 'But, Anuruddha, how do you dwell thus?'

'Venerable sir, as to that, whichever of us returns first from the village with alms-food... (as in Sutta 31, para. 9)... sit out the night together with talk on the Dhamma. That is how we dwell diligent, ardent and self-controlled.'

16. 'Good, good, Anuruddha; but while dwelling diligent, ardent and self-controlled in this way, have you attained as a comfortable abiding any distinction worthy of a Noble One's knowledge and vision more than the human dhamma?'

'As to that, venerable sir, as we dwell here diligent, ardent and self-controlled, we perceive both illumination and the vision of forms, but that illumination of ours soon disappears and so does the vision of forms and we have not penetrated the sign, (the reason) for what.'

17. 'Still, Anuruddha, the sign for that can be penetrated by you. I too, before my enlightenment, while I was still an unenlightened Bodhisatta, perceived both illumination and the vision of forms. But that illumination of mine and the vision of forms soon disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason, what is the condition, why this illumination of mine and the vision of forms disappears?" I thought thus: "Uncertainty arose in me, and owing to the uncertainty my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that uncertainty does not arise in me again."

18. 'As I dwelt diligent, ardent and self-controlled I perceived both illumination and vision of forms. But that illumination of mine and the vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason, what is the condition, why this illumination of mine and the vision of forms disappears?" I thought thus:

"Inattention arose in me, and owing to the inattention my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty arises in me again nor inattention."

19. 'As I dwelt diligent . . . vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason . . . disappears?" I thought thus: "Lethargy and drowsiness arose in me, and owing to the lethargy and drowsiness my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty nor inattention nor lethargy and drowsiness arise in me again."

20. 'As I dwelt diligent . . . vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason . . . disappears?" I thought thus: "Alarm arose in me, and owing to the alarm my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms." Suppose, Anuruddha, a man set out on a journey and murderers leapt out on each side of him, then alarm would arise in him on that account. So too, (I thought thus:) "Alarm arose in me and owing to the alarm my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty nor inattention nor lethargy and drowsiness nor alarm arise in me again."

21. 'As I dwelt diligent . . . vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason . . . disappears?" I thought thus: "Elation arose in me, and owing to the elation my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms." Suppose, Anuruddha, a man seeking a hidden treasure found at once five hidden treasures, then elation would arise in him on that account. So too (I thought thus:) "Elation arose in me, and owing to the elation my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty nor inattention nor lethargy and drowsiness nor alarm nor elation arise in me again."

22. 'As I dwelt diligent . . . vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason . . . disappears?" I thought thus:

"Inertia arose in me, and owing to the inertia my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty nor inattention nor lethargy and drowsiness nor alarm nor elation nor inertia arise in me again."

23. 'As I dwelt diligent . . . vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason . . . disappears?" I thought thus: "Too active an energy arose in me, and owing to too active an energy my concentration died away. When the concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms." Suppose, Anuruddha, a man gripped a quail tightly with both hands, it would die then and there. So too, (I thought thus:) "Too active an energy arose in me, and owing to too active an energy my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty nor inattention nor lethargy and drowsiness nor alarm nor elation nor inertia nor too active an energy arise in me again."

24. 'As I dwelt diligent . . . vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason . . . disappears?" I thought thus: "Too sluggish an energy arose in me, and owing to too sluggish an energy my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms." Suppose Anuruddha, a man gripped a quail loosely, it would jump out of his hand. So too, (I thought thus:) 'Too sluggish an energy arose in me, and owing to too sluggish an energy my concentration died away. When concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty nor inattention nor lethargy and drowsiness nor alarm nor elation nor inertia nor too active an energy nor too sluggish and energy arise in me again."

25. 'As I dwelt diligent . . . vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason . . . disappears?" I thought thus: "Longing arose in me, and owing to longing my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty nor inattention

nor lethargy and drowsiness nor alarm nor elation nor inertia nor too active an energy nor too sluggish an energy nor longing arise in me again."

26. 'As I dwelt diligent . . . vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason . . . disappears?" I thought thus: "Perception of difference arose in me, and owing to perception of difference my concentration died away; when concentration died away, the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty nor inattention nor lethargy and drowsiness nor alarm nor elation nor inertia nor too active an energy nor too sluggish an energy nor longing nor perception of difference arise in me again."

27. 'As I dwelt diligent . . . vision of forms disappeared.

'I thought thus: "What is the reason . . . disappears?" I thought thus: "Too much meditating² upon forms arose in me, and owing to too much meditating upon forms my concentration died away; when concentration died away the illumination disappeared and so did the vision of forms. I shall so act that neither uncertainty nor inattention nor lethargy and drowsiness nor alarm nor elation nor inertia nor too active an energy nor too sluggish an energy nor longing nor perception of difference nor too much meditating upon forms arise in me again.

28. 'When I knew thus that uncertainty is an imperfection of mind, I abandoned it. Knowing that inattention . . . lethargy and drowsiness . . . alarm . . . elation . . . inertia . . . too active an energy . . . too sluggish an energy . . . longing . . . perception of difference . . . too much meditating upon forms is an imperfection of mind, I abandoned it.

29. 'While I dwelt diligent, ardent and self-controlled I perceived illumination and I did not see forms; I saw forms and I did not perceive illumination, even for a whole night and a whole day and a whole night and day. I thought thus: "What is the reason, what is the condition, for this?" I thought thus: "On the occasion on which I give attention to the sign of illumination without giving attention to the sign of form, on that occasion I perceive illumination and I do not see forms. And on that occasion on which I give attention to the sign of forms without giving

2 Atinijjhāyitattam: a word having the same root as found in jhāna.

attention to the sign of illumination, on that occasion I see forms and I do not perceive illumination; even for a whole night and a whole day and a whole night and day.”

30. ‘While I dwelt diligent, ardent and self-controlled, I perceived limited illumination and I saw limited forms, I perceived measureless illumination and I saw measureless forms, even for a whole night and a whole day and a whole night and day. I thought thus: “What is the reason, what is the condition for this?” I thought thus: “On the occasion on which my concentration is limited, on that occasion my eye is limited, and with a limited eye I perceive limited illumination and I see limited forms and on the occasion on which my concentration is measureless, on that occasion my eye is measureless, and with measureless eye I see measureless forms; even for a whole night and a whole day and a whole night and day.

31. ‘As soon as, by my knowing thus that uncertainty is an imperfection of mind, it had been abandoned in me; as soon as by my knowing thus that inattention... lethargy and drowsiness... alarm... elation... inertia... too active and energy... too sluggish an energy... longing... perception of difference... as soon as by my knowing thus that too much meditating on forms is an imperfection of mind, it had been abandoned in me.

32. ‘Thereupon I thought thus: “I have abandoned those imperfections in my mind. Now I (shall) develop concentration in three ways.”

33. ‘I developed concentration with initial application and sustained application: I developed it without initial application and with only sustained application, I developed it without initial application and without sustained application; I developed it with happiness; I developed it without happiness; I developed it accompanied by enjoyment; I developed it accompanied by equanimity.

34. ‘As soon as I developed concentration thus, knowledge and vision arose in me: “My deliverance is unassailable, this is the last birth, there is no renewal of being now.”’

This is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Anuruddha was satisfied and he delighted in the Blessed One’s words.

Notes

para. 7. verse vi, 1.2: there is a difference of opinion about the meaning of *yamāmase*, whether it means 'we should restrain ourselves' or 'we may perish'.

para. 7: verses iii-vi=Dh. 3-6, Jā, iii, 212; verses i-x=Ja.iii, 488; Vin. i, 348-9; verses viii-x=Dh.328-30; verse ii=Ud. 91; verse vi=Thag. 275; verses viii-ix= Sn. 451.

para. 11i. for use of the plural Anuruddhā, see Sutta 31, para. 5, note.

para. 22. for '*duṭṭhulla*—inertia': see Sutta 127 note (and 64, para. 9.)

para. 27. '*atinijjhāyitattā*—too much meditating on'—*ati* + *ni* + *jhāyita* + *tta*. Not in P.T.S. Dict. Cf. *nijjhāna* at Sutta 95, para. 14

para. 28. Cf. treatment at *Netti*. 88

para. 28. and 31: Cf. Sutta 7, para. 5 and 6 for parallel construction.

Anuruddha Sutta

Anuruddha

Introduction

Pañcakanga (or 'Five Tools' as his name would translate) was an intelligent and learned layman. From other places in the Suttas we may gather that he had much information on Dhamma and enjoyed discussing it and asking questions. Here he is asking about the immeasurable (apamañña) deliverance of mind and the exalted (mahaggata) deliverance of mind. His questions are answered by venerable Anuruddha Thera, an Arahant particularly skilled in the ability to survey with the heavenly eye, vast numbers of world-systems. Both of the deliverances spoken of here are developed through jhāna, the first through pervasion of people, other beings or directions with the four Divine Abidings—Loving-kindness, Compassion, Gladness (with the joy of others), and Equanimity. The second, exalted, deliverance is arrived at through expanding the kasiṇa until it covers vast areas. The latter part of this Sutta shows the intimate acquaintance that the Ven. Thera had with the devas (heavenly inhabitants, gods) into whose 'wavelength' he could so easily tune his mind through jhāna.

The Sutta (127)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park.

2. Then Pañcakanga the carpenter addressed a certain man thus: 'Come, good man, go to the venerable Anuruddha and pay homage in my name with your head at his feet, and say: "Venerable sir, let the venerable Anuruddha as one of four accept tomorrow's meal from Pañcakanga the

carpenter; and venerable sir, Pañcakanga the carpenter would rather have come himself to the venerable Anuruddha but he is very busy and much occupied with work for the king.”

‘Yes, venerable sir,’ the man replied, and he went to the venerable Anuruddha, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said: ‘Pañcakanga the carpenter pays homage with his head at the venerable Anuruddha’s feet, and he says: “Let the venerable Anuruddha . . . with work for the king.”’

The venerable Anuruddha accepted in silence.

3. Then when the night was ended, it being morning, the venerable Anuruddha dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe he went to Pañcakanga the carpenter’s house, and he sat down on the seat made ready. Then with his own hands Pañcakanga the carpenter served and satisfied the venerable Anuruddha with various kinds of good food. Then when the venerable Anuruddha had eaten and no longer had the bowl in his hand, Pañcakanga the carpenter took a low seat and sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said:

4. ‘Venerable sir, here elder bhikkhus have come to me and said thus: “Householder, develop the measureless deliverance of mind” and some elders said thus: “Householder, develop the exalted deliverance of mind”. Now, venerable sir, as to this measureless deliverance of mind and this exalted deliverance of mind, are these dhammas different in meaning and different in the letter or are they the same in meaning and only different in the letter?’

5. ‘Say how it occurs to you, householder. Afterwards it will be cleared up for you.’

‘Venerable sir, I think it is like this: as to the measureless deliverance of mind and the exalted deliverance of mind, these dhammas are the same in meaning and only different in the letter.’

6. ‘Householder, as to the measureless deliverance of mind and the exalted deliverance of mind, these dhammas are different in meaning and different in the letter. And it can be known in what way they are so.

7. ‘What is the measureless deliverance of mind? Here a bhikkhu abides

pervading one quarter with his mind endued with loving-kindness, likewise the second quarter, likewise the third quarter, likewise the fourth quarter; so above, below, around; he abides pervading the entire world everywhere and equally with his mind endued with loving-kindness, abundant, exalted, measureless and free from affliction. He abides pervading one direction with his mind endued with compassion... with gladness... with equanimity... measureless and free from affliction. This is what is called the measureless deliverance of mind.

8. 'What is the exalted deliverance of mind? Here a bhikkhu abides being intent on pervading¹ as "exalted" the extent of one tree root. This is called the exalted deliverance of mind.

'Here a bhikkhu abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" the extent of two or three tree roots. This too is what is called the exalted deliverance of mind.

'Here a bhikkhu abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" the extent of one village area. This too is what is called the exalted deliverance of mind.

'Here a bhikkhu abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" the extent of two or three village areas. This too is what is called the exalted deliverance of mind.

'Here a bhikkhu abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" the extent of one major kingdom. This too is what is called the exalted deliverance of mind.

'Here a bhikkhu abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" the extent of two or three major kingdoms. This too is what is called the exalted deliverance of mind.

'Here a bhikkhu abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" the extent of what is bounded by the ocean. This too is what is called the exalted deliverance of mind.

'This is the way in which it can be known that these dhammas are different in meaning and different in the letter.

9. 'There are these four kinds of reappearance of being. What four? Here someone abides being intent on pervading thus: "Limited radiance".

1. Pharivā: this could also mean 'extending over'.

On the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears (in) the company of the Gods of Limited Radiance (Paritābhā).² Here someone abides being intent on pervading thus: "Measureless radiance". On the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears (in) the company of the Gods of Measureless Radiance (Appamānābhā). Here someone abides being intent on pervading thus: "Defiled radiance". On the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears (in) the company of the Gods of Defiled Radiance (Sankiliṭṭhābhā). Here someone abides being intent on pervading thus: "Pure radiance". On the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears in the company of the Gods of Pure Radiance (Pari-suddhābhā). There are these four kinds of reappearance of being.

10. 'There may be an occasion on which those gods assemble together. When they do so, what is understood is difference of (identity in) their appearance, not difference of their (kind of) radiance. Suppose a man brought many oil lamps into a house, then what is understood is difference of (identity in) their flames, not difference of their (kind of) radiance. So too, there may be an occasion . . . not difference of their (kind of) radiance.

11. 'There may be an occasion on which those gods disperse from there. When they do so, what is understood is difference of (identity in) their appearance, not difference of their (kind of) radiance. Suppose a man took those many oil lamps out of the house, then what is understood is difference of (identity in) their appearance, not difference of their (kind of) radiance. So too, there may be an occasion . . . not difference of their (kind of) radiance.

12. 'It is not that gods actually think thus: "This that is ours is permanent or everlasting or eternal", but rather that wherever those gods live, there they take delight. Suppose flies were being carried along on a carrying-pole or on a basket, they would not actually think thus: "This that is ours is permanent or everlasting or eternal", but rather that wherever those flies live, there they take delight. So too, it is not that . . . take delight.'

2. See Sutta 41, para. 26 for these gods and some that follow.

13. When this was said, the venerable Abhiya Kaccāna said to the venerable Anuruddha: 'Good, venerable Anuruddha. And there is a further question that I can ask: Are all the gods with radiance of limited radiance? Or are some of the gods there of measureless radiance?'

'According to the factor (distinguishing the kind of their being), friend Kaccāna, (in which they reappear) there are some gods there with limited radiance and some gods with measureless radiance.'

14. 'Venerable Anuruddha, what is the reason, what is the condition for the fact that while these gods have reappeared in a single order of gods there are some gods there with limited radiance and some gods with measureless radiance?'

15. 'As to that, friend Kaccāna, I shall ask you a question in return. Answer it as you like. How do you conceive this, friend Kaccāna: the bhikkhu who abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" the extent of one tree root, and the bhikkhu who abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" the extent of two or three tree roots, which of these two bhikkhus' development of mind is the more exalted?'

'The second one's, venerable sir.'

16. 'How do you conceive this, friend Kaccāna: the bhikkhu who abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" two or three roots, and the bhikkhu who abides being intent on pervading as "exalted" one village area, which of these two bhikkhus' development of mind is the more exalted?'

'The second one's, venerable sir.'

17. '... one village area ... two or three village areas ... more exalted?'

'The second one's, venerable sir.'

18. '... two or three village areas ... one major kingdom ... more exalted?'

'The second one's, venerable sir.'

19. '... one major kingdom ... two or three major kingdoms ... more exalted?'

'The second one's, venerable sir.'

20. '... two or three major kingdoms... of what is bounded by the ocean, which of these two bhikkhus' development of mind is the more exalted?'

'The second one's, venerable sir.'

21. 'This is the reason, friend Kaccāna, this is the condition, for the fact that while these gods have reappeared in a single order of gods there are some gods with limited radiance and some gods with measureless radiance.'

22. 'Good, venerable Anuruddha. And there is a further question that I can ask: Are all the gods with radiance of defiled radiance? Or are some of the gods there of pure radiance?'

'According to the factor (distinguishing the kind of their being), friend Kaccāna, (in which they reappear) there are some gods there with defiled radiance and some gods with pure radiance.'

23. 'Venerable Anuruddha, what is the reason, what is the condition, for the fact that while these gods have reappeared in a single order of gods there are some gods there with defiled radiance and some gods with pure radiance?'

24. 'As to that, friend Kaccāna, I shall give you a simile, for some wise men understand by means of a simile the meaning of what is said here. Suppose the oil of a burning lamp is unclean³ and its wick unclean,³ then because of its oil and its wick it burns (*jhāyati*) as if darkly; so too, here a bhikkhu abides being intent on pervading a defiled radiance: his bodily inertia is not quite tranquillized, his lethargy and drowsiness is not quite eliminated, and his agitation and worry is not quite removed; for that reason he practises *jhāna* (*jhāyati*) as if darkly. On the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears in the company of the gods with defiled radiance. Suppose the oil of a burning lamp is clean⁴ and its wick is clean,⁴ then because of the cleanness of its oil and wick it does not burn (*na jhāyati*) as if darkly; so too, here a bhikkhu abides being intent on pervading an undefiled radiance; his bodily inertia is quite tranquillized, his lethargy and drowsiness is quite eliminated, and

3. Lit: 'impure'.

4. Lit: 'pure'.

his agitation and worry is quite removed; for that reason he does not practise jhāna (*na jhāyati*) as if darkly. On the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappears in the company of the gods with pure radiance. This is the reason, this is the condition, for the fact that while these gods have reappeared in a single order of gods there are some gods there with defiled radiance and some gods with pure radiance.'

25. When this was said, the venerable Abhiya Kaccāna said to the venerable Anuruddha: 'Good, venerable Anuruddha. Venerable sir, the venerable Anuruddha has not said: "Thus I heard" or "It ought to be thus", but on the contrary, venerable sir, the venerable Anuruddha speaks in this way: "Thus are those gods, and such are those gods". Venerable sir, it occurs to me thus: "Certainly the venerable Anuruddha has lived with those gods and has talked and held converse with them?"'

'Certainly, friend Kaccāna, this question of yours is a personal one directed at me, nevertheless I will answer you: I have long lived with those gods and have talked and held converse with them.'

29. When this was said, the venerable Abhiya Kaccāna told Pañcakanga the carpenter: 'It is gain for you, householder, it is great gain for you, that you have abandoned your dhamma of doubt and have had the opportunity of hearing this discourse on the Dhamma.'

Notes

para. 12. *adhivasanti*—live is probably a better reading than *adhinivisanti*.

para. 13. *tad-aṅgena*—according to the factor: possibly this expression might be the basis for the *bhavaṅga (citta)* of the Patthāna and Commentaries. See comment: *Tadaṅgenā ti tassa bhavūpattiyā aṅgena, bhavūpapatti-kāraṇenā' ti attho*.

From the fact that Ven. Abhiya Kaccāna addresses his senior as 'Bhante' instead of 'āvuso' the occasion appears to be after the Buddha's Parinibbāna (see D. ii, 153), unless he was a sāmaṇera.

para. 24. From this para. it seems that rūpajhāna does not imply the complete absence of all the five hindrances?

para. 25: For *dutthulla* as inertia see Sutta 64, para. 9 (not in this selec-

tion) and 128, para. 22. Comy. glossess with *kāyālasīya* (bodily indolence) which fits these contexts, but P.T.S. Dict. only gives meaning as 'lewdness' or equivalent (for which see e.g. VinA. 528). *Ālasīya* (not in P.T.S. Dict.) is n. from adj. *alasa*.

Anenjasapaya Sutta

The Way to the Imperturbable

Introduction

This is one of those Suttas which *begins* at a level of attainment which few people even end with. For not many people attain the fourth jhāna from which by stages the Sutta progresses through the four formless attainments to Nibbāna. At each stage the Buddha shows how a bhikkhu considers what should be abandoned, aspiring to what 'is more peaceful, a superior goal.'

The two sections 'With clinging there is no Nibbāna' and 'Without clinging there is Nibbāna' are important for they bring out two different ways of regarding the attitude embodied in the phrases: 'If I were not, and naught were mine, I shall not be, and naught will be mine. And what there is, has come to be, that I abandon.'

Venerable Ānanda Thera exclaims of this Sutta: 'It is wonderful, venerable sir, it is marvellous! For each stage of attainment, it seems, the crossing of the flood (of saṃsāra) has been told to us by the Blessed One.' Then the Sutta ends with that stirring passage in which the Buddha urges the bhikkhus *not to delay* their meditation *lest later you regret it*, and he points out the roots of trees and empty huts where it can be done.

The Sutta (106)

1. Thus I heard:

One one occasion the Blessed One was living in the Kuru Country.

There is a town of the Kurus called Kammāssadamma¹, and there he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this

2. 'Bhikkhus, sensual desires are impermanent, hollow, false, false-natured, made up of illusion, and fools' talk.

'Sensual desires here and now and sensual desires in lives to come, perceptions of sensual desires here and now and perceptions of sensual desires in lives to come, are alike Māra's realm, Māra's domain, Māra's bait, Māra's hunting-ground. Evil unprofitable notions of covetousness and ill-will and ambition lead on (to rebirth) here (in the sensual desire sphere), and they obstruct the training of a noble disciple here.

(4th Meditation)

3. 'Now, bhikkhus, a noble disciple considers thus: "Sensual desires here and now and sensual desires in lives to come, perceptions of sensual desires here and now and perceptions of sensual desires in lives to come, are alike Māra's realm, Māra's domain, Māra's bait, Māra's hunting-ground. Evil unprofitable notions of covetousness and ill-will and ambition lead on (to rebirth) here (in the sensual desire sphere), and they obstruct the training of a noble disciple here. Suppose I were to abide with mind abundant and exalted by transcending the world and resolving (firmly) with the mind², then there would be no more evil unprofitable notions of covetousness and ill-will and ambition in me, and with the abandoning of them my mind would be limited no longer; it would become measureless and would become well-developed too."

'When he enters upon this way and abides in it often, his mind acquires confidence in this base. Once there is full confidence, then he either enters upon the way to (rebirth in) the Imperturbable, or else he decides to (perfect) understanding (by reaching Arahantship). On the dissolution of the body, after death, it is possible that that consciousness of his which leads on (to rebirth), may pass on (upon rebirth) to (one of) the Im-

1. The Commentary to Sutta 10, "The Foundations of Mindfulness" remarks that the Kuru people were intelligent and could penetrate deep Dhamma. Hence several Suttas of this sort were taught there by the Buddha.

2. This has more the sense of 'aiming at' or 'directing the mind at'; see also translator's note.

perturbable (states). This is called the first way directed to the Imperturbable.

(Infinite Space)

4. 'Again a noble disciple considers thus: "(There are) sensual desires here and now and sensual desires in lives to come, perceptions of sensual desires here and now and perceptions of sensual desires in lives to come; whatever is form, all form is the four great primary elements and the form derived from the four great primary elements."³

'When he enters upon this way and abides in it often, his mind acquires confidence in this base. Once there is full confidence, then he either enters upon the way to (rebirth in) the Imperturbable, or else he decides to (perfect) understanding (by reaching Arahantship). On the dissolution of the body, after death, it is possible that that consciousness of his, which leads on (to rebirth), may pass on (upon rebirth) to (one of) the Imperturbable (states). This is called the second way directed to the Imperturbable.

(Infinite Consciousness)

5. 'Again, a noble disciple considers thus: "Sensual desires here and now and sensual desires in lives to come, perception of sensual desires here and now and perceptions of sensual desires in lives to come, forms here and now and forms in lives to come, perceptions of forms here and now and perceptions of forms in lives to come, are all impermanent; what is impermanent is not worth relishing, not worth affirming, not worth accepting."

'When he enters upon this way and abides in it often, his mind acquires confidence in this base. Once there is full confidence, then he either enters upon the way to (rebirth in) the Imperturbable, or else he decides to (perfect) understanding (by reaching Arahantship). On the dissolution of the body, after death, it is possible that that consciousness of his, which leads on (to rebirth), may pass on (upon rebirth) to (one of) the Imperturbable (states). This is called the third way directed to the Imperturbable.

3. It is possible that the text is incomplete here though the Comy. does not say so. As this is one of the Suttas dealing with advanced practice, only a person with practical experience could interpret it correctly.

(Nothingness-I)

6. 'Again, a noble disciple considers thus: "Sensual desires here and now and sensual desires in lives to come, perceptions of sensual desires here and now and perceptions of sensual desires in lives to come, forms here and now and forms in lives to come, perceptions of forms here and now and perceptions of forms in lives to come, perceptions of the Imperturbable—all are perceptions; where these perceptions cease without remainder, that is (more) peaceful, that is a superior (goal), that is to say the base consisting of nothingness."

'When he enters on this way and abides in it often, his mind acquires confidence in this base. Once there is full confidence, then he either enters upon the way to (rebirth in) the base consisting of nothingness, or else he decides to (perfect) understanding (by reaching Arahantship). On the dissolution of the body, after death, it is possible that that consciousness of his, which leads on (to rebirth), may pass on (upon rebirth) to the base consisting of nothingness. This is called the first way directed to the base consisting of nothingness.

(Nothingness—II)

7. 'Again, a noble disciple, gone to the forest or to the root of a tree or to an empty hut, considers thus: "This is void of self or of a self's property."

'When he enters upon this way and abides in it often...pass on (upon rebirth) to the base consisting of nothingness. This is called the second way directed to the base consisting of nothingness.

(Nothingness—III)

8. 'Again, a noble disciple considers thus: "I am not anywhere anyone's owning; nor is there anywhere my owning in anyone."

'When he enters upon this way and abides in it often...pass on (upon rebirth) to the base consisting of nothingness. This is called the third way directed to the base consisting of nothingness.

(Neither-Perception-Nor-Non-Perception)

9. 'Again, a noble disciple considers thus: "Sensual desires here and now

and sensual desires in lives to come, perceptions of sensual desires here and now and perceptions of sensual desires in lives to come, form here and now and form in lives to come, perceptions of forms here and now and perceptions of form in lives to come, perceptions of the Imperturbable, perceptions of the base consisting of nothingness—all are perceptions: when all these perceptions cease without remainder, that is (more) peaceful, that is a superior (goal), that is to say the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception.”

‘When he enters upon this way and abides in it often, his mind acquires confidence in this base. Once there is full confidence, then he either enters upon the way to (rebirth in) the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, or else he decides to (perfect) understanding (by reaching Arahantship). On the dissolution of the body, after death, it is possible that that consciousness of his, which leads on (to rebirth), may pass on (upon rebirth) to the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception. This is called the way directed to the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception.’

(With Clinging There Is No Nibbāna)

10. When this was said, the venerable Ānanda asked the Blessed One: ‘Venerable sir, here a bhikkhu enters upon this way: “If I were not, and naught were mine, I shall not be and naught will be mine. (And) what there is, has come to be, that I abandon”,⁴ and thus he obtains equanimity. Venerable sir, does such a bhikkhu reach Nibbāna?’

‘Perhaps one such bhikkhu might reach Nibbāna, Ānanda, perhaps another such bhikkhu might not reach Nibbāna.’

‘Venerable sir, what is the cause, what is the reason, why one might and another might not?’

‘Here, Ānanda, a bhikkhu enters upon this way: “If I were not, and naught were mine, I shall not be and naught will be mine. (And) what there is, has come to be, that I abandon”, and thus he obtains equanim-

4. See also translator’s note. This slogan had non-Buddhist meanings, as he explains, but to a Buddhist it means: “If I did not exist in the past (=five aggregates) and made no kamma then, I should not exist now. And if the present five aggregates did not exist, I should not come to exist in future.”

ity. He relishes that equanimity, welcomes it and accepts it. When he does that, then his consciousness depends on that equanimity, clings to it. A bhikkhu who is affected by clinging does not attain Nibbāna, Ānanda.'

11. 'But, venerable sir, when that bhikkhu clings, what does he cling to?'

'To the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, Ānanda.'

'It seems, venerable sir, that when this bhikkhu clings, he clings to the best (fuel for) clinging?'

'When this bhikkhu clings, Ānanda, he clings to the best (fuel for) clinging; for this is the best (fuel for) clinging, namely the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception.'

(Without Clinging There Is Nibbana)

12. 'Here, Ānanda, a bhikkhu enters upon this way: "If I were not, and naught were mine, I shall not be and naught be mine. (And) what there is, has come to be, that I abandon", and thus he attains equanimity. He does not relish the equanimity, welcome it or accept it. When he does not do that, then his consciousness does not depend on that equanimity or cling to it. A bhikkhu who is unaffected by clinging attains Nibbāna, Ānanda.'

13. 'It is wonderful, venerable sir, it is marvellous! For each stage (of attainment), it seems, the crossing of the flood has been told to us by the Blessed One. But, venerable sir, what is the Noble One's liberation?'

'Here, Ānanda, a noble disciple considers thus: "Sensual desires here and now and sensual desires in lives to come, perceptions of sensual desires here and now and perceptions of sensual desires in lives to come, form here and now and form in lives to come, perceptions of form here and now and perceptions of form in lives to come, perceptions of Imper-turbability, perceptions of the base consisting of nothingness, perceptions of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception—that is embodiment, that is as far as embodiment extends: (but) this is the deathless, that is to say, the liberation of mind through not clinging.'

14. 'So, Ānanda, I have shown the way directed to the Imperturbable,

I have shown the way directed to the base consisting of nothingness, I have shown the way directed to the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, I have shown for each stage (of attainment) the crossing of the flood, I have shown the Noble One's liberation.

15. 'Ānanda, what should be done for his disciples out of pity by a master who seeks their welfare and has pity on them, that I have done for you, Ānanda. There are these roots of trees, there are these empty huts. Meditate,⁵ Ānanda, do not delay lest you later regret it. This is our message for you.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Ānanda was satisfied and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 3. Imperturbable (*āneñjā*): a term used mostly for the four formless states but here and in Sutta 105 for the 4th form-sphere jhāna and only the first two formless states. Cf Sutta 4, para. 27.

For resolve (*adhiṭṭhāna*) see the four kinds in Sutta 140, para. 12 and 20. (end). (There translated 'foundations'. Ed.)

For transcend (*abhiḥhuyya*) see the eight bases for transcendence (*abhi-bhāyatana*) in Sutta 77, para. 24. and note, and the Transcendent Being (*Abhiḥhū*) in Sutta 1, para. 15.

For world (*loka*) see Sutta 10, para. 3. and note, also Samyutta XXXV, nos. 90 and 116.

para. 7. for expression "This is void of self ..." etc., cf. Samyutta vol. iv, 54, and Vis. 653.

para. 8. for the expression "I am not anywhere ..." etc., cf. Anguttara vol i, 206; ii, 177; iii, 170; and Vis. 653-4 (reading *kiñcanat'asmiṃ* and *kiñcanat'atthi*, the form being nom. from *kiñcanatā* (?)) Note the play on *kiñcanatā* (= *kiñcana*) and *ākiñcañña*, which occurs also in a different form at Sutta 43, para. 36. But cf. A. iii, 170 "Mā me kvaciṃ katthaci kiñcana rajjaniyesu dhammesu rāgo udapādi."

5. This can also be rendered "Practise jhāna, Ānanda ..."

para. 10. For the expression "If I were not . . ." etc., Cf. Samyutta voliii, 56 (explanation=*ucchedadit̥hi*: the wrong view of annihilation), 99, and 183, 206; also Anguttara (Sevens) no. 52 and (Tens) no. 29. Should one read *no c'assaṃ . . . no bhavissam̃* throughout?

Read probably: *no ce assa (assaṃ) no ca me siyā; na bhavissati (bhavissāmi) na ca me bhavissati; yad atthi yaṃ bhūtam̃ taṃ pajahāmi*= "If I were not, and naught were mine, I shall not be and naught will be mine. (And) what there is, has come to be, that I abandon". The statement is an ontological consequence of the preceding statements.

These expressions seem to have been stereotyped slogans or descriptions of the attainments of nothingness and neither-perception-nor-non-perception, primarily non-Buddhist, and sometimes used as a basis for the embodiment view (*sakkāya-dit̥hi*).

para. 11. 'best (fuel for) clinging': for this rendering see note to Sutta 11, para. 17.

Culasunnata Sutta¹

Voidness-I

Introduction

The meaning of voidness (*suññata*) is very precisely defined by the Buddha in this Sutta. We are told, step by step, exactly what is void and what, still remaining, has to be recognized as not void. And we begin in this world of the senses which we know fairly well. Then by stages we withdraw to the forest, from that to the earth and using that as a *kasina*, a base for concentration, arrive after long efforts maybe, at the base of infinite space. All that has gone before, all experience while in that concentration, is of infinite space. Now, one who does not have a good Teacher might stop here imagining that he had arrived at voidness and perhaps mistake it for Nibbāna. But he has to push on through the other three formless concentrations until he attains to the signless concentration of mind in which there is no discrimination of 'marks' or 'signs'. This has to be seen as a conditioned state, impermanent and liable to cessation. Having seen this, he is free from birth and death, free from ignorance, an Arahant.

The Sutta (121)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in the Eastern Park, the Palace of Migāra's Mother.

2. Then when it was evening, the venerable Ānanda rose from retreat, and he went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said to the Blessed One:

1. For the translator's rendering of the Mahasunnata Sutta, No 122, see The Wheel Publication, No. 87. B.P.S., Kandy.

3. 'Venerable sir, once the Blessed One was living in the Sakyan country. There is a town of the Sakyans called Nāgaraka; there I heard and learnt this from the Blessed One's own lips: "Now I abide much in the voiding, Ānanda." Venerable sir, was this well heard by me, well apprehended, well attended to and well remembered?'

'Certainly, Ānanda, that was well heard by you, well apprehended, well attended to and well remembered. As formerly, so now too, I abide much in the void abiding.

4. 'Ānanda, just as the Palace of Migāra's Mother is void of elephants, cattle, horses and mares, void of gold and silver, void of the foregathering of women and men, and there is (present) only this non-voidness, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) the community of bhikkhus, so too, without giving attention to perception of village, without giving attention to perception of man, a bhikkhu gives attention to the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of forest. His mind enters into that perception of forest and acquires confidence, steadiness and decision. He understands thus: "Disturbances that would be present dependent on perception of village are not present here, disturbances that would be present on perception of man are not present here, and only this measure of disturbance is present, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of forest." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of village." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of man", (and he understands): "There is (present) only this non-voidness, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of forest." So he sees it as void of what is not there, but of what remains there he understands: "There is that still present there." Now this has been for him an alighting upon voidness that accords with what actually is, without perversion of meaning and is pure.

5. 'Again, Ānanda, without giving attention to perception of man, without giving attention to perception of forest a bhikkhu gives attention to the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of earth. His mind enters into that perception of earth and acquires confidence, steadiness and decision. Just as though a bull's hide were freed from folds by stretching it with a hundred pegs, so too,

without giving attention to all the ridges and hollows, the river ravines, the tracts of stumps and thorns, the rocky inequalities, on this earth, a bhikkhu gives attention to the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of earth. His mind enters into the perception of earth and acquires confidence, steadiness and decision. He understands thus: "Disturbances that would have been present dependent on perception of man are not present here, disturbances that would be present dependent on perception of forest are not present here, and only this measure of disturbance is present, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of earth." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of man." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of forest", (and he understands): "There is (present) only this non-voidness, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of earth." So he sees it as void of what is not there, but of what remains there he understands: "There is that still present there." Now this too has been for him an alighting upon voidness, that accords with what actually is, without perversion of meaning, and is pure.

6. 'Again, Ānanda, without giving attention to perception of forest, without giving attention to perception of earth, a bhikkhu gives attention to the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of infinite space. His mind enters into that perception of the base consisting of infinite space and acquires confidence, steadiness and decision. He understands thus: "Disturbances that would be present dependent on perception of forest are not present here, disturbances that would be present on perception of earth are not present here, and only this measure of disturbance is present, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of infinite space." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of forest." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of earth", (and he understands:) "There is (present) only this non-voidness, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of infinite space." So he sees it as void of what is not there, but of what remains there he understands: "There is that still present there." Now this too has been for him an alighting upon void-

ness that accords with what actually is, without perversion of meaning and is pure.

7. 'Again, Ānanda, without giving attention to perception or earth, without giving attention to perception of the base consisting of infinite space, a bhikkhu gives attention to the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of infinite consciousness. His mind enters into the perception of the base consisting of infinite consciousness and acquires confidence, steadiness and decision. He understands thus: "Disturbances that would be present dependent on perception of earth are not present here, disturbances that would be present dependent on perception of the base consisting of infinite space are not present here, and only this measure of disturbance is present, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of infinite consciousness." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of earth." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of the base consisting of infinite space", (and he understands): "There is (present) only this non-voidness, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of infinite consciousness." So he sees it as void of what is not there, but of what remains there he understands: "There is that still present there." Now this too has been for him an alighting upon voidness that accords with what actually is, without perversion of meaning, and is pure.

8. 'Again, Ānanda, without giving attention to perception of the base consisting of infinite space, without giving attention to perception of the base consisting of infinite consciousness, a bhikkhu gives attention to the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of nothingness. His mind enters into the perception of the base consisting of nothingness and he acquires confidence, steadiness and decision. He understands thus: "Disturbances that would be present dependent on perception of the base of infinite space are not present here, disturbances that would be present dependent on perception of the base of infinite consciousness are not present here, and only this measure of disturbance is present, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of nothingness." He understands: "This field of

perception is void of perception of the base consisting of infinite space", and he understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of the base consisting of infinite consciousness", (and he understands): "There is (present) only this non-voidness, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of nothingness." So he sees it as void of what is not there, but of what remains there he understands: "There is that still present there." Now this too has been for him an alighting upon voidness that accords with what is, without perversion of meaning and is pure.

9. 'Again, Ānanda, without giving attention to perception of the base consisting of infinite consciousness, without giving attention to perception of the base consisting of nothingness, a bhikkhu gives attention to the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception. His mind enters into the perception of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception and acquires confidence, steadiness and decision. He understands thus: "Disturbances that would be present dependent on the perception of the base consisting of infinite consciousness are not present here, disturbances that would be present dependent on the perception of the base consisting of nothingness are not present here, and only this measure of disturbance is present, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of the base consisting of infinite consciousness." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of the base consisting of nothingness", (and he understands): "There is (present) only this non-voidness, that is to say, the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) perception of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception." So he sees it as void of what is not there, but of what remains there he understands: "There is that still present there." Now this too has been for him an alighting upon voidness, that accords with what actually is, without perversion of meaning and is pure.

10. 'Again, Ānanda, without giving attention to perception of the base consisting of nothingness, without giving attention to the base consisting

of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, a bhikkhu gives attention to the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) the signless concentration of mind. His mind enters into the signless concentration of mind and acquires confidence, steadiness and decision. He understands thus: "Disturbances that would be present dependent on perception of the base consisting of nothingness are not present here, disturbances that would be present dependent on perception of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception are not present here, and only this measure of disturbance is present, that is to say, that (disturbance) which has life as its condition dependent on the presence of this body with its six bases." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of the base consisting of nothingness." He understands: "This field of perception is void of perception of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception", (and he understands): "There is (present) only this non-voidness, that is to say, that (non-voidness) with life as its condition dependent on this body with its six bases." So he sees it as void of what is not there, but of what remains there he understands: "There is that still present there." Now this too has been for him an alighting upon voidness that accords with what actually is, without perversion of meaning, and is pure.

11. 'Again, Ānanda, without giving attention to perception of the base consisting of nothingness, without giving attention to perception of the base consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, a bhikkhu gives attention to the single state (of non-voidness) dependent on (the presence of) the signless concentration of mind. His mind enters into the signless concentration of mind and acquires confidence, steadiness and decision. He understands thus: "This signless concentration of mind is conditioned and mentally produced." He understands: "Whatever is conditioned and mentally produced is impermanent and liable to cessation." When he knows and sees thus, his mind is liberated from the taint of sensual desire, from the taint of being, from the taint of ignorance. When liberated there comes the knowledge "It is liberated". He understands: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived out, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come." He understands thus: "Disturbances that would be present dependent on the taint of sensual desire are not present here, disturbances that would be present dependent on

the taint of being are not present here, disturbances that would be present dependent on the taint of ignorance are not present here, and only this measure of disturbance is present, that is to say, that (non-voidness) with life as its condition dependent on (the presence of) this body with its six bases." He understands: "This field of perception is void of the taint of sensual desire." He understands: "This field of perception is void of the taint of being." He understands: "This field of perception is void of the taint of ignorance", (and he understands): "There is (present) only this non-voidness, that is to say, that (non-voidness) with life as its condition dependent on (the presence of) this body with its six bases." So he sees it as void of what is not there, but of what remains there he understands: "There is that still present there." Now this has been for him an alighting upon voidness that accords with what actually is, without perversion of meaning, is pure and is unsurpassed by any other.

12. 'Whatever monks or divines in the past have entered upon and abode in a voidness that was purified and unsurpassed by any other, they have all of them entered upon and abode in this voidness that is pure and unsurpassed by any other.

'Whatever monks and divines in the future will enter upon . . . they will all of them enter upon . . . unsurpassed by any other.

'Whatever monks and divines in the present enter upon . . . they all of them enter upon . . . unsurpassed by any other.

'Therefore, Ānanda, you should train thus: "We will enter upon and abide in the voidness that is pure and unsurpassed by any other."'

That is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Ānanda was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 4. (to the end): *avakkanti*—alighting upon: Cf. S. ii, 101 (*nāmarūpassa avakkanti*) and *okkanto* in S. iii, 225.

Culahatthipadapama Sutta

The Simile of the Elephant's Footprint-I

Introduction

This simile, begun by the wanderer Pilotika in praise of the Buddha, was finished by the Buddha in a step by step explanation of the Dhamma. This goes through the following stages:

“a Tathāgata appears in the world . . . He teaches Dhamma . . . a householder . . . hears that Dhamma . . . he acquires faith in the Tathāgata . . . goes forth from home life into homelessness.”

Then follows “this store of the Noble One's virtue”, a detailed enumeration of some precepts for bhikkhus. After this, restraint of the senses, full awareness, a secluded resting-place, abandoning the five hindrances, attainment of the jhānas, the three knowledges, and Arahantship, follow in order. The brahmin Janussoni, a very rich and powerful man, was so impressed with this discourse that he went for Refuge, but not so much impressed (as some other brahmins were) that he asked for the Going-forth and Admission to the Sangha as a bhikkhu.

The Sutta (27)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park.

2. Now on that occasion Jānussoni of the divine caste drove in broad

day through Sāvatti in a chariot drawn by mares, all in white. He saw the wanderer Pilotika coming. When he saw him, he asked him: 'Now where is Master Vacchāyana coming from in broad day?'

'Sir, I am coming from the monk Gotama's presence.'

'How does Master Vacchāyana conceive the monk Gotama's ability of understanding? He is wise, is he not?'

'Sir, who am I to know the monk Gotama's ability of understanding? One would surely have to be his equal to know the monk Gotama's ability of understanding.'

'Master Vacchāyana praises the monk Gotama with high praise indeed.'

'Sir, who am I to praise the monk Gotama? The monk Gotama is praised by the praised—as best among gods and men.'

'What value does Master Vacchāyana see that he has such confidence in the monk Gotama?'

3. 'Sir, suppose a wise elephant-woodsman went into an elephant wood, and he saw in the elephant wood a big elephant's footprint long in extent and broad across, he would conclude: "It is a bull elephant and a big one." So too, as soon as I saw four footprints in the monk Gotama, I concluded: "The Blessed One is fully enlightened, the Dhamma is well-proclaimed, the Sangha has entered upon the good way." What are the four?'

4. 'Sir, I have seen here certain warrior-noble caste scholars that were clever and knew others' theories as a hairsplitter (marksman knows archery): one would fancy they must go about demolishing views with the understanding that they have. They hear: "The monk Gotama will visit such a village or town." They formulate a question thus: "If he is asked like this, he will answer like this, and so we shall prove his theory wrong; and if he is asked like this, he will answer like this, and so again we shall prove his theory wrong."¹ They hear: "The monk Gotama has come to visit such and such a village or town." They go to the monk Gotama. The monk Gotama instructs, urges, rouses and encourages them with a talk on the Dhamma.' After that they do not so much as ask him the question, so how should they prove his theory

1. For an example see Sutta 58, para. 4 ff.

wrong? In actual fact they become his disciples. When I saw this first footprint in the monk Gotama, I concluded: "The Blessed One is fully enlightened, the Dhamma is well proclaimed, the Sangha has entered on the good way."

5. 'Again, I have seen certain divine caste scholars that were clever . . . this second footprint . . . the Sangha has entered on the good way.'

6. 'Again, I have seen certain householder scholars that were clever . . . this third footprint . . . the Sangha has entered on the good way.'

7. 'Again, I have seen certain monk scholars that were clever and knew others' theories as a hair-splitter (marksman knows archery): one would fancy they must go about demolishing views with the understanding that they have. They hear: "The monk Gotama will visit such and such a village or town." They formulate a question: "If he is asked like this, he will answer like this, and so we shall prove his theory wrong, and if he is asked like this, he will answer like this, and so again we shall prove his theory wrong." They hear: "The monk Gotama has come to visit such and such a village or town." They go to the monk Gotama. The monk Gotama instructs, urges, rouses and encourages them with talk on the Dhamma. They do not so much as ask him the question, so how should they prove his theory wrong? In actual fact they ask the monk Gotama to allow them to go forth from the home life into homelessness, and he gives them the Going-forth. Not long after they have gone forth in this way, dwelling alone and withdrawn, diligent, ardent and self-controlled, by realization themselves, with direct knowledge they here and now enter upon and abide in that supreme goal of the life divine for the sake of which clansmen rightly go forth from the home life into homelessness. They say thus: "We were very nearly lost, we were very nearly undone, for formerly we claimed that we were monks though we were not, we claimed that we were divines though we were not, we claimed that we were Arahants though we were not, but now we are monks, now we are divines, now we are Arahants." When I saw this fourth footprint in the monk Gotama, I concluded: "The Blessed One is fully enlightened, the Dhamma is well-proclaimed, the Sangha has entered on the good way."

8. 'As soon as I saw these four footprints in the monk Gotama I concluded: "The Blessed One is fully enlightened, the Dhamma is well proclaimed, the Sangha has entered on the good way."' "

9. When this was said, Jānussoni of the divine caste got down from his chariot drawn by mares, all in white, and arranging his robes on one shoulder, he raised his hands palms together towards where the Blessed One was, and uttered this exclamation three times: 'Honour to the Blessed One, Arahant and Fully Enlightened! Honour to the Blessed One, Arahant and Fully Enlightened! Honour to the Blessed One, Arahant and Fully Enlightened! Now suppose that, sometime or other, we were to meet Master Gotama and have some conversation with him?'

10. Then Jānussoni of the divine caste went to the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he related to the Blessed One all his conversation with the wanderer Pilotikā. When this was said, the Blessed One told him:

11. 'At this point, divine, the simile of the elephant's footprint has not yet been completed in detail. So listen then how it is completed in detail and attend carefully to what I shall say.'

'Yes, sir,' Jannussoni of the divine caste replied. The Blessed One said this:

12. 'Divine, suppose an elephant woodsman went into an elephant wood, and he saw in the elephant wood a big elephant's footprint long in extent and broad across: a wise elephant woodsman would not yet conclude "It is a bull elephant and a big one." Why is that? In an elephant wood there are small cow elephants that leave a big footprint. It might be the footprint of one of those. He follows it. As he does so, he sees in the elephant wood a big elephant's footprint long in extent and broad across and something used³ high up: a wise elephant woodsman would not yet conclude "It is a bull elephant and a big one." Why is that? In an elephant wood there are tall cow elephants with prominent teeth that leave a big footprint. It might be the footprint of one of

2. In Pāli: *Namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammā-sambuddhassa.*

3. Comy. explains the trunk and branches scraped by the elephant.

those. He follows it. As he does so, he sees in the elephant wood an elephant's footprint long in extent and broad across and something used high up and marks made by tusks: a wise elephant woodsman would not yet conclude "It is a bull elephant and a big one." Why is that? In an elephant wood there are tall cow elephants with tusks that have a big footprint. It might be the footprint of one of those. He follows it. As he does so, he sees in the elephant wood an elephant's footprint long in extent and broad across and something used high up and marks made by tusks and broken-off branches. And he sees the bull elephant at the root of a tree or in the open, walking about or standing, sitting or lying down. He concludes: "This is that great bull elephant."

13. 'So too, divine, here a Tathāgata appears in the world, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, perfect in true knowledge and conduct, sublime, knower of worlds, incomparable leader of men to be tamed, teacher of gods and men, enlightened, blessed.

14. 'He declares this world with its gods, its Māras and its (Brahmā) Divinities, this generation with its monks and divines, with its kings, and men, which he has himself realized by direct knowledge.

15. 'He teaches Dhamma good in the beginning, good in the middle and good in the end, with (the right) meaning and phrasing, and he announces a life divine that is utterly perfect and pure.

16. 'A householder or householder's son or one born in some clan hears that Dhamma. On hearing the Dhamma he acquires faith in the Tathāgata. Possessing that faith, he considers thus: "House life is crowded and dirty; life gone forth is wide open. It is not possible, living in a household, to lead a life divine as utterly perfect and pure as a polished shell. Suppose I shaved off hair and beard, put on the yellow cloth, and went forth from the home life into homelessness?"

'And on another occasion, abandoning perhaps a small, perhaps a large fortune, abandoning perhaps a small, perhaps a large circle of relatives, he shaves off hair and beard, puts on the yellow cloth, and goes forth from the home life into homelessness.

17. 'Being thus gone forth and possessing the bhikkhus' training and way of life, abandoning killing living beings, he becomes one who abstains

from killing living beings, with rod and weapon laid aside, gentle and kindly, he abides compassionate to all beings.

'Abandoning taking what is not given, he becomes one who abstains from taking what is not given, taking (only) what is given, expecting (only) what is given, he abides pure in himself by not stealing.

'Abandoning what is not the life divine,¹ he becomes one who lives the life divine, who lives apart abstaining from vulgar lechery.

'Abandoning false speech, he becomes one who abstains from false speech, he speaks truth, cleaves to truth, is trustworthy, reliable and undeceiving of the world.

'Abandoning malicious speech, he becomes one who abstains from malicious speech: as one who is neither a repeater elsewhere of what is heard here for the purpose of causing division from these, nor a repeater to these of what is heard elsewhere for the purpose of causing division from those, who is thus a reuniter of the divided, a promoter of friendships, and-enjoying concord, rejoicing in concord, delighting in concord, he becomes a speaker of words that promote concord.

'Abandoning harsh speech, he becomes one who abstains from harsh speech: he becomes a speaker of such words as are innocent, pleasing to the ear and lovable, as go to the heart, are civil, desired of many, and dear to many.

'Abandoning gossip, he becomes one who abstains from gossip: as one who tells in season what is true and beneficial and the Dhamma and Discipline, he becomes a speaker of timely words, worth recalling, reasoned, measured and connected with good.

'He becomes one who abstains from injuring seeds and plants.

'He becomes one who eats in only one part of the day, refusing (food) at night and late meals.

'He becomes one who abstains from dancing, singing, music and theatrical shows.

'He becomes one who abstains from wearing of garlands, smartening with scent and embellishment with unguents.

'He becomes one who abstains from high and large couches.

'He becomes one who abstains from accepting gold and silver.

1. Meaning here 'not indulging in sexual intercourse but practising celibacy'.

'He becomes one who abstains from accepting raw corn.

'He becomes one who abstains from accepting raw meat.

'He becomes one who abstains from accepting women and girls.

'He becomes one who abstains from accepting bondswomen and bondsmen.

'He becomes one who abstains from accepting sheep and goats.

'He becomes one who abstains from accepting poultry and pigs.

'He becomes one who abstains from accepting elephants, cattle, horses and mares.

'He becomes one who abstains from accepting fields and lands.

'He becomes one who abstains from going on errands.

'He becomes one who abstains from buying and selling.

'He becomes one who abstains from false weights, false metal and false measures.

'He becomes one who abstains from cheating, deceiving, defrauding and trickery.

'He becomes one who abstains from wounding, murdering, binding brigandage, plunder and violence.

'He becomes one who is content with robes to keep the body, with alms-food to keep the belly: wherever he goes he takes all with him. Just as wherever a winged bird flies it flies using its own wings, so too he becomes one who is content with robes to keep the body, with alms-food to keep the belly: wherever he goes he takes all with him.

'Possessing this store of Noble Ones' virtue, he feels in himself pleasure that is blameless.

18. 'He becomes one who, on seeing a visible form with the eye, apprehends no signs and features through which, if he left the eye faculty unguarded, evil unprofitable dhammas of covetousness and grief might invade him. He practises the way of restraint, he guards the eye faculty, undertakes the restraint of the eye faculty. On hearing a sound with the ear . . . On smelling an odour with the nose . . . On tasting a flavour with the tongue . . . On touching a tangible with the body . . . On cognizing a dhamma with the mind . . . undertakes the restraint of the mind faculty.

'Possessing this Noble Ones' faculty restraint, he feels in himself plea-

sure that is blameless.

19. 'He becomes one who acts in full awareness when moving forward and moving backward, who acts in full awareness when looking towards and looking away, who acts in full awareness when flexing and extending, who acts in full awareness when wearing the patched cloak, robes and bowl, who acts in full awareness when eating, drinking, chewing and tasting, who acts in full awareness when evacuating the bowels and making water, who acts in full awareness when walking, standing, sitting, waking up, talking and keeping silent.

20. 'Possessing this store of the Noble Ones' virtue, and possessing this Noble Ones' faculty restraint, and possessing this Noble Ones' mindfulness and full awareness, he resorts to a secluded resting-place—to the forest, a tree-root, a rock, a ravine, a mountain cave, a charnel ground, a woodland solitude, an open space, a heap of straw.

21. 'On return from his alms-round after the meal, he sits down, folding his legs crosswise, setting his body erect, establishing mindfulness before him.

'Abandoning covetousness for the world, he abides with a mind free from covetousness, he purifies mind from covetousness. Abandoning ill-will and hatred, he abides without a mind of ill-will, compassionate for the welfare of all living beings, he purifies mind from ill-will and hatred. Abandoning lethargy and drowsiness, he abides with a mind free from lethargy and drowsiness, percipient of light, mindful and fully aware, he purifies mind from lethargy and drowsiness. Abandoning agitation and worry, he abides unagitated with a mind stilled in himself, he purifies mind from agitation and worry. Abandoning uncertainty, he abides with a mind crossed beyond uncertainty, unquestioning about profitable dhammas, he purifies mind from uncertainty.

22. 'Having thus abandoned these five hindrances, imperfections of mind that weaken understanding, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, he enters upon and abides in the first jhāna, which is accompanied by initial and sustained application, with happiness and (bodily) pleasure born of seclusion.

23. 'This is called a footprint of a Tathāgata, something used by a Tathāgata, something marked by a Tathāgata, but a noble disciple does not yet conclude: "The Blessed One is fully enlightened, the Dhamma is well proclaimed, the Sangha has entered upon the good way."
24. 'Again, with the stilling of initial and sustained application, he enters upon and abides in the second jhāna, which has self-confidence and singleness of mind without initial application and without sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of concentration.
25. 'This also is called a footprint of a Tathāgata . . .
26. 'Again, with the fading as well of happiness he abides in equanimity, mindful and fully aware, still feeling pleasure with the body, he enters upon and abides in the third jhāna on account of which Noble Ones announce: "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful."
27. 'This also is called a footprint of a Tathāgata . . .
28. 'Again, with the abandoning of pleasure and pain, and with the previous disappearance of joy and grief, he enters upon and abides in the fourth jhāna, which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.
29. 'This also is called a footprint of a Tathāgata . . .
30. 'When the concentrated mind is thus purified and bright, unblemished, rid of defilement and become malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs, he inclines the mind to knowledge of recollection of past life . . . (as in Sutta 4, para. 27) . . . thus with its aspects and particulars he recollects his manifold past life.
31. 'This also is called a footprint of a Tathāgata . . .
32. 'When concentrated mind is thus purified . . . and attained to imperturbability, he directs, he inclines the mind to knowledge of the passing away and reappearance of beings . . . (as in Sutta 4, para. 29) . . . thus with heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees . . . how beings pass on according to their kammās.

33. 'This also is called a footprint of a Tathāgata, something used by a Tathāgata, something marked by a Tathāgata, but a noble disciple does not yet conclude: "The Blessed One is fully enlightened, the Dhamma is well proclaimed, the Sangha has entered upon the good way."

34. 'When concentrated mind is thus purified . . . and attained to imper-turbability, he directs, he inclines the mind to knowledge of the exhaus-tion of the taints. He understands as it actually is: "This is suffering" . . . (complete as in Sutta 4, para. 31) . . . He understands as it actually is: "This is the way leading to the cessation of taints."

35. 'This also is called a footprint of a Tathāgata, something used by a Tathāgata, something marked by a Tathāgata, but a noble disciple has not already concluded, but rather is in the act of concluding: "The Bles-sed One is fully enlightened, the Dhamma is well proclaimed, the Sangha has entered upon the good way."

36. 'Knowing thus, seeing thus, his mind is liberated from the taint of sensual desire, from the taint of being, and from the taint of ignorance. When liberated, there is the knowledge "It is liberated". He understands: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived out, what can be done is done, there is no more of this to come."

37. 'This also is called a footprint of a Tathāgata, something used by a Tathāgata, something marked by a Tathāgata. It is at this point that a noble disciple has concluded: "The Blessed One is fully enlightened, the the Dhamma is well proclaimed, the Sangha has entered upon the good way."

'It is at this point, divine, that the simile of the elephant's footprint has been completed in detail.'

38. When this was said, Jānussoni of the divine caste said: 'Magnificent, Master Gotama! Magnificent, Master Gotama! The Dhamma has been made clear in many ways by Master Gotama, as though he were righting the overthrown, revealing the hidden, showing the way to one who was lost, holding up a lamp in the darkness for those with eye-sight to see forms.

39. 'I go to Master Gotama for refuge, and to the Dhamma and to the Sangha. From today let Master Gotama remember me as a follower who has gone to him for refuge for life.'

Notes

para. 2. *ko c'āhaṃ bho ko ca samaṇassa Gotamassa paññāveyyattiyāṃ jānissāmi*—Who am I to know the monk Gotama's ability of understanding? : for this idiom *ko ca . . . ko ca* cf. *Sutta 95*, para. 34 and *Sutta 136*, para. 5, etc.

para. 12. *Uccākālārikā* (No explanation by Ven. Nyānamoli, but the Comy. explains: *uccā* as referring to the large size of the footprint and *kālārikā* as referring to the prominence of teeth).

para. 16. *Sambādho ghārāvāso*—house life is crowded: cf. Ud. 59 *Sambādho gharāvāso bahukicco*: perhaps 'restrictive' in the sense of restricting freedom of action and thought would be nearer.

Maha-Assapura Sutta At Assapura-I

Introduction

In this Sutta the Buddha is concerned that his bhikkhus who are thought of as 'monks' by other people and who call themselves 'monks' should actually have not just the outer signs of monks, such as a shaven head and robes, but the qualities and practices of monks too. To appreciate what these should be it is necessary to know first the derivation of the Pāli word translated as 'monk'—*samaṇa*. This word is always derived in Pāli from the root *sam* to make peaceful (we have it in English as *same*, in the sense of even, level). So a monk, *samaṇa*, should always be peaceful in mind, speech and body through the practice of calm and insight meditation. For this to be accomplished, there are various steps of Dhamma-practice:

- to have conscience and shame;
- body, **s**peech, mind conduct to be purified, frank, open;
- livelihood to be purified, frank, open;
- keeping the doors of the faculties guarded;
- knowing the right amount in eating;
- being devoted to wakefulness;
- being possessed of mindfulness and full awareness;
- resorting to a secluded resting place;
- abandoning the five hindrances;
- entering on and abiding in the four jhānas;
- recollecting manifold past life;
- passing away and reappearance of beings;
- exhaustion of taints.

The Buddha says that one like this is truly called a *Samaṇa*. This one is an Arahant, one who is far from (*āraka*) evil unprofitable dhammas. An inspiring Sutta to read often.

The Sutta (39)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living in the Angan country. There is a town of the Angans' called Assapura. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. "'Monks, Monks", bhikkhus, that is how people perceive you. And when you are asked "What are you?", you claim that you are monks. Since that is how you are reputed and how you claim, you should train thus: "We shall try to live up to such dhammas as constitute the Monk and as constitute the Divine, so that our reputations may be true and our claims represent what actually is, and so that the acts of those whose robes, alms-food, resting-place and requisite of medicine as cure for the sick we use will furnish them great fruit and benefit in us, and so that our going forth shall not be in vain but fruitful and fertile."

3. 'What dhammas constitute the Monk and constitute the Divine? You should train thus: "We shall be possessed of conscience and shame."

'Now, bhikkhus, it may be that you (consider) thus: "We are possessed of conscience and shame: with that much it is enough, with that much it is done, the Monk's goal has been reached and there is nothing more for us to do", and that you rest content with that much. Bhikkhus, I tell you, I declare to you: You who seek the Monks' status, do not fall short of the Monks' goal, for there is more to be done.

4. 'What more is to be done? You should train thus: "Our bodily conduct will be purified, frank and open, not inconsistent but restrained, and we shall not laud ourselves and disparage others on account of that purified bodily conduct."

'Now, bhikkhus, it may be that you (consider) thus: "We are possessed of conscience and shame, and we are purified in bodily conduct: with that much it is enough, with that much it is done, the Monks' goal has been reached and there is nothing more for us to do", and that you rest content with that much. Bhikkhus, I tell you, I declare to you: You who seek the Monks' status, do not fall short of the Monks' goal, for there is more to be done.

5. 'What more is to be done? You should train thus: "Our verbal conduct will be purified, frank and open, not inconsistent but restrained and we shall not laud ourselves and disparage others on account of that purified verbal conduct" ... for there is more to be done.

6. 'What more is to be done? You should train thus: "Our mental conduct will be purified, frank and open, not inconsistent but restrained and we shall not laud ourselves and disparage others on account of that purified mental conduct" ... for there is more to be done.

7. 'What more is to be done? You should train thus: "Our livelihood will be purified, frank and open, not inconsistent but restrained and we shall not laud ourselves and disparage others on account of that purified livelihood" ... for there is more to be done.

8. 'What more is to be done? You should train thus: "We shall keep the doors of the faculties guarded. On seeing a form with the eye, we shall apprehend no signs and features through which, if we leave the eye-door unguarded, evil unprofitable dhammas of covetousness and grief might invade us; we shall practise the way of its restraint, we shall guard the eye-faculty, undertake the restraint of the eye-faculty. On hearing a sound with the ear ... On smelling an odour with the nose ... On tasting a flavour with the tongue ... On touching a tangible with the body ... On cognizing a dhamma with the mind, we shall apprehend no signs and features which, if we leave the mind-door unguarded, evil unprofitable dhammas of covetousness and grief might invade us; we shall practise the way of its restraint, we shall guard the mind-faculty, undertake the restraint of the mind-faculty."

'Now, bhikkhus, it may be that you (consider) thus: "We are possessed of conscience and shame, and we are purified in bodily conduct, verbal conduct and mental conduct, and we are guarded in the doors of our faculties: with that much it is enough, with that much it is done, the Monks' goal has been reached and there is nothing more for us to do", and that you rest content with that much. Bhikkhus, I tell you, I declare to you: You who seek the Monks' status, do not fall short of the Monks' goal, for there is more to be done.

9. 'What more is to be done? You should train thus: "We shall know the

right amount in eating. Reflecting wisely, we shall nourish ourselves with nutriment neither for amusement nor for intoxication (of vanity) nor for smartening nor for embellishment, but only for the endurance and continuance of this body, for the ending of discomfort, and for assisting the life divine (considering:) "Thus I shall terminate old feelings without arousing new feelings and blameless shall live in comfort and health."

'Now, bhikkhus, it may be that you (consider) thus: "We are possessed of conscience and shame, we are purified in bodily conduct, verbal conduct, and mental conduct, we are guarded in the doors of our faculties, and we know that right amount in eating: with that much it is enough, with that much it is done, the Monks' goal has been reached and there is nothing more for us to do", and that you rest content with that much. Bhikkhus, I tell you, I declare to you: You who seek the Monks' status, do not fall short of the Monks' goal, for there is more to be done.

10. 'What more is to be done? You should train thus: "We shall be devoted to wakefulness. By day while walking and sitting² we shall purify the mind of obstructive dhammas. In the first watch of the night while walking and sitting we shall purify the mind of obstructive dhammas. In the middle watch of the night we shall lie down on the right side in the lion's sleeping pose with one foot overlapping the other, mindful and fully aware, after noting in our mind the time of rising. After rising, in the third watch while walking and sitting we shall purify the mind of obstructive dhammas."

'Now bhikkhus, it may be that you (consider) thus: "We are possessed of conscience and shame, we are purified in bodily, verbal and mental conduct, we are guarded in the doors of our faculties, we know the right amount in eating, and we are devoted to wakefulness: with that much it is enough, with that much it is done, the Monks' goal has been reached and there is nothing more for us to do", and that you rest content with that much. Bhikkhus, I tell you, I declare to you: You who seek the Monks' status, do not fall short of the Monks' goal, for there is more to be done.

2. Walking and sitting mindfully, with one's meditation object in mind.

11. 'What more is to be done? You should train thus: "We shall be possessed of mindfulness and full awareness. We shall act in full awareness when moving forward and moving backward; we shall act in full awareness when looking towards and looking away; we shall act in full awareness when flexing and extending; we shall act in full awareness when wearing the patched cloak, bowl and robes; we shall act in full awareness when eating, drinking, chewing and tasting; we shall act in full awareness when evacuating the bowels and making water; we shall act in full awareness when walking, standing, sitting, falling asleep, waking up, talking and keeping silent."

'Now, bhikkhus, it may be that you (consider) thus: "We are possessed of conscience and shame, we are purified in bodily, verbal and mental conduct, we are guarded in the doors of our faculties, we know the right amount in eating, we are devoted to wakefulness, and we are possessed of mindfulness and full awareness: with that much it is enough, with that much it is done, the Monks' goal has been reached and there is nothing more for us to do", and that you rest content with that much. Bhikkhus, I tell you, I declare to you: You who seek the Monks' status, do not fall short of the Monks' goal, for there is more to be done.

12. 'What more is to be done? Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu resorts to a secluded resting-place: to the forest, to the root of a tree, a rock, a hill-cleft, a mountain cave, a charnel ground, a woodland solitude, an open space, or a heap of straw.

13. 'On returning from his alms-round after his meal, he sits down; having folded his legs crosswise, sets his body erect, and establishes mindfulness before him. Abandoning covetousness for the world, he abides with his mind free from covetousness. Abandoning ill-will and hatred, he abides with his mind free from ill-will; with pity for all creatures and beings, he purifies his mind of ill-will and hatred. Abandoning lethargy and drowsiness, he abides free from lethargy and drowsiness, percipient of light and mindful and fully aware, he purifies his mind of lethargy and drowsiness. Abandoning agitation and worry, he abides unagitated with a mind calmed in himself, he purifies his mind of agitation and worry. Abandoning uncertainty he abides with uncertainty crossed over, undoubt-

ting about profitable dhammas, he purifies his mind of uncertainty.

14. 'Bhikkhus, suppose a man borrowed a loan and undertook works, and the works succeeded, so that he repaid all the money of the old loan, and there remained over some extra for his wife and children, then, on considering that, he was glad on that account and found joy on that account; or suppose a man was afflicted, suffering and gravely ill, and his food did not sustain him and his body had no strength, but later he recovered from the affliction and his food sustained him and his body regained strength, then, on considering that, he was glad on that account and found joy on that account; or suppose a man were imprisoned in a prison-house, but later he was released from the imprisonment, safe and sound, with no loss to his property, then, on considering that, he was glad on that account and found joy on that account; or suppose a man were a bondsman, not self-dependent but dependent on others and unable to go where he wanted but later on he was released from that bondage, self-dependent, independent of others and a freed man able to go where he wanted, then, on considering that, he was glad on that account and found joy on that account; or suppose a man with property and goods entered on a road across a desert, but later on he crossed over the desert, safe and sound, with no loss to his property, then, on considering that, he was glad on that account and found joy on that account—so too, bhikkhus, when these five hindrances are unabandoned in himself, a bhikkhu sees them respectively as a debt, a disease, a prison-house, a bondage, and a road across a desert, and when these five hindrances are abandoned in himself, he sees that as unindebtedness, healthiness, release from prison, freedom from bondage, and a land of safety.

15. 'Having abandoned these five hindrances, imperfections of mind that weaken understanding, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, he enters upon and abides in the first jhāna which is accompanied by initial and sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of seclusion.

'He makes happiness and pleasure born of seclusion drench, steep, fill and extend throughout his whole body, so that there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of seclusion do not extend. Just as a skilled bath man or bath man's apprentice heaps bath

powder in a metal basin and, sprinkling it gradually with water, kneads it up till the moisture wets his ball of bath powder, soaks it, and extends over it within and without, though it does not itself become liquid, so too, a bhikkhu makes happiness and pleasure born of seclusion drench, steep, fill, and extend throughout this whole body, so that there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of seclusion do not extend.

16. 'Again, with the stilling of initial and sustained application he enters upon and abides in the second jhāna, which has self-confidence and singleness of mind, without initial application and without sustained application, with happiness and pleasure born of concentration.

'He makes happiness and pleasure born of concentration drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of concentration do not extend. Just as though there were a lake whose waters welled up (from below), having no inflow from east, west, north or south, nor yet replenished from time to time by the skies with showers, then the cool fount of water welling up in the lake would make the cool water drench, steep, fill and extend throughout the lake, and there would be nothing of the whole lake to which the cool water did not extend, so too, the bhikkhu makes happiness and pleasure born of concentration drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, so that there is nothing of his whole body to which the happiness and pleasure born of concentration do not extend.

17. 'Again, with the fading as well of happiness he abides in equanimity, and mindful and fully aware, still feeling pleasure with the body, he enters upon and abides in the third jhāna, on account of which the Noble Ones announce: "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful."

'He makes pleasure divested of happiness drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the pleasure divested of happiness does not extend. Just 'as, in a water-lily pond or a white lotus pond or a red lotus pond some water-lilies or white lotuses or red lotuses are born under the water, grow under the water do not stand up out of the water, flourish immersed under the

water, and cool water drenches, fills and extends throughout them, to their tips and to their roots, and there is nothing of the whole of those water-lilies, those white lotuses, those red lotuses, to which the cool water does not extend, so too, the bhikkhu makes pleasure divested of happiness drench, steep, fill and extend throughout this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which pleasure divested of happiness does not extend.

18. 'Again, with the abandoning of pleasure and pain, and with the previous disappearance of joy and grief, he enters upon and abides in the fourth jhāna, which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure, and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.

'He sits with a pure bright mind extending over this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the pure bright mind does not extend. Just as though a man were sitting clothed from head to foot in white cloth, and there were nothing of his whole body to which the white cloth did not extend, so too, the bhikkhu sits with a pure bright mind extending over this body, and there is nothing of his whole body to which the pure bright mind does not extend.

19. 'When the concentrated mind is thus pure and bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, and become malleable, wieldy, steady and attained to imperturbability, he directs, he inclines mind to knowledge of recollection of past life. He recollects his manifold past life ... (as in Sutta 4, para. 27) ... Thus with details and particulars he recollects his manifold past life.

'Just as though a man went from his own village to another village, and then he went from that village to another village and then he went back again to his own village, and he thought: "I went from my own village to that village, and there such was the way I sat, such the way I spoke, such the way I was silent; and from that village I went to that other village, and there such was the way I stood, such the way I sat, such the way I spoke, such the way I was silent; and from that village I came back again to my own village"; so too, a bhikkhu recollects his manifold past life ... Thus with details and particulars he recollects his manifold past life.

20. 'When the concentrated mind is thus pure and bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, and become malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs, he inclines, mind to the knowledge of the passing away and reappearance of beings. With the heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees beings passing away and reappearing ... (as in Sutta 4, para. 28)... He understands how beings pass on according to their kammass.

'Just as though there were two houses with doors and a man with good eyes standing there in between saw men entering the house and coming out and going to and fro; so too, with heavenly eyesight... He understands how beings pass on according to their kammass.

21. 'When the concentrated mind is thus pure and bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, and become malleable, wieldy, steady and attained to imperturbability, he directs, he inclines, mind to the knowledge of the exhaustion of taints. He understands as it actually is, that "This is suffering" ... (as in Sutta 4, para. 31, substituting 'he understands' for 'I had direct knowledge')... There is no more of this to come."

'Just as if there were a lake in a mountain recess, clear, limpid and unturbid, so that a man with good eyes standing up there on the bank, saw shells, gravel and pebbles, and also shoals of fish swimming about and resting, and he might think: "There is this lake, clear, limpid and unturbid, and there are these shells, gravel and pebbles, and also these shoals of fish swimming about and resting"; so too, a bhikkhu understands, as it actually is, that "This is suffering" ... There is no more of this to come."

22. 'Bhikkhus, it is one such as this who is called a "Monk", who is called a "Divine", who is called "Washed", who is called "Attained to Knowledge", who is called "In the Stream", who is called "Noble", who is called "Arahant".

23. 'And how is a bhikkhu a "Monk" (*Samana*)? He has quieted (*samita*) evil unprofitable dhammas that defile, renew being, bring misery, ripen as pain, and give future birth, ageing and death. That is how a bhikkhu is a "Monk".

24. 'And how is a bhikkhu a "Divine" (*Brahmana*)? He has divided himself (*bāhita*) from evil unprofitable dhammas that ... give future birth, ageing and death. That is how a bhikkhu is a "Divine".

25. 'And how is a bhikkhu "Washed"?² He has washed off evil unprofitable dhammas that ... give future birth, ageing and death. That is how a bhikkhu is "Washed".

26. 'And how is a bhikkhu "Attained to Knowledge"?³ He has known evil unprofitable dhammas that ... give future birth, ageing and death. That is how a bhikkhu is "Attained to Knowledge".

27. 'And how is a bhikkhu "In the Stream" (*Sottiya*)? He has let the evil unprofitable dhammas that ... give future birth, ageing and death, stream away (*nissuta*) from him. That is how a bhikkhu is "In the Stream".

28. 'And how is a bhikkhu "Noble" (*Ariya*)? Evil unprofitable dhammas that ... give future birth, ageing and death, are far (*āraka*) from him. That is how a bhikkhu is "Noble".

29. 'And how is a bhikkhu "Arahant"? Evil unprofitable dhammas that defile, renew being, bring misery, ripen as pain, and give future birth, ageing and death, are far (*āraka*) from him. That is how a bhikkhu is "Arahant".'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 14. 'mūla—money': see Sutta 96, para. 5.

'*acchādeti, chadeti*—to sustain (life)': not in this sense in P.T.S. Dict.

'*baddha*—imprisoned': not in this sense in P.T.S. Dict. See Sutta 19, para. 6. (*bandha*).

'*bandhana*—imprisonment': not in this sense in P.T.S. Dict. Cf. Sutta 129, para. 10. (*transfixing*).

2. 'Washed'—a brahminical term for ritual bathing. See end of Sutta 7.

3. A brahminical term signifying to them 'knowledge of the three (or four) Vedas'.

Ganaka Moggallana Sutta Moggallana the Accountant

Introduction

Though this accountant lived in times when mathematics were simpler than our own days, still he had the tidy and thorough approach of good accountants of all times, a fact which shows in his question. He thought that religion too should be approached in a very methodical step by step progression, a view which the Buddha confirms. He shows how progressive training through care with the precepts, guarding of the faculties, knowing the right amount in eating, abiding devoted to wakefulness, possessing mindfulness and full awareness, resorting to a secluded resting place, leads to the four jhānas. This means that the attainment of jhāna—and this is how the Buddha defines Right Meditation—is not possible unless based on all those other steps, a fact which should not be overlooked by those who practise some kind of meditation these days, and hope to succeed with it. There are no short cuts.

Then the accountant, still logical in his questions, asks whether all the Buddha's disciples attain the goal of Nibbāna when they are instructed like this. The Buddha counters with a question about the road to Rajagaha and the accountant has to admit that though he gives good directions yet not everyone would get there. 'What's that to do with me? I'm the one who shows the way.' The Buddha agrees with this. He also is one who shows the way. He points it out and anyone can take the road, or go astray if they are muddle-headed.

Finally the accountant praises the Buddha's systematic teaching 'As jasmine is reckoned best of flower perfumes so Master Gotama's advice

is supreme among the Teachings of today.' The accountant's words still ring true!

The Sutta (28)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in the Eastern Park in the palace of Migāra's Mother. Then the divine Moggallāna the Accountant, went to the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat one side. When he had done so, he said to the Blessed One:

2. 'Master Gotama, in this palace of Migāra's Mother there can be seen progressive training, progressive work and progressive practice, down to the last step of the stair¹, and also in the case of some divines there can be seen progressive training, progressive work and progressive practice, that is to say, in study, and also in the case of other divines there can be seen progressive training . . . that is to say, in archery, and also in the case of accountants like us who get our living by accountancy, there can be seen progressive training . . . that is to say, in reckoning—for when we get an apprentice, we first make him count: one one, two twos, three threes, four fours, five fives, six sixes, seven sevens, eight eights, nine nines, ten tens, and we make him count a hundred too—now is it possible, Master Gotama, in the case of this Dhamma and Discipline, to describe progressive training, progressive work and progressive practice, in the same way?'

3. 'It is possible, divine, in the case of this Dhamma and Discipline to describe progressive training, progressive work and progressive practice.

'Just as a skilled tamer of horses, on getting a fine thoroughbred, gives him first exercise with the setting of the mouth, afterwards further exercise, so too, divine, the Tathāgata on getting a man to be tamed, disciplines him first in this way:

1. 'This is to say, in the building work' might be added here to make the simile more intelligible.

4. "Come bhikkhu, be virtuous, restrained with the Pāṭimokkha² restraint (of the bhikkhus' Rule), perfect in conduct and resort, and, seeing fear in the slightest fault, train by undertaking the training precepts."

'As soon as the bhikkhu is virtuous, restrained with the Pāṭimokkha restraint, perfect in conduct and resort, and, seeing fear in the slightest fault, trains himself by undertaking the training precepts, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

5. "Come bhikkhu, keep the doors of the faculties guarded. On seeing a form with the eye, apprehend no signs or features through which, if you leave the eye-door unguarded, evil unprofitable dhammas of covetousness and grief might invade you; practise the way of its restraint, guard the eye-faculty, undertake the restraint of the eye-faculty. On hearing a sound with the ear . . . On smelling an odour with the nose . . . On tasting a flavour with the tongue . . . On touching a tangible with the body . . . On cognizing a dhamma with the mind, apprehend no signs or features through which, if you leave the mind-door unguarded, evil unprofitable dhammas of covetousness and grief might invade you; practise the way of its restraint, guard the mind-faculty, undertake the restraint of the mind-faculty."

'As soon as the bhikkhu keeps the doors of the faculties guarded, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

6. "Come bhikkhu, be one who knows the right amount in eating. Reflecting wisely you should nourish yourself with nutriment neither for amusement nor for intoxication nor for smartening nor for embellishment, (but) only for the endurance and continuance of this body, for the ending of discomfort, and for assisting the life divine: 'Thus I shall terminate old feelings without arousing new feelings and blameless, I shall live in comfort and health.'"

'As soon as the bhikkhu knows the right amount in eating, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

7. "Come bhikkhu, abide devoted to wakefulness. By day while walking

3. This is the name for the code of 227 rules which are fundamental to the bhikkhu life. They are recited on Full and New Moon days in the presence of all bhikkhus resident in a monastery.

and sitting, purify the mind of obstructive dhammas. In the first watch of the night while walking and sitting, purify the mind of obstructive dhammas. In the middle watch of the night, lie down on the right side in the lion's sleeping pose with one foot overlapping the other, mindful and fully aware, after noting in the mind the time for arising. After rising, in the third watch while walking and sitting, purify the mind of obstructive dhammas."

'As soon as the bhikkhu is devoted to wakefulness, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

8. "Come bhikkhu, be possessed of mindfulness and full awareness. Be one who acts in full awareness when moving forward and moving backward; who acts in full awareness when looking towards and looking away; who acts in full awareness when wearing the patched cloak, bowl and robes; who acts in full awareness when eating, drinking, chewing and tasting; who acts in full awareness when evacuating the bowels and making water; who acts in full awareness when walking, standing, sitting, falling asleep, waking up, talking and keeping silent."

'As soon as the bhikkhu is possessed of mindfulness and full awareness, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further:

9. "Come bhikkhu, resort to a secluded resting place: to a forest, to the root of a tree, to a hill-cleft, to a mountain cave, to a charnel ground, to a woodland solitude, to an open space, to a heap of straw."

'He resorts to a secluded resting place: to a forest. . . On return from his alms-round, after his meal, he sits down, folding his legs crosswise, setting his body erect and establishing mindfulness before him. Abandoning covetousness for the world, he abides with his mind free from covetousness. Abandoning ill-will and hatred, he abides with his mind free from ill-will and compassionate to all living beings; he purifies his mind from ill-will and hatred. Abandoning lethargy-and-drowsiness, he abides free from lethargy-and-drowsiness; percipient of light and mindful and fully aware, he purifies his mind from lethargy-and-drowsiness. Abandoning agitation-and-worry, he abides unagitated with a mind calmed in himself; he purifies his mind of agitation-and-worry. Abandoning un-

certainly, he abides with uncertainty crossed over, undoubting about profitable dhammas; he purifies his mind of uncertainty.

10. 'Having abandoned these five hindrances, imperfections of mind that weaken understanding, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, he enters on and abides in the first jhāna . . . with happiness and (bodily) pleasure born of seclusion. Again, with the stilling of initial and sustained application . . . second jhāna . . . with happiness and pleasure born of concentration. Again with the fading as well of happiness . . . third jhāna . . . "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful". Again, with the abandoning of pleasure and pain . . . fourth jhāna . . . and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.'

11. 'This is my instruction to those bhikkhus who are in the higher training, abiding with minds as yet unattained, aspiring to the supreme surcease of bondage. But these dhammas conduce both to a pleasant abiding here and now and to mindfulness and full awareness for those bhikkhus who are Arahants with taints exhausted, who have lived the life, done what was to be done, laid down the burden, reached the highest goal, destroyed the fetters of being, who are liberated through rightly knowing.'

12. When this was said, the accountant Moggallāna of the divine caste said to the Blessed One: 'But do all Master Gotama's disciples when thus advised and thus instructed by him, attain the supreme goal, Nibbāna, or do some not attain it?'

'When thus advised and instructed, divine, some of my disciples attain the supreme goal, Nibbāna, and some do not.'

13. 'Master Gotama, since there is Nibbāna, and there is the path leading to Nibbāna, and there is Master Gotama as guide, what is the cause, what is the reason why, when Master Gotama's disciples are thus advised and instructed by him, some attain the supreme goal, Nibbāna, and some do not?'

14. 'Now as to that, divine, I will ask you a question in return; answer it as you like. How do you conceive this: you are familiar with the

road that leads to Rājagaha?’

‘Yes, Master Gotama, I am familiar with the road that leads to Rājagaha’

‘How do you conceive this, divine: Suppose a man came who wanted to go to Rājagaha, and he approached you and said: “Venerable sir, I want to go to Rājagaha; show me the road to Rājagaha.” Then you told him: “Now, good man, this road goes to Rājagaha. Follow it for a while and you will see a certain village, follow it for a while and you will see a certain town, follow it for a while and you will see Rājagaha with its parks and groves and lands and lakes.” Then having been thus advised and instructed by you, he took a wrong road and went to the west: and then a second man approached you and said: “Venerable sir, I want to go to Rājagaha, show me the road to Rājagaha.” Then you told him: “Now, good man, this road goes to Rājagaha. Follow it for a while and you will see a certain village, follow it for a while and you will see a certain town, follow it for a while and you will see Rājagaha with its fair parks and groves and lands and lakes.” Then having been thus advised and instructed by you, he got safely to Rājagaha. Now, divine, since there is Rājagaha, and there is the path leading to Rājagaha, and there is yourself as guide, what is the cause, what is the reason why, when they have been thus advised and instructed by you, one man takes a wrong road and goes to the west and one gets safely to Rājagaha?’

‘What have I to do with that, Master Gotama? I am one who shows the way.’

‘So too, divine, there is Nibbāna, and the path leading to Nibbāna, and there is myself as guide, yet when my disciples are thus advised and instructed by me some attain the supreme goal, Nibbāna, and some do not. What have I to do with that, divine? A Tathāgata is one who shows the way.’

15. When this was said, the accountant Moggallāna of the divine caste said to the Blessed One: ‘There are persons who are faithless and go forth from the home life into homelessness not out of faith but seeking a livelihood, who are fraudulent, deceitful, treacherous, haughty,³ hollow and personally vain, rough-tongued, loose-spoken, unguarded in their

3. The translator has in brackets ‘(distracted)’ here.

faculties, ignorant of the right amount in eating, undevoted to wakefulness, unconcerned with monkhood, not greatly respectful of training, busy, careless, forward in erring, neglectful of seclusion, idle, wanting in energy, forgetful, not fully aware, unconcentrated, with minds astray, devoid of understanding and drivelling—Master Gotama does not abide with such as these.

‘But there are clansmen who go forth out of faith from the home life into homelessness, who are not fraudulent or deceitful or treacherous or haughty or personally vain or rough-tongued or loose-spoken, who are guarded in their faculties, aware of the right amount in eating, devoted to wakefulness, concerned with monkhood, greatly respectful of training, not busy, not careless, neglectful of erring, forward in seclusion, energetic, self-endeavouring, established in mindfulness, fully aware, concentrated, with unified minds, endowed with understanding, not drivelling—Master Gotama abides with such as these.

16. ‘Just as black orris root is reckoned the best of root perfumes and red sandal is reckoned the best of wood perfumes and jasmine is reckoned the best of flower perfumes, so too, Master Gotama’s advice is supreme among the Dhammas of today.

17. ‘Magnificent, Master Gotama; magnificent Master Gotama! The Dhamma has been made clear in many ways by Master Gotama, as though he were righting the overthrown, revealing the hidden, showing the way to one who is lost, holding up a lamp in the darkness for those with eyes to see forms. I go to Master Gotama for refuge, and to the Dhamma, and to the Sangha. From today let Master Gotama accept me as a follower who has gone to him for refuge for life.’

Notes

para. 2. Cf. Sutta 85 where it is obvious that *pacchinna* (‘last’) refers to the bottom step.

para. 7. *acchādaya*—overlapping: the word is not in the P.T.S. Dict. See Sutta 39.

para. 14. Cf. the simile in Samyutta XXII, 84.

II

DOING OR TALKING

(b) DIALOGUE AND VIEWS

'Any monks or divines who do not understand as they actually are the origin and the disappearance and the gratification and the danger and the escape in the case of these two kinds of views (of being and non-being) are affected by lust, hate, delusion, craving, clinging, without vision, given over to favouring and opposing, and who delight in diversification, enjoy diversification; they are not liberated from birth, ageing and death, from sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair, they are not liberated from suffering, I say.'

(Sutta 11)

Canki Sutta

Canki

Introduction

Dogmatism and Truth are the subjects of this discourse. The dogmatist, now, as in the Buddha's days, says 'Only this is true, anything else is wrong'. Here the dogmatist is a young brahmin who is affirming the traditional brahminical lore without himself having any basis for 'knowing and seeing' the truth of it for himself. So the dogmatists of all religions and pseudo-religious political creeds are just like blind men—they do not see (with insight—vipassanā) for themselves, they only follow along.

But, the young brahmin says, we don't only believe out of faith but also because of a divinely inspired tradition. The Buddha the gives five factors on which beliefs are based:

faith,
preference,
(oral) tradition,
arguing upon evidence, and
liking to ponder upon views,

which beliefs may be either true or false. That is, these five factors are no guarantee of the truth of the things believed though they do guarantee a rigid and dogmatic attitude.

The young brahmin, who evidently has a very keen mind, is stimulated by this discussion to ask: 'How does one guard the truth?'—that is, not make statements which go beyond what is legitimate. Satisfied with the reply he asks further: 'How does one discover the truth?'—which is answered by the Buddha with reference to a person who sees the conduct of an enlightened bhikkhu and then gains faith in him. The way

of discovering truth is then mapped out step by step from faith to the penetration of ultimate truth with wisdom. 'How is there final arrival at truth?' is the brahmin's last main question and the Buddha shows how one factor is the basis of another. Finally the young brahmin declares his love and reverence for monks, which before he had despised.

The Sutta (95)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was wandering in the country of the Kosalans with a large Sangha of bhikkhus. There is town of the Kosalans called Opasādā. There the Blessed One arrived, and while there he stayed in the Gods' Grove, the Sāla-tree Grove to the north of Opasādā.

2. Now on that occasion Canki of the divine caste was living as ruler at Opasādā, surrounded by livestock, owning grass, wood and water, and owning grain, as the royal representative with royal authority and full powers conferred on him by King Pasenadi of Kosala.

3. The divine-caste householders of Opasādā heard: 'The monk Gotama, it seems . . . (as in Sutta 41, para. 2) . . . Now it is good to see such Arahants.'

4. Then the divine-caste householders of Opasādā came out from Opasādā in groups, gathering in groups, and they went northwards to the Gods' Grove, the Sāla-tree Grove.

5. Now on that occasion Canki of the divine caste had gone to rest at midday in the upper palace. He saw the divine-caste householders of Opasādā coming out from Opasādā in groups, gathering in groups, going northwards to the Gods' Grove, the Sāla-tree Grove. When he saw them, he asked his minister: 'Why are the divine-caste householders of Opasādā coming out from Opasādā in groups, gathering in groups, and going northwards towards the Gods' Grove, the Sāla-tree Grove?'

6. 'Sir, there is the monk Gotama, the son of the Sakyans who went forth from the Sakyans clan, who has been wandering in the country of

the Kosalans . . . (as in Sutta 41, para. 2) . . . They are going to see that Master Gotama.'

'Then go to the divine-caste householders of Opasādā and tell them: "Sirs, Canki of the divine caste says this: 'Be pleased to wait, sirs, Canki of the divine caste is coming to see the monk Gotama too.''"'

'Yes, sir,' he replied, and he went to the divine-caste householders of Opasādā and gave them the message.

7. Now on that occasion there were five hundred divine caste foreigners from various states staying at Opasādā for some business or other. They heard: 'Canki of the divine caste, it seems, is going to see the monk Gotama.' Then they went to Canki of the divine caste and they asked him: 'Sir, is it true, as it seems, that you are going to see the monk Gotama?'

'So it occurred to me, sirs: "I shall go to see the monk Gotama."'

8. 'Sir, do not go to see the monk Gotama. It is not proper that you should go to see the monk Gotama; it is proper that the monk Gotama should come to see you.

'For you, sir, are well-born on both sides, of pure descent seven generations back, your pedigree is unassailable and impeccable. And since that is so, it is not proper that you go to see the monk Gotama. It is proper that the monk Gotama should come to see you.

'You, sir, are rich, with great wealth and great property. And since that is so . . .

'You, sir, as an expert in the Three Vedas, know the text and the context of the Histories, the fifth (of the divines' authorities), with their invocations, liturgy, and word-analysis, you are fully versed in Natural Science and that of the Marks of the Great Man. And since that is so . . .

'You, sir, are handsome, fair to see, confidence-inspiring, and possessed of outstanding beauty, with divine appearance and divine presence, remarkable to behold. And since that is so . . .

'You, sir, are virtuous, most virtuous, possessed of great virtue. And since that is so . . .

'You, sir, have good speech, a good delivery, you are possessed of civil speech that is distinct, with no faults, which makes the meaning clear. And since that is so . . .

'You, sir, teach the teachers of many, and you have three hundred student divines to recite the hymns. And since that is so . . .

'You, sir, are honoured, respected, revered, venerable and esteemed by Pokkharasāti of the divine caste. And since that is so . . .

'You, sir, live as a ruler at Opasādā, surrounded by livestock, owning grass, wood and water, and owning grain, as the royal representative with royal authority and full powers conferred on you by King Pasenadi of Kosala. And since that is so, on that account it is not proper that you should go to see the monk Gotama; it is proper that the monk Gotama should come to see you.'

9. When this was said, Canki of the divine caste told them: 'Now, sirs, hear from me why it is proper for me to see Master Gotama, and why it is not proper for Master Gotama to come to see me.

'Sirs, the monk Gotama is well-born on both sides, of pure descent seven generations back, his pedigree is unassailable and impeccable. And since that is so, on that account it is not proper for Master Gotama to come to see me; it is proper for me to go to see Master Gotama.

'Sirs, the monk Gotama went forth abandoning much gold and bullion stored in cellars and laid up in attics. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama went forth from the home life into homelessness while still young, a black-haired boy endowed with the blessing of youth, in the first phase of life. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama went forth from the home life to homelessness and though his mother and father wished otherwise and grieved with tearful faces, he shaved off his hair and beard and put on the yellow cloth. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama is handsome, fair to see, confidence-inspiring, and possessed of outstanding beauty, with divine appearance and divine presence, remarkable to behold. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama is virtuous, with Noble One's virtue, with profitable virtue, possessing profitable virtue. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama has good delivery, he is possessed of civil speech that is distinct, with no faults, which makes the meaning clear. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama teaches the teachers of many. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama has exhausted greed for sensual desires, he is without personal vanity. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama holds the theory that there is kamma, the theory that kamma is valid,¹ he does not value what is bad for the race of divines. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama went forth from a great family, from one of the original warrior-caste families. And since that is so . . .

'Sirs, the monk Gotama went forth from a rich family, of great wealth and great property. And since that is so . . .

'People, sirs, come from beyond the kingdom, from beyond the country, to question the monk Gotama. And since that is so . . .

'Many thousand gods, sirs, have gone for refuge for life to the monk Gotama. And since that is so . . .

'And, sirs, a good report of Master Gotama has been spread to this effect: "This Blessed One is such since he is Arahant, Fully Enlightened, perfect in true knowledge and conduct, sublime, knower of worlds, incomparable leader of men to be tamed, teacher of gods and men, enlightened, blessed." And since that is so . . .

'The Monk Gotama, sirs, is possessed of the thirty-two Marks of the Great Man. And since that is so . . .

'King Seniya Bimbisāra of Magadha and his wife and children, sirs, have gone for refuge for life to the monk Gotama. And since that is so . . .

'King Pasenadi of Kosala and his wife and children, sirs, have gone for refuge for life to the monk Gotama. And since that is so . . .

'Pokkharasāti of the divine caste and his wife and children, sirs, have gone for refuge for life to the monk Gotama. And since that is so . . .

'The monk Gotama has arrived at Opasādā, sirs, and he is living at Opasādā in the Gods' Grove, the Sāla-tree Grove to the north of Opasādā. Now any monks or divines that come to our town are our guests, and guests should be honoured, respected, revered and venerated by us. And since that is so, on that account it is not proper for Master Gotama to come to see me; it is proper for me to go to see Master Gotama.

1. That intentional actions do have results. "What is bad for the race of divines" (brahmins) was to hold annihilationist and acausal views as some other teachers did.

'Sirs, that much in praise of Master Gotama I know, but the praise of Master Gotama is not just that much—for the praise of Master Gotama is immeasurable. And Master Gotama being possessed of each one of these factors, it is not proper for him to come to see me; it is proper for me to go to see Master Gotama. Therefore, sirs, let all of us go to see the monk Gotama.'

10. Then Canki of the divine caste, together with a large number of divines, went to the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him. When the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side.

11. Now on that occasion the Blessed One was seated concluding a certain amiable talk with some very senior divines. But there was a young student divine called Kāpaṭhika, shaven-headed and sixteen years old. An expert in the Three Vedas, he knew the text and context of the Histories, the fifth (of the divines' authorities), with their invocations, liturgy and word-analysis, and he was fully versed in Natural Science and that of the Marks of the Great Man. He was sitting in the midst of that assembly. While the very senior divines were conversing with the Blessed One, he interrupted their talk from time to time. Then the Blessed One rebuked the student divine Kāpaṭhika thus: 'Let the venerable one not interrupt from time to time the very senior divines' talk when they are conversing. Let the venerable Bhāradvāja² wait till the talk is concluded.'

When this was said, Canki of the divine caste spoke to the Blessed One: 'Let Master Gotama not rebuke the student divine Kāpaṭhika. He is a clansman, very learned, with a good delivery, and wise; he is capable of taking part in this discussion with Master Gotama.'

12. Then the Blessed One thought: 'Surely the student divine Kāpaṭhika will have completed the Word of the Three Vedas, and that is why the divines honour him thus.'

Then the student divine Kāpaṭhika thought: 'When the monk Gotama meets my eye with his, I shall ask him a question.'

Then, knowing with mind the thought in the student divine Kāpa-

2. Kāpaṭhika's clan name.

ṭhika's mind, the Blessed One turned his eyes to where he was. Then the student divine Kāpaṭhika thought: 'The monk Gotama has turned to me. Suppose I ask him a question?' Then he said to the Blessed One: 'Master Gotama, there is the divines' ancient hymnal in the legendary lore and in what has come down in the scriptures about which divines make the conclusion without reserve: "Only this is true; anything else is wrong".³ What does Master Gotama say about that?'

13. 'How then, Bhāradvāja, do the divines have any single divine who says: "I know this, I see this: Only this is true; anything else is wrong"?''

'No, Master Gotama.'⁴

'How then, Bhāradvāja, do the divines have any single teacher or teacher's teacher back to the seventh generation of teachers, who says thus: "I know this, I see this: Only this is true; anything else is wrong"?''

'No, Master Gotama.'

'How then, Bhāradvāja, did the divines' former sages, makers of the hymns,⁵ tellers of the hymns, whose ancient hymnal has been chanted, told and compiled, which divines now keep chanting and pronouncing, the pronouncements that they keep pronouncing and the recitations that they keep reciting—that is to say, Aṭṭhaka, Vāmaka, Vāmadeva, Vessāmitta, Yamataggi, Angirasa, Bhāradvāja, Vāsetṭha, Kassapa, and Bhagu—did these say thus: "We know this, we see this: Only this is true; anything else is wrong"?''

'No, Master Gotama.'

'So, Bhāradvāja, it seems that the divines do not have any single divine who says thus: "I know this, I see this: Only this is true; anything else is wrong". And the divines do not have any single teacher or teacher's teacher back to the seventh generation of teachers who say thus: "I know this, I see this: Only this is true; anything else is wrong". And the divines' former sages, makers of the hymns, tellers of the hymns, whose ancient hymnal has been chanted, told and compiled,

3. The young brahmin is contesting the Buddha's authority in matters of Dhamma by affirming the correctness of the brahminical religious tradition enshrined in the Vedas.

4. Kāpaṭhika has to admit that such a claim is dogmatic and not based on 'knowing and seeing', which means insight-wisdom (*vipassanā-paññā*)

5. The hymns (*manta*) means the Vedic hymns in the Rg Veda, etc.

which divines now keep chanting and pronouncing, the pronouncements that they keep pronouncing and the recitations that they keep reciting—that is to say, Aṭṭhaka, Vāmaka, Vāmadeva, Vessāmitta, Yamataggi, Angirasa, Bhāradvāja, Vāseṭṭha, Kassapa, and Bhagu—these too did not say thus: “We know this, we see this: Only this is true; anything else is wrong”. Suppose there were a file of blind men each in touch with the next; the first one does not see, the middle one does not see, and the last one does not see. So it is too, surely, with the divines’ declarations: the first one does not see, the middle one does not see, and the last one does not see. How do you conceive this, Bhāradvāja, that being so, does it not appear that the divines’ faith has no roots?’

14. ‘Divines honour this not only out of faith, Master Gotama. They honour it as (oral) tradition,⁶ too.’

‘Bhāradvāja, first you took your stand on faith. Now you say it is (oral) tradition. There are five dhammas that have two kinds of sequel here and now. What five? They are: faith, preference, (oral) tradition, arguing upon evidence and liking to ponder upon views. These five dhammas have two kinds of sequel here and now.⁷ Now some (belief) may well have faith placed in it, and yet it may be hollow, empty and false; and again some (belief) may have no faith placed in it, and yet it may be factual, true and no other than it seems. Some (belief) may well be preferred, and yet it may be hollow, empty and false; and again, some (belief) may not be preferred, and yet it may be factual, true and no other than it seems. Some (belief) may well be (oral) tradition, and yet it may be hollow, empty and false; and again, some (belief) may not be (oral) tradition, and yet it may be factual, true and no other than it seems. Some (belief) may be well argued, and yet it may be hollow, empty and false; and again, some (belief) may not be well argued, and yet it may be factual, true and no other than it seems. Some (belief) may be well pondered, and yet it may be hollow, empty and false; and again, some (belief) may not be well pondered and yet it may be factual, true and no other than it seems. (In such circumstances)

6. An (orally-transmitted) tradition of hymns which brahmins believed divinely inspired.

7. Each of the five dhammas is now taken to show how there are two kinds of sequel.

ces) it is not yet proper for a wise man who preserves truth to make the conclusion without reserve: "Only this is true; anything else is wrong".'

15. 'But, Master Gotama, in what way does a man guard truth? How is there preserving of truth? We ask Master Gotama about guarding of truth.'

'If a man has faith, Bhāradvāja, then (in such circumstances as these) he preserves truth when he says: "My faith is thus"; but then too he still does not, on that account (alone), make the conclusion without reserve: "Only this is true; anything else is wrong". He preserves truth in this way too; this is how there is preserving of truth; we describe preserving of truth in this way, but there is as yet no discovery of truth.

'If a man has a preference, then (in such circumstances as these) he preserves truth when he says: "My preference is thus"; but then too he still does not, on that account (alone), make the conclusion without reserve: "Only this is true; anything else is wrong"; he preserves truth in this way . . . but there is as yet no discovery of truth.

'If a man has an (oral) tradition, then (in such circumstances as these) he preserves truth when he says: "My (oral) tradition is thus"; but then too he still does not, on that account (alone), make the conclusion without reserve: "Only this is true; anything else is wrong"; he preserves truth in this way . . . but there is as yet no discovery of truth.

'If a man argues upon evidence, then (in such circumstances as these) he preserves truth when he says: "My evidence is thus"; but then too he still does not, on that account (alone), make the conclusion without reserve: "Only this is true; anything else is wrong"; he preserves truth in this way . . . but there is as yet no discovery of truth.

'If a man likes to ponder a view, then (in such circumstances as these) he preserves truth when he says: "My liking to ponder a view is thus"; but then too he still does not, on that account (alone), make the conclusion without reserve: "Only this is true; anything else is wrong"; he preserves truth in this way too, this is how there is preserving of truth; we describe preserving of truth in this way, but there is as yet no discovery of truth.'

16. 'In that way a man preserves truth, Master Gotama, in that way there is preserving of truth; we see that he preserves truth in that way. But in what way is there discovery of truth? In what way is truth discovered? We ask Master Gotama about discovery of truth.'

17. 'Here, Bhāradvāja, a bhikkhu lives near some village or town. Then a householder or householder's son goes to him to test him in three kinds of dhammas: in dhammas provocative of greed, in dhammas provocative of hate, and in dhammas provocative of delusion: "Are there in this venerable one any dhammas provocative of greed such that, with his mind obsessed by them, he might, unknowing, say 'I know', unseeing, say 'I see', or get others to do likewise, which would be long for their harm and suffering?" While testing him he comes to know that there are no such dhammas in that venerable one. (He comes to know:) "The bodily behaviour and the verbal behaviour of that venerable one are not those of one affected by greed. But the Dhamma that this venerable one teaches is profound, hard to see and hard to discover; it is (the most) peaceful and superior (of all), not attainable by (mere) ratiocination, subtle, for the wise to experience. This Dhamma cannot be taught by one who is affected by greed.'

18. 'As soon as, in testing him, he comes to see that he is purified from dhammas provocative of greed, he next tests him in dhammas provocative of hate: "Are there in this venerable one any dhammas provocative of hate such that, with his mind obsessed by them, he might, unknowing, say 'I know', unseeing, say 'I see', or get others to do likewise, which would be long for their harm and suffering?" While he is testing him, he comes to know that there are no such dhammas in that venerable one. (He comes to know): "The bodily behaviour and the verbal behaviour of this venerable one are not those of one affected by hate. But the Dhamma that this venerable one teaches is profound, hard to see and hard to discover. It is (the most) peaceful and superior (of all), not attainable by (mere) ratiocination, subtle, for the wise to experience. This Dhamma cannot be taught by one who is affected by hate.'

19. 'As soon as, in testing him, he comes to see that he is purified from

dhammas provocative of hate, he next tests him in dhammas provocative of delusion: "Are there in this venerable one any dhammas provocative of delusion such that, with his mind obsessed by them, he might, unknowing, say 'I know', unseeing, say 'I see', or get others to do likewise, which would be long for their harm and suffering?" While he is testing him he comes to know that there are no such dhammas in that venerable one. (He comes to know): "The bodily behaviour and verbal behaviour of this venerable one are not those of one affected by delusion. But the Dhamma that this venerable one teaches is profound, hard to see, and hard to discover; it is (the most) peaceful and superior (of all), not attainable by (mere) ratiocination, for the wise to experience. This Dhamma cannot be taught by one who is affected by delusion."

20. 'As soon as, in testing him, he comes to see that he is purified from dhammas provocative of delusion, then he plants his faith in him: when he visits him he respects him, when he respects him, he gives ear; one who gives ear, hears the Dhamma with an attentive ear. Having heard the Dhamma, he memorises it; he investigates the meaning of dhammas memorized. When he investigates the meaning of dhammas memorized, he likes to ponder those dhammas. When he likes to ponder upon dhammas, zeal springs up. One in whom zeal has sprung up is actively involved; through being actively involved he evaluates (his own efforts). When he evaluates (his own efforts), he controls himself. When he is self-controlled, he realizes with the body the ultimate truth and he sees it by penetration of it with understanding.

'This is how there is discovery of truth; this is how truth is discovered. We describe discovery of truth in this way. But there is no final arrival at truth yet.'

21. 'In that way there is discovery of truth, Master Gotama; in that way truth is discovered. We see that there is discovery of truth in that way. But in what way in there final arrival at truth? We ask Master Gotama about final arrival at truth.'

'Final arrival at truth, Bhāradvāja, is the repetition, development and cultivation of those same dhammas. In this way there is final arrival at truth. In this way truth is finally arrived at. We describe final arrival at truth in this way.'

22. 'In that way there is a final arrival at truth; in that way truth is finally arrived at. We see that there is a final arrival at truth in that way. But what dhamma is most helpful for finally arriving at truth? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for finally arriving at truth.'

'Control is most helpful for final arrival at truth, Bhāradvāja. If a man made no (effort at) control, he would not finally arrive at truth. It is because he makes an (effort at) control that he finally arrives at truth. That is why control is most helpful for final arrival at truth.'

23. 'But what dhamma is most helpful for control? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for control.'

'Evaluation (of one's efforts) is most helpful for control, Bhāradvāja. If a man does not evaluate (his efforts), he would not make an (effort at) control. It is because he evaluates (his efforts) that he makes an (effort at) control. That is why evaluation is most helpful for control.'

24. 'But what dhamma is most helpful for evaluation? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for evaluation.'

'Active involvement is most helpful for evaluation, Bhāradvāja. If a man were not actively involved, he would not evaluate (his own efforts). It is because he is actively involved that he evaluates (his own efforts). That is why active involvement is most helpful for evaluation.'

25. 'But what dhamma is most helpful for active involvement? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for active involvement.'

'Zeal is most helpful for active involvement, Bhāradvāja. If a man did not arouse zeal, he would not become actively involved. It is because he arouses zeal that he becomes actively involved. That is why zeal is most helpful for active involvement.'

26. 'But what dhamma is most helpful for zeal? We ask Master Gotama what dhamma is most helpful for zeal.'

'A liking to ponder dhammas is most helpful for zeal, Bhāradvāja. If a man had no liking to ponder dhammas, he would not arouse zeal. It is because he has a liking to ponder dhammas that he arouses zeal. That is why a liking to ponder dhammas is most helpful for zeal.'

27. 'But what dhamma is most helpful to a liking to ponder dhammas? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for a liking to ponder dhammas.'

'Investigation of meaning is most helpful for a liking to ponder dhamma, Bhāradvāja. If a man did not investigate meaning, he would not like to ponder dhammas. It is because he does investigate meaning that he likes to ponder dhammas. That is why investigation of meaning is most helpful for a liking to ponder dhammas.'

28. 'But what dhamma is most helpful for investigation of meaning? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for investigation of meaning.'

'Memorizing dhammas is most helpful for investigation of meaning Bhāradvāja. If a man did not memorize dhammas,⁸ he would not investigate the meaning. It is because he memorizes dhammas that he investigates the meaning. That is why memorizing dhammas is most helpful for investigation of meaning.'

29. 'But what dhamma is most helpful for memorizing dhammas? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for memorizing dhammas.'

'Hearing Dhamma is most helpful for memorizing dhammas, Bhāradvāja. If a man did not hear Dhamma, he would not memorize dhammas. It is because he hears Dhamma that he memorizes dhammas. That is why hearing Dhamma is most helpful to memorizing dhammas.'

30. 'But what dhamma is most helpful to hearing Dhamma? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for hearing Dhamma.'

'Giving ear is most helpful for hearing Dhamma, Bhāradvāja. If a man did not give ear, he would not hear Dhamma. It is because he gives ear that he hears Dhamma. That is why giving ear is most helpful for hearing Dhamma.'

31. 'But what dhamma is most helpful to giving ear? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for giving ear.'

'Respect is most helpful for giving ear, Bhāradvāja. If a man did not

8. Lit. 'a dhamma', or just 'Dhamma'.

respect, he would not give ear. It is because he respects that he gives ear. That is why respect is most helpful for giving ear.'

32. 'But what dhamma is most helpful for respect? We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for respect.'

'Visiting is most helpful for respect, Bhāradvāja. If a man did not visit (a teacher), he would not respect (him). It is because he visits that he respects. That is why visiting is most helpful for respect.'

33. 'But what dhamma is most helpful for visiting?, We ask Master Gotama about the dhamma most helpful for visiting.'

'Faith is most helpful for visiting. If a man did not arouse faith, he would not visit. It is because he arouses faith that he visits. That is why faith is most helpful for visiting.'

34. 'We asked Master Gotama about protection of the truth. Master Gotama answered about protection of the truth and that was to our preference and liking, and so we are satisfied. We asked Master Gotama about discovery of truth... about final arrival at truth... about the dhamma most helpful for final arrival at truth... Master Gotama answered about the dhamma most helpful for final arrival at truth and that was to our preference and liking, and so we are satisfied. And whatever we asked Master Gotama, that he answered to our preference and liking, and so we are satisfied. Formerly our opinion was this: "Who are these monkish shavelings, these swarthy menial offspring of the Kinsman's feet,⁹ that they should be knowers of Dhamma?" But indeed Master Gotama has inspired love and reverence for monks in me.'

35. 'Magnificent, Master Gotama, magnificent!... (as in Sutta 4, para. 36)... visible forms.'

36. 'I go to Master Gotama for refuge and to the Dhamma and to the Sangha. From today let Master Gotama accept me as a follower who has gone to him for refuge for life.'

9. Brahmins reckoned themselves to be the offspring of Brahma's (the Kinsman's) head. Low caste workers were thought to be the product of his feet.

Notes

para. 2. *satussada*—surrounded with life: literally, according to Comy, should be ‘beset by beings’. In M. 91. the expression, according to the Comy, means ‘(a brahmin) who has the seven prominences’.

para. 8. *na arahati bhavaṃ Caṅkī samanāṃ Gotamaṃ dassanāyā uṣasāṃ-kamitum*—it is not proper that you go to see the monk Gotama: a peculiar idiomatic use of *arahati* not registered in P.T.S. Dict.

vuddhasīlīm—greatly virtuous: this meaning ‘of *vuddha* (= *vaddha* or increased: Comy) is not in P.T.S. Dict.

para. 9. *viyata-cāpallā*—is without personal vanity: P.T.S. Dict. gives only ‘fickleness’ which is wrong according to Comy. See also Vbh. 351, and Comy.

pāṇehi saraṇaṃ gato—gone for refuge for life. Cf. *pāṇuṇṇetaṃ saraṇagataṃ* (Sutta 4, para. 37), the more usual form of the idiom.

para. 12. *itihītiha-paramparāya piṭaka-sampadāya*—in the legendary lore and what has come down in the scriptures. *Sampadā* should be taken as derived from *sampadati*: A.i, 189 reads *piṭaka-sampadānena* and the Commentarial gloss *sampatti* should be taken as derived from *sampāpuṇṇāti*.

para. 14. *diṭṭhi-nijjhāna-khanti*—liking to ponder upon views: this expression together with its parallel, *dhamma-nijjhāna-khanti*—‘a liking to ponder upon Dhamma (or dhammas)’ appears quite plainly from the contexts in this Sutta as to meaning. P.T.S. Dict is not only wrong but contradicts itself under the headings of *diṭṭhi*, *khanti* and *nijjhāna*. Other refs. are:

diṭṭhiuññhānakhanti: A.i, 189; S. iv, 139; M.ii, 218.

dhammanijjhānakhanti: Vbh. 325; M.i, 133; 480.

Mūla Tikā commenting on Atthasālinī 74 says:

‘Kenaci vutte kismiñci sute avicāretvā saddhaṃ *saddhā*. sayam eva taṃ vicāretvā rocanaṃ *ruci*. evaṃ vā evaṃ vā bhavissati’ ti ākāravicaṇaṃ *ākāraṇavitakko*. vicārentassa katthaci diṭṭhiyā nijjhānakkhamaṇaṃ *diṭṭhinijjhānakhanti*’ (DhsAA. 69).

Cf. also *atinijjhāyitatta* at Sutta 128, para. 27 and *nijjhatti* M.i, 320

(M. 48, para. 2) and *nijjhāpentī* at same place. And *mattaso nijjhānam khamatī* at S. iii, 225—has a liking to ponder by (test of) measurement with understanding upon . . . ? ?

para. 20. *tamhi saddham niveseti*—he plants his faith in him: this idiom is interesting in its connection with *abhinivāsati* (to insist on or to [mis-] interpret and the Commentarial use of *abhinivāsa* as ‘interpretation’ or ‘right belief’ that precedes knowledge (see Vis. Ch. XXI para. 83—p. 661).

para. 34. for idiom ‘*keca . . . keca,*’ see Sutta 27, para. 2.

Tevijjavacchagotta Sutta

Vacchagotta and the Three True Know- ledges

Introduction

It is, and has always been fashionable for leaders new religious movements to take upon themselves, or let their devotees give them, titles and epithets of mysterious significance which, though impressive in sound, do not stand up to close examination. Here in this Sutta, Vacchagotta has heard that the Buddha claims the titles given to Mahāvira the Jain leader. Notice how Vacchagotta has not come to any conclusion about this but tentatively questions the Buddha. He, in replying, says that he does not claim to be an 'Omniscient all-seer...' His claim is to the possession of the Three True Knowledges which he then explains. These knowledges, as explained in many Suttas, are reached through the causal practice of Dhamma and though they may not be known to us as we have not yet developed ourselves in this way, still there is nothing mysterious about them. Vacchagotta asks further questions: Are there laypeople who attain Arahantship? Are there laypeople who pass on to heaven? Have any Ājīvaka ascetics attained Arahantship? And have any of them gone to heaven? The answer to the first is 'No' since lay-life necessarily involves craving and clinging (though laypeople may become Non-returners). But many laypeople attain various heavenly realms as a result of having practised generosity, moral conduct and meditation. Ājīvaka ascetics do not become Arahants because they hold

views of non-causation and so cannot develop liberating understanding (paññā). Even they do not get to the heavens since their views generally incline them towards evil. However, those of other religions where generosity and moral conduct (and perhaps some meditation) are taught, will, of course, reap the fruits of their good kammās in a heavenly re-birth.

The Sutta (71)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Vesāli in the Hall with the peaked roof in the Great Wood.

2. Now on that occasion the Wanderer Vacchagotta was staying in the Wanderer's Park with the single White-lotus Mango tree.

3. When it was morning, the Blessed One dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Vesāli for alms. Then he thought: 'It is still too early to wander for alms in Vesāli. Suppose I went to the Wanderer Vacchagotta in the Wanderer's Park with the single White-lotus Mango tree?'

4. Then the Blessed One went to the Wanderer Vacchagotta in the Wanderer's Park with the single White-lotus Mango tree. The Wanderer Vacchagotta saw the Blessed One coming. Seeing him, he said to him: 'Let the Blessed One come, venerable sir; welcome to the Blessed One, venerable sir; it is long, venerable sir, since the Blessed One made an occasion to come here. Let the Blessed One be seated, venerable sir; this seat is ready.'

The Blessed One sat down on the seat made ready, and Vacchagotta the Wanderer took another, lower, seat and sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said:

5. 'Venerable sir, I have heard thus: The monk Gotama is an Omniscient all-seer who claims to have complete knowledge and vision thus: "Whether I am walking or standing or sleeping or waking, my know-

ledge and vision are continuously, unceasingly, maintained.” Venerable sir, when they say that, do they say what the Blessed One says without misrepresenting the Blessed One with what is not so, do they express dhammas in accordance with the Dhamma, with no legitimate deduction from their assertions that provides in the Dhamma grounds for condemning them?’

‘Vaccha, those who say thus: “The monk Gotama is an Omniscient all-seer who claims to have complete knowledge and vision thus: ‘Whether I am walking or standing or sleeping or waking, my knowledge and vision are continuously, unceasingly maintained’”, do not say what I say, and they misrepresent me with what is not so.’

6. ‘Venerable sir, how should I answer that I may say what the Blessed One says without misrepresenting the Blessed One with what is not so, and that I may express dhammas in accordance with the Dhamma, with no legitimate deduction from my assertions that might provide grounds for condemning me?’

‘Vaccha, if you answer thus: “The monk Gotama has the Three True Knowledges”¹, you will be saying what I say without misrepresenting me with what is not so, and you will express a dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma with no legitimate deduction from your assertion that might provide grounds for condemning you.

7. ‘For in so far as I wish, I recollect my manifold past life...with its details and particulars I recollect my manifold past life.

8. ‘And in so far as I wish, with the heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, I see beings passing away and reappearing... I understand how beings pass on according to their kammās.

9. ‘And by realization myself with direct knowledge I here and now enter upon and abide in the deliverance of the heart and the deliverance by understanding that are taint-free with the exhaustion of taints.

1. It should be remembered that by tevijjā (Three True Knowledges) brahmins (and others) would understand the Three Vedas thoroughly learned by heart together with their ritual.

10. 'If you answer thus: "The monk Gotama has the Three True Knowledges", you will be saying what I say without misrepresenting me with what is not so, and you will express a dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma with no legitimate deduction from your assertion that might provide grounds for condemning you.'

11. When this was said, the Wanderer Vacchagotta asked: "Master Gotama, is there any householder who, without abandoning the fetters of householdership, makes an end of suffering on the dissolution of the body, after death?"

'There is no householder who, without abandoning the fetters of householdership, makes an end of suffering on the dissolution of the body, after death.'

12. 'Master Gotama, has any householder, without abandoning the fetter of householdership, passed on to heaven on the dissolution of the body, after death?'

'There are not only one hundred or two or three or four or five hundred but far more householders who, without abandoning the fetter of householdership, pass on to heaven on the dissolution of the body, after death.'

13. 'Master Gotama, is there any Ājivaka ascetic² who on the dissolution of the body, after death, has made an end of suffering?'

'There is no Ājivaka ascetic who on the dissolution of the body, after death, has made an end of suffering.'

14. 'Master Gotama, is there any Ājivaka ascetic who on the dissolution of the body, after death, has passed on to heaven?'

'In ninety-one aeons back, as I recollect, I have no knowledge of any Ājivaka ascetic who, on the dissolution of the body, after death, passed on to heaven, except one, and he supported the theory that there is action and that there is doing.'

15. 'That being so, Master Gotama, this other sectarians' basis is empty,

2. See para. 21 of Sutta 60 for the view of the Ājivakas and the footnote to the same para. for a comment on their leader.

even of (a chance of) a passing on to heaven!’

‘That being so, Vaccha, this other sectarians’ basis is empty even of (a chance of) a passing no to heaven.’

That is what the Blessed One said. The Wanderer Vacchagotta was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One’s words.

Notes

para. 13. Ājivaka—Ājivaka ascetic: mentioned in Sutta 5, para. 31, on which Comy., remarks ‘a naked monk’ (MA. i, 151). Para. 14. indicates that they were not orthodox brahmins (divines) because they did not believe in kamma as the wanderers (paribbājaka) did. It can be taken they were followers of Makkhali Goṣāla and others. See Sutta 76, para. 61.

para. 14. *Kammavāda*—theory of action. *Kiriyavāda*—theory of doing: see Sutta 60, para. 13-16.

Culasihanada Sutta

The Lion's Roar-I

Introduction

The Sutta opens with a Lion's Roar—one of those bold, fearless and truthful statements that the Buddha made from time to time. He recommends that the bhikkhus should proclaim that only in the Buddhasāsana are found the four Noble types of attainment. Someone may say: 'That's narrow! You don't allow that others can gain Enlightenment!' But it should not be thought of in this way for the Enlightenment of the Buddha, the Arahants and the other stages of Noble attainment are arrived at by causal practice. Now among the hundreds or thousands of religious paths in this world most teach moral conduct in some form, some in addition teach meditation—the calming, concentrating and purifying of the mind-heart. But where, outside of the original teachings of the Buddha, is the wisdom of penetrating impermanence, dukkha and not self taught? Moral conduct purifies actions of body and speech. Meditation purifies the mind. But there still remains to be purified views (theories, speculations, deductions, doctrines, dogmas)—and they can be purified only by paññā—wisdom or the deep understanding which is the result of intensive and usually long practice of insight-meditation (vipassanā). Where this is lacking in a teaching, there can be no Enlightenment. The Buddha points out in this discourse that though a teacher should claim to teach a complete knowledge of some aspect of Dhamma, yet he will be found deficient in his teaching when closely examined. This is the wonder of the Dhamma, that it can be closely examined and found to be without flaw. The Buddha has incited us to examine this Dhamma, to practise it and so verify it.

The Sutta (11)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvattthi in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapindika's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable Sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, only here is there a monk, only here a second monk, only here a third monk, only here a fourth monk. The doctrines of others are devoid of monks¹: that is how you should rightly roar your lion's roar.

3. 'It is possible that wanderers of other sects here might ask: "But what is the venerable ones' (source of) comfort and strength that you venerable ones say thus?" Wanderers of other sects who ask thus may be answered in this way: "Friends, four dhammas have been declared to us by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, on seeing which in ourselves we say thus: 'Only here is there a monk, only here a second monk, only here a third monk, only here a fourth monk. The doctrines of others are devoid of monks.' What are the four? We have confidence in the Master, we have confidence in the Dhamma, we have perfected the virtues, and those who share the Dhamma are dear to us whether they are laymen or gone forth and they are loved by us. These are the four dhammas declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, an Arahant and Fully Enlightened, on seeing which in ourselves we say as we do."

4. 'It is possible that wanderers of other sects might say thus: "Friends, we too have confidence in the Master, that is, our Master; we too have confidence in the Dhamma, that is, our Dhamma; we too have perfected

1. The "monk" is the Stream-winner, the "second monk" the Once-returned, the "third monk" the Non-returned, and the "fourth monk" the Arahant. "Here" means the Buddha's Teachings. "The doctrines of others are devoid of monks" (samana=one who is peaceful) means that these four stages of attainment of penetration into the Dhamma are found only where wisdom (paññā) is cultivated—only in the Buddha's teachings.

the virtues, that is, our virtues; and those who share Dhamma are dear to us too whether they are laymen or gone forth and they are loved by us. What is the distinction here, friends, what is the variance, what is the difference, between you and us?" Wanderers of other sects who ask thus may be answered in this way: "How then, friends, is the goal? One or many?" Answering rightly, the wanderers of other sects would answer thus: "Friends, the goal is one, not many."—"But, friends, is that goal for one affected by lust or free from lust?" Answering rightly, the wanderers from other sects would answer thus: "Friends, the goal is for one free from lust, not affected by lust."—"But, friends is that goal for one affected by hate or free from hate?" Answering rightly, they would answer: "Friends, the goal is for one free from hate, not affected by hate."—"But, friends, is that goal for one affected by delusion or free from delusion?" Answering rightly, they would answer: "Friends, the goal is for one free from delusion, not affected by delusion."—"But, friends, is that goal for one affected by craving or free from craving?" Answering rightly, they would answer "Friends, the goal is for one free from craving, not affected by craving."—"But, friends, is that goal for one affected by clinging, or free from clinging?" Answering rightly, they would answer: "Friends, the goal is for one free from clinging, not affected by clinging."—"But, friends, is that goal for one who has vision or for one without vision?" Answering rightly, they would answer: "Friends, that goal is for one with vision, not for one without vision."—"But, friends, is that goal for one who favours and opposes, or for one who does not favour and oppose?" Answering rightly, they would answer: "Friends, the goal is for one who does not favour and oppose, not for one who favours and opposes."—"But, friend, is that goal for one who delights in diversification or for one who has no delight in diversification?" Answering rightly, they would answer: "Friends, the goal is for one who has no delight in diversification, not for one who delights in diversification."

5. 'Bhikkhus, there are these two kinds of views: the view of being and the view of non-being.

6. 'Any monks or divines who rely on the view of being, adopt the view of being and accept the view of being, are opposed to the view of non-

being. Any monks or divines who rely on the view of non-being, adopt the view of non-being and accept the view of non-being, are opposed to the view of being.

7. 'Any monks or divines who do not understand as they actually are the origin and the disappearance and the gratification and the danger and the escape in (the case of) these two kinds of views, are affected by lust, affected by hate, affected by delusion, affected by craving, affected by clinging, without vision, given over to favouring and opposing, and who delight in diversification, enjoy diversification; they are not liberated from birth, ageing and death, from sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair, they are not liberated from suffering, I say.

8. 'Any monks or divines who understand as they actually are the origin and the disappearance, and the gratification and the danger and the escape in (the case of) these two kinds of views, are without lust, without hate, without delusion, without craving, without clinging, with vision, not given over to favouring and opposing, and who have no delight in diversification, no enjoyment in diversification; they are liberated from birth, ageing and death, from sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair, they are liberated from suffering, I say.

9. 'Bhikkhus, there are these four kinds clinging: clinging to sensual desires, clinging to wrong views, clinging to rites and rituals² and clinging to a self-doctrine.

10. 'When certain monks and divines claim to propound the full knowledge of all kinds of clinging, they do not completely describe full knowledge of all kinds of clinging. They describe full knowledge of clinging to sensual desires without describing clinging to (wrong) views, clinging to rites and rituals, or clinging to a self-doctrine. Why is that? Those good monks and divines do not understand these three instances (of clinging) as they actually are. Consequently while these good monks and divines claim to propound full knowledge of all kinds of clinging, they describe (only) full knowledge of clinging to sensual desires without

2. Taking upon oneself, of rituals and vows which are believed to lead to liberation or salvation, but have no such fruits.

describing clinging to views, clinging to rites and rituals and clinging to a self-doctrine.

11. 'When certain monks and divines claim to propound the full knowledge of all kinds of clinging, they describe full knowledge of clinging to sensual desires and clinging to views, without describing clinging to rites and rituals and clinging to a self-doctrine... they do not understand two instances... They describe full knowledge of clinging to sensual desires and clinging to views, without describing clinging to rites and rituals and clinging to a self-doctrine.

12. 'When certain monks and divines claim to propound the full knowledge of all kinds of clinging, they describe full knowledge of clinging to sensual desires, clinging to views and clinging to rites and rituals, without describing clinging to a self-doctrine... they do not understand one instance... They describe full knowledge of clinging to sensual desires and clinging to views and clinging to rites and rituals without describing clinging to a self-doctrine.

13. 'Bhikkhus, in such a Dhamma and Discipline as that it is plain that confidence in the Master is not rightly directed, it is plain that confidence in the Dhamma is not rightly directed, that perfecting of the virtues is not rightly directed, and that the dearness and love among those who share the Dhamma are not rightly directed. Why is that? Because that is how it is when the Dhamma and the Discipline is ill-expounded, ill-proclaimed, leading nowhere, uncondusive to peace and proclaimed by one not fully enlightened.

14. 'Bhikkhus, when a Tathāgata, an Arahant and Fully Enlightened One, claims to propound full knowledge of all kinds of clinging, he completely describes all kinds of clinging: he describes full knowledge of clinging to sensual desires and clinging to (wrong) view and clinging to rites and rituals and clinging to a self-doctrine.

15. 'Bhikkhus, in such a Dhamma and Discipline as that it is plain that confidence in the Master is rightly directed, that confidence in the Dhamma is rightly directed, that perfecting of virtues is rightly directed, and that dearness and love among those who share the Dhamma are

rightly directed. Why is that? Because that is how it is when the Dhamma and the Discipline is well-expounded, well proclaimed, leading onward, conducive to peace, and proclaimed by one fully enlightened.

16. 'Now these four kind of clinging have what as their source, what as their origin, from what are they born, by what are they produced?

'These four kinds of clinging have craving as their source, craving as their origin, they are born from craving, and produced by craving.

'Craving has what as its source...?

'Craving has feeling as its source... produced by feeling.

'Feeling has what as its source...?

'Feeling has contact as its source... produced by contact.

'Contact has what as its source...?

'Contact has the sixfold base as its source... produced by the sixfold base.

'The sixfold base has what as its source...?

'The sixfold base has name-and-form as its source... produced by name-and-form.

'Name-and-form has what as its source...?

'Name-and-form has consciousness as its source... produced by consciousness.

'Consciousness has what as its source...?

'Consciousness has formations as its source... produced by formations.

'Formations have what as their source...?

'Formations have ignorance as their source, ignorance as their origin, they are born from ignorance, and produced by ignorance.

17. 'Bhikkhus, as soon as ignorance is abandoned and true knowledge has arisen in a bhikkhu, then with the fading of ignorance and the arising of true knowledge he no longer clings to sensual desires (as fuel for) clinging, or to (wrong) views (as fuel for) clinging, or to rites and rituals (as fuel for) clinging, or to a self-doctrine (as fuel for) clinging. When he does not cling, he has no anguish. When he has no anguish, he attains Nibbāna for himself³: Birth is exhausted, the life divine has

3. Though to some this may sound 'selfish' (How impossible this is for one who has penetrated to the truth of not self (anattā) through strenuous restraint, effort and meditation!) it is, the Comy. explains, the experience of complete liberation immediately the defilements (kilesa) have been quenched.

been lived out, what can be done is done, there is no more of this in the beyond.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied, and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 5. for *paṇṇāsa*—diversification, see Sutta 18, para. 16 and note.

para. 17. the idiom *n' eva kāmūpādānāṃ upādīyati*, etc., where *upādāna* is the subject of the verb *upādīyati* has been rendered by borrowing the word *upādāna*'s other meaning of 'fuel'; for 'to cling to a clinging' makes no sense in English. *Upādāna* is utraquistic in Pāli, while 'clinging' in English is not. Cf Sutta 106, para. 11.

Culasakuludayi Sutta To Sakuludayin-2

Introduction

Here is a discourse which deals with three important points:

- the self or soul after death
- an entirely pleasant (heavenly) world and how to get there
- and the highest aim of Buddhists.

Sakuludāyin, after admitting that he has no supernatural success and cannot understand the formula of Dependent Origination, introduces a topic from his own teachings about 'a shining soul after death'—which is more brilliant than anything else. Such doctrines are common amongst mystics of all religions who no doubt have seen such things for themselves. *But* they have failed to examine them in the light of Impermanence, Suffering and No self and so cling to such manifestations as the holy essence or the pure soul. The Buddha remarks that he knows a lot of heavenly beings who have radiance and light far exceeding Sakuludāyin's self.

The subject of discussion then changes to the existence of an entirely pleasant (heavenly) world which Sakuludāyin proposes to reach by the first four of the Five Precepts plus some bodily mortification. The Buddha shows that this is quite inadequate as a course for reaching such a heaven and then speaks of how it should be done: the first three jhānas. (It is noteworthy that the Buddha does not even consider the six heavens of the sensual sphere—which correspond to popular ideas of 'heaven' in all religions, when speaking of an 'entirely pleasant world') The planes of existence corresponding to the fourth jhāna are what the Buddha terms 'an entirely pleasant world'.

Sakuludāyin immediately assumes that bhikkhus lead the life divine for the sake of such existence in the Brahma-world. The Buddha says it is

not so and goes on to list the knowledges which are superior to it, concluding with the knowledge of the exhaustion of taints which is Arahantship.

The Sutta (79)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the Squirrels' Sanctuary. Now on that occasion the wanderer Sakuludāyin was staying in the Wanderers' Park, the Peacocks' Sanctuary, with a large following of wanderers.

2-6. Then, it being morning, the Blessed One dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Rājagaha for alms. Then he thought: 'It is still too early to wander for alms. Suppose I went to the Wanderers' Park, the Peacocks' Sanctuary, to the wanderer Sakuludāyin? . . .' (as in Sutta 77, para. 4-5).

7. 'For what talk are you gathered here now, Udāyin? And what was your talk meanwhile which was left unfinished?'

'Let it be, Master Gotama, let the discussion for which we were gathered here now be. Master Gotama can well hear about that later. Venerable sir, when I do not come to this following, then it sits talking many kinds of vulgar talk. When I have come to this following, then it sits looking only to me thus: "Let us hear the Dhamma that the monk Udāyin expounds." When the Blessed One comes, then both I and this following sit looking only to the Blessed One thus: "Let us hear the Dhamma that the Blessed One expounds."'

8. 'Then Udāyin, it may occur to you (to suggest something that) I should talk about.'

'Venerable sir, in the last few days there was an Omniscient All-seer who was claiming complete knowledge and vision thus: "Whether I am walking or standing or sleeping or waking, my knowledge and vision are continuously, unceasingly maintained." When he was asked a question about the past by me, he prevaricated, led the talk

aside, and showed anger, hate and surliness. Then it was only about the Blessed One that I felt happy thus: "Ah, surely it is the Blessed One, surely it is the Sublime One who is skilled in these dhammas."

'But, Udāyin, who was this Omniscient All-seer?'

'It was the (Jain) Nigantha Nātaputta, venerable sir.'

9. 'Udāyin, if someone should recollect his manifold past life thus: one birth, two births . . . thus with all its details and particulars, should he recollect his manifold past life, then either he might ask me a question about the past, or I might ask him a question about the past, and either his answer to my question might commend itself to my mind, or my answer to his question might commend itself to his mind. And if someone with the heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, should see beings, passing away and reappearing . . . should understand how beings pass on according to their karmas, then either he might ask me a question about the future, or I might ask him a question about the future, and his answer to my question might commend itself to my mind, or my answer to his question might commend itself to his mind.

'Rather let the past be, Udāyin, and let the future be. I shall teach you the Dhamma: When this exists, that comes to be; with the arising of this, that arises. When this does not exist, that does not come to be; with the cessation of this, that ceases.'

10. 'Venerable sir, I cannot even recall with details and particulars all that I have experienced with this personal existence¹, so how should I recall my manifold past life: one birth, two births . . . how thus with its details and particulars should I recall my manifold past life as the Blessed One does? And I cannot now even see a midden-goblin, so how should I with the heavenly eyesight, which is purified and surpasses the human, see beings passing away and reappearing . . . how should I understand how beings pass on according to their karmas, as the Blessed One does? But, venerable sir, when the Blessed One told me: "When this exists, that comes to be; with the arising of this, that arises. When this

1. Attabhāva, i.e. in this present life.

does not exist, that does not come to be; with the cessation of this, that ceases", that it still more unclear to me. Perhaps, venerable sir, an answer to a question about our own teachers' doctrine might commend itself to the Blessed One's mind?'

11. 'Well, Udāyin, how is it then in your own teachers' doctrine?'

'Venerable sir, it is thus in our own teachers' doctrine: "This possesses the perfect light², this possesses the perfect light."'

'But, Udāyin, since it is thus in your own teachers' doctrine: "This possesses the perfect light, this possesses the perfect light, what then is that which possesses the perfect light?'

'Venerable sir, that which possesses the perfect light is that which possesses the light, than which there is none other more perfect or excellent.'

'But, Udāyin, what is that which possesses the light than which there is none other more perfect of excellent?'

'Venerable sir, that which possesses the perfect light is that which possesses the light than which there is none other more perfect or excellent.'

12. 'Udāyin, you might continue for a time in this way. You say: "Venerable sir, that which possesses the perfect light is that which possesses the light than which there is none other more perfect or excellent", yet you do not make it known what that is. Suppose a man were to say: "I want and desire the beauty who is (the fairest) in this country", and then they asked him: "Good man, that beauty whom you want and desire, do you know whether she is a warrior-noble or a divine or a burgess or an artisan?" and he replied: "No." And then they asked him: "Good man, that beauty whom you want and desire, do you know what her name and surname are? ... whether she is tall, short or middle height? ... whether she is dark or fair or golden-skinned? ... what village or town or city she lives in?" and he replied: "No." And then they asked him: "Good man, do you want and desire what you neither know nor see?" and he an-

2. An unusual use of the word *vaṇṇa*, here meaning light or radiance. Apparently Udāyin's doctrine of a 'shining self after death' (see para. 13) is based on some mystical experience involving light which has been grasped at as the 'self.'

swered: "Yes"—what do you think, Udāyin, that being so, would not that man's talk amount to nonsense?"

'Surely, venerable sir, that being so, that man's talk would amount to nonsense.'

13. 'But in the same way you, Udāyin, say thus: "That which possesses the perfect light is that which possesses the light than which there is none other more perfect or excellent", yet you do not make it known what that is.'

'Venerable sir, just as a beautiful beryl gem of purest water, eight-faceted, well cut, lying on red brocade, glows and shines, so too is the self having such light that remains sound after death.'

14 'How do you conceive this, Udāyin? This fine beryl gem of purest water, eight-faceted, well cut, lying on red brocade, which glows and shines, or a glowworm in a pitch-dark night—of these two which has the more outstanding, the more excellent light?'

'The glowworm on a pitch-dark night, venerable sir.'

15. 'How do you conceive this, Udāyin? This glowworm on a pitch-dark night, or an oil-lamp on a pitch-dark night—of these two which has the more outstanding, the more excellent light?'

'The oil-lamp on a pitch-dark night has, venerable sir.'

16. 'How do you conceive this, Udāyin? This oil-lamp on a pitch-dark night or a great bonfire on a pitch-dark night—which of these two has the more outstanding, the more excellent light?'

'The great bonfire on a pitch-dark night has, venerable sir.'

17. 'How do you conceive this, Udāyin? This great bonfire on a pitch-dark night, or the Healing Star at night towards dawn in a clear cloudless sky—of these two which has the more outstanding, the more excellent light?'

'The Healing Star at night towards dawn in a clear cloudless sky has, venerable sir.'

18. 'How do you conceive this, Udāyin? This Healing Star at night towards dawn in a clear cloudless sky, or the Moon on the Uposatha

Day of the Fifteenth full in a clear cloudless midnight sky—of these two which has the more outstanding, the more excellent light?’

‘The Moon on the Uposatha Day of the Fifteenth full in a clear cloudless midnight sky has, venerable sir.’

19. ‘How do you conceive this, Udāyin? This Moon on the Uposatha day of the Fifteenth full in a clear cloudless midnight sky, or the Sun in the autumn season in the last month of the Rains full in a clear cloudless midday sky—of these two which has the more outstanding, the more excellent light?’

“The sun in the autumn season in the last month of the Rains full in a clear cloudless midday sky has, venerable sir.’

20. ‘Further more, Udāyin, many more are the gods who do not make use of the radiance of this moon and sun than those who do—those I know, yet I do not say that that which possesses the perfect light is that which possesses the light than which there is none other more perfect or excellent. But you, Udāyin, say of that whose quality is inferior to and lower than that of a glowworm that it possesses the perfect light, and yet you do not make known what that it is.’

21. ‘The Blessed One has terminated the discussion; the Sublime One has terminated the discussion.’

‘But Udāyin, why do you say that?’

‘Venerable sir, it is thus in our own teachers’ doctrine: “This possesses the perfect light, this possesses the perfect light”. But on being pressed, questioned and cross-questioned about our own teachers’ doctrine by the Blessed One, we are found empty and wanting and in the wrong.’

22. ‘How is it, Udāyin, is there an entirely pleasant world? Is there a practical way to realize an entirely pleasant world?’

‘Venerable sir, it is thus in our own teachers’ doctrine: “There is an entirely pleasant world; there is a practical way to realize an entirely pleasant world.”

23. ‘But, Udāyin, what is that practical way to realize an entirely pleasant world?’

'Here venerable sir, someone abandons killing living beings and abstains from killing living beings; he abandons taking what is not given and abstains from taking what is not given; he abandons misconduct in sexual desires and abstains from misconduct in sexual desires; he abandons false speech and abstains from false speech; or else he undertakes some kind of mortification. This is the practical way to realize the entirely pleasant world.'

24. 'How do you conceive this, Udāyin, on an occasion when he abandons killing living beings and abstains from killing living beings, does his self then feel only pleasure, or both pleasure and pain?'

'Both pleasure and pain, venerable sir.'

'How do you conceive this, Udāyin, on an occasion when he abandons taking what is not given and abstains from taking what is not given, does his self then feel only pleasure, or both pleasure and pain?'

'Both pleasure and pain, venerable sir.'

'How do you conceive this, Udāyin, on an occasion when he abandons misconduct in sexual desires and abstains from misconduct in sexual desires, does his self then feel only pleasure, or both pleasure and pain?'

'Both pleasure and pain, venerable sir.'

'How do you conceive this, Udāyin, on an occasion when he abandons false speech and abstains from false speech, does his self then feel only pleasure, or both pleasure and pain?'

'Both pleasure and pain, venerable sir.'

'How do you conceive this, Udāyin, on an occasion when he undertakes some kind of mortification, does his self feel only pleasure or both pleasure and pain?'

'Both pleasure and pain, venerable sir.'

'How do you conceive this, Udāyin, is there realization of an entirely pleasant world by following a way of mixed pleasure and pain?'

25. 'The Blessed One has terminated the discussion. The Sublime One has terminated the discussion.'

'But, Udāyin, why do you say that?'

'Venerable sir, it is thus in our own teachers' doctrine: "There is an entirely pleasant world; there is a practical way to realize an entirely

pleasant world". But on being pressed and questioned and cross-questioned about our own teachers' doctrine by the Blessed One, we are found empty and wanting and in the wrong. But how is it, venerable sir, is there an entirely pleasant world? Is there a practical way to realize an entirely pleasant world?'

26. 'There is an entirely pleasant world, Udāyin; there is a practical way to realize an entirely pleasant world.'

'Venerable sir, what is that practical way?'

27. 'Here, Udāyin, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, a bhikkhu enters upon and abides in the first jhāna, which is accompanied by initial application and sustained application with happiness and (bodily) pleasure born of seclusion.

'With the stilling . . . second jhāna . . . third jhāna . . . "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful".'

'This is the practical way to realize an entirely pleasant world.'

'Venerable sir, that is not the practical way to realize an entirely pleasant world; at that point the entirely pleasant world has already been realized.'

'Udāyin, the entirely pleasant world has not already been realized at that point; that is only the practical way to realize an entirely pleasant world.'

28. When this was said, the wanderer Sakuludāyin's following started shouting, very clamorous and noisy: 'We don't renounce our teachers' doctrine for this reason; we don't renounce our teachers' doctrine for this reason! We know nothing higher than that!'

Then the wanderer Sakuludāyin quieted his following, and he asked the Blessed One:

29. 'Venerable sir, at what point is the entirely pleasant world realized?'

'Here, Udāyin, with the abandoning of (bodily) pleasure and pain, and with the previous disappearance of (mental) joy and grief, he enters upon and abides in the fourth jhāna, which has neither-pain-nor-pleasure, and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity. He consorts, converses and enters into discussion with such gods as have appeared in the

entirely pleasant world. It is at this point that the entirely pleasant world has been realized.'

30. 'Then, venerable sir, it must certainly be in order to realize that entirely pleasant world that bhikkhus lead the life divine under the Blessed One?'

'It is not in order to realize that entirely pleasant world that bhikkhus lead the life divine under me. There are other dhammas higher and more sublime in order to realize which bhikkhus lead the life divine under me.'

31-39. 'What are they, venerable sir?'

'Here, Udāyin, a Tathāgata appears in the world . . . (as in Sutta 27, para. 13-21).

40. 'Having abandoned these five hindrances, defilements of the mind that weaken understanding, quite secluded from sensual desires . . . first jhāna . . . with happiness and (bodily) pleasure born of seclusion. This is a dhamma higher and more sublime, in order to realize which bhikkhus lead the life divine under me.

41. 'Again, with the stilling of initial application . . . second jhāna . . . with happiness and pleasure born of concentration. This is a dhamma higher and more sublime, in order to realize which bhikkhus lead the life divine under me.

42. 'Again . . . third jhāna . . .

43. 'Again . . . fourth jhāna . . . purity of mindfulness due to equanimity. This is a dhamma higher and more sublime in order to realize which bhikkhus lead the life divine under me.

44. 'When his concentrated mind is thus purified . . . knowledge of recollection of past life . . . he recollects his manifold past life. This is a dhamma higher and more sublime . . .

45. 'When his concentrated mind . . . with the heavenly eyesight . . . how beings pass on according to their kammās. This is a dhamma higher and more sublime . . .

46-47. 'When his concentrated mind . . . knowledge of exhaustion of taints . . . There is no more of this to come. This is a dhamma higher and more sublime in order to realize which bhikkhus lead the life divine under me.'

48. 'These, Udāyin, are the dhammas higher and more sublime in order to realize which bhikkhus lead the life divine under me.'

49. When this was said, the wanderer Sakuludāyin said to the Blessed One: 'Magnificent, venerable sir! Magnificent . . . (as in Sutta 7, para. 25).'

50. 'I go to the Blessed One for refuge, venerable sir, and to the Dhamma and to the Sangha of bhikkhus. I would receive the Going-forth under the Blessed One, and I would receive the Full Admission.'

51. When this was said, the wanderer Sakuludāyin's following addressed him thus: 'Let not Master Udāyin lead the life divine under the Blessed One. Let not Master Udāyin who has been a teacher become a pupil. Just as it is with a well-pitcher that has once been a water-jar, so it will be for Master Udāyin. Let not Master Udāyin lead the life divine under the Blessed One. Let not Master Udāyin who has been a teacher become a pupil.'

That is how the wanderer Sakuludāyin's following obstructed his leading the life divine under the Blessed One.

Notes

para. 51. *manika* here seems to be a water jar or carafe used as a source, not as a carrier, of water, and *uddekanika* (*uddevanika*—Sinh. Ed. of Comy has *Uddekani-kato* and Burmese Tikā *udañjaniko ti udāñ-jano*) a pitcher used for drawing or carrying water. The sense of degradation is clear.

Culasaccaka Sutta To Saccaka-I

Introduction

Saccaka appears to have been a cunning braggart who somehow got a reputation as a religious teacher but who met his match in the Buddha. His first piece of boastfulness, ending with 'Even if I engaged a senseless post in argument it would shake and shiver and tremble . . . ' is followed by his vain predictions of what he will do to 'the monk Gotama'. Saccaka turns out to be a believer in self-soul and is made to declare that form is self, feeling is self, perception is self, formations are self, consciousness is self. His lack of understanding is then demonstrated by the Buddha with his question upon the power of kings to impose punishment for crimes, which Saccaka answers affirmatively and at quite unnecessary length, not realizing that he is trapping himself. But when asked if he has power even over his 'own' body: 'Let it be like this and not like that', he has to admit that he has none. And the same is true of the other four aggregates. Saccaka is defeated and for all his brave words about making other monks and brahmins sweat, it is he who sweats copiously while the Buddha is not at all disturbed. But Saccaka has such a great conceit that he shrugs off his defeat and cannot therefore learn anything. He asks more questions and the Buddha in reply again emphasizes Not-self. Finally Saccaka does recognize that he was overbold in attacking the Buddha and perhaps he has gained some little confidence in him since he invites him, with the bhikkhusangha, to a meal the next day. The Buddha's concluding explanations about the fruits of merit are interesting.

The Sutta (35)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Vesāli in the Great Wood in the Hall with the Peaked Roof.

2. Now on that occasion Saccaka the Nigantha's son was staying at Vesāli, a debater and a clever speaker, regarded by many as a saint. He spoke these words before an assembly in Vesāli: 'I see no monk or divine, the head of a sangha, head of a sect, teacher of a sect, even if he claims to be Arahant and Fully Enlightened, who would not shake and shiver and tremble and sweat under the armpits on being engaged in argument with me. Even if I engaged a senseless post in argument it would shake and shiver and tremble on being engaged in argument with me, so what shall I say of a human being?'

3. Then it being morning, the venerable Assaji dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Vesāli for alms. As Saccaka the Nigantha's son was walking and wandering for exercise in Vesāli, he saw the venerable Assaji coming in the distance. When he saw him, he went up to him and exchanged greetings with him, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he stood at one side. Then Saccaka the Nigantha's son said:

4. 'How does the monk Gotama discipline¹ disciples, Master Assaji; and in what way is the monk Gotama's instruction usually presented among disciples?'

'This is how the Blessed One disciplines¹ disciples, Aggivessana; and in this way the Blessed One's instruction is usually presented among disciples: "Bhikkhus, form is impermanent, feeling is impermanent, perception is impermanent, formations are impermanent, consciousness is impermanent; bhikkhus, form is not self, feeling is not self, perception is not self; formations are all impermanent, dhammas are all not self." That is the way the Blessed One disciplines disciples; and that is the way in which the Blessed One's instruction is usually presented among disciples.'

1. Lit, 'lead away from' or 'lead out of' (dukkha and saṃsāra). 'Lead away' (vineti) is given by Ven. Nyānamoli as an alternative rendering. Note that 'disciple' (sāvaka) is literally 'hearer' or 'listener'.

'If this is what the monk Gotama asserts, we hear indeed what is ill hearing. Now suppose, sometime or other, we were to meet Master Gotama, suppose we had some conversation with him? Suppose we were to detach him from that evil view?'

5. Now at that time five hundred Licchavis had met together in an assembly hall for some business or other. Then Saccaka the Nigantha's son went to them and said: 'Come forth, Licchavis, sirs, come forth. There will be converse today between me and the monk Gotama. If the monk Gotama maintains to me what was maintained to me by one of his famous pupils, the bhikkhu called Assaji, then with argument I will drag the monk Gotama to, and drag him fro, and drag him round about, just as a strong man might seize a long-haired ram by the hair and drag him to, and drag him fro, and drag him round about; so with argument I will drag the monk Gotama to, drag him fro and drag him him round about just as a strong brewer's workman might throw a big brewer's sieve into a deep water tank, and taking it by the corners, drag it to, and drag it fro and drag it round about; so with argument I will shake the monk Gotama down and shake him up and thump him, just as a strong brewer's mixer might take a strainer by the corners and shake it down and shake it up and thump it about. And just as a sixty year old elephant might go down into a pond and have great sport in the game of hemp-washing, so too I shall have great sport, I fancy, in the game of hemp-washing the monk Gotama. Come forth, Licchavis, sirs, come forth. There will be converse today between me and the monk Gotama.'

6. Thereupon some Licchavis said: 'Now will the monk Gotama refute Saccaka the Nigantha son's assertions; or will Saccaka the Nigantha's son refute the monk Gotama's assertions?' And some Licchavis said: 'How will Saccaka the Nigantha's son refute the Blessed One's assertions; on the contrary, the Blessed One will refute Saccaka the Nigantha son's assertions.'

Then Saccaka the Nigantha's son went with the five hundred Licchavis to the Hall with the Peaked Roof in the Great Wood.

7. Now on that occasion a number of bhikkhus were walking up and

down² in the open. Then Saccaka the Nigantha's son went up to them and asked: 'Where is Master Gotama living now, sirs. We want to see Master Gotama.'

'The Blessed One has gone into the Great Wood, Aggivessana, and is sitting at the root of a tree for the day's abiding.'³

8. Then Saccaka the Nigantha's son went together with a large following of Licchavis into the Great Wood to where the Blessed One was and exchanged greetings with him, and after the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. And some of the Licchavis paid homage to the Blessed One and sat down at one side; some exchanged greetings with him, and when this courteous and amiable talk was finished, they sat down at one side; some raised their hands palms together in salutation and sat down at one side; some pronounced their name and clan in the Blessed One's presence and sat down at one side; some kept silence and sat down at one side.

9. When Saccaka the Nigantha's son had sat down, he said to the Blessed One: 'I would question Master Gotama on a certain point, if Master Gotama would grant me the favour of an answer to the question?'

'Ask what you like, Aggivessana.'

'How does Master Gotama discipline (lead away) his disciples; and in what way is Master Gotama's instruction usually presented among the disciples?'

'This is how I discipline (lead away) disciples, Aggivessana; and this is the way my instruction is usually presented among disciples: Form is impermanent, feeling is impermanent, perception is impermanent, formations are impermanent, consciousness is impermanent; form is not self, feeling is not self, perception is not self, formations are not self, consciousness is not self; formations are all impermanent, dhammas are all not self. That is the way I discipline disciples; and that is the way in which my instruction is usually presented among disciples.'

10. 'A simile occurs to me, Master Gotama.'

'Let it occur to you, Aggivessana,' the Blessed One said.

2. Practising walking meditation (cankamana).

3. Abiding in meditation in the Noble Fruit Attainment throughout the day.

‘Just as when seeds and plants, whatever their kind, reach growth, all do so in dependence on earth, based upon earth; and just as when the kinds of work to be done by the strong are done, all are done in dependence on earth, based upon earth—so too, Master Gotama, a man has form as self, he produces merit or demerit based on form. He has feeling as self, he produces merit or demerit based on feeling. He has perception as self, he produces merit or demerit based on perception. He has formations as self, he produces merit or demerit based on formations. He has consciousness as self, he produces merit or demerit based on consciousness.’

11. ‘Aggivesana, are you not asserting thus: form is my self, feeling is my self, perception is my self, formations are my self, consciousness is my self?’

‘I assert thus, Master Gotama: form is my self, feeling is my self, perception is my self, formations are my self, consciousness is my self. And so does this great multitude.’

‘What has this great multitude to do with you, Aggivesana? Please confine yourself to your own assertion alone.’

‘Then, Master Gotama, I assert thus: form is my self, feeling is my self, perception is my self, formations are my self, consciousness is my self.’

12. ‘In that case, Aggivesana, I shall ask you a question in return. Answer it as you like. How do you conceive this, Aggivesana, would a head-anointed warrior-noble king have the power in his own realm to execute those who should be executed, to fine those who should be fined, to banish those who should be banished, for example, King Pasenadi of Kosala, or King Ajātasattu Vedehiputta of Magadha?’

‘Master Gotama, a head-anointed warrior-noble king would have the power in his own realm to execute those who should be executed, to fine those who should be fined, to banish those who should be banished, for example, King Pasenadi of Kosala, or King Ajātasattu Vedehiputta of Magadha. For even these (oligarchic) communities and societies such as the Vajjians and the Mallians, have the power in their own realm to execute those who should be executed, to fine those who should be fined, to banish those who should be banished, so all the more so an anointed

warrior king such as King Pasenadi of Kosala or King Ajātasattu Vedehiputta of Magadha. He would have it, Master Gotama, and he would be worthy to have it.'

13. 'How do you conceive this, Aggivessana: when you say thus: "Form is my self", have you any such power over that form as: "Let my form be thus; let my form be not thus"?''

When this was said, Sāccaka the Nigantha's son was silent.

A second time the Blessed One said to him: 'How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, when you say thus: "Form is my self", have you any such power over that form as: "Let my form be thus; let my form be not thus"?''

A second time Saccaka the Nigantha's son was silent.

Then the Blessed One said to him: 'Aggivessana, answer now. Now is not the time to be silent. If anyone did not answer when asked a question according with Dhamma up to the third time by the Tathāgata his head would split in seven pieces there and then.'

14. Now on that occasion a thunderbolt-wielding spirit with an iron bolt in his head, burning, blazing, glowing, appeared in the air above Saccaka the Nigantha's son (thinking): 'If this Saccaka the Nigantha's son does not answer when asked a question according with Dhamma up to the third time, I shall split his head into seven pieces here and now.'

The Blessed One saw the thunderbolt-wielding spirit and so did Saccaka the Nigantha's son. Then Saccaka the Nigantha's son was frightened, terrified and his hair stood on end, and seeking to make the Blessed One his shelter, his asylum and refuge, he said: 'Ask me, Master Gotama; I will answer.'

15. 'How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, when you say thus: "Form is my self", have you any such power over that form as: "Let my form be thus; let my form be not thus"?''

'No, Master Gotama.'

16. 'Pay attention, Aggivessana, pay attention how you reply. What you said before does not agree with what you said after, or what you said after with what you said before. How do you conceive this, Aggi-

vessana, when you say thus: "Feeling is my self", have you any such power over that feeling as: "Let my feeling be thus; let my feeling be not thus"?'

'No, Master Gotama.'

17. 'Pay attention, Aggivessana, pay attention how you reply. What you said before does not agree with what you said after, or what you said after with what you said before. How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, when you say thus: "Perception is my self", have you any such power over that perception as: "Let my perception be thus; let my perception be not thus"?'

'No, Master Gotama.'

18. 'Pay attention, Aggivessana, pay attention how you reply. What you said before does not agree with what you said after, or what you said after with what you said before. How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, when you say thus: "Formations are my self", have you any such power over those formation as: "Let my formations be thus; let my formations be not thus"?'

'No, Master Gotama.'

19. 'Pay attention, Aggivessana, pay attention how you reply. What you said before does not agree with what you said after, or what you said after with what you said before. How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, when you say thus: "Consciousness is my self", have you any such power over that consciousness as: "Let my consciousness be thus; let my consciousness be not thus"?'

'No, Master Gotama.'

20. 'Pay attention, Aggivessana, pay attention how you reply. What you said before does not agree with what you said after, or what you said after with what you said before. How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, is form permanent or impermanent?'

'Impermanent, Master Gotama.'

'Now is what is impermanent unpleasant⁴ or pleasant?'

'Unpleasant, Master Gotama.'

4. This is dukkha, generally, as below, translated 'suffering'.

'Now is what is impermanent, unpleasant,⁴ and subject to change fit to be regarded as: "This is mine, this is I, this is my self"?''

'No, Master Gotama.'

21. 'How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, is feeling permanent or impermanent?' ...

22. 'How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, is perception permanent or impermanent?' ...

23. 'How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, are formations permanent or impermanent?' ...

24. 'How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, is consciousness permanent or impermanent?' ...

'Impermanent, Master Gotama.'

'Now is what is impermanent unpleasant⁴ or pleasant?'

'Unpleasant, Master Gotama.'

'Now is what is impermanent, unpleasant⁴ and subject to change fit to be regarded as: "This is mine, this is I, this is my self"?''

'No, Master Gotama.'

25. 'How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, when a man adheres to suffering, resorts to suffering, accepts suffering, always views suffering as: "This is mine, this is I, this is my self", would he himself ever fully understand suffering or abide with suffering quite exhausted?'

'Why should he, Master Gotama? No, Master Gotama.'

* 'How do you conceive this, Aggivessana, that being so, do you not adhere to suffering, do you not resort to suffering, do you not accept suffering, do you not always view suffering as: "This is mine, this is I, this is my self"?''

'Why not, Master Gotama? Yes, Master Gotama.'*

26. 'It is as though a man needing heartwood, seeking heartwood, wandering in search of heartwood, took a sharp axe and went to the wood; and there he saw a large plantain trunk, straight, young, with no fruit-bud core. Then he cut off the root, he cut off the crown, and having

4. This is dukkha, generally, as below, translated 'suffering'.

cut off the crown he unrolled the leaf-sheaths; but as he went on unrolling the leaf-sheaths he would never come even to any sapwood, let alone heartwood. So too, Aggivessana, when you are pressed and questioned and cross-questioned by me about your own assertion, you are empty, vacant and in the wrong. But these words of yours were spoken before this assembly: "I see no monk or divine, the head of a sangha, head of a sect, teacher of a sect, even if he claims to be Arahant and Fully Enlightened, who would not shake and shiver and tremble and sweat under the armpits on being engaged in argument with me. Even if I engaged a senseless post in argument it would shake and shiver and tremble, so what shall I say of a human being?" Now there are drops of sweat on your forehead and they have soaked through your upper robe and fallen to the ground. But there is no sweat on my body now.'

And the Blessed One uncovered his golden-coloured body before the assembly. When this was said, Saccaka the Nigantha's son sat silent, dismayed, with shoulders drooping and head down, glum and with nothing to say.

27. Then Dummukha the son of the Licchavis, seeing Saccaka the Nigantha's son thus, said to the Blessed One: 'A simile occurs to me, Master Gotama.'

'Let it occur to you, Dummukha.'

'Suppose, venerable sir, not far from a village or town there were a pond with a crab in it. And then a party of boys and girls went out from the town or village to the pond, and they went into the water and pulled the crab out of the water and put it on dry land. And whenever the crab extended a leg, they cut it off, broke it, smashed it with sticks and stones, so that the crab with all its legs cut off, broken and smashed would be unable to get back to the pond as before—so too, all Saccaka the Nigantha's son's distortions, paradoxes and travesties have been cut off, broken and smashed by the Blessed One, and now he cannot get near the Blessed One as was the purpose of his words.'

28. When this was said, Saccaka the Nigantha's son told him: 'Wait, Dummukha, wait. We are not treating with you, here we are treating with Master Gotama.'

(Then he said): 'Let that talk of ours be, Master Gotama, like that of many a monk and divine it was (just) so many words, I fancy. But how does a disciple of the monk Gotama carry out the message, respond to advice, cross beyond uncertainty, lose his doubts, gain intrepidity, and become independent of others in the Teacher's message?'

'Here, Aggivessana, any kind of form whatever, whether past, future or present, in oneself or external, gross or subtle, inferior or superior, far or near—a disciple of mine sees with right understanding all form as it actually is thus: "This is not mine, this not I, this is not my self." Any kind of feeling whatever . . . Any kind of perception whatever . . . Any kind of formation whatever . . . Any kind of consciousness whatever, whether past, future or present, in oneself or external, gross or subtle, inferior or superior, far or near—a disciple of mine sees with right understanding all consciousness as it actually is thus: "This not mine, this is not I, this not my self." This is how a disciple of mine carries out the message, responds to advice, crosses beyond uncertainty, loses his doubts, gains intrepidity and becomes independent of others in the Teacher's message.'

29. 'Master Gotama, how does a bhikkhu become an Arahant, with the taints exhausted who has lived the life, done what was to be done, laid down the burden, reached the highest goal, destroyed the fetters of being, and who through right final knowledge is liberated?'

'Here, Aggivessana, any kind of form whatever, whether past, future or present, in oneself or external, gross or subtle, inferior or superior, far or near, a bhikkhu sees with right understanding all form as it actually is thus: "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self", and through not clinging he is liberated. Any kind of feeling whatever . . . Any kind of perception whatever . . . Any kind of formation whatever . . . Any kind of consciousness whatever, whether past, future or present, in oneself or external, gross or subtle, inferior or superior, far or near, a bhikkhu sees with right understanding all consciousness as it actually is thus: "This is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self", and through not clinging he is liberated. That is how a bhikkhu becomes an Arahant, with taints exhausted, who has lived the life, done what was to be done, laid down the burden, reached the highest goal, destroyed the fetters of being, and through right final knowledge is liberated.

30. 'When a bhikkhu's mind is thus liberated, he possesses three unsurpassabilities: unsurpassability in vision, unsurpassability in practice of the way, and unsurpassability in deliverance. When a bhikkhu is thus liberated, he honours, respects, reveres, and venerates only the Tathāgata: The Blessed One is enlightened and teaches the Dhamma by enlightenment. The Blessed One is controlled and he teaches the Dhamma by control. The Blessed One is serene and he teaches the Dhamma by serenity. The Blessed One has crossed over and he teaches the Dhamma by having crossed over. The Blessed One has attained Nibbāna and he teaches the Dhamma by having attained Nibbāna.'

31. When this was said, Saccaka the Nigantha's son replied: 'Master Gotama, we were bold and forward in conceiving Master Gotama to be attackable by argument. A man might be such that he could with impunity attack a mad elephant, yet he could not attack Master Gotama with impunity. A man might be such that he could with impunity attack a blazing mass of fire, yet he could not attack Master Gotama with impunity. A man might be such that he could with impunity attack a terrible poisonous serpent, yet he could not attack Master Gotama with impunity. We were bold and forward in conceiving Master Gotama to be attackable by argument.'

32. 'Let the Blessed One, together with the Sangha of Bhikkhus, accept tomorrow's meal from me.'

The Blessed One accepted in silence.

33. Then knowing that the Blessed One had accepted, he addressed the Licchavis: 'Hear me, Licchavis, the monk Gotama together with the Sangha of Bhikkhus has been invited by me for tomorrow's meal. You may bring to me whatever you think is proper for him.'

34. Then when the night was ended the Licchavis brought five hundred ceremonial dishes of milk rice as gifts of food. Then Saccaka the Nigantha's son had good food of various kinds prepared in his own house, and he had the time announced to the Blessed One: 'It is time, Master Gotama, the meal is ready.'

35. Then, it being morning, the Blessed One dressed, and taking his bowl

and (outer) robe, he went with the Sangha of Bhikkhus to Saccaka the Nigantha's son's house, and sat down on the seat made ready. Then with his own hands, Saccaka the Nigantha's son served and satisfied the Sangha of Bhikkhus headed by the Enlightened One with the various kinds of good food. Then when the Blessed One had eaten and no longer had the bowl in his hand, Saccaka the Nigantha's son took a low seat and sat down at one side. When he had done so, he said to the Blessed One: 'Master Gotama, whatever the merit and (expected future) greatness due to merit in (this) act-of-giving, may that be for the happiness of the givers.'

'Aggivessana, such (merit and expected greatness due to merit) as comes of (giving to) one fit for offerings in the way that you are, (you being) not without lust, not without hate, and not without delusion, will be for the givers (who have given to you); but such as comes of (giving to) one fit for offerings in the way that I am, (I being) without lust, without hate and without delusion, will be for you (who have given to me).

Notes

para. 2. *sādhussammata*—regarded . . . as a saint: might mean 'well-regarded' but see D. ii, 150 where it is used of Purāṇa Kassapa and others.

para. 5. *soṇḍikā-kilaṅja*—brewer's sieve: *kilaṅja* is usually rendered 'mat', but Comy. indicates a possible rendering by 'sieve'.

soṇḍikā-dhutta—brewer's mixer: this sense of the '*dhutta*' (a jolter or shaker), not in P.T.S. Dict., is clear from the words *odhumeyya* and *nid-dhumeyya* ('shake down and shake up') which immediately follows.

vāla—a strainer: not in this sense in P.T.S. Dict.; Comy. glosses with *parissavana*.

para. 25. *dukkham vā parikkhepetvā vihāreyya*—dwell with suffering quite destroyed: *parikkhepeti* seems to be a causative of *khayati* (khiyati) and not of *khipati*. Not in P.T.S. Dict.

The second half of this paragraph marked * . . . * is not in all texts.

For *kiṃ hi no siyā* (why should he), see Sutta 22, para. 7 and 25 (not in this selection).

para. 26. *akukkukajātāṃ*—with no fruit but core: P.T.S. Dict. says 'not measurable by a *kukka*-length=enormous', but see Comy.

para. 34. *thālīpaka*—dish of milk-rice: see M.ii, 154 where listed as one of the four sorts of ceremonial food offerings.

para. 35. *puñña*—merit

'*puñña-mahī*—expected greatness (in the future) due to the merit': (in the sense that it is said that when someone is mahesakkhā—i.e. 'influential'—that is due to merit made in the past). This is probably better than taking it as the 'greatness' or 'magnitude' of the actual gift.

For enhancement of merit by the purity of the giver on the one hand and the purity of the recipient on the other, see Sutta 142. (Not in this selection).

Devadaha Sutta

At Devadaha

Introduction

A Sutta devoted to the Jains, their beliefs and practices. The Buddha had several encounters with Jain monks and laymen but never, as far as we know, met their teacher Nātaputta (often known as Mahāvira). The latter taught that past kamma determined all present experience and that evil done in the past could only be exhausted through mortification of the body. Such doctrines the Buddha knew to be untrue since the past only partly determines what is to be experienced now while one could never wear away all past evil kamma because what one does not know about cannot be 'worn away'.

The first part of this long Sutta is taken up with the refutation of the Jains' beliefs and practices. This clears away wrong views. When they are out of the way then follows the fruitful path of striving which, while some temporary pain may be involved (from continuous sitting and walking meditation for instance), leads to the happiness and pleasure of jhāna. Unlike worldly sensual happiness it should not be feared and avoided, but rather cultivated as the basis for liberation or Nibbāna.

The Sutta (101)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living in the Sakyān country. There is a town of the Sakyāns called Devadaha and there he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

2. 'Bhikkhus, there are some monks and divines who assert thus, whose view is thus: "Whatever this person feels, whether pleasure or pain or neither-pain-nor-pleasure, all that is caused by what was done in the past.¹ So by annihilating with penance past evil kammās, and by doing no fresh evil kammās, there will be no consequence in the future. With no consequence in the future there is exhaustion of kammās. With the exhaustion of kammās there is exhaustion of suffering. With the exhaustion of suffering there is exhaustion of feeling. With the exhaustion of feeling all suffering will be used up." So the Nigaṇṭhas (Jain monks) say.

3. 'I go to the Nigaṇṭhas who assert thus and I say: "Friends, is it true, as it seems, that you assert thus, that your view is thus: 'Whatever this person feels . . . all suffering will be used up?'" If, when they are asked thus, the Nigaṇṭhas admit, and say "Yes," I say to them:

4. 'But, friends, do you know you were² in the past, and not that you were not?'

'No, friend.'

'But, friends, do you know that you did evil kammās in the past and did not abstain from them?'

'No, friend.'

'But, friends, do you know that you did such and such evil kammās?'

'No, friend.'

'But, friends, do you know that so much suffering has already been used up, or that so much suffering has still to be used up, or that, when so much suffering has been used up, all suffering will have been used up?'

'No, friend.'

'But, friends, do you know what is the abandoning of unprofitable dhammas and the cultivation of profitable dhammas here and now?'

'No, friend.'

5. 'So, friends, it seems that you do not know that you were in the

1. Note the wrong view of many people these days who regard everything experienced as the results of past kamma. If this was true, no way out (to Nibbāna) is possible.

2. 'Do you know that you existed in the past, and not that you did not exist?'

past and not that you were not; or that you did evil kammās in the past and did not abstain from them; or that you did such and such evil kammās; or that so much suffering has already been used up; or that so much suffering has still to be used up; or that when so much suffering has been used up, all suffering will have been used up; or what is the abandoning of unprofitable dhammas and the cultivation of profitable dhammas here and now. That being so, it is not fitting for the venerable Nigaṇṭhas to declare: "Whatever this person feels, whether pleasure or pain or neither-pain-nor-pleasure, all that is caused by what is done in the past. So by annihilating with penance past evil kammās and by doing no fresh evil kammās, there will be no consequence in the future. With no consequence in the future, there is exhaustion of kammās... all suffering will be used up."

6. 'If, friend Nigaṇṭhas, you knew that you were in the past and not that you were not; or that you did evil kammās in the past and did not abstain from them; or that you did such and such evil kammās; or that so much suffering had already been used up; or that so much suffering had still to be used up; or that when so much suffering had been used up, all suffering would have been used up; or what is the abandoning of unprofitable dhammas and the cultivation of profitable dhammas here and now; that being so, it might be fitting for the venerable Nigaṇṭhas to declare: "Whatever this person feels... all suffering will be used up."

7. 'Friend Nigaṇṭhas, suppose a man were wounded by a dart thickly smeared with poison and he felt painful, racking, piercing feelings because of the dart's piercing. Then his friends and companions, relatives and kin brought a surgeon physician and the surgeon physician cut round the wound's opening with a knife, and he felt painful, racking, piercing feelings because of cutting round the wound's opening with a knife. Then the surgeon physician probed for the dart with a probe and he felt painful, racking, piercing feelings because of the probing for the dart with a probe. Then the surgeon physician pulled out the dart and he felt painful, racking, piercing feelings because of the pulling out of the dart. Then the surgeon physician applied a medicinal cauterizer to the wound's opening and he felt painful, racking, piercing feelings because of the application of the medicinal cauterizer to the wound's opening.

Then on another occasion when the wound was healed and covered with skin and he was well, happy, independent, master of himself and able to go where he liked, he thought: "Formerly I was pierced by a dart thickly smeared with poison and I felt painful, racking, piercing feelings because of the dart's piercing . . . Then the surgeon physician applied a medicinal cauterizer to the wound's opening . . . Now that the wound is healed and covered with skin I am well, happy, independent, my own master and I go where I like³."

8. 'So too, friend Nigaṇṭhas, if you knew that you were in the past and not that you were not⁴ . . . or what is the abandoning of unprofitable dhammas and the cultivation of profitable dhammas here and now; that being so, it might be fitting for the venerable Nigaṇṭhas to declare: "Whatever this person feels . . . all suffering will be used up."

9. 'But since, friend Nigaṇṭhas, you do not know that you were in the past and not that you were not . . . or what is the abandoning of unprofitable dhammas and the cultivation of profitable dhammas in this life; therefore it is not fitting for the venerable Nigaṇṭhas to declare: "Whatever this person feels . . . all suffering will be used up."

10. 'When this is said, the Nigaṇṭhas tell me: "The Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta, friend, the All-knowing, the All-seeing, claims to have complete knowledge and vision thus: 'Walking and standing and sleeping and waking my knowledge and vision are continuously, unceasingly maintained.' He says thus: 'Nigaṇṭhas, you have done evil kammās in the past; use them up with piercing mortification. And when you are here and now restrained in body, speech and mind, that is doing no evil kammās for the future. So, by annihilating with penance past evil kammās, and by doing no fresh kammās, there will be no consequence in the future. With no consequence in the future there is exhaustion of kammās . . . all suffering will be used up. This is our preference, and is liked by us, and we are satisfied.'"

3. The application of this simile is that the man who was wounded does remember all the painful details about this wound, while the Jains only assume that they were 'wounded' (by evil kammās) in the past, but remember nothing.

4. For the two 'sequels' see Sutta 95, para. 14.

11. 'When this is said, I tell the Nigaṇṭhas: "There are five dhammas, friend Nigaṇṭhas, that have two kinds of sequel here and now. What five? They are: faith, preference, (oral) tradition, arguing upon evidence and liking to ponder upon views.⁵ These five dhammas have two kinds of sequel here and now. Herein, how has the venerable Nigaṇṭhas' faith, how has their preference, how has their (oral) tradition, how has their arguing upon evidence, how has their liking to ponder upon views, been as regards the master in the past?" Saying thus, bhikkhus, I find no reasonable defence among the Nigaṇṭhas.

12. 'Again, bhikkhus, I say to the Nigaṇṭhas: "How do you conceive this, friend Nigaṇṭhas, when there is intense striving, intense endeavour, do you then feel painful, racking, piercing feelings due to intense striving; but when there is no intense striving, no intense endeavour, do you then feel no painful, racking, piercing feelings due to intense striving?"'

'When there is intense striving, friend Gotama, intense endeavour, then we feel painful, racking, piercing feelings due to intense striving, but when there is no intense striving, no intense endeavour, then we feel no painful, racking, piercing feelings due to intense striving.'

13 'So it seems, friend Nigaṇṭhas, that when there is intense striving . . . piercing feelings due to intense striving; but when there is no intense striving, no painful, racking, piercing feelings due to intense striving. That being so, it cannot be fitting for the venerable Nigaṇṭhas to declare: "Whatever this person feels, whether pleasure or pain or neither-pain-nor-pleasure, all that is caused by whatever was done in the past.⁷ So by annihilating with penance past evil kammās, and by doing no fresh evil kammās, there will be no consequence in the future. With no consequence in the future there is exhaustion of kammās. With the exhaustion

5. These five are a touchstone for one's views. They are introduced here since the Jains have said that Nātaputta's teachings were their preference (2nd of the five) and to their liking (last of the five).

6. This refers to Nātaputta's teaching "you have done evil kammās in the past"—have the Nigaṇṭhas examined his teaching to find out whether it is factual or not factual in the light of these five? There is no "reasonable defence" among them because they have accepted the teachings, instead of critically examining them.

7. It is obvious that the pain experienced originates not from the past but from present actions (such as continuous standing).

of kmmas there is exhaustion of suffering, with the exhaustion of suffering there is exhaustion of feeling, with the exhaustion of feeling all suffering will be used up.”

14. ‘If, friend Nigaṇṭhas, when there was intense striving, intense endeavour, then painful, racking, piercing feelings due to intense striving were (not) present, and when there was no intense striving, no intense endeavour, then painful, racking, piercing feelings due to intense striving were present, that being so, it might be fitting for the venerable Nigaṇṭhas to declare: “Whatever this person feels . . . all suffering will be used up.”’

15. ‘But because, friend Nigaṇṭhas, when there is intense striving, intense endeavour, then you feel painful, racking, piercing feelings due to intense striving, but when there is no intense striving, no intense endeavour, then you do not feel painful, racking, piercing feelings due to intense striving, you are (therefore) feeling only the painful, racking, piercing feelings of your self-imposed striving, and it is through ignorance, unknowing, and delusion, that you mistake it thus: “Whatever this person feels . . . all suffering will be used up.”’

‘Saying thus, bhikkhus, I find no reasonable defence among the Nigaṇṭhas.

16. ‘Again, bhikkhus, I say to the Nigaṇṭhas: “How do you conceive this, friend Nigaṇṭhas, is it possible that kamma (with result) experienceable in this life can, through striving and endeavour, become (that with result) experienceable in life to come?”’

‘No, friend.’

‘But is it possible that kamma (with result) experienceable in life to come can, through striving and endeavour, become (that with result) experienceable in this life?’

‘No, friend.’

17. ‘How do you conceive this, friend Nigaṇṭhas, is it possible that kamma (with result) experienceable as pleasure can, through striving and endeavour, become (that with result) experienceable as pain?’

‘No, friend.’

‘But is it possible that kamma (with result) experienceable as pain can,

through striving and endeavour, become (that with result) experienceable as pleasure?’

‘No, friend.’

18. ‘How do you conceive this, friend Nigaṇṭhas, is it possible that kamma (with result) experienceable in a matured (personality) can, by striving and endeavour, become (that with result) experienceable in an unmatured (personality)?’

‘No, friend.’⁸

‘But is it possible that kamma (with result) experienceable in an unmatured (personality) can, by striving and endeavour, become (that with result) experienceable in a matured (personality)?’

‘No friend.’⁸

19. ‘How do you conceive this, friend Nigaṇṭhas, is it possible that kamma (with result) that is much experienceable can, through striving and endeavour, become (that with result) little experienceable?’

‘No, friend.’

‘But is it possible that kamma (with result) that is little experienceable can, through striving and endeavour, become (that with result) much experienceable?’

‘No, friend.’

20. ‘How do you conceive this, friend Nigaṇṭhas, is it possible that kamma (with result) that is experienceable can, through striving and endeavour, become (that with result) that is unexperienceable?’

‘No, friend.’

‘But is it possible that kamma (with result) that is unexperienceable can, through striving and endeavour, become (that with result) that is experienceable?’

‘No, friend.’

21. ‘So it seems, friend Nigaṇṭhas, that it is impossible that kamma experienceable here and now can, through striving and effort, become

8. The point of these two paragraphs is that the fruits of kamma which will be experienced by an old person, cannot, however one strives, be experienced when young, and the reverse of this. Such kinds of kamma only ripen (come to fruit or result) when conditions (of age in this case) are fulfilled.

kamma experienceable in after life; ... impossible that kamma experienceable in after life... kamma experienceable here and now, ... impossible that kamma experienceable as pleasure ... kamma experienceable as pain; ... impossible that kamma experienceable as pain ... kamma experienceable as pleasure; ... impossible that kamma experienceable in a matured (personality)... experienceable in an unmatured (personality); impossible that kamma experienceable in an unmatured (personality) ... experienceable in a matured (personality); ... impossible that kamma that is much experienceable ... little experienceable; ... impossible that kamma that is little experienceable ... much experienceable; impossible that kamma that is experienceable ... unexperienceable; that it is impossible that kamma that is unexperienceable can, through striving and endeavour, become experienceable. That being so, the venerable Nigaṇṭhas' striving is fruitless, their effort fruitless.'

22. 'So the Nigaṇṭhas say, bhikkhus. And when they say thus there are ten legitimate deductions from their assertions that provide grounds for censuring (them).

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by what was done in the past, then the Nigaṇṭhas surely would have been doers of kammās ill-done in the past, since they now feel such painful, racking, piercing feelings.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by being created by a Lord (Creator), then the Nigaṇṭhas surely would have been created by a bad Lord (Creator), since they now feel such painful, racking, piercing feelings.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by the state of destiny⁹, then the Nigaṇṭhas surely must have a bad destiny, since they now feel such painful, racking, piercing feelings.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by class (among the six classes of birth)¹⁰, then the Nigaṇṭhas surely would belong to a bad class, since they now feel such painful, racking, piercing feelings.

9. Elsewhere (M.60) translated 'coincidence'. 'Destiny' is a completely determined state about which beings can do nothing.

10. Mentioned in M 60. Explained in D.2.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by striving here and now, then the Nigaṇṭhas surely would strive badly here and now (in this life), since they now feel such painful, racking, piercing feelings.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by what was done in the past, then the Nigaṇṭhas are to be censured; if not, then the Nigaṇṭhas are to be censured.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by being created by a Lord (creator), then the Nigaṇṭhas are to be censured; if not, they are to be censured.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by the state of destiny, then the Nigaṇṭhas are to be censured; if not, they are to be censured.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by class, then the Nigaṇṭhas are to be censured; if not, they are to be censured.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by striving here and now, then the Nigaṇṭhas are to be censured; if not, they are to be censured.

'So say the Nigaṇṭhas, bhikkhus. And when they say thus there are ten legitimate deductions from their assertions that provide grounds for censuring (them).

'So their striving is fruitless, their endeavour fruitless.

23. 'And how is striving fruitful, bhikkhus, how is endeavour fruitful?

'Here, bhikkhus, when a bhikkhu is not overwhelmed by suffering¹¹ he does not overwhelm himself with suffering; and he does not give up pleasure which accords with Dhamma yet he is not infatuated with the pleasure. He knows thus: "When I make an effort of will, there is fading away of this (particular) source of suffering in me owing to the effort of will; but when I look on with equanimity, there is fading away of this (particular) source of suffering in me while I develop equanimity."

'He makes an effort of will in respect of that particular source of suffering of which, when he makes an effort of will, there is fading away

11. The translator also has 'pain' here which fits better. A bhikkhu, unlike the Nigaṇṭhas, does not give pain to his body so that he cannot handle the situation.

in him owing to the effort of will; but he develops equanimity in respect of that source of suffering of which, when he looks on it with equanimity, there is fading away in him while he develops equanimity

‘When he makes an effort of will there is fading away of such and such a source of suffering owing to the effort of will. Thus that suffering is used up in him. When he looks on with equanimity, there is fading away of such and such a source of suffering while he develops equanimity: thus that suffering is used up in him.

24. ‘Suppose, bhikkhus, a man lusted after a woman with his mind taken up by intense desire and intense passion, and he saw that woman standing with another man, chatting, joking and laughing, what do you think, bhikkhus, would sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair arise in that man when he saw the woman standing with another man, chatting, joking and laughing?’

‘Yes, venerable sir. Why is that? Because the man lusted after the woman with his mind taken up by intense desire and intense passion, that is why sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair would arise in the man when he saw the woman standing with another man, chatting, joking and laughing.’

25. ‘Then, bhikkhus, the man thought: “I lust after this woman with my mind taken up by intense desire and intense passion, and sorrow and lamentation, grief and despair arise in me when I see that woman standing with another man, chatting, joking and laughing. What if I abandoned desire and lust for that woman?” He did so and on another occasion he saw that woman standing with another man, chatting, joking and laughing. What do you think, bhikkhus, would sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair arise in the man when he saw the woman standing with another man . . .?’

‘No, venerable sir. Why is that? Because the man was without lust for the woman . . . chatting, joking and laughing.’

26. ‘So too, bhikkhus, when a bhikkhu is not overwhelmed by suffering, he does not overwhelm himself with suffering; and he does not give up pleasure which accords with Dhamma yet he is not infatuated with that

pleasure... (as in para. 23 above up to)... thus that suffering is used up in him.

'Thus the striving is fruitful, the effort fruitful.

27. 'Again bhikkhus, a bhikkhu considers thus: "According as I live pleasantly unprofitable dhammas increase in me and profitable dhammas diminish; but when I exert myself in what is painful, unprofitable dhammas diminish in me, and profitable dhammas increase. What if I exerted myself in what is painful?"¹²

'He exerts himself in what is painful. When he does so, unprofitable dhammas diminish in him and profitable dhammas increase. At a later time he does not exert himself in what is painful. Why is that? The aim for which he exerted himself in what is painful has been achieved; that is why at a later time he does not exert himself in what is painful.

28. 'Suppose, bhikkhus, a fletcher were warming and heating an arrow shaft between two flames, and making it straight and workable: as soon as the fletcher's arrow shaft had been warmed and heated between two flames and had been made straight and workable, then at a later time the fletcher would not (again) warm and heat the arrow shaft and make it straight and workable.

29. 'So too, a bhikkhu considers thus: "According as I live pleasantly... (as in para. 27 above)... "he does not exert himself in what is painful.

'Thus too, striving is fruitful, endeavour fruitful.

30-38. 'Again, bhikkhus, here a Tathāgata appears in the world... (as in Sutta 27, para. 13-21)... purifies mind from uncertainty.

39. 'Having abandoned these five hindrances, defilements of the mind that weaken understanding, secluded from sense desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas, he enters upon the first jhāna... (as in Sutta 4, para. 23)... born of seclusion.

12. For instance, in the Austere Practices (having 3 robes only, living at the root of a tree, eating once day, never lying down, etc.), see Ch. II of "Path of Purification". Fasting for a few days, not sleeping at night, can also be included here. There is also the pain from long stretches of sitting and walking meditation.

'Thus too, striving is fruitful, endeavour fruitful.

40. 'Again, with the stilling of initial and sustained application . . . second jhāna . . . born of concentration.

'Thus too, striving is fruitful, endeavour fruitful.

41. 'Again, with the fading as well of happiness . . . third jhāna . . . "He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful."

'Thus too, striving is fruitful, endeavour fruitful.

42. 'With the abandoning of (bodily) pleasure and pain . . . fourth jhāna . . . and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.

'Thus too, striving is fruitful, endeavour fruitful.

43. 'When his concentrated mind is thus quite purified . . . he directs, he inclines the mind to knowledge of the recollection of past life . . . thus with details and particulars he recollects his manifold past life.

'Thus too, striving is fruitful, endeavour fruitful.

44. 'When his concentrated mind is thus quite purified . . . he directs, he inclines his mind to the knowledge of the passing away and reappearance of beings . . . he understands how beings pass on according to their kammās.

'Thus too, striving is fruitful, endeavour fruitful.

45. 'When his concentrated mind is thus quite purified . . . he directs, he inclines his mind to knowledge of exhaustion of taints . . . (as in Sutta 4, para. 31) . . . "This is that way leading to the cessation of taints."

46. 'Knowing thus, seeing thus, his mind is liberated from the taint of sensual desire, from the taint of being and from the taint of ignorance. When liberated, there is the knowledge: "It is liberated". He understands: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived, what can be done is done, there is no more of this to come."

'Thus too, striving is fruitful, endeavour fruitful.

47. 'So the Tathāgata says, bhikkhus. And when the Tathāgata says thus, there are ten legitimate grounds for commending him.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by what was done in the past, then the Tathāgata surely would have been a doer of deeds well done in the past, since he now feels such taintless pleasant feelings.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by being created by a Lord (Creator), then the Tathāgata surely would have been created by an auspicious Lord (Creator), since he now feels such taintless pleasant feelings.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by the state of destiny, then the Tathāgata surely would have a good destiny, since he now feels such taintless pleasant feelings.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by class (among the six classes of birth), then the Tathāgata surely would have a good class, since he now feels such taintless pleasant feelings.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by striving here and now, then the Tathāgata would surely strive well here and now, since he now feels such taintless pleasant feelings.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by what was done in the past, then the Tathāgata is to be commended; if not, then the Tathāgata is to be commended.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by being created by a Lord (Creator), then the Tathāgata is to be commended; if not, then the Tathāgata is to be commended.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by the state of destiny, then the Tathāgata is to be commended; if not, then the Tathāgata is to be commended.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by class, then the Tathāgata is to be commended; if not, then the Tathāgata is to be commended.

'If the pleasure and pain that beings feel were caused by striving here and now, then the Tathāgata is to be commended; if not, the Tathāgata is to be commended.

'So the Tathāgata says, bhikkhus. And when the Tathāgata says thus, there are these ten legitimate grounds for commending him.'

This was what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied and

delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 7 "pulled out". P.T.S. Ed. here has *abbaheyya* but *abbaheyya* in parallel passage at M.ii. 257. The Siamese readings are different. None of the versions is in the P.T.S. Dict.

para. 11. For the "five dhammas" cf. Sutta 95 (ii, 170), A. i, 189. For '*ditṭhinijjhānakhanti*—a liking to ponder upon views' cf. M.i. 133 (*nijjhānam khamati*), and M.i. 480; ii, 173 '*dhammanijjhānakhanti*'. P.T.S. gives inconsistent and incorrect renderings severally under *ditṭhi*, *khamati* and *nijjhāna*. The meaning of this statement is made clear in Sutta 95, para. 14: (and see Notes to that Sutta).

para. 12. The Siamese edition reads here and throughout as follows:

"*yasmim vo samaye tibbo opakkamo hoti tibban padhānan tibbā tasmim samaye opakkamikā dukkhā tippā kātukā vedana vediyatha*". The distinction between *tibba* ("intense") and *tippa* ("racking") seems helpful.

para. 14. The sense seems to need the negative "were not present (*na tittṭheyya*) but it is not in the Siamese or P.T.S. Edns.

para. 24 "*apekka*" as "interest" or "passion" is not in this sense in the P.T.S. Dict.

One or two misprints in P.T.S. have been corrected from the Siamese Edn.

Other Suttas dealing with the Jains: M. 14, 56, 58, 104.

Magandiya Sutta To Magandiya

Introduction

The variety of wandering religious teachers in Jambudipa during the Buddha-time can be seen from many Suttas in this selection. Here is another of them, Māgandiya, who is a materialist apparently devoted to sensual pleasure. He deplures seeing the grass bed spread for the Buddha 'that wrecker of being, Master Gotama'. When they meet, the Buddha makes him explain what he means by the phrase 'wrecker of being'. Māgandiya, however, cannot answer the Buddha when he speaks of the subtler happiness enjoyed by those who have given up attachment to sense pleasures. The gods do not envy human beings their pleasures for they have their own which are more subtle. Then comes the powerful simile of the leper used to illustrate the same point. This is used several times in the course of this Sutta in connection with sensual desires. The Buddha points out with the simile of the king or king's minister that a person will never be able to still the mind while indulging freely in sensual desires. The Buddha then utters a stanza which he must have known was also part of the lore of the wanderers but Māgandiya is quite unable to explain what is 'health' and 'Nibbāna'. As a materialist he reckons 'health' means the body's well-being while absence of sickness in the body is according to him, Nibbāna. At this point the Buddha speaks the simile of the man born blind who is just as deceived by his dirty old cloth as is Māgandiya with his ideas of health and Nibbāna. Eventually Māgandiya understands the right way both to regard the body and to train the mind. He becomes a bhikkhu and later, through his diligence, attains Arahantship.

The Sutta (75)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living in the country of the Kurus—there is a town of theirs called Kammāssadamma—on a spread of grass in the fire chamber of a divine belonging to the Bhāradvāja-lineage.

2. Then when it was morning the Blessed One dressed, and taking his bowl and (outer) robe, he went into Kammāssadamma for alms. When he had wandered for alms in Kammāssadamma and had returned from his alms-round after the meal, he went to a certain grove for the day's abiding, and he went into the grove and sat down at the root of a tree.

3. Then the wanderer Māgandiya, who was walking and wandering for exercise, went to the Bhāradvāja-lineage divine's fire chamber, where he saw a spread of grass made ready. When he saw it, he asked the divine: 'Whose is this spread of grass prepared in Master Bhāradvāja's fire chamber? It seems like a monk's bed.'

4. 'Master Māgandiya, there is a monk called Gotama, a son of the Sakyans who went forth from a Sakyan clan; a good report (of him) has been spread to this effect: That Blessed One is such since he is Arahant, Fully Enlightened, Perfect in true knowledge and conduct, sublime, knower of worlds, incomparable leader of men to be tamed, teacher of gods and men, enlightened, blessed. This bed is made ready for that Worthy Gotama.'

5. 'Indeed, Master Bhāradvāja, it is an ill sight we see, when we see a bed made ready for that wrecker of being,¹ Master Gotama.'

6. 'Mind your speech, Māgandiya, mind your speech! There are many wise warrior-nobles, wise divines, wise householders and wise monks, who have full confidence in Master Gotama, and have been disciplined (=led away) in profitable dhammas in the true way of the Noble Ones.'

7. 'Master Bhāradvāja, even if we saw that Master Gotama face to

1. See para. 10, also; brahmins made much of having sons, while the Buddha led a celibate life after his renunciation, therefore Māgandiya accuses him as a 'wrecker of being'.

face, we would tell him to his face: "The monk Gotama is a wrecker of being." Why is that? Because that is treated of in our Scriptural Discourses.'

'If Master Māgandiya has no objection I might tell that to Master Gotama.'

'Then let Master Bhāradvāja not worry (about my minding my speech); let him tell him just what I have said.'

8. The Blessed One heard with the heavenly ear, which is purified and surpasses the human, this conversation between the Bhāradvāja-lineage divine and the wanderer Māgandiya. Then when it was evening he rose from meditation and went to the divine's fire chamber and sat down on the spread of grass. Then the divine of the Bhāradvāja-lineage went to him and exchanged greetings with him, and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, the Blessed One asked him: 'Bhāradvāja, did you have some conversation with the wanderer Māgandiya about this spread of grass?'

When this was said the divine was awestruck and his hair stood on end. He said: 'We wanted to tell Master Gotama about that, but Master Gotama has forestalled us.'

9. But their talk together was left unfinished, for then the wanderer Māgandiya, who was walking and wandering for exercise came to the Blessed One in the Bhāradvāja-lineage divine's fire chamber. He exchanged greetings with him and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, the Blessed One said to him:

10. 'Māgandiya, the eye delights in forms, takes delight in forms, is gladdened by forms; that is tamed in a Tathāgata, guarded, protected, restrained, and he teaches the Dhamma for its restraint. Was it with reference to that you said: "The monk Gotama is a wrecker of being"?''

'It was with reference to that, Master Gotama, that I said: "The monk Gotama is a wrecker of being." Why is that? Because that is treated of in our Scriptural Discourses.'

'The ear delights in sound . . .

'The nose delights in odours . . .

'The tongue delights in flavours ...

'The body delights in tangibles ...

'The mind delights in dhammas ...

'... Because that is treated of in our Scriptural Discourses.'

11. 'How do you conceive this, Māgandiya, here someone has formerly enjoyed himself with forms cognizable by the eye that were wished-for, desired, agreeable and likeable, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust; and on another occasion, having known as they actually are, the origin, the disappearance, the gratification, the danger and the escape in the case of forms, he abandoned craving for forms, he removed fever for forms, and he abode without thirst and with mind stilled in himself. What should be said of him, Māgandiya?'²

'Nothing, Master Gotama.'

'How do you conceive this, Māgandiya, here someone has formerly enjoyed himself with sounds cognizable by the ear ...

'... with odours cognizable by the nose ...

'... with flavours cognizable by the tongue ...

'... with tangibles cognizable by the body that were wished-for, desired, agreeable and likeable, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust; and on another occasion, having known as they actually are, the origin, the disappearance, the gratification, the danger and the escape in the case of tangibles, he abandoned craving for tangibles, he removed fever for tangibles, and he abode without thirst and with mind stilled in himself. What should be said of him, Māgandiya?'

'Nothing, Master Gotama.'

12. 'Māgandiya, formerly when I lived the home life, I was furnished and invested with the five cords of sensual desire and I enjoyed myself with forms cognizable by the eye that are wished-for, desired, agreeable and likeable, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust. I enjoyed myself with sounds cognizable by the ear ... with odours cognizable by the nose ... with flavours cognizable by the tongue ... with tangibles cognizable by the body ... provocative of lust.

2. That is, should he be called a 'wrecker of being' who is characterized by a negative attitude to the senses, or a wise man?

13. 'I had three palaces, one for the Rains, one for the Winter and one for the Summer. I (lived) in the Rains palace for the four months of the Rains enjoying myself with musicians with no men among them and I did not go down to the lower palace.

14. 'On another occasion, having known the origin, the disappearance, the gratification, the danger and the escape in the case of sensual desires, I abandoned craving for sensual desires, I removed fever for sensual desires, and I abode without thirst and with mind stilled in myself. I see other beings not without lust for sensual desires, devoured by craving for sensual desires, burning with fever for sensual desires, pursuing sensual desires. I do not envy them, nor do I delight in that. Why is that? Because I delight in such delight as is quite apart from sensual desires, apart from unprofitable dhammas and on the contrary attains to heavenly pleasure; I do not envy what I have abandoned, nor do I delight in that.

15-17. 'Suppose a householder's son was rich with great wealth and property and being furnished and invested with the five cords of sensual desire, he enjoyed them—forms cognizable by the eye that are wished-for . . . sounds cognizable by the ear . . . odours cognizable by the nose . . . flavours cognizable by the tongue . . . tangibles cognizable by the body that are wished-for, desired, agreeable and likeable, connected with sensual desire and provocative of lust—and after having been well conducted in body, speech and mind, on the dissolution of the body, after death, he reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven in the retinue of the Gods of the Thirty-three; and there, surrounded by a crowd of nymphs in the Grove of Delight (Nandana), he was furnished and invested with the five cords of heavenly sensual desires and enjoyed (them); and suppose he saw a householder or a householder's son furnished and invested with the five cords of sensual desire and enjoying (them); how do you conceive this, Māgandiya, would that son of the gods surrounded by a crowd of nymphs in the Grove of Delight, furnished and invested with the five cords of heavenly sensual desire and enjoying (them) envy the householder the five cords of human sensual desires, or would he turn towards human sensual desires?'

'No, Master Gotama. Why not? Because heavenly sensual desires are more advanced and superior in comparison with human sensual desires.'

'So too, Māgandiya, formerly when I lived the home life... (repeat para. 12 and 14)... I do not envy what I have abandoned, nor do I delight in that.'

18-20. 'Suppose a man who was a leper with sores and abscesses on his limbs, being devoured by worms and scratching the scabs off his wounds' openings with his nails, was cauterizing his body with a burning ember, and then his friends and companions, his relatives and kin, brought a surgeon physician to treat him, who made medicine for him by which he was delivered from the leprosy and was well and happy, independent, master of himself and able to go where he liked, and then he saw another man, a leper with sores and abscesses on his limbs, being devoured by worms and scratching the scabs off his wounds' openings with his nails, who was cauterizing his body with a burning ember; how do you conceive this, Māgandiya, would this man envy that leper for his burning ember or his use of medicine?'

'No, Master Gotama. Why is that? Because when there is sickness medicine has to be made, and when there is no sickness medicine does not have to be made.'

'So too, Māgandiya, formerly when I lived the home life... (repeat para. 12 and 14)... I do not envy what I have abandoned, nor do I delight in that.'

21. 'Suppose a man who was a leper with sores and abscesses on his limbs, being devoured by worms and scratching the scabs of his wounds' openings with his nails, was cauterizing his body with a burning ember, and then his friends and companions, his relatives and kin, brought a surgeon physician to treat him, who made medicine for him by which he was delivered from the leprosy and was well and happy, independent, his own master and able to go where he liked; and then two strong men seized him by both arms and dragged him towards a burning charcoal pit, how do you conceive this, Māgandiya, would that man fling his body this way and that?'

'Yes, Master Gotama. Why is that? Because such fire is indeed painful to touch and causes great burning and fever.'

'How do you conceive this, Māgandiya, is that fire painful to touch and the cause of great burning and fever only now, or was that fire painful to touch and the cause of great burning and fever also previously?'

'Master Gotama, that fire is painful to touch and the cause of great burning and fever now, and it was so previously. For when that man was a leper with sores and abscesses on his limbs, being devoured by worms and scratching the scabs off his wounds' openings with his nails, and cauterizing his body with a burning ember, his faculties were deadened and he had the mistaken perception of pleasure in what was actually painful to touch.'

'So too, Māgandiya, sensual desires in the past (were) painful to touch and caused great burning and fever, and sensual desires in the future (will be) painful to touch and cause great burning and fever, and sensual desires now are painful to touch and cause great burning and fever. Māgandiya, these beings who are not free from lust for sensual desires³, who are being devoured by cravings for sensual desires and are burning with fever for sensual desires, their faculties are deadened and they have the mistaken perception of pleasure in what is actually painful to touch.

22. 'Suppose a leper with sores and abscesses on his limbs, being devoured by worms and scratching the scabs off his wounds' openings with his nails, was cauterizing his body with a burning ember, but the more he did that, the fouler, the more evil-smelling and more infected his wounds' openings became, yet he found a certain measure of satisfaction and enjoyment in tickling his wounds' openings; so too, Māgandiya, beings who are not free from lust for sensual desires, who are being devoured by cravings for sensual desires and burning with fever for sensual desires, still indulge in sensual desires; but the more such beings indulge in sensual desires the more their craving for sensual desires increases and the more their fever for sensual desires burns, yet they find a certain measure of satisfaction and enjoyment in dependence on sensual desires.

3. Remember that includes both desires in oneself and pleasurable sense objects exterior to oneself.

23. 'How do you conceive this, Māgandiya, have you ever seen or heard of a king or king's minister being furnished and invested with the five cords of sensual desire and enjoying (them), who was able, without abandoning craving for sensual desires, to abide free from thirst with a mind stilled in himself, or who is able or who will be able to do so?'

'No, Master Gotama.'

'Good, Māgandiya, I too have never seen or heard of a king or king's minister being furnished and invested with the five cords of sensual desire and enjoying (them), who was able, without abandoning craving for sensual desires, to abide free from thirst, with a mind stilled in himself, or who is able or who will be able to do so. On the contrary, any monks or divines who abode or abide or will abide free from thirst with mind stilled in themselves, have all known as it actually is, the origin, the disappearance, the gratification, the danger and the escape, in the case of sensual desires, and it is after abandoning craving for sensual desires and removing fever for sensual desires that they abode, or abide, free from thirst with mind stilled in themselves.'

24. Then at that point the Blessed One uttered this exclamation:

'The greatest (worldly) gain is health,
Nibbāna is the greatest bliss,
The Eightfold is the best of paths
For it leads safe to Deathlessness.'

25. When this was said, the Wanderer Māgandiya said: 'It is wonderful, Master Gotama, it is marvellous, how well that has been expressed by Master Gotama: "The greatest (worldly) gain is health"! We too have heard it said by former wanderers in the Teachers' tradition that: "The greatest (worldly) gain is health", and that agrees, Master Gotama.'

26. 'But, Māgandiya, when you heard it being said by former wanderers in the Teachers' tradition that: "The greatest (worldly) gain is health", what is that "health", what is that "Nibbāna"?''

When this was said, the wanderer Māgandiya rubbed his hand, (saying): 'This is that health, Master Gotama, this is that Nibbāna; for I am now healthy and happy and nothing afflicts me.'

27. 'Māgandiya, suppose there were a man born blind who saw no dark and light forms, or blue forms or yellow forms or red forms or pink forms, or what was even and uneven, or forms of stars, or the moon and sun, and he heard a man with good eyesight saying: "Oh sirs, genuine white cloth is fine when it is spotless and clean!" and he went in search of white (cloth); and then a man cheated him with a dirty, unbleached garment thus: "Good man, here is a fine white cloth for you, spotless and clean", and he accepted it and put it on, and he was satisfied when he had put it on and uttered words of satisfaction thus: "Oh sirs, genuine white cloth is fine when it is spotless and clean!" How do you conceive this, Māgandiya, would that man born blind have accepted that dirty unbleached garment and put it on and been satisfied when he had put it on, and uttered words of satisfaction thus: "Oh sirs, genuine white cloth is fine when it is spotless and clean!" knowing and seeing, or out of faith in the man with good eyesight?'

'Venerable sir, he would have done as he did unknowing and unseeing, out of faith in the man with good eyesight.'

'So too, Māgandiya, the wanderers of other sects are blind, eyeless and unknowing of health and unseeing of Nibbāna and yet they utter this stanza thus:

"The greatest (worldly) gain is health,
Nibbāna is the greatest bliss."

'This stanza was uttered by former Arahants who were Fully Enlightened, thus:

"The greatest (worldly) gain is health,
Nibbāna is the greatest bliss,
The Eightfold is the best of Paths
For it leads safe to Deathlessness."

Now it is current among ordinary men.

'Now as to this body, Māgandiya, a disease is what it is, a cancer is what it is, a dart is what it is, a calamity is what it is, an affliction is what it is: it is of this that you say: "This is that health, Master Gotama, this is that Nibbāna." There is no noble eyesight in you, Māgandiya, by means of which noble eyesight you might know health and see Nibbāna.'

28. 'I have confidence in Master Gotama thus: Master Gotama is capable of teaching me the Dhamma in such a way that I may come to know health and come to see Nibbāna.'

'Māgandiya, suppose there were a man born blind who saw no dark and light forms, or blue, yellow, red or pink forms, or what was even and uneven, or the forms of stars, or the moon and sun, and his friends and companions, his relatives and kin, brought a surgeon physician to treat him who might make a medicine on account of which his eyesight would not appear or be purified; how do you conceive this, Māgandiya, would that doctor reap weariness and disappointment?'

'Yes, Master Gotama.'

'So too, Māgandiya, were I to teach you the Dhamma thus: "This is that health, this is that Nibbāna", you might not know that health or see that Nibbāna, and that would be wearisome and a bother for me.'

29. 'I have confidence in Master Gotama thus: Master Gotama is capable of teaching me the Dhamma in such a way that I may come to see Nibbāna.'

'Māgandiya, suppose there were a man born blind, who saw no dark and light forms, or blue, yellow, red or pink forms, or what was even and uneven, or the forms of stars, or the moon and sun, and he heard a man with good eyesight saying: "Oh sirs, a genuine white cloth is fine when it is spotless and clean!" and he went in search of white (cloth); and then a man cheated him with a dirty unbleached garment thus: "Good man, here is a fine white cloth for you, spotless and clean", and he accepted it and put it on; then his friends and companions, his relatives and kin, brought a surgeon physician to treat him, who made a medicine—emetics and purges and ointments and counter-ointments and nasal treatment—and on account of that medicine his eyesight would appear and be purified, and with the appearing of his eyesight his desire and lust for that dirty unbleached garment would be abandoned, then he might burn with indignation and enmity for that man and might conceive how to kill him thus: "Sirs, I have long been tricked indeed, cheated and defrauded by this man with this dirty unbleached garment (saying:) 'Good man, here is a fine white cloth for you, spotless and clean'"; so too, Māgandiya, were I to teach you the Dhamma thus: "This is that health,

this is that Nibbāna”, you might know that health and see that Nibbāna, and with the appearing of your eyesight your desire and lust for the five aggregates affected by clinging might be abandoned; but perhaps you might (think:) “Sir, I have long been tricked indeed, cheated and defrauded by this mind: ‘I have been clinging just to form, I have been clinging just to feeling, I have been clinging just to perception, I have been clinging just to formations, I have been clinging just to consciousness. With my clinging as condition, being; with being as condition, birth; with birth as condition, ageing and death have positive being, and (also) sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair. That is how there is an origin to this whole mass of suffering.’”

30. ‘I have confidence in Master Gotama thus: Master Gotama is capable of teaching me the Dhamma in such a way that I may come to know health and come to see Nibbāna.’

‘Then, Māgandiya, frequent True Men. When you frequent True Men, you will hear the True Dhamma. When you hear the True Dhamma, you will put dhammas into practice that are in accordance with the True Dhamma. When you put dhammas into practice that are in accordance with the True Dhamma, you will know for yourself and see for yourself. When you know for yourself and see for yourself thus: “These are diseases, cancers and darts: diseases and cancers and darts cease here without remainder, with the cessation of my clinging, cessation of being; with the cessation of being, cessation of birth; with the cessation of birth, ageing and death cease, and (also) sorrow and lamentation, grief and despair: that is how there is a cessation to this whole mass of suffering.”’

31. When this was said, the wanderer Māgandiya said: ‘Magnificent, Master Gotama! Magnificent, Master Gotama! The Dhamma has been made clear in many ways by Master Gotama, as though he were righting the over-thrown, revealing the hidden, showing the way to one who was lost, holding up a lamp in the darkness for those with eyesight to see forms.

32. ‘I go to Master Gotama for refuge and to the Dhamma and to the Sangha of bhikkhus. I would receive the Going-forth under Master Gotama and the Full Admission.’

33. Māgandiya, one who belonged formerly to another sect... (as in Sutta 57, para. 17)... lives on probation for four months... A difference in persons has become known to me in this (probation).

'Venerable sir, if those who belonged formerly... I will live on probation four years... the Full Admission to the bhikkhu's state.'

34. The Wanderer Magandiya received the Going-forth under the Blessed One, and he received the Full Admission. And not long after his Full Admission, dwelling alone, withdrawn, diligent, ardent and self-controlled, the venerable Māgandiya by realization himself with direct knowledge here and now entered upon and abode in that supreme goal of the life divine for the sake of which clansmen rightly go forth from the home life into homelessness. He had direct knowledge thus: 'Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come.'

And the venerable Māgandiya became one of the Arahants.

Notes

para. 5. *Bhūnahu*—wrecker of being: whatever may be the etymology of this word, what it refers to here is shown by Māgandiya himself in para. 10. See Vis. pref. (Kosambi)

para. 7. *Telamasikatena sāhula-cīwarena*—dirty unbleached garment: *telamasikata* is not commented on.

Aggivacchagotta Sutta

Vacchagotta and Fire

Introduction

In our world, just as in the Buddha's days, there are millions of views, religious, political, nutritional, and so on. People, desiring another prop to the ego, cling to a view which fits their requirements—and so we get the various religious and political groups arising, each one with their view, which is of course the right one to the holders of it. Most people, therefore, are tangled in views (and there are even 'Buddhist views' too!). The Buddha was the only Teacher to have shown the way beyond belief by systematic and causal Dhamma practice so that one knows for oneself the truth of Dhamma. It is not surprising, then, that in this and other Suttas he points out the danger in views: 'the thicket of views, the wilderness of views, the contortion of views, the vacillation of views, the fetter of views. It is accompanied by suffering, by vexation, by despair, and by fever, and it does not lead to dispassion, to fading out, to cessation, to stillness, to direct knowledge, to full enlightenment, to Nibbāna; Vacchagotta is trying to pin down the Buddha with some definite view but the Buddha refuses to be confined in this way and indicates that the rise and fall of the five aggregates is what he has seen and thus been liberated from all tendencies to conceive views. Then Vacchagotta questions about an Arahant and where he 'reappears' (=is reborn) after death. The four questions he asks are really a repetition of four in the list of ten: 'After death a Tathāgata is . . . is not . . . both . . . neither?' To these questions about the Arahant the Buddha replies: 'The term "reappears" does not apply', and so on. The Arahant (or the Tathāgata) does not exist after death, nor not exist, nor both, nor neither! In fact, in words one cannot describe

properly an enlightened person (what is enlightened?) while he is living, so what can be done when his aggregates are dispersed and no longer grasped after at the time of death: 'A Tathāgata is liberated from reckonings in terms of consciousness, he is profound, immeasurable, as hard to fathom as the ocean...' The fire has *gone out* but where has *it gone*? No amount of words will solve this problem, only Dhamma-practice will lead to the solution. Meanwhile, it is worth remarking that some who say that in Theravāda the Buddha is viewed as extinct after death are proved wrong by this Sutta, while others who conceive Buddhas enthroned in their paradises and everlasting in their true nature, also come to grief here. This is because they hold to views about a subject which cannot be viewed (except by realization). Buddhas and Arahants are immeasurably greater than human concepts can delimit them.

The Sutta (72)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park.

2. Then Vacchagotta the Wanderer went to the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him and when the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he asked:

3. 'How is it, Master Gotama, "the world is eternal¹: only this is true and everything else is wrong"? Does Master Gotama hold this view?'

'Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "the world is eternal: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

4. 'How then, Master Gotama, "the world is not eternal: only this is true and everything else is wrong"? Does Master Gotama hold this view?'

1. The following views appear to be a questionnaire widely known and used in those days for getting to know the philosophical standpoint (=view, ditthi, of various teachers. See Sutta 63 where the Buddha calls these 'the undeclared questions'.

'Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "the world is not eternal: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

5. 'How is it, Master Gotama, "the world is finite: only this is true and everything else is wrong"? Does Master Gotama hold this view?'

'Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "the world is finite: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

6. 'How then, Master Gotama, "the world is infinite: only this is true and everything else is wrong"? Does Master Gotama hold this view?'

'Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "the world is infinite: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

7. 'How is it, Master Gotama, "the soul and the body are the same: only this is true and everything else is wrong"? Does Master Gotama hold this view?'

'Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "the soul and the body are the same: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

8. 'How then, Master Gotama, "the soul is one and the body another: only this is true and everything else is wrong"? Does Master Gotama hold this view?'

'Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "the soul is one and the body another: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

9. 'How is it, Master Gotama, "after death a Tathāgata is²: only this is true and everything else is wrong"? Does Master Gotama hold this view?'

'Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "after death a Tathāgata is: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

10. 'How then, Master Gotama, "after death a Tathāgata is not: only this is true and everything else is wrong"? Does Master Gotama hold this view?'

'Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "after death a Tathāgata is not: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

2. By the word 'Tathāgata', here used by a non-Buddhist, one should understand 'any person who is reckoned to have attained the ultimate goal'.

11. 'How then, Master Gotama, "after death a Tathāgata both is and is not: only this is true and everything else is wrong" ? Does Master Gotama hold this view ?'

'Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "after death a Tathāgata both is and is not: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

12. 'How then, Master Gotama, "after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not: only this is true and everything else is wrong" ? Does Master Gotama hold this view ?'

"Vaccha, I do not hold the view: "after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not: only this is true and everything else is wrong".'

13. 'How is it then, Master Gotama was asked each of these ten questions, he replied that he did not hold the view. What danger does Master Gotama see that he is altogether disassociated from each of these fields of view ?'

14. 'Vaccha, the field of view that "the world is eternal" is the thicket of views, the contortion of views, the vacillation of views, the fetter of views. It is accompanied by suffering, by vexation, by despair, and by fever, and it does not lead to dispassion, to fading out, to cessation, to stillness, to direct knowledge, to full enlightenment, to Nibbāna.

'The field of view that "the world is not eternal" . . .

' . . . "the world is finite" . . .

' . . . "the world is infinite" . . .

' . . . "the soul and the body are the same" . . .

' . . . "the soul is one and the body another" . . .

' . . . "after death a Tathāgata is" . . .

' . . . "after death a Tathāgata is not" . . .

' . . . "after death a Tathāgata both is and is not" . . .

' . . . "after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not" . . . it does not lead to . . . full enlightenment, to Nibbāna.'

'Seeing this danger I am thus altogether disassociated from each of these fields of view.'

15. 'Does Master Gotama have any field of view at all ?'

'Vaccha, "field of view" is a term with which a Tathāgata has nothing

to do. What is seen by a Tathāgata is this: "Such is form, such its origin, such its disappearance; such is feeling, such its origin, such its disappearance; such is perception, such its origin, such its disappearance; such are formations, such their origin, such their disappearance; such is consciousness, such its origin, such its disappearance." Because of that, I say, a Tathāgata is liberated with the exhaustion, fading out, cessation, giving up, and relinquishment of all conceits, all excogitations, all I-making and my-making and tendencies to conceits, and with not clinging to any of them.'

16. 'When a bhikkhu's mind is liberated thus, Master Gotama where does he reappear (after death)?'

'(The term) "reappears" does not apply, Vaccha.'

'Then he does not reappear, Master Gotama?'

'(The term) "does not reappear" does not apply, Vaccha.'

'Then he both reappears and does not reappear, Master Gotama?'

'(The term) "both reappears and does not reappear" does not apply, Vaccha.'

'Then he neither reappears nor does not reappear, Master Gotama?'

'(The term) "neither reappears nor does not reappear" does not apply, Vaccha.'

17. 'When Master Gotama was asked each of these four questions, he replied that they do not apply.

'Here, Master Gotama, I fall into unknowing, I fall into confusion, and what measure of confidence I had through Master Gotama's previous conversation has now vanished.'

18. 'Enough of this unknowing and this confusion of yours, Vaccha. This Dhamma is profound, hard to see and hard to discover. It is (the most) peaceful and superior (goal of all), unattainable by (mere) ratiocination, subtle and for the wise to experience. It is hard for you to know it when you belong to another view, another choice, another preference, whose training is different, whose teacher's doctrine is different. So I shall question you here in return, Vaccha. Answer as you choose. How do you conceive this, Vaccha: suppose a fire was burning before you, would you know "This fire is burning before me"?''

'I should, venerable sir.'

'If someone asked you thus, Vaccha: "What does this fire burning before you burn dependent on?" What would you answer, being asked thus?'

'Being asked thus, Master Gotama, I should answer thus: "This fire burning before me burns dependent on grass and sticks."'

'If that fire before you was extinguished, would you know thus: "This fire before me is extinguished"?''

'I should, venerable sir.'

'If someone asked you: "Which direction has that fire which is extinguished gone in: the east, west, north or south?" What would you answer, being asked thus?'

'That does not apply, Master Gotama. The fire burnt owing to the grass and sticks (it had to cling to) as fuel; when they are finished up and it has no nutriment because it is not nourished with any more, it is reckoned as "extinguished".'

19. 'So too, Vaccha, when describing a Tathāgata the form by which he could be described has been abandoned by a Tathāgata, cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, done away with, so that it is no more liable to future arising. A Tathāgata is liberated from reckoning in terms of form, Vaccha, he is profound, immeasurable, as hard to fathom as the ocean: (the term "re-)arises" does not apply, (the term) "does not arise" does not apply, (the term) "both arises and does not arise" does not apply, and (the term) "neither arises nor does not arise" does not apply. When describing a Tathāgata, the feeling . . . perception . . . formations . . . consciousness by which he could be described has been abandoned by a Tathāgata, cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, done away with, so that it is no more liable to future arising. A Tathāgata is liberated from reckonings in terms of consciousness, Vaccha, he is profound, immeasurable, as hard to fathom as the ocean: (the term "re-)arises" does not apply, (the term) "does not arise" does not apply, (the term) "both arises and does not arise" does not apply, and (the term) "neither arises nor does not arise" does not apply.'

20. When this was said the wanderer Vacchagotta said to the Blessed One: 'Master Gotama, suppose there were a great sāla tree not far from a village or town, and its impermanence wore away its branches and

foliage and wore away its bark and wore away its sapwood, so that on another occasion, being divested of branches and foliage, divested of bark, and divested of sapwood, it became pure, consisted purely of heartwood, so too, this discourse of Master Gotama's is divested of branches and foliage, divested of bark, and divested of sapwood, and consists purely of heartwood.

21-22. 'Magnificent, Master Gotama! . . . I go to Master Gotama for refuge . . . (as Sutta 4, para. 36-7) . . . as a follower who has gone to him for refuge for life.'

Notes

para. 17. *ahu*—was: not in P.T.S. Dict; see also M.ii, 51.

para. 18. *upādāna*—fuel: the same word is used for the fuel of a fire and for the 'clinging' of Dependent Origination (See Sutta 11, para. 16). Also note the use of *āhāra* (nutriment) for a fire here, with which cf. the Fire simile at Sutta 38, para. 9, and nutriment: Sutta 38, para. 10 and 16.

Culamalunkya Sutta To Malunkyaputta-I

Introduction

The bhikkhu who has given his name to this Sutta became dissatisfied with the Buddha's Teaching because he did not know where the Buddha stood with regard to the various views mentioned below. It appears that this list of views was a well-known summary of philosophical positions from the answers to which one could find out where particular religious teachers had taken their stand. The Buddha differs from them as he has not taken a stand upon any doctrine which is incapable of verification in this very life. For this reason, all 'views' (beliefs, theories, doctrines, dogmas) based ultimately on belief in the existence of self-soul, have been rejected by him and find no place in his teaching. All these views can never be resolved, can never be verified, while in this short life we are continually suffering the dart of dukkha deeply embedded in our hearts. How can we trifle with this or that view ('my' view is right, 'yours' is wrong) when all the time the great question of dukkha remains unanswered, unfaced, evaded by recourse to more sensual pleasures and more evasive views? The Dhamma cannot be practised or attained while one adheres to one of these views—or the many others not mentioned here. So, those words of the Buddha should be remembered: 'Remember what is undeclared by me as undeclared, and remember what is declared by me as declared.' Those ten undeclared views are an impediment to Dhamma practice, while what is declared—the Four Noble Truths—are 'connected with welfare, belong to the principles of the life divine, lead to dispassion, to fading out, to cessation, to peace, to direct knowledge, to full enlightenment, to Nibbāna.'

The Sutta (63)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvattthi in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park.

2. Then while the venerable Mālunkyaṇḍita was alone in meditation the following thought arose in his mind:

3. 'There are these fields of views undeclared by the Blessed One, set aside and avoided by him, namely: "The world¹ is eternal" and "the world is not eternal" and "the world is finite" and "the world is infinite" and "the soul is the same as the body" and "the soul is one and the body another" and "after death a Tathāgata is" and "after death a Tathāgata is not" and "after death a Tathāgata both is and is not" and "after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not". The Blessed One does not declare these to me, and it is not to my preference and liking² that he does not declare them to me, so I shall go to the Blessed One and ask him the meaning of this. If he declares for any one of these statements, I will live the life divine under him; if he does not, I shall forsake the training and revert to what I abandoned.'

4. Then when it was evening, the venerable Mālunkyaṇḍita rose from meditation, and went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side. When he had done so, he told the Blessed One what he had thought, and he added:

5. 'If the Blessed One knows "the world is eternal", let the Blessed One declare to me "the world is eternal"; if the Blessed One knows "the world is not eternal", let the Blessed One declare to me "the world is not eternal"; if the Blessed One does not know either "the world is eternal" or "the world is not eternal", then it is straightforward for one who does not know and does not see (to say) "I do not know, I do not see".

'If the Blessed One knows "the world is finite" ... "the world is infinite" ...

1. As used here 'world' means the universe and even more than this as it comprises also the various sub-human and super-human states.

2. For preference and liking see Sutta 95 para. 14; 101, para. 11.

‘If the Blessed One knows “the soul is the same as the body” ... “the soul is one, the body another” ...

‘If the Blessed One knows “after death a Tathāgata is” ... “after death a Tathāgata is not” ...

‘If the Blessed One knows “after death a Tathāgata both is and is not”, let the Blessed One declare to me “after death a Tathāgata both is and is not”; if the Blessed One knows “after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not”, let the Blessed One declare to me “after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not”; if the Blessed One does not know either “after death a Tathāgata both is and is not” or “after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not”, then it is straightforward for one who does not know and does not see (to say) “I do not know, I do not see”.’

6. ‘How then, Mālunkya-putta, did I ever say to you: “Come, Mālunkya-putta, lead the life divine under me and I will declare to you “the world is eternal” or ... “after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not”?’

‘No, venerable sir.’

‘Did you ever tell me: “I will lead the life divine under the Blessed One, and the Blessed One will declare to me ‘the world is eternal’ or ... ‘after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not’?”’

‘No, venerable sir.’

‘That being so, misguided man, what are you and what are you forsaking?’

7. ‘If anyone should say thus: “I will not lead the life divine under the Blessed One till the Blessed One declares to me ‘the world is eternal’ or ... ‘after death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not’; for that would still remain undeclared by a Tathāgata and meanwhile that person would die.

‘Suppose a man were wounded by a dart thickly smeared with poison, and his friends and companions, his relatives and kin, brought a surgeon physician, and the man said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out the dart till I know the man who wounded me; whether he was warrior-noble caste or divine caste or burgess caste or artisan caste”, and he said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know the man who wounded me: what his name and his family are”, and he said:

“I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know the man who wounded me: whether he is tall or short or of medium height”, and he said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know the man who wounded me: whether he is dark or brown or fair-skinned”, and he said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know the man who wounded me: whether he lives in such a village or town or city”, and he said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know the bow that wounded me; whether it was a long bow or a cross bow”, and he said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know the bowstring that wounded me: whether it was fibre or reed or sinew or hemp or bark”, and he said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know the shaft that wounded me: whether it was wild or cultivated”, and he said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know with whose feathers the arrow was feathered: whether a vulture’s or a hawk’s or a kite’s or a peacock’s or a stork’s”, and he said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know the shaft that wounded me: with whose sinew it was bound, whether an ox’s or a buffalo’s or a lion’s or a monkey’s”, and he said: “I will not (have the surgeon) pull out this dart till I know the arrowhead that wounded me: whether it was hoof-tipped or curved or barbed or calfs-toothed or an ‘oleander’.” That would still not all be known to that man and meanwhile he would die. So too, Mālunkyaputta, if anyone should say thus: “I will not lead the life divine under the Blessed One till the Blessed One declares to me...” for that would still remain undeclared by a Tathāgata and meanwhile that person would die.

8. ‘There will never be any life divine while there is the view “the world is eternal”. And there will never be any life divine while there is the view “the word is not eternal”. And while there is the view “the world is eternal” and there is the view “the world is not eternal”, there is also birth and there is ageing and there is death and there are sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair, of which I describe the destruction here and now.

‘There will never be any life divine while there is the view “the world is finite”...“the world is infinite”...’

‘There will never be any life divine while there is the view “the soul is the same as the body” . . . “the soul is one and the body another” . . .

‘There will never be any life divine while there is the view “after death a Tathāgata is” . . . “after death a Tathāgata is not” . . .

‘There will never be any life divine while there is the view “after death a Tathāgata both is and is not”. There will never be any life divine while there is the view “after death a Tathagata neither is nor is not”. And while there is the view “after death a Tathagata both is and is not” and there is the view “after death a Tathagata neither is nor is not”, there is also birth and there is ageing and there is death and there are sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair, of which I describe the destruction here and now.

9. ‘Consequently, Mālunkya-putta, remember what is undeclared by me as undeclared, and remember what is declared by me as declared.

‘And what is undeclared by me? “The world is eternal” is undeclared by me. “The world is not eternal” is undeclared by me. “The world is finite” is undeclared by me. “The world is infinite” is undeclared by me. “The soul is the same as the body” is undeclared by me. “The soul is one and the body another” is undeclared by me. “After death a Tathāgata is” is undeclared by me. “After death a Tathāgata is not” is undeclared by me. “After death a Tathāgata both is and is not” is undeclared by me. “After death a Tathāgata neither is nor is not” is undeclared by me.

10. ‘Why is that undeclared by me? It is unconnected with welfare, it does not belong to the principles of the life divine, it does not lead to dispassion, to fading out, to cessation, to peace, to direct-knowledge, to full-enlightenment, to Nibbāna. That is why it is undeclared by me.

11. ‘What is declared by me? “This is suffering” is declared by me. “This is the origin of suffering” is declared by me. “This is the cessation of suffering” is declared by me, “This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering” is declared by me.

12. ‘Why is that declared by me? It is connected with welfare, it belongs to the principles of the life divine, it leads to dispassion, to fading out, to cessation, to peace, to direct-knowledge, to full-enlightenment, to Nib-

bāna. That is why it is declared by me.

13. 'Consequently, Mālunkyaputta, remember what is undeclared by me as undeclared, and remember what is declared by me as declared.'

That is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Mālunkyaputta was satisfied, and he delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 7. *Kaṅkā*—crow: see Sutta 54, para. 17, note.

Sithilahanu—stork: This is a guess since P.T.S. Dict. and Comy only say 'a kind of bird'. The name 'loose-jaw' could apply to certain kinds of storks or cranes whose beaks do not meet in the middle.

para. 7. renderings of *akka* (fibre), *sanṭha* (reed), *maruvā* (hemp), and *khīrapaṇṇa* (bark) are guesswork. There is no reliable guidance. It is difficult to see how P.T.S. Dict. can give a botanical Latin name to *khīrapaṇṇa* (lit., milk-leaf), since if that identification is based on Sanskrit, it is not reliable for Sutta Pāli.

para. 7: *roruva*—lion: P.T.S. Dict. says 'hart' but Comy, says *kāla-siha* (black lion).

para. 7. *khurappa*—hoof-tip: not in P.T.S. Dict. *Vekaṇḍa*—curved, *nārāca*—barbed, *vacchadanta*—lit., 'calf's tooth', *karavīrapaṇṇa*—lit., 'oleander-leaf', are guesses at the meanings of these descriptions of arrowhead shapes.

para: 10. *ādibrahmacariyaka*—belonging to the principles of the life divine.

Dighanakha Sutta To Dighanakha

Introduction

Annihilationist views ('after death I shall not exist') tend to be held by those who experience much dukkha in mind and body, that is, having felt pain they formulate views which desire non-existence. Their views are rooted in the craving not to be (or exist, vibhavaṭaṇhā). It appears that Dighanakha of this Sutta (Aggivessana was his clan-name) held his view for this reason—he would be the sort of character who was always 'agin the government'—whatever the government was or did. The Buddha shows him how a wise man thinks about holding any kind of view: that there will be a clash with those whose views are different and from that arise disputes, quarrels, and harmful words and bodily actions. Having seen this, a wise man abandons that view and does not adhere to any new view. The body too should be viewed with relinquishment so that one's life is not spent 'following the body'. Feelings of the three sorts arise and pass away and when the wise person has noticed this, through the contemplation of feelings, an aspect of mindfulness, he becomes dispassionate towards feelings and through dispassion is liberated. Then he disputes with none for he no longer takes up either one side or the other. He is not fooled by the ordinary use of language, as most people are when they use 'I' and 'mine' and 'self'; he just uses these words without attachment knowing that behind them there is no unchanging entity. He has abandoned everything which can be clung to. Hearing this Sutta, Dighanakha became a Stream-winner, while venerable Sāriputta Thera, who was standing behind the Buddha fanning him, attained Arahantship.

The Sutta (74)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Rājagaha in the Sūkarakhaṭṭha Cave.

2. Then the wanderer Dighanakha went to the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him. When the courteous and amiable talk was finished, he stood at one side, and he said: ‘Master Gotama, my theory and my view is this: “I have no liking for any”.’¹

‘This view of yours, Aggivessana, “I have no liking for any”, have you no liking for that too?’

‘Even if I had a liking for this view of mine, it would be all the same, Master Gotama, it would be all the same.’²

3. ‘Well, Aggivessana, there are plenty in the world who say: “It would be all the same, it would be all the same” and who yet do not abandon that view and do cling to some other view; and there are few in the world who say: “It would be all the same, it would be all the same” and yet do abandon that view and do not cling to some other view.

4. ‘Some monks and divines hold the theory and the view: “I have a liking for all.” Some monks and divines hold the theory and the view: “I have no liking for any.” Some monks and divines hold the theory and the view: “I have a liking for some, I have no liking for some.” The monks and divines among these whose theory and view is: “I have a liking for all” have a view that is close to lust, to bondage, to relishing, to acceptance, to clinging; the monks and divines among these whose theory and view is: “I have no liking for any” have a view that is close to non-lust, to non-bondage, to non-relishing, to non-acceptance, to non-clinging.’

1. By this view Dighanakha expresses his disapproval of all states of rebirth, a negative view no doubt rooted in hate (dosa). Comy. also says he is a materialist and nihilist. To restrict his view merely to views is to make him contradict himself at the outset, while to aver that the ‘all’ (see translator’s note at the conclusion of this Sutta) refers to everything that exists is too wide and vague.

2. That is, Dighanakha would adopt the same negative attitude even towards a view that he liked.

5. When this was said, the wanderer Dighanakha remarked: 'Master Gotama commends my field of views, Master Gotama recommends my field of views.'

'Aggivessana, monks and divines among these whose theory and view is: "I have a liking for some, I have no liking for some" have a view that, in what they have a liking for, is close to lust, bondage, relishing, acceptance, clinging, and, in what they have no liking for, is close to non-lust, non-bondage, non-relishing, non-acceptance, non-clinging.

6. 'Now a wise man among these monks and divines [whose theory and view is: "I gave a liking for all" considers thus: "If I obstinately misapprehend and insist upon the assertion of this my view: 'I have a liking for all' that 'only this is true; anything else is wrong', then I shall clash with the two others, both with the monk or divine whose theory and view is: 'I have no liking for any' and with the monk or divine whose theory and view is: 'I have a liking for some, I have no liking for some.' I shall clash with these two, and when there is a clash, there are disputes; when there are disputes, there are quarrels; when there are quarrels, there is harm." When he foresees for himself this clash, these disputes, these quarrels, and this harm, he abandons that view and does not cling to some other view. This is how there comes to be the abandoning of these views; this is how there comes to be the relinquishing of these views.

7. 'A wise man among these monks and divines whose theory and view is: "I have no liking for any" considers thus: "If I obstinately misapprehend and insist upon the assertion of this my view: 'I have no liking for any' that 'only this is true; anything else is wrong', then I shall clash with the two others, both with the monk or divine whose theory and view is: 'I have a liking for all' and with the monk or divine whose theory and view is: 'I have a liking for some, I have no liking for some.' I shall clash with these two, and when there is a clash, there are disputes . . ." When he sees for himself this clash, these disputes, these quarrels, this harm, he abandons that view and does not cling to some other view. This is how there comes to be the abandoning of these views, this is how there comes to be the relinquishing of these views.

8. 'A wise man among these monks and divines whose theory and view is: "I have a liking for some, I have no liking for some" considers thus: "If I obstinately misapprehend and insist upon the assertion of this my view: 'I have a liking for some, I have no liking for some' that 'only this is true; anything else is wrong', then I shall clash with the two others, both with the monk or divine whose theory and view is: 'I have a liking for all' and with the monk or divine whose theory and view is: 'I have no liking for any.' I shall clash with these two, and when there is a clash..." That is how there comes to be the relinquishing of these views.

9. 'Now, Aggivessana, this body that has form consists of the four great elements, it is procreated by a mother and father and built up out of boiled rice and bread, it has the nature of impermanence, of being worn and rubbed away, of dissolution and disintegration. It must be regarded as impermanent, as (liable to) suffering, as a disease, as a cancer, as a dart, as a calamity, as an affliction, as alien, as falling to pieces, as void, as not self. When a man regards it thus, he abandons his desire for the body, affection for the body, and his habit of treating the body as the basis for all his inferences.³

10. 'There are three kinds of feeling: pleasant feeling, painful feeling, neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling. On the occasion when a man feels pleasant feeling he does not feel painful feeling or neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling on that occasion: he feels only pleasant feeling on that occasion. On the occasion when he feels painful feeling he does not feel pleasant feeling or neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling on that occasion: he feels only painful feeling on that occasion. On the occasion when he feels neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling he does not feel pleasant feeling or painful feeling on that occasion: he feels only neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling on that occasion.

11. 'Pleasant feeling is impermanent, conditioned, dependently arisen and has the nature of exhaustion, of fall, of fading, and of ceasing. Also

3. Kāyanvayatā—'following the body' or 'being dependent on the body' are more concise translations. See translator's note also.

painful feeling is impermanent, conditioned, dependently arisen and has the nature of exhaustion, of fall, of fading, and of ceasing. Also neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling is impermanent, conditioned, dependently arisen and has the nature of exhaustion, of fall, of fading, and of ceasing.

12. 'When a well-taught noble disciple sees thus, he becomes dispassionate towards pleasant feeling, becomes dispassionate towards painful feeling, becomes dispassionate towards neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling; being dispassionate his lust fades away; with the fading of lust he is liberated. When (his mind is) liberated, then comes the knowledge: "It is liberated." He understands: "Birth is exhausted, the life divine has been lived, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this to come."

13. 'A bhikkhu whose mind is liberated thus, Aggivessana, sides with none, disputes with none, and he employs, though without misapprehending it, the speech currently used in the world.'

14. Now on that occasion the venerable Sāriputta was standing behind the Blessed One fanning him. Then he thought: 'The Blessed One, it seems, speaks of the abandoning of these various dhammas, having directly known them; the Sublime One speaks, it seems, of the relinquishing of these various dhammas, having directly known them.' As he considered thus his mind was liberated from taints through not clinging.

15. But in the Wanderer Dighanakha the spotless immaculate vision of the Dhamma arose: 'All that is subject to arising is subject to cessation.' Then he saw and reached and knew and fathomed the Dhamma; he crossed beyond uncertainty, had done with questioning, gained intrepidity and became independent of others in the Teacher's Dispensation.

16. He said: 'Magnificent, Master Gotama! Magnificent, Master Gotama! The Dhamma has been made clear in many ways by Master Gotama, as though he were righting the overthrown, revealing the hidden, showing the way to one who is lost, holding up a lamp in the darkness for those with eyes to see forms.

'I go to Master Gotama for refuge, and to the Dhamma and to the Sangha of bhikkhus. From today let Master Gotama remember me as a follower who has gone to him for refuge for life.'

Notes

para. 2. *Sabbam me na khamati*—I have no liking for any: There is no special Pāli word corresponding to the English 'any'. 'I have no liking for all' is ambiguous and might be understood as 'I have a liking for some'. The sense demands the English negative idiom with negative and 'any'.

para. 9. *kāyanwayatā*—cf. Sutta 36. para. 4. *kāyanwayanī cittaṃ* and *cittanvaḥ kāyo*. The term is difficult to translate. It seems to refer to what we are now accustomed to call the 'neo-realistic' or 'physiological-neurological' view of the 'body' and its 'sensations'. As such it is rejected here as an adequate view.

Sandaka Sutta To Sandaka

Introduction

Jambudipa, the Rose-apple Land (India) was full of 'lives divine'—various ways of living based on very diverse doctrines, some of which together with their practices were extreme and grotesque. Venerable Ānanda Thera here describes eight of them, four of which are 'not-divine-lives', that is, they do not promote purity of heart, not even pure morality. These four were the actual doctrines of teachers living in the Buddha-time and in commenting on them venerable Ānanda Thera has gently ridiculed them while at the same time showing what is right view in each case. They may be characterized as 'materialistic nihilism', 'the doctrine of no-kamma (good or evil)', 'the doctrine of no-reason (for purification or defilement)', and 'the doctrine of purification by trudging through the round of rebirths' (about which nothing can be done). It is easy to see that all such doctrines make for unrestrained indulgence in this life and for fatalistic acceptance too. People who follow them are not likely to develop in Dhamma. The fact that people still followed such teachers (and modern parallels could be found) and practised nakedness, shavenness, devotion to the squatting position and pulling out hair and beard—all painful things to do, shows how *extremist teachers can always be sure of followers*. There are always fools ready to follow even the most foolish doctrine—and some of those people will be educated and cultured. What they lack is the analytic approach to questions, the ability to treat their religions to the same kind of clear thinking as they use when solving a scientific problem. Following the first four come 'four kinds of life divine without consolation'. These four at least are reckoned as paths of practice but their fruits are meagre. First the Jain doctrine of an omniscient seer is politely mocked with a series of humorous incidents. It can be reckoned as 'without consolation' since everything happens deterministically—there is nothing one can do! The brah-

mins with their oral study of the Vedas are next. Little consolation can come from a teaching that may be true or false, well-remembered or ill. And the rationalist philosopher suffers from a similar disadvantage: his theses may be well or ill-reasoned. Not much consolation can be had of the last kind of 'eel-wriggling' teacher who is 'dense and confused' but cunning with words. All this is the negative section, so to speak, the clearing away of rubbish, before the Dhamma is taught. Venerable Ānanda Thera proceeds to do this step by step: restraint of the senses, abandonment of the five hindrances, the four jhānas, recollection of past lives, the knowledge of the passing away and reappearance of beings, the exhaustion of taints which is Arahantship. Sandaka is not yet satisfied. He wants to know what characterizes an Arahant. Would he indulge in sensual desires? (A question no doubt prompted by the behaviour of some non-Buddhists who claimed to be Arahant). The answer is that one attained to Arahantship is *incapable* of five things: intentionally killing, stealing, sexual intercourse, speaking falsehood, and laying up a store (of food, clothing, etc., as unenlightened people do). He cannot do any of these things because he has no craving left, no harmfulness and no untruthfulness. Further questions and answers follow after which Sandaka advises his own followers to become bhikkhus. But as he has been a teacher for so long he does not feel able to be a pupil again.

The Sutta (76)

1. Thus I heard:

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Kosambi in Ghosita's Park.

2. Now on that occasion the Wanderer Sandaka was staying in the Pīlakka-tree Cave with a large assembly of wanderers.

3. Then when it was evening, the venerable Ānanda rose from meditation, and he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Friends, let us go to the Devakātasobbha, the Rain Pool, to see the cave.'

'Yes, friend,' they replied. Then the venerable Ānanda went to the Rain Pool with a number of bhikkhus.

4. Now on that occasion the wanderer Sandaka was seated with a large assembly of wanderers who were shouting, very clamorous and noisy, talking many kinds of vulgar talk, such as talk of kings, robbers, ministers, armies, alarms, battles, food, drink, clothing, beds, garlands, perfumes, relatives, vehicles, villages, towns, cities, countries, women, heroes, streets, wells, the dead, trifles, the origin of the world, the origin of the sea, whether things are or are not.

The wanderer Sandaka saw the venerable Ānanda coming in the distance. Seeing him, he quieted his own assembly thus: 'Sirs, be quiet; sirs, make no noise. Here comes the monk Ānanda. If there are any disciples of the monk Gotama staying in Kosambi, this monk Ānanda is one of them. The venerable ones like quiet; they are disciplined in quiet, they commend quiet. Perhaps if he finds our assembly a quiet one, he will think to join us.'

Then the wanderers were silent.

5. The venerable Ānanda went to Sandaka the wanderer, who said to him: 'Come, Master Ānanda, welcome, Master Ānanda; it is long since Master Ānanda made an occasion to come here. Let Master Ānanda be seated; this seat is ready.'

The venerable Ānanda sat down on the seat prepared, and Sandaka the wanderer took another, lower, seat and sat down at one side. When he had done so, the venerable Ānanda asked him: 'For what talk are you gathered here now, Sandaka? And what was your talk meanwhile which was left unfinished?'

'Let that be, Master Ānanda, let the talk for which we are now gathered here be. Master Ānanda can well hear about that later. It would be good if a talk on the Dhamma in his own Teacher's doctrine occurred to Master Ānanda.'

'Then Sandaka, listen and attend carefully to what I shall say.'

'Yes, sir,' he replied. The venerable Ānanda said this:

6. 'Sandaka, these four ways of life that are no life divine have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened; and also these four kinds of life divine without consolation have been declared, wherein a wise man almost certainly would not live the life divine, or while living it, he would not succeed in the

Dhamma belonging to the true way¹ that is profitable.'

'But, Master Ānanda, what are those four ways of life that are no life divine declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man almost certainly would not live the life divine, or, while living it, he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable?'

7. 'Here, Sandaka, some teacher's theory and view is this: "There is nothing given, nothing offered, nothing sacrificed, no fruit or ripening of good and bad karmas, no this world, no other world, no mother, no father, no spontaneously (born) beings, no good and virtuous monks and divines that have themselves realized by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other world.² Man consists of four great elements. When he dies, earth returns and goes back to the body of earth, water returns and goes back to the body of water, fire returns and goes back to the body of fire, and air returns and goes back to the body of air, the faculties are transferred to space. (Four) men with the bier as fifth go with the corpse. The funeral orations last as far as the charnel ground. The bones whiten. Burnt offerings end with ashes. Giving is fools' doctrine. When anyone makes the assertion that there is (giving and the like), it is empty, false prating. Fools and wise men are alike cut off and annihilated with the dissolution of the body; after death they are not."

8. 'About this a wise man considers thus. "This good teacher has this theory and view: 'There is nothing given . . . after death they are not'. Now if this good teacher's words are true, then here (in this teaching) I have done (my duty) by not doing (it), here I have lived (the life divine) by not living (it); and both of us are exactly equal here (in this teaching), both are arrived at equality. But what I do not say is that both of us are cut off and annihilated with the dissolution of the body, that after death we shall not be. But this good teacher's nakedness, his shavenness, devotion to the squatting position and pulling out of hair and beard, are superfluous, since I, who live in a house crowded with children, using Benares sandalwood, wearing garlands, and unguents, accept-

1. This means the Path and Fruit attainments.

2. As far as this in Sutta 60.

ing gold and silver, shall reap exactly the same destination as this good teacher. What do I know and see that I should lead the life divine under this teacher?" So when he finds that this is no life divine, he consequently turns away and leaves it.

9. 'This is the first way of life that is no life divine declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man would certainly not live the life divine, or while living it he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.

10. 'Again, Sandaka here some teacher's theory and view is this: "When a man acts or has action done, when he mutilates or has mutilation done, when he tortures or has torturing done, when he inflicts sorrow, when he oppresses, when he threatens or causes threatening, when he slays living beings, takes what is not given, breaks open locks, raids for plunder, commits burglary, ambushes highways, goes with another's wife, utters falsehood—no evil is done for the doer. If a man with a razor-rimmed wheel makes the living beings on this earth into one mass of meat, into one heap of meat, there is no evil sourcing from it and no outcome of evil. If a man follows the Ganges' south bank killing and slaughtering, mutilating and having mutilation done, there is no evil sourcing from it and no outcome of evil. If a man follows the Ganges' north bank giving (gifts) and having (them) given, offering (sacrifices) and having them offered, then there is no merit sourcing from it and no outcome of merit. By giving, by training, by restraint, by speaking truth, there is no merit and no outcome of merit."

11. 'About this a wise man considers thus: "This good teacher has this theory and view: 'When a man acts . . . there is no merit and no outcome of merit.' If this good teacher's words are true, then here (in this teaching) I have done (my duty) by not doing (it), here I have lived (the life divine) by not living (it); and both of us are exactly equal here (in this teaching), both are arrived at equality. But what I do not say is that whatever both (of us) do, no evil is done. But this good teacher's nakedness . . . are superfluous . . ." So when he finds that this is no life divine, he consequently turns away and leaves it.

12. 'This is the second way of life that is no life divine declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man would certainly not live the life divine, or, while living it, he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.

13. 'Again, Sandaka, here some teacher's theory and view is this: "There is no reason, no condition, for beings' defilement; beings are defiled without reason or condition. There is no reason, no condition, for beings' purification; beings are purified without reason or condition. There is no power, no energy, no manly courage, no manly endurance; all creatures, all breathing things, all beings, all souls, are without mastery, power or energy; moulded by fate, coincidence and essence, they experience pleasure and pain in the six species."

14. 'About this a wise man considers thus: "This good teacher has this theory and view: "There is no reason . . . in the six species." If this good teacher's words are true, then here (in this teaching) I have done (my duty) by not doing (it), here I have lived (the life divine) by not living (it); and both of us are exactly equal here (in this teaching), both are arrived at equality. But what I do not say is that both (of us) are purified without reason or condition. But this good teacher's nakedness . . . are superfluous . . ." So when he finds this is no life divine, he consequently turns away and leaves it.

15. 'This is the third way of life that is no life divine declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man would certainly not live the life divine, or, while living it, he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.

16. 'Again, Sandaka, here some teacher's theory and view is this: "There are these seven bodies that are unmade, with no assignment made, uncreated, without a creator, barren, standing like mountain peaks, standing like pillars. They do not move or change or afflict each other. None is able (to arouse) pleasure or pain, or pleasure and pain, in another. What are the seven? They are the earth body, the water body, the fire body, the air body, pleasure, pain and soul as the seventh. These seven

bodies are unmade, with no assignment made, uncreated, without a creator, barren, standing like mountain peaks, standing like pillars. They do not move or change or afflict each other. None is able (to arouse) pleasure, pain, or pleasure and pain, in another. Herein, there is no killer, no slaughterer, no hearer, no maker of hearing, no cognizer, no intimator. Even those who cut off a head with a sharp knife do not deprive anyone of life, the knife merely passes through the space between the seven bodies. But there are these fourteen-hundred thousand principal kinds of generation, and sixty hundred kinds, and six hundred kinds; then five hundred kinds of kamma, and five kinds of kamma, and kamma and half kamma; then sixty-two ways, sixty-two aeons intervals (sub-aeons), six species, eight planes of man, forty-nine hundred kinds of livelihood, forty-nine hundred kinds of going-forth, forty-nine hundred abodes of serpents, twenty hundred faculties, thirty hundred hells, thirty-six elements of dust, seven percipient breeds, seven non-percipient breeds, seven sheathless breeds, seven kinds of gods, seven kinds of men, seven kinds of demons, seven lakes, seven knots, seven kinds of chasms, seven hundred kinds of chasms, seven kinds of dreams, seven hundred kinds of dreams, and there are eighty-four hundred-thousand great aeons wherein, by travelling and trudging through the round of rebirth fools and wise men both will make an end of suffering. 'By this virtue or duty or mortification or life divine I shall get unripened kamma to ripen or annihilate ripened kamma as it comes': there is none of that. Pleasure and pain are meted out. With the end of the round of rebirths there is no loss or increase, no improvement or worsening. Just as a ball of string when thrown goes as far as the string unwinds, so too, by travelling and trudging through the round of rebirths fools and wise men both will make an end of suffering."

17. 'About this a wise man considers thus: "This good teacher has this theory and view: 'There are these seven bodies . . . fools and wise men both will make an end of suffering.' If this good teacher's words are true, then here (in this teaching) I have done (my duty) by not doing (it), here I have lived (the life divine) by not living (it); and both of us are exactly equal here (in this teaching), both are arrived at equality. But what I do not say is that both of us will make an end of suffering by travelling and trudging through the round of rebirths. But this good

teacher's nakedness, his shavenness, devotion to the squatting position and pulling out hair and beard, are superfluous since I, who live in a house crowded with children, using Benares sandalwood, wearing garlands, scents and unguents, accepting gold and silver, shall reap exactly the same destination as this good teacher. What do I know and see that I should lead the life divine under this teacher?" So when he finds that this is no life divine, he consequently turns and leaves it.

18. 'This is fourth way of life that is no life divine declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man would certainly not live the life divine, or while living it he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.'

19. 'These are the four ways of life which are no life divine declared by the Blessed One . . . the true way that is profitable.'

20. 'It is wonderful, Master Ānanda, it is marvellous, how the four ways of life that are no life divine have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the life divine, or while living it he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable! But, Master Ānanda, what are those four kinds of life divine without consolation that have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not lead the life divine, or while living it he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable?'

21. 'Here, Sandaka, some omniscient, all-seeing teacher claims to have complete knowledge and vision thus: "Whether I am walking or standing or sleeping or waking, my knowledge and vision are continuously, unceasingly maintained." He enters an empty house, gets no alms-food, a dog bites him, he meets with a savage elephant, he meets with a Savage horse, he meets with a savage bull, he asks the name and surname of a woman and of a man, he asks the way to a village or town. When he is questioned: "How is this?"³ (he replies): "The empty house had to be entered by me, that is why I entered it. Alms-food had not to be got by me, that is why I did not get (it). There had to be a biting by a dog, that is why I was

3. That is, 'If you are omniscient, why did you ask?'

bitten. There had to be a meeting with a savage elephant... savage horse... savage bull... that is why I met with (it). There had to be an asking of a woman's and a man's name and surname, that is why I asked. There had to be an asking the way to a village or town, that I why I asked."⁴

22. 'About this a wise man considers thus: "This omniscient all-seeing good teacher claims to have complete knowledge and vision thus... There had to be an asking the way to a village or town, that is why I asked."

'So when he finds that this life divine is without consolation, he consequently turns away and leaves it.

23. 'This is the first life divine without consolation declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the life divine, or while living it, he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.

24. 'Again, Sandaka, here some teacher depends on (oral) tradition⁵, his truth is (oral) tradition,⁵ he teaches a Dhamma by (oral) tradition,⁵ by legends handed down, by what has come down in scriptures. But when a teacher depends on (oral) tradition and his truth is (oral) tradition, some is well remembered and some is ill remembered, and some is thus and some is otherwise⁶.

25. 'About this a wise man considers thus: "This good teacher depends on (oral) tradition... some is thus and some is otherwise."

'So when he finds that this life divine is without consolation, he consequently turns away and leaves it.

26. 'This is the second life divine without consolation... he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.

4. The whole paragraph parodies the Jains' determinism or fatalism.

5: Acquired by repeated hearing and handed down from teacher to pupil. Refers primarily to the Vedas of brahminical tradition which were said to be divinely inspired. MS. has 'hearsay' which is too vague.

6. That is, (a tradition) is (sometimes) true and (sometimes) false. See "Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge", p. 187.

27. 'Again, Sandaka, here a certain teacher is a rationalist, an enquirer. He teaches a Dhamma hammered out by reasoning, following a line of enquiry as it occurs to him. But when a teacher is a rationalist, an enquirer, some is well reasoned and some is ill reasoned, and some is thus and some is otherwise.'

28. 'About this a wise man considers thus: "This good teacher is a rationalist...some is thus and some is otherwise."

'So when he finds that this life divine is without consolation, he consequently turns away and leaves it.

29. 'This is the third life divine without consolation...he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.'

30. 'Again, Sandaka, here a certain teacher is dense and confused. Because he is dense and confused, when he is asked such and such a question he starts verbal wriggling, eel-wriggling: "I don't say it is like this. And I don't say it is like that. And I don't say it is otherwise. And I don't say it not so. And I don't say it not not so."

31. 'About this a wise man considers thus: "This good teacher is dense and confused... And I don't say it is not not so."

'So when he finds that this life divine is without consolation he consequently turns away leaves it.

32. 'This is the fourth life divine without consolation declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the life divine, or while living it, he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.'

33. 'These are the four kinds of life divine without consolation...he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.'

34. 'It is wonderful, Master Ānanda, it is marvellous, how the four kinds of life divine without consolation have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, Arahant and Fully Enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the life divine, or while living it, he would not succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that

is profitable !

‘But, Master Ānanda, what does he tell, what does he declare, where-in a wise man certainly would live the life divine, and while living it he would succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable?’

35-43. ‘Here, Sandaka, a Tathāgata appears in the world . . . (as in Sutta 27, paras. 13-21) . . . He declares this world . . . He teaches a Dhamma . . . A householder or householder’s son . . . homelessness . . . Being thus gone forth and possessing the bhikkhus’ training . . . On seeing a visible form with the eye . . . One who acts in full awareness . . . secluded resting-place . . . Abandoning covetousness . . . ill-will . . . lethargy and drowsiness . . . agitation and worry . . . uncertainty . . . he purifies the mind from uncertainty.

44. ‘Having thus abandoned these five hindrances, defilements of mind that weaken understanding, quite secluded from sensual desires, secluded from unprofitable dhammas he enters upon and abides in the first jhāna which is accompanied by initial application and sustained application, with happiness and (bodily) pleasure born of seclusion.

45. ‘When a wise man attains such sublime distinction under any teacher, he certainly would live the life divine under him, and living it, he would succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.

46. ‘Again, with the stilling of initial and sustained application . . . (as in Sutta 4, para. 24) . . . born of concentration.

47. ‘When a wise man attains such sublime distinction . . .

48. ‘Again with the fading as well of happiness . . . “He has a pleasant abiding who has equanimity and is mindful.”

49. ‘When a wise man attains such sublime distinction . . .

50. ‘Again, with the abandoing of (bodily) pleasure . . . and has purity of mindfulness due to equanimity.

51. ‘When a wise man attains such sublime distinction . . .

52. 'When his concentrated mind is thus purified, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection and become malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs, he inclines, his mind to the knowledge of recollection of past life... (as in Sutta 4, para. 27)... thus with details and particulars he recollects his manifold past life.

53. 'When a wise man attains such sublime distinction ...

54. 'When his concentrated mind is thus purified... he directs, he inclines, his mind to the knowledge of the passing away and reappearance of beings... (as in Sutta 4, para. 29)... thus with the heavenly eyesight which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees... how beings pass on according to their kammās.

55. 'When a wise man attains such sublime distinction ...

56. When his concentrated mind is thus purified... he directs, he inclines his mind to the knowledge of the exhaustion of taints... (as in Sutta 4, para. 31, Sutta 27, para. 34)... This is the way leading to the cessation of taints.

57. 'Knowing thus, seeing thus, his mind is liberated from the taint of sensual desire... (as in Sutta 27, para. 36)... There is no more of this to come.

58. 'When a wise man attains such sublime distinction under any teacher, he certainly would live the life divine under him, and living it, he would succeed in the Dhamma belonging to the true way that is profitable.'

59. 'But, Master Ānanda, when a bhikkhu is an Arahant with the taints exhausted and he has lived the life, done what was to be done, laid down the burden, reached the highest goal, destroyed the fetters of being, and through right knowledge is liberated, would he indulge in sensual desires?'

'Sandaka, when a bhikkhu is an Arahant with the taints exhausted... and through right knowledge is liberated, he is incapable of transgression in five instances. A bhikkhu whose taints are exhausted is incapable of purposely depriving a living being of life; he is incapable

of taking what is not given, in other words, stealing; he is incapable of indulging in sexual intercourse; he is incapable of knowingly speaking falsehood; he is incapable of indulging sensual desires, laying up a store as formerly in lay life. When a bhikkhu is an Arahant with taints exhausted, and has lived the life, done what was to be done, laid down the burden, reached the highest goal, destroyed the fetters of being, and through right knowledge is liberated, he is incapable of transgression in these five instances.'

60. 'But, Master Ānanda, when a bhikkhu is Arahant... and with right knowledge is liberated, whether he is walking or standing or sleeping or waking, are his knowledge and vision that his taints are exhausted continuously, unceasingly maintained?'

'As to that, Sandaka, I shall give you a simile, for some wise men understand by means of a simile the meaning of what is said. Suppose a man's hands and feet were cut off, does he, whether he is walking or standing or sleeping or waking, know: "My hands and feet are cut off", continuously, unceasingly, or does he know: "My hands and feet are cut off" when he reviews (the fact)?'

'The man, Master Ānanda, does not know: "My hands and feet are cut off" continuously, unceasingly. On the contrary, he knows: "My hands and feet are cut off" when he reviews (the fact).'

'So too, Sandaka, when a bhikkhu is an Arahant... and with right knowledge is liberated, whether he is walking or standing or sleeping or waking, his knowledge and vision that his taints are exhausted are not continuously and unceasingly maintained. On the contrary he knows: "My taints are exhausted" when he reviews (the fact).'

61. 'How many guides⁷ are there in this Dhamma and Discipline, Master Ananda?'

'There are not one hundred, Sandaka, nor two hundred, nor three hundred, nor four hundred, nor five hundred; there are indeed far more than that in this Dhamma and Discipline.'

'It is wonderful, Master, Ānanda, it is marvellous! There is no lauding one's own Dhamma and disparaging others' Dhamma and in the range

1. This includes not only the Arahats and other Nobles Ones, but also all those who are spiritually advanced in peace and insight.

of the Dhamma's teaching so many guides appear. But these Ājivaka ascetics, these mothers' dead sons,⁸ I mean Nanda Vaccha, Kisa Sankicca, and Makkhali Gosāla, laud themselves and disparage others.'

62. Then the Wanderer Sandaka addressed his own assembly: 'Go, sirs; the way of life under the monk Gotama is the life divine. It is not easy for us now to give up gain, honour and renown.'

That is how the Wanderer Sandaka exhorted his own assembly to the life divine under the Blessed One.

Notes

para. 4. *tiracchāna-kathā*—vulgar talk' is literally 'animal-talk'; 'beastly talk' is etymologically tempting but inaccurate in meaning, which is simply 'worldly talk' as the subjects show. *Itibhavābhavakathā*—whether things are or not': the meaning may be 'about all such kinds of being'.

para. 16. There are many problems in this para. But there is no need to go into the details. Some still await a solution.

para. 24. *Piṭaka-sampadā* is rendered by 'what has come down in scriptures'. The word 'scripture' suggests itself for '*Piṭaka*', but there were, perhaps, no scriptures then; or were there with the brahmins? For *piṭaka-sampadā* cf. A. i, 189. *sampadā* from *sampadāti* here?

The words *sussuta* and *dussuta* are from *su* and *dur* + *sata* (remembered). *Sata* in this active sense is not in the P.T.S. Dict., under *sata*, but see under *sarati* 2.

para. 60. The variant reading given has been adopted. That in the text would render thus:

"For this, Sandaka, I shall give you a simile... Suppose a man's hands and feet are cut off, whether he is walking, standing or sleeping his hands and feet are continuously, unceasingly cut off. Nevertheless, it is when he reviews (the fact) that he knows: 'My hands and feet are cut off.' So too, Sandaka, when a bhikkhu is an Arahant... and with right

8. The Ājivaka ascetics were reckoned 'mothers' dead sons' because of their lack of good conduct and training.

knowledge is liberated, whether he is walking or standing or sleeping or waking his taints are continuously, unceasingly exhausted. Nevertheless, it is when he reviews (the fact) that he knows: 'My taints are destroyed.'" (follows para. 61 here).

Pancattaya Sutta

The Five and Three

Introduction

A Sutta upon the complexities of views (theories, beliefs, dogmas) held by the many varieties of monks and brahmins in the Buddha's days. It is of interest to us because the Buddha shows how all such views have some basis in experience. They are not just arbitrary formulations of ideas but are stated in those various ways because of some meditational experience. Our times too are not lacking in such spiritually based views. The Buddha knew that all views are based on conditioned phenomena but he also knew the escape beyond all that: Nibbāna the Unconditioned. This escape was won by him out of the tangle of views about the future, the past, and the misinterpretation of present experience, for instance, thinking that some state of jhāna or identification of 'I' as the doer, is Nibbāna.

The Buddha clearly states (para. 16.) that apart from faith, preference, tradition, arguing upon evidence and a liking to ponder upon views, there is no way in which views like these can be verified. Even the knowledge on which those views are based 'proclaims the clinging that they have.' Clinging to views is one aspect of clinging which has to be cut away before Enlightenment is possible. But for most people 'clinging to views' is their religious creed (or their political one) and they cannot know Enlightenment while persisting in their clinging.

'The supreme state of peace that is unsurpassable' was discovered by the Buddha, by *not clinging* to the six bases (for sense-contact, eye . . . mind). But people cling not only to views as an aspect of the self or ego, but to all these six bases which they take to be self or soul. 'An inner tangle and an outer tangle . . .' (s.i, 13).

The Sutta (102)**1. Thus I heard:**

On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvatt̥hi, in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapīṇḍika's Park. There he addressed the bhikkhus thus: 'Bhikkhus.'

'Venerable sir,' they replied. The Blessed One said this:

(Based on Future Finiteness)

2. 'Bhikkhus, there some monks and divines, who, conjecturing about future finiteness and holding views about future finiteness, affirm various assertions contingent upon future finiteness.

(i) 'Some affirm such (assertion) as this: "The percipient self is intact after death."

(ii) 'Some affirm such (assertions) as this: "The non-percipient self is intact after death."

(iii) 'Some affirm such (assertionss) as this: "The neither-pecipient-nor-non-percipient self is intact after death."

(iv) 'Or they describe an existing being's (eventual) annihilation, obliteration and non-being.

(v) 'Then some affirm (the assertion of) 'Nibbāna' here and now.²

'Thus (a) they either describe an existing being to be intact after death, or (b) they describe an existing being's (eventual) annihilation, obliteration and non-being, or (c) they affirm (the assertion of) "Nibbāna" here and now. So these five are three, and these three are five.

'This is the summary of the Five and Three.

3. (i) 'Here, bhikkhus, when monks and divines describe a percipient self intact after death, then those good monks and divines describe the percipient self intact after death to be:

1. possessed of form,

or 2. formless,

or 3. possessed of form and formless,

1. Literally 'make known' and so throughout.

2. This does not mean Nibbāna in the Buddhist sense, See. para. 25. And see Sutta 75 (Māgandīya) for one who holds this view.

- or 4. neither possessed of form nor formless,
- or 5. percipient of unity,
- or 6. percipient of difference,
- or 7. percipient of the limited,
- or 8. percipient of the measureless.

4. 'Or else while those just mentioned affirm thus, (some) others (similarly) affirm (assertions about) consciousness as the absolute³, measureless and imperturbable, which goes beyond that of those (first mentioned).

5. 'Bhikkhus, a Tathāgata understands (the whole of) that thus: "When monks and divines describe the percipient self to be intact after death, then those good monks and divines describe the percipient self intact after death to be (1) possessed of form . . . (as in para. 3.) . . . (8) percipient of the measureless. Or else some (others) affirm (assertions about perception of) the base consisting of nothingness thus: "There is nothing", as measureless and imperturbable, which (perception) is declared (by them) the purest, most perfect, most high, most unsurpassable, of those (kinds of) perceptions, whether perceptions of form or perceptions of the formless or perceptions of unity or perceptions of difference. (Now the whole of) that is conditioned and (thus) gross; but there is cessation of formations, there is that."⁴ By knowing thus and by seeing the escape from (all) that, a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

6. (ii) 'Here bhikkhus, when monks and divines describe the non-percipient self to be intact after death, then those good monks and divines describe the non-percipient self intact after death to be:

- 1. possessed of form,
- or 2. formless,
- or 3. possessed of form and formless,
- or 4. neither possessed of form nor formless.

7. 'Here these oppose those good monks and divines who describe the percipient self intact after death. Why is that? (Because they assert thus:)

3. Kasiṇa, in Sutta 77 translated as 'wholeness'.

4. The cessation of formations means Nibbāna (Comy).

“Perception is a disease, a cancer, a dart; (but) the (more) peaceful, the superior (goal), is this, that is to say, non-perception.”

8. ‘Bhikkhus, a Tathāgata understands (the whole of) that thus: “When monks and divines describe the non-percipient self to be intact after death, then those good monks and divines describe the non-percipient self intact after death to be (1) possessed of form... (as in para. 6.)... neither possessed of form nor formless. (But) that any monk or divine should say: ‘I shall describe consciousness’s coming, or going, or passing away, or reappearance, or increase, or maturity, apart from form, from feeling, from perception, from formations, from consciousness—that is impossible. (Now the whole of) that is conditioned and thus gross; but there is cessation of formations, there is that.’ By knowing thus and by seeing the escape from (all) that, a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

9. (iii) ‘Here, bhikkhus, when monks and divines describe the neither-percipient-nor-non-percipient self to be intact after death, then those good monks and divines describe the neither-percipient-nor-non-percipient self intact after death to be:

- 1. possessed of form,
- or 2. formless,
- or 3. possessed of form and formless,
- or 4. neither possessed of form nor formless.

10. ‘Here these oppose those good monks and divines who describe the percipient self intact after death, and they (also) oppose those good monks and divines who describe the non-percipient self intact after death. Why is that? (Because they assert thus:) “Perception is a disease, a cancer, a dart; (but) the (more) peaceful, the superior (goal), is this, that is to say, neither-perception-nor-non-perception.”

11. ‘Bhikkhus, a Tathāgata understands (the whole of) that thus: “When monks and divines describe the neither-percipient-nor-non-percipient self to be intact after death, then those good monks and divines describe the neither-percipient-nor-non-percipient self intact after death to be (1) possessed of form... (as in para. 9.)... neither possessed of form nor formless. (But) when any monk or divine describes that the attaining

of this base (consisting of neither-perception-nor-non-perception) comes about with full formations of what is to be seen, heard, sensed and cognized, that proclaims (precisely) what prevents the attaining of that base; for that base is not proclaimed to be attainable with an attainment accompanied by such formations; that base is proclaimed to be attainable with an attainment accompanied by (only) reduced formations. (Now the whole of) that is conditioned and (thus) gross; but there is cessation of formations, there is that." By knowing thus and by seeing the escape from (all) that, a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

12. (iv) 'Here, bhikkhus, there are those monks and divines who describe an existing being's (eventual) annihilation, obliteration and non-being. Here these oppose those good monks and divines who describe the percipient self intact after death, and they oppose those good monks and divines who describe the non-percipient self intact after death, and they oppose those good monks and divines who describe the neither-percipient-nor-non-percipient self intact after death. Why is that? Because all those good monks and divines, being intent upon the round (of births) beyond (this life) only affirm (their) attachment thus: "We shall be such after death, we shall be such after death." Just as a trader who goes to market thinks: "From this there will be this for me; with this I shall get this", so too, these good monks and divines surely fancy: "We shall be such after death, we shall be such after death."

13. 'Bhikkhus, a Tathāgata understands (the whole of) that thus: "There are monks and divines who describe an existing being's (eventual) annihilation, obliteration and non-being. Because of fear of the existing-body, because of disgust with the existing-body, they keep running round, keep circling round, that same existing-body. Just as a dog tethered by a leash and anchored to a stout pole or post keeps running round, keeps circling round, that same pole or post, so too, these worthy monks and divines, because of fear of the existing-body, because of disgust with the existing-body, keep running round, keep circling round, that same existing-body. (Now the whole of) that is conditioned and (thus) gross; but there is cessation of formations, there is that." By knowing thus and by seeing the escape from (all) that, a Tathāgata

goes beyond (all) that.

14. 'Bhikkhus, any monks and divines there may be, who, conjecturing about future finiteness and holding views about future finiteness, affirm various assertions contingent upon future finiteness, all of them affirm these five bases, or one of them.

(Based on Past Finiteness)

15. 'Bhikkhus, there are some monks and divines, who, conjecturing about past finiteness and holding views about past finiteness, affirm various assertions contingent upon past finiteness.

1. 'Some affirm thus: "The self is eternal and is the world.⁵ Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
2. 'Some thus: "The self is not eternal and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
3. 'Some thus: "The self is eternal and not-eternal and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
4. 'Some thus: "The self is neither eternal nor not eternal and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
5. 'Some thus: "The self is finite and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
6. 'Some thus: "The self is infinite and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
7. 'Some thus: "The self is finite and infinite and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
8. 'Some thus: "The self is neither finite nor infinite and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
9. 'Some thus: "The self is percipient of unity and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
10. 'Some thus: "The self is percipient of difference and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
11. 'Some thus: "The self is percipient of the limited and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";

5. The 'self' or soul is identified with the 'world' (—any state of existence). The 'self' is held to be any one of the five aggregates and the 'world' is the other four. (Comy).

12. 'Some thus: "The self is percipient of the measureless and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
13. 'Some thus: "The self has only pleasure and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
14. 'Some thus: "The self has only pain and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
15. 'Some thus: "The self has both pleasure and pain and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong";
16. 'And some affirm thus: "The self has neither-pain-nor-pleasure and is the world. Only this is true, anything else is wrong."

16. (1) 'Here, that any monk or divine whose assertion and whose view is thus: "The self is eternal and is the world; only this is true, anything else is wrong" shall ever, apart from faith or from preference or from (oral) tradition or from arguing upon evidence or from liking to ponder upon views, have any actually personal purified and clear knowledge of that, that is not possible. Now when there is no actually personal purified and clear knowledge, then even that mere portion of knowledge thereof, which these good monks and divines clarify, itself proclaims the clinging that they have. (Now the whole of) that is conditioned and (thus) gross; but there is cessation of formations, there is that." By knowing thus and by seeing the escape from (all) that, a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

17. (2) 'Here, that any monk or divine whose assertion and whose view is thus: "The self is not eternal and is the world; only this is true, anything else is wrong" shall ever... (complete as in para. 16)... a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

18. (3-16) '... (repeat para. 16. for each of the rest of the 16 views in para. 15)... a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

('Nibbāna' Here and Now)

19. (v) Here, bhikkhus, some monk or divine, with the relinquishing of views based on past finiteness and of views based on future finiteness and in no way resolving⁶ upon the fetters of sensual desire, enters upon

6. Literally, 'with complete non-resolve'.

and abides in the happiness of seclusion⁷ (and thinking:) "The more peaceful is this, the superior (goal) is this: that I enter upon and abide in the happiness of seclusion." That happiness of seclusion ceases in him. With the cessation of the happiness of seclusion grief arises; with the cessation of the grief the happiness of seclusion arises. Just as what the shadow leaves the sunshine extends to, and what the sunshine leaves the shadow extends to, so too, with the cessation of the happiness of seclusion grief arises; with the cessation of the grief the happiness of seclusion arises.

20. 'Bhikkhus, a Tathāgata understands (the whole of) that thus: "This good monk or divine, with the relinquishing of views based on past finiteness and of views based on future finiteness and in no way resolving upon the fetters of sensual desire, enters upon and abides in the happiness of seclusion (and thinks:) 'The (more) peaceful is this, the superior (goal) is this: that I enter upon and abide in the happiness of seclusion.'" That happiness of seclusion ceases in him. With the cessation of the happiness of seclusion grief arises; with the cessation of the grief the happiness of seclusion arises. (Now the whole of) that is conditioned and (thus) gross; but there is cessation of formations, there is that." By knowing thus and by seeing the escape from (all) that, a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

21. 'Here bhikkhus, some monk or divine, with the relinquishing of views based on past finiteness and of views based on future finiteness, in no way resolving upon the fetters of sensual desire and with the surmounting of the happiness of seclusion enters upon and abides in non-material pleasure⁸ (and thinks:) "The (more) peaceful is this, the superior (goal) is this; that I enter upon and abide in non-material pleasure." That non-material pleasure ceases in him. With cessation of the non-material pleasure, happiness of seclusion arises; with the cessation of the happiness of seclusion, the non-material pleasure arises. Just as what the shadow leaves the sunshine extends to, and what the sunshine leaves the shadow extends to, so too, with the cessation of non-material pleasure, happiness of seclusion arises; with the cessation of happiness of seclusion, non-material pleasure arises.

7. This means 2nd jhāna.

8. This means 3rd jhāna.

22. 'Bhikkhus, a Tathāgata understands (the whole of) that thus: "This good monk or divine . . . (as in para. 20 with appropriate changes) . . . abides in non-material pleasure . . . I abide in non-material pleasure . . ." a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

23. 'Here, bhikkhus, some monk or divine, with the relinquishing . . . and with the surmounting of the happiness of seclusion and of non-material pleasure enters upon and abides in neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling⁹ (and thinks:) "The (more) peaceful is this, the superior (goal) is this: that I enter upon and abide in neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling." That neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling ceases in him. With the cessation of the neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, non-material pleasure arises; with the cessation of the non-material pleasure, neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling arises. Just as what the shadow leaves the sunshine extends to, and what the sunshine leaves the shadow extends to, so too, with the cessation of neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, non-material pleasure arises; with the cessation of non-material pleasure, neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling arises.

24. 'Bhikkhus, a Tathāgata understands (the whole of) that thus: "This good monk or divine . . ." a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

25. 'Here, bhikkhus, some monk or divine, with the relinquishing of views based on past finiteness, and views based on future finiteness, in no way resolving upon the fetters of sensual desire, and with the surmounting of the happiness of seclusion, of non-material pleasure, and of neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, sees thus: "I am at peace, I have attained Nibbāna, I am without clinging."

26. 'Bhikkhus, a Tathāgata understands (the whole of) that . . . "... I am without clinging." Certainly this venerable one affirms the way directed to Nibbāna. Yet in clinging (as the doer) this good monk or divine still either clings to a view based on past finiteness or to a view based on future finiteness or to the happiness of seclusion, or to non-material pleasure, or to neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling. And when he sees thus: "I am at peace, I have attained Nibbana, I am without clinging", that itself proclaims the clinging that he has. (Now the whole

9. This is 4th jhāna.

of) that is conditioned and (thus) gross; but there is cessation of formations, there is that. By knowing thus and by seeing the escape from (all) that, a Tathāgata goes beyond (all) that.

(The Unsurpassable Peace)

27. 'Bhikkhus, the supreme state of peace that is unsurpassable has been discovered by a Tathāgata, that is to say, liberation through not clinging, by knowing as they are the origination, the disappearance, the gratification, the danger and the escape, (in the case) of the six bases for contact.

28. 'Bhikkhus, that is the supreme state of peace that is unsurpassable, discovered by a Tathāgata, that is to say, liberation through not clinging, by knowing as they are the origination, the disappearance, the gratification, the danger and the escape, (in the case) of the six bases for contact.'

29. This is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus were satisfied and they delighted in the Blessed One's words.

Notes

para. 7. 9 and 12 read *tesam ete* instead of *tesam eke*.

para. 8. the reading *aham aññātra rūpa aññātra vedanāya aññātra saññāya aññātra saṅkhārehi viññāṇassa āgatiṃ*... has been preferred. See Samyutta XXII nos. 53-4.

para. 11. The compound *ditṭha-suta-muta-viññātabbassa* has been resolved as 'of what is to be seen, heard, sensed and cognized'; but it could also be rendered as 'of what is to be cognized as seen, heard and sensed'.

para. 16. For *faith*, etc., see Sutta 95, para. 14.

“A Treasury of the Buddha’s Discourses”

The selection of 90 Suttas from the Majjhima-Nikaya was made on the following principles:

1. The majority of readers of this book are likely to be Buddhist lay people, therefore most of the Suttas on lay practice have been included in the first section—“Lay people”.

2. But to complement this, the next section is on “Bhikkhu Life” and while not quite so long as the preceding section, is still nearly 20 Suttas. Some Suttas only of interest to bhikkhus (such as the Anumana Sutta) have been omitted.

3. Most of the Suttas dealing with various aspects of Training in Dhamma fall in this section. At the end of it come three Suttas which illustrate the step-by-step training of a bhikkhu.

4. Suttas which are on the various views held by non-Buddhists at that time, and conversations between non-Buddhists and Buddhist practisers find a place in this section.

5. Among the numerous Suttas in the Majjhima on ‘wisdom’ (pañña) which are phrased in terms of dhammas rather than persons, some have been omitted, like the Mūlapariyāya Sutta, because of their complexity and the need of many explanations. This section is still nevertheless one of the biggest.

6. This group of Suttas illustrates the attainment of Arahantship and so follows logically upon the last section, as well as section three.

7. The few Suttas which give biographical details of the Bodhisatta’s practices before Enlightenment and continue in some cases to speak of later events, such as the teaching of the first five bhikkhus, could hardly be omitted as they are so important. Four Suttas make up this short section.

8. The last section shows the Buddha speaking about himself as the Tathāgata and from the four Suttas here we gain an impression of the Buddha’s majesty.

This note summarizes the contents of the various sections of this anthology. The guiding principle in making it was to bring out all the major features of the Buddha’s teaching.